



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 17 Hydref 2012  
Wednesday, 17 October 2012**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy  
Questions to the Minister for the Environment and Sustainable Development
- 27 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth  
Questions to the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage
- 50 Dadl gan Aelodau Unigol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.21(iv): Ynni Adnewyddadwy  
o Aber Afon Hafren  
Debate by Individual Members under Standing Order No. 11.21(iv): Renewable  
Energy from the Severn Estuary
- 75 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ar Bolisi Ynni a Chynllunio  
yng Nghymru  
The Environment and Sustainability Committee's Report on Energy Policy and  
Planning Wales
- 99 Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Gwasanaethau i Blant  
Welsh Conservatives Debate: Children's Services
- 130 Cyfnod Pleidleisio  
Voting Time
- 136 Dadl Fer: Gwella Gofal Dementia—Datblygu Gwasanaethau Di-dor  
Short Debate: Improving Dementia Care—Developing Seamless Services

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Prynhawn da. Galwaf Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i drefn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Good afternoon. I call the National Assembly for Wales to order.

## **Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy Questions to the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development**

### **Adeiladu ar Orlifdir**

*1. Mike Hedges: Pa gyngor y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei ddarparu i bwyllgorau cynllunio awdurdodau lleol ynghylch adeiladu anheddau ar orlifdir. OAQ(4)0170(ESD)*

**The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths):** Advice to local planning authorities regarding building dwellings in flood risk areas is contained in national planning policy documents, 'Planning Policy Wales', and technical advice note 15 on development and flood risk.

**Mike Hedges:** Due to the number of buildings that are currently being built, when given planning permission, in areas that are known to be liable to flooding, does the Minister feel that there is a need either for stronger guidance or for new legislation along the lines of the 'white wedge' legislation regarding building in zones outside conurbations?

**John Griffiths:** The Welsh Government takes flood risk very seriously indeed, involving as it does risk to life and limb, as well as property. Therefore, it is an utmost priority for us. We have a restrictive approach to building on floodplains under technical advice note 15, and the evidence that I have from the Environment Agency indicates that that is working. I believe that about 0.02% of applications are approved in the undefended floodplain contrary to Environment Agency advice and our 'Planning Policy Wales' guidance. We have taken the further step from July this year of putting in a notification direction to local

### **Building on Floodplains**

*1. Mike Hedges: What advice does the Welsh Government provide to local authority planning committees regarding the building of dwellings on flood plains. OAQ(4)0170(ESD)*

**Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths):** Nodir cyngor i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ynghylch adeiladu anheddau mewn ardaloedd lle ceir perygl o lifogydd mewn dogfennau polisi cynllunio cenedlaethol, sef 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', a nodyn cyngor technegol 15 ar ddatblygu a pherygl llifogydd.

**Mike Hedges:** Oherwydd nifer yr adeiladau sy'n cael eu hadeiladu ar hyn o bryd, pan roddir caniatâd cynllunio, mewn ardaloedd y gwyddys eu bod yn agored i lifogydd, a yw'r Gweinidog yn teimlo bod angen naill ai canllawiau cadarnach neu ddeddfwriaeth newydd tebyg i'r ddeddfwriaeth 'lletem wen' ynghylch adeiladu mewn parthau y tu allan i gytreffi?

**John Griffiths:** Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cymryd risg llifogydd o ddifrif, o ystyried ei bod yn peri risg i fywydau, yn ogystal ag eiddo. Felly, mae'n flaenoriaeth hollbwysig inni. Rydym yn cyfyngu ar nifer yr adeiladau a gaiff eu codi ar orlifdiroedd o dan nodyn cyngor technegol 15, ac mae'r dystiolaeth sydd gennyf gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn awgrymu bod hyn yn gweithio. Credaf fod tua 0.02% o geisiadau yn cael eu cymeradwyo o fewn ardaloedd gorlifdir diamddiffyn yn groes i gyngor Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'n canllawiau 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru'. Ym mis Gorffennaf eleni, gwnaethom gymryd y cam ychwanegol o roi

authorities that if they are minded to approve developments on undefended floodplains, against national planning policy or contrary to Environment Agency advice, then that should be referred to the Welsh Government for us to decide whether to call in that matter.

**Darren Millar:** Minister, you will know that I have raised concerns about developments on floodplains in the past. One thing that my party has suggested as a way to move forward on this is a revision of technical advice note 15 in order to create blue-belt land around some of those flood risk areas to prevent development from occurring on them once and for all. What consideration will you give to the creation of blue-belt land across Wales?

**John Griffiths:** We keep ‘Planning Policy Wales’ and our technical advice notes under constant review, so that is generally the case. However, as I said in response to Mike Hedges’s question, we believe, on the evidence that we have from the Environment Agency, that the very restrictive approach under TAN 15 is working.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Minister, on my way to the Assembly this morning, Radio Wales—my constant companion—warned that nine flood alerts, and 10 flood warnings, were issued yesterday. In view of today’s announcement that one of the areas at greatest risk of flooding is along the Severn estuary, what discussions have you had, or will you be having, with the Environment Agency regarding its view on housing development in this most vulnerable area?

**John Griffiths:** We constantly discuss flood risk and how we can best protect communities in Wales from flooding with the Environment Agency, as well as with local authorities, Welsh Water, and other key stakeholders. Areas such as the Severn estuary are prominent in those discussions. Therefore, we will continue to work with partners to ensure that we protect Wales

cyfarwyddyd i awdurdodau lleol, mewn hysbysiad, yn nodi os byddant yn cymeradwyo datblygiadau ar orlifdiroedd diamddiffyn, yn erbyn polisi cynllunio cenedlaethol neu yn groes i gyngor Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, yna dylid cyfeirio’r achosion hynny i Lywodraeth Cymru er mwyn inni benderfynu p’un a ddylid galw’r mater hwnnw i mewn ai peidio.

**Darren Millar:** Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod fy mod wedi codi pryderon am ddatblygiadau ar orlifdiroedd yn y gorffennol. Un peth a awgrymwyd gan fy mhlaid fel ffordd o symud ymlaen yn hyn o beth yw y dylid diwygio nodyn cyngor technegol 15 er mwyn creu tir llain glas o amgylch rhai o’r ardaloedd hynny lle ceir perygl llifogydd er mwyn atal datblygiad rhag digwydd arnynt unwaith ac am byth. Pa ystyriaeth a roddwch i greu tir llain glas ledled Cymru?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym yn adolygu ‘Polisi Cynllunio Cymru’ a’n nodiadau cyngor technegol yn barhaus, felly yn gyffredinol, dyna sy’n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn Mike Hedges, credwn, ar sail y dystiolaeth a gawsom gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, bod y dull cyfyngol iawn o dan TAN 15 yn gweithio.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Weinidog, wrth deithio i’r Cynulliad y bore yma, rhybuddiodd Radio Wales—fy nghydymaith ffyddlon—bod naw hysbysiad o lifogydd, a 10 rhybudd rhag llifogydd, wedi’u cyhoeddi ddoe. O ystyried y cyhoeddiad heddiw mai un o’r ardaloedd sy’n wynebu’r perygl mwyaf o lifogydd yw’r ardal ar hyd aber afon Hafren, pa drafodaethau rydych wedi’u cael, neu y byddwch yn eu cael, gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ynghylch ei barn ar ddatblygu tai yn yr ardal ddiamddiffyn iawn hon?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym yn trafod perygl llifogydd a’r ffordd orau o amddiffyn cymunedau yng Nghymru rhag llifogydd yn gyson gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, yn ogystal â chydag awdurdodau lleol, Dŵr Cymru, a rhanddeiliaid allweddol eraill. Cyfeirir yn aml at ardaloedd megis aber Hafren yn y trafodaethau hynny. Felly, byddwn yn parhau i weithio gyda

against that risk as best we can.

phartneriaid i sicrhau ein bod yn amddiffyn Cymru rhag y risg honno hyd eithaf ein gallu.

### Morglawdd yr Hafren

**2. Mike Hedges:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru ar y cynnig i adeiladu morglawdd ar draws Aber Afon Hafren. OAQ(4)0169(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** The Severn estuary represents a potentially important source of renewable energy that could provide substantial economic benefits. Proposals to harness this potential should be evaluated in terms of their energy and economic value, and their environmental impact.

**Mike Hedges:** I tabled this question before I saw the whole of the agenda; I know that the matter is up for debate later on. My supplementary question—and I agree with the Member of Parliament for Neath in his desire to have a barrage—is to urge the Minister to press the Westminster Government to proceed with the scheme as soon as is practicable.

**John Griffiths:** I thank Mike Hedges for his supplementary question. We did, of course, play an active role in the two-year feasibility study, whereby the UK Government looked at ways of harnessing the energy of the Severn estuary. Ultimately, the UK Government concluded that it did not see a strategic case for public investment in tidal energy in the Severn estuary at that time, which was around 2010. Obviously, we continue to consider these matters, and, as Mike Hedges mentioned, I am sure there will be an interesting debate here later today.

**William Graham:** I was interested in your first answer to Mike Hedges. Have you a timescale when those studies are likely to have some conclusions for you, bearing in mind that this is a project that could revitalise large parts of south Wales, and link in well with the city regions strategy we discussed yesterday?

**John Griffiths:** As I said, we took part in that very important UK study, which was very informative in terms of how harnessing

### The Severn Barrage

**2. Mike Hedges:** *Will the Minister outline the Welsh Government's position on the proposal to build a barrage across the Severn estuary. OAQ(4)0169(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Gallai aber Hafren fod yn ffynhonnell bwysig o ynni adnewyddadwy a allai esgor ar fuddiannau economaidd sylweddol. Dylid gwerthuso cynigion i harneisio'r potensial hwn o safbwynt eu gwerth o ran ynni a'u gwerth economaidd, a'u heffaith ar yr amgylchedd.

**Mike Hedges:** Cyflwynais y cwestiwn hwn cyn imi weld yr agenda gyfan; gwn fod y mater yn cael ei drafod yn nes ymlaen. Mae a wnelo fy nghwestiwn atodol—a chytunaf ag awydd yr Aelod Seneddol dros Gastell-nedd i gael morglawdd—ag erfyn ar y Gweinidog i bwysu ar Lywodraeth San Steffan i fwrw ati â'r cynllun cyn gynted ag y bo'n ymarferol.

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Mike Hedges am ei gwestiwn atodol. Gwnaethom, wrth gwrs, chwarae rhan weithredol yn yr astudiaeth ddichonoldeb dwy flynedd, lle yr ystyriodd Llywodraeth y DU ffyrdd o harneisio ynni aber afon Hafren. Yn y pen draw, daeth Llywodraeth y DU i'r casgliad nad oedd o'r farn bod achos strategol o blaid buddsoddiad cyhoeddus mewn ynni llanw yn aber Afon Hafren ar y pryd, sef oddeutu 2010. Yn amlwg, rydym yn parhau i ystyried y materion hyn, ac, fel y soniodd Mike Hedges, rwy'n siŵr y bydd dadl ddiddorol yma yn nes ymlaen heddiw.

**William Graham:** Roedd gennyf ddiddordeb yn eich ateb cyntaf i Mike Hedges. A oes gennych amserlen o ran pryd y mae'r astudiaethau hynny yn debygol o ddod i unrhyw gasgliadau ichi, o ystyried ei fod yn brosiect a allai adfywio rhannau helaeth o'r de, a bod cyswllt amlwg â'r strategaeth dinas-ranbarthau a drafodwyd gennyf ddoe?

**John Griffiths:** Fel y dywedais, gwnaethom gymryd rhan yn yr astudiaeth bwysig honno gan Lywodraeth y DU, a gyflwynodd lawer o

the energy in the Severn estuary is best taken forward. Discussions continue with various interested parties and the Welsh Government is very much open to ideas.

**Simon Thomas:** Weinidog, cadarnhaodd y Prif Weinidog ddoe ei fod bellach yn safbwynt gan y Llywodraeth i fynnu hawliau cynllunio llawn dros ynni adnewyddol yng Nghymru. Os felly, a wnewch chi gadarnhau mai eich hamcan chi yw bod unrhyw benderfyniad sy'n cael ei wneud dros forglawdd yn yr Hafren yn benderfyniad ar y cyd rhwng y Llywodraeth fan hyn a Llywodraeth San Steffan?

**John Griffiths:** The First Minister was very clear as to the Welsh Government's rightful ambitions in terms of greater control and greater consenting powers over energy applications and the energy scene in Wales, and I very much agree with everything that the First Minister said.

**Peter Black:** What weight will be given to the environmental considerations of this particular proposal when you have your discussions with the UK Government on this issue?

**John Griffiths:** We have made very clear all along that the environmental impacts are a very important part of the decision-making process and the assessment of any particular proposal. We deal with these matters in accordance with our central organising principle of sustainable development, so we look at the three strands—environmental, economic and social.

### Blaenoriaethau

**3. Paul Davies:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y 12 mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0165(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I am committed to fulfilling, across Wales, the commitments that are set out for my portfolio in the programme for government.

**Paul Davies:** I am grateful to the Minister for that answer. I accept that one of our priorities must also be the protection of our natural

wybodaeth o ran y ffordd orau o harneisio'r ynni yn aber afon Hafren. Mae trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt o hyd gydag amrywiol bartion â diddordeb ac mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn barod iawn i wrando ar syniadau.

**Simon Thomas:** Minister, the First Minister confirmed yesterday that it is now the Government's stance to insist on full planning rights over renewable energy in Wales. If so, will you confirm that your aim is that any decision made on a Severn barrage is a joint decision between the Government here and the Government in Westminster?

**John Griffiths:** Roedd y Prif Weinidog yn glir iawn o ran uchelgais priodol Llywodraeth Cymru o ran mwy o reolaeth a mwy o bwerau cydsynio dros geisiadau ynni a'r sefyllfa ynni yng Nghymru, ac rwy'n cytuno'n llwyr â phopeth a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog.

**Peter Black:** Pa bwys a gaiff ei roi ar ystyriaethau amgylcheddol y cynnig penodol hwn pan fyddwch yn trafod y mater hwn gyda Llywodraeth y DU?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym wedi nodi'n glir iawn drwy gydol y broses bod effeithiau amgylcheddol yn rhan bwysig iawn o'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau ac asesu unrhyw gynnig penodol. Rydym yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn yn unol â'n prif egwyddor drefniadol, sef datblygu cynaliadwy, felly rydym yn ystyried y tri maes—amgylcheddol, economaidd a chymdeithasol.

### Priorities

**3. Paul Davies:** *Will the Minister make a statement on his priorities for the next 12 months. OAQ(4)0165(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Rwy'n ymrwymedig i gyflawni, ledled Cymru, yr ymrwymadau a nodwyd ar gyfer fy mhorthfolio yn y rhaglen lywodraethu.

**Paul Davies:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni roi blaenoriaeth hefyd i

environment. However, many of my constituents, including small tourist operators, are extremely concerned about the implications of the proposed highly-protected marine conservation zones on all three of the possible sites off the coast of Pembrokeshire. Now that the consultation has closed, can the Minister therefore tell us when we are likely to receive an announcement with regard to the impact of this particular consultation?

**John Griffiths:** I very much look forward to making a statement in short order on the outcomes of that first stage of a three-stage consultation process. We have been clear all along that the first stage was presenting the science around marine conservation zones and then getting responses to our proposals, particularly in terms of the social and economic impacts. So, very soon, I will set out the further stages of that three-stage consultation process.

**Kenneth Skates:** Minister, Welsh woodlands are a very important strategic public resource and are hugely cost-effective tools in tackling obesity, combating climate change and creating jobs. Indeed, it is estimated that one in six jobs in the Welsh economy can be attributed to the environment. Minister, will you give us an update on how Wales is progressing in its ambitious target to create 100,000 ha of new woodland by 2020?

**John Griffiths:** I thank Ken Skates for his interest in the woodlands in Wales, which I know is a deeply held interest for him. Welsh woodlands have delivered in the round for Wales since devolution in terms of timber production and the commercial element, tourism, access, health and biodiversity. So, they are important in the round in terms of Welsh Government policy and priorities. That is why 'Woodland for Wales' clearly sets out our ambitions. Among those is a long-term aspiration to increase woodland cover and create new woodland in Wales. We have made some progress; Glastir will help us to move on with that agenda. However, I very much look forward to keeping Members informed as we make that progress.

ddiogelu ein hamgylchedd naturiol. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o'm hetholwyr, gan gynnwys gweithredwyr twristiaeth bach, yn hynod bryderus am oblygiadau'r parthau cadwraeth morol hynod warchoddedig arfaethedig ar bob un o'r tri safle posibl oddi ar arfordir Sir Benfro. Nawr bod yr ymgynghoriad wedi dod i ben, a all y Gweinidog felly ddweud wrthym pryd rydym yn debygol o gael cyhoeddiad o ran effaith yr ymgynghoriad penodol hwn?

**John Griffiths:** Rwy'n edrych ymlaen yn fawr at wneud datganiad cyn gynted â phosibl ar ganlyniadau'r cam cyntaf hwnnw o broses ymgynghori tri cham. Rydym wedi bod yn glir drwy gydol y broses mai'r cam cyntaf oedd cyflwyno'r wyddoniaeth sy'n gysylltiedig â pharthau cadwraeth morol ac yna gael ymatebion i'n cynigion, yn enwedig o ran yr effeithiau cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Felly, maes o law, byddaf yn nodi camau pellach y broses ymgynghori tri cham hwnnw.

**Kenneth Skates:** Weinidog, mae coetiroedd Cymru yn adnodd cyhoeddus strategol pwysig iawn ac yn ffordd gost-effeithiol tu hwnt o fynd i'r afael â gordewdra, trechu newid yn yr hinsawdd a chreu swyddi. Yn wir, amcangyfrifir y gellir priodoli un o bob chwe swydd yn economi Cymru i'r amgylchedd. Weinidog, a wnewch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni ar hynt Cymru tuag at ei tharged uchelgeisiol i greu 100,000 ha o goetir newydd erbyn 2020?

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Ken Skates am ei ddiddordeb yn y coetiroedd yng Nghymru, y gwn fod ganddo ddiddordeb brwd yn y mater. Mae coetiroedd Cymru wedi darparu'n gyffredinol i Gymru ers datganoli o ran cynhyrchu pren a'r elfen fasnachol, twristiaeth, mynediad, iechyd a bioamrywiaeth. Felly, maent yn bwysig yn gyffredinol o safbwynt polisi a blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru. Dyna pam mae 'Coetiroedd i Gymru' yn nodi ein huchelgeisiau yn glir. Yn eu plith, mae dyhead hirdymor i gynyddu arwynebedd coetiroedd a chreu coetiroedd newydd yng Nghymru. Rydym wedi gwneud rhywfaint o gynydd; bydd Glastir yn ein helpu i fwrw ati â'r agenda honno. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n edrych ymlaen yn fawr iawn at roi'r

wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau o ran y cynnydd hwnnw.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Roeddech chi, fel fi, yn y cyfarfod trawsbleidiol neithiwr ar fioamrywiaeth lle cawsom drafodaeth ddifyr a gwerthfawr ar wasanaethau ecosystemau a'u pwysigrwydd i ni yng Nghymru. Pa sicrwydd a allwch ei rhoi y bydd dealltwriaeth ac ymrwymiad eich adran chi tuag at *approach* ecosystemaidd yn cael ei adlewyrchu ar draws adrannau Llywodraeth Cymru?

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** You, like me, attended the cross-party group meeting last night on biodiversity, where we had an interesting and valuable discussion on ecosystem services and their importance to us in Wales. What assurance can you give that your department's understanding and commitment to an ecosystems approach will be reflected across Welsh Government departments?

**John Griffiths:** It is very much a part of our new and emerging thinking in Welsh Government and very much in accordance with our sustainable development central organising principle that we take forward ecosystem services. The cross-party group on biodiversity yesterday evening was very interesting; many interesting ideas were put on the table. The creation of the single body and 'Sustaining a Living Wales' clearly set out how we intend to integrate and go forward in organisational terms and in policy-creation and policy-delivery terms with that ecosystems approach.

**John Griffiths:** Mae rhoi gwasanaethau ecosystem ar waith yn sicr yn rhan amlwg o'r ffordd newydd o feddwl sy'n dod i'r amlwg o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru ac yn sicr, mae'n unol â'n prif egwyddor drefniadol, sef datblygu cynaliadwy. Roedd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar fioamrywiaeth neithiwr yn ddiddorol iawn; cyflwynwyd llawer o syniadau diddorol. Drwy greu'r un corff sengl a thrwy 'Cynnal Cymru Fyw', nodwyd yn glir ein bwriad i integreiddio'r dull ecosystemau hwnnw a bwrw ati o ran materion trefniadol ac o ran llunio polisiau a chyflwyno polisiau.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Yn sgîl yr ateb hwnnw, felly, pa sicrwydd a allwch ei rhoi na fydd dyletswyddau cadwriaethol statudol y corff adnoddau naturiol newydd yn wannach mewn unrhyw ffordd na dyletswyddau'r cyrff presennol, yn enwedig Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru? Gan fy mod ar fy nhraed, hoffwn ofyn hefyd pa bryd y byddwch mewn sefyllfa i ddatgelu enw swyddogol newydd y corff arfaethedig.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Thank you for that response. In light of that response, therefore, what assurance can you give that the statutory conservation duties of the new natural resources body will not be weaker in any way than the duties of the current bodies, particularly those of the Countryside Council for Wales? As I am on my feet, I would also like to ask when you will be in a position to reveal the official name of the proposed body.

**John Griffiths:** I can assure the Member that the current duties of the three legacy bodies, as they are now known, will transfer across to the single body, so there will be no diminution in the standards applicable to those duties. I look forward to announcing the name of the new body soon—hopefully next week—along with the names of the board members.

**John Griffiths:** Gallaf sicrhau'r Aelod y bydd dyletswyddau presennol y tri chorff etifeddiaeth, fel y'u gelwir erbyn hyn, yn trosglwyddo i'r corff sengl, felly ni fydd y safonau sy'n berthnasol i'r dyletswyddau hynny yn is mewn unrhyw ffordd. Edrychaf ymlaen at gyhoeddi enw'r corff newydd yn fuan—wythnos nesaf, gobeithio—ynghyd ag enwau aelodau'r bwrdd.

**William Powell:** At this morning's cross-party group on fuel poverty, Stuart Margerrison, director of fuel poverty at British Gas, reflected that, despite its

**William Powell:** Yn y grŵp trawsbleidiol y bore yma ar dlodi tanwydd, dywedodd Stuart Margerrison, cyfarwyddwr tlodi tanwydd Nwy Prydain, er gwaethaf ei llwyddiannau



successes in year one, the Nest programme still has some way to go in terms of its promotion across the whole of Wales. What will the Welsh Government do in specific terms to help to address this issue in year two?

**John Griffiths:** I thank William Powell for that question. We constantly monitor our service delivery schemes and mechanisms. Nest is comparatively new and is under constant monitoring and scrutiny. We will look to learn the lessons of early experience to carry out necessary improvements as we move forward.

**William Powell:** In the rural heartlands of Wales, with its sparsity and the predominance of stone-built housing stock, the Nest programme faces particular challenges. What can the Welsh Government proactively do to assist residents who live in those areas and where does the Green Deal potentially fit into assisting them in fighting their experience of fuel poverty?

**John Griffiths:** We very much shaped Nest to deal with fuel poverty and energy efficiency issues across rural and urban Wales; that is more the case under Nest than under its predecessor. There are many houses that were built a considerable number of years ago in Wales that might benefit from external cladding to help with energy efficiency. Some microgeneration devices might help address some of the problems that those householders have. The Green Deal and FITs, the feed-in tariffs, are potentially helpful on that. Really, the frustration is waiting for the detail to emerge as far as the Green Deal is concerned. We and many key partners await that detail with great interest.

1.45 p.m.

**Russell George:** Minister, we are not long past the 100-day marker since the Rio conference. At that conference, you signed two declarations, the first committing to the climate group's clean revolution and the green economy, and the second committing

yn ystod ei blwyddyn gyntaf, bod cryn dipyn o waith i'w wneud o hyd i hyrwyddo rhaglen Nyth ledled Cymru. Beth a wnaiff Llywodraeth Cymru yn benodol er mwyn helpu i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn yn ystod yr ail flwyddyn?

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i William Powell am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rydym yn monitro ein cynlluniau a'n dulliau darparu gwasanaethau yn gyson. Mae Nyth yn gymharol newydd a chaiff ei monitro a'i chraffu'n gyson. Byddwn yn anelu at ddysgu gwersi o'n profiad cynnar er mwyn gwneud y gwelliannau angenrheidiol wrth inni fwrw ymlaen.

**William Powell:** Ym mrodydd gwledig Cymru, â'u poblogaeth wasgaredig a'r ffaith bod y rhan fwyaf o'r stoc dai wedi'u hadeiladu o gerrig, mae rhaglen Nyth yn wynebu heriau penodol. Beth all Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud er mwyn helpu trigolion sy'n byw yn yr ardaloedd hynny a beth yw rôl bosibl y Fargen Werdd o ran eu helpu i frwydro yn erbyn eu profiad o dlodi tanwydd?

**John Griffiths:** Gwnaethom lunio Nyth i raddau helaeth i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd ac effeithlonrwydd ynni ar draws ardaloedd gwledig a threfol Cymru; mae Nyth yn gwneud hynny i raddau helaethach na'i rhagflaenydd. Gallai cladin allanol fod o fudd i lawer o dai a adeiladwyd sawl blwyddyn yn ôl yng Nghymru o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni. Gallai rhai dyfeisiau microgynhyrchu helpu i ymdrin â rhai o'r problemau sydd gan y deiliaid tai hynny. Gallai'r Fargen Werdd a'r tariffau cyflenwi trydan fod yn ddefnyddiol yn hynny o beth. Mewn gwirionedd, aros am y manylion mewn perthynas â'r Fargen Werdd sy'n rhwystredig. Rydym ni a llawer o bartneriaid allweddol yn aros yn frwd am y manylion hynny.

**Russell George:** Weinidog, rydym newydd basio 100 diwrnod ers cynhadledd Rio. Yn y gynhadledd honno, gwnaethoch lofnodi dau ddatganiad, y cyntaf yn ymrwmo i chwyldro glân grŵp yr hinsawdd a'r economi werdd, a'r ail yn ymrwmo i batrwm newydd ar

to a new paradigm for sustainable development and poverty eradication. Can you tell me what progress you have made on the many commitments that are fundamental to those two declarations?

**John Griffiths:** Yes. I was very pleased with the recognition that sub-national Governments received at Rio in the official text and the inclusion of sub-national Governments within it, because it is clearly the case that we and other such administrations are key deliverers of policy that will address the climate change challenges. That was a very useful development, and I was pleased to sign those declarations. We are doing much to meet our commitments. For example, there is the Arbed scheme, which has been very well received and which we will continue to roll out in future. Much has been done on smart travel and achieving a modal shift to public transport. Nest is another example. There are many areas where the Welsh Government has achieved a great deal, but it is strengthening that effort, and we will meet our objectives under those declarations.

**Russell George:** As you will be aware, a number of the commitments in the declarations to which you subscribed the Welsh Government have a cross-portfolio remit and can be delivered only with support from your colleagues, and particularly the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science. She will be aware of what you have signed her up to. What has your department been working on to strengthen the green economy and deliver on commitment 19 of the clean revolution and green economy declaration, which is on the fostering of public-private partnerships?

**John Griffiths:** I have weekly discussions with ministerial colleagues, and sustainable development, as our central organising principle, informs those discussions. Those discussions include the Minister for business. We have recently discussed many aspects of the green economy, not least because of the

gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy a dileu tlodi. A allwch chi ddweud wrthyf ba gynnydd a wnaed gennych ar yr ymrwymadau niferus sy'n hollbwysig i'r ddau ddatganiad hynny?

**John Griffiths:** Gallaf. Roeddwn yn falch iawn o'r gydnabyddiaeth a gafodd Llywodraethau is-genedlaethol yn Rio yn y testun swyddogol a'r ffaith bod Llywodraethau is-genedlaethol wedi'u cynnwys o fewn y testun hwnnw, gan ei bod yn amlwg yn wir ein bod ni a gweinyddiaethau eraill o'r fath yn allweddol o ran cyflwyno polisiau a fydd yn ymdrin â'r heriau sy'n gysylltiedig â newid yn yr hinsawdd. Roedd hynny'n ddatblygiad defnyddiol iawn, ac roeddwn yn falch i lofnodi'r datganiadau hynny. Rydym yn weithgar iawn o ran bodloni ein hymrwymadau. Er enghraifft, ceir cynllun Arbed, sydd wedi cael croeso cynnes iawn a byddwn yn parhau i'w gyflwyno yn y dyfodol. Gwnaed cryn dipyn o ran teithio deallus a sicrhau newid moddol i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae Nyth yn enghraifft arall. Mae llawer o feysydd lle mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cyflawni'n sylweddol, ond mae'n atgyfnerthu'r ymdrech honno, a byddwn yn cyflawni ein hamcanion yn unol â'r datganiadau hynny.

**Russell George:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae gan nifer o'r ymrwymadau yn y datganiadau y gwnaethoch ymrwymo Llywodraeth Cymru iddynt gylch gwaith sy'n croesi gwahanol bortffolios a dim ond gyda chefnogaeth eich cyd-Aelodau, ac yn arbennig y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth, y gellir eu cyflawni. Bydd hithau'n ymwybodol o'r hyn yr ydych wedi ei hymrwymo hi iddo. Pa waith a wnaed gan eich adran i atgyfnerthu'r economi werdd a chyflawni ymrwymiad 19 o'r datganiad ar chwyldro glân a'r economi werdd, sy'n ymwneud â meithrin partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat?

**John Griffiths:** Rwy'n cynnal trafodaethau wythnosol â chyd-Weinidogion, a datblygu cynaliadwy, fel ein prif egwyddor drefniadol, sy'n llywio'r trafodaethau hynny. Mae'r trafodaethau hynny yn cynnwys y Trefnydd. Rydym wedi trafod sawl agwedd ar yr economi werdd yn ddiweddar, yn enwedig yn

recent Confederation for British Industry report in the UK, which demonstrated that possibly the only area of growth, or certainly the main area of growth, in the economy at the moment is the green economy. Therefore, that is certainly uppermost in our minds.

**Christine Chapman:** Minister, more than 53,000 animals were experimented on in Wales in 2011, which is an increase of more than 14% on the previous year. Although I understand that the responsibility in this field is not devolved, experimentation and the suffering that it can cause raise real questions on animal welfare, which is a matter for the Assembly. Therefore, Minister, as a priority, can you enter into discussions with the Home Office to see what can be done to reverse this worrying trend?

**John Griffiths:** I thank Christine Chapman for that question. As she rightly says, these matters are not devolved to the Welsh Government. Nonetheless, they are the cause of considerable interest and concern in Wales. I recognise that, and I would be very happy to raise these issues with the Home Office. I will let the Member know what the response is.

#### Gwella'r Broses Gynllunio

**4. Paul Davies:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn mynd i wella'r broses gynllunio yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0166(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Improving the planning process is a priority. I will ensure that national planning policies are kept up to date, local development plans put in place, and the efficiency of the planning application process improved. A draft planning reform Bill and White Paper will be published next year.

**Paul Davies:** I am grateful to the Minister for that answer. The independent advisory group stated in its report that it sees a need to improve public and stakeholder roles in the planning system. I accept that some strategic planning applications need to be dealt with on a regional basis or, indeed, on a national basis, but it is still important that the views of

sgîl adroddiad diweddar Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn y DU, a ddangosodd o bosibl mai'r unig faes twf, neu'n sicr y prif faes twf, yn yr economi ar hyn o bryd yw'r economi werdd. Felly, mae hynny yn sicr yn cael blaenoriaeth gennym.

**Christine Chapman:** Weinidog, arbrofwyd ar fwy na 53,000 o anifeiliaid yng Nghymru yn 2011, sef cynnydd o fwy na 14% ar y flwyddyn flaenorol. Er fy mod yn deall nad yw'r cyfrifoldeb yn y maes hwn wedi'i ddatganoli, mae arbrofi a'r dioddefaint y gall ei hachosi yn codi cwestiynau go iawn am les anifeiliaid, sy'n fater i'r Cynulliad. Felly, Weinidog, fel blaenoriaeth, allwch chi gychwyn trafodaethau gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i wrthdroi'r duedd hon sy'n peri pryder?

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Christine Chapman am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Fel y dywed, a hithau'n llygad ei lle, nid yw'r materion hyn wedi'u datganoli i Lywodraeth Cymru. Serch hynny, maent yn achosi cryn ddi-ddordeb a phryder yng Nghymru. Rwy'n cydnabod hynny, a byddwn yn fwy na pharod i godi'r materion hyn gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref. Hysbysaf yr Aelod am yr ymateb.

#### Improving the Planning Process

**4. Paul Davies:** *Will the Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Government is going to improve the planning process in Wales. OAQ(4)0166(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Mae gwella'r broses gynllunio yn flaenoriaeth. Byddaf yn sicrhau y caiff polisïau cynllunio cenedlaethol eu diweddarau'n gyson, y caiff cynlluniau datblygu lleol eu rhoi ar waith, ac y caiff effeithlonrwydd y broses ceisiadau cynllunio ei wella. Bydd Bil diwygio cynllunio a Phapur Gwyn drafft yn cael eu cyhoeddi y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Paul Davies:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Nododd y grŵp cynghori annibynnol yn ei adroddiad ei fod o'r farn bod angen gwella rôl y cyhoedd a rôl rhanddeiliaid yn y system gynllunio. Derbyniat fod angen ymdrin â rhai ceisiadau cynllunio strategol ar sail ranbarthol neu, yn wir, ar sail genedlaethol, ond mae'n bwysig

local communities be heard loud and clear. Does the Minister agree that engagement with local communities on planning applications must be a priority for the Welsh Government? If so, will he outline what the Welsh Government is doing to ensure that local communities are fully consulted?

**John Griffiths:** I very much agree with the Member that local communities must be at the forefront of our planning system. That is why we have the local development plans and local planning authorities as the basic bedrock of our planning system in Wales. There are some interesting ideas in the independent advisory group report about the involvement of town and community councils, for example, and how they may work up their own local plans, which would inform supplementary planning guidance. Those are among some of the ideas being considered at the moment. I certainly agree that local communities must remain at the heart of our planning system.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'r Llywodraeth yn paratoi Bil cynllunio newydd a fydd, gobeithio, yn dangos dynesiad gwell a mwy cyfoes tuag at gynllunio. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Arolygiaeth Gynllunio yn parhau i fod yn gorff Lloegr a Chymru ac yn gorff hyd braich, i fod. Onid yw'n bryd i'r corff hwn hefyd gael ei leoli yng Nghymru gan ddod yn rhan o'r datblygiadau newydd cyffrous yn y maes hwn yng Nghymru?

**John Griffiths:** We are always considering developments in line with devolution to create a greater resource within Wales. We are open to ideas as an administration. We believe that the England and Wales Planning Inspectorate has served and is serving Wales well. There is a great deal of cross-fertilisation of experience and expertise, which is beneficial to Wales.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** Does the Minister have plans for the role and performance of national parks in the planning system? If the Minister does, what is the timescale for that work?

**John Griffiths:** We expect later this year to

sicrhau o hyd bod barn cymunedau lleol yn cael ei chlywed yn glir. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru roi blaenoriaeth i ymgysylltu â chymunedau lleol ar geisiadau cynllunio? Os felly, a wnaiff amlinellu beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau yr ymgynghorir yn llawn â chymunedau lleol?

**John Griffiths:** Rwy'n cytuno'n llwyr â'r Aelod bod yn rhaid i gymunedau lleol chwarae rhan flaenllaw yn ein system gynllunio. Dyna pam mai'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol a'r awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yw sail ein system gynllunio yng Nghymru. Mae rhai syniadau diddorol yn adroddiad y grŵp cynghori annibynnol am gyfranogiad cynghorau tref a chymuned, er enghraifft, a sut y gallent lunio eu cynlluniau lleol eu hunain, a fyddai'n llywio canllawiau cynllunio atodol. Mae'r rheini ymhlith rhai o'r syniadau sy'n cael eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd. Rwy'n sicr yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i gymunedau lleol barhau wrth wraidd ein system gynllunio.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The Government is preparing a new planning Bill that will, hopefully, show a better and more contemporary approach to planning. However, the Planning Inspectorate continues to be an England and Wales body and an arm's-length body, allegedly. Is it not high time for this body, too, to be based in Wales, becoming a part of the exciting new developments in this field in Wales?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym bob amser yn ystyried datblygiadau yn unol â datganoli er mwyn creu gwell adnodd yng Nghymru. Rydym yn barod i ystyried unrhyw syniadau fel gweinyddiaeth. Credwn fod Arolygiaeth Gynllunio Cymru a Lloegr wedi gwasanaethu Cymru'n dda a'i bod yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae sawl enghraifft o rannu profiad ac arbenigedd, sydd o fudd i Gymru.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** A oes gan y Gweinidog gynlluniau ar gyfer rôl a pherfformiad parciau cenedlaethol yn y system gynllunio? Os felly, beth yw'r amserlen ar gyfer y gwaith hwnnw?

**John Griffiths:** Yn ddiweddarach eleni,

receive the results of work that we commissioned on the role of the national parks in planning in Wales, and I look forward to informing Members of the results of that work.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 5, OAQ(4)0171(ESD), is not asked.

### Y Corff Adnoddau Naturiol Newydd

**6. Elin Jones:** *Beth fydd blaenoriaethau'r Corff Adnoddau Naturiol Cymru newydd. OAQ(4)0163(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Bydd y corff yn rheoli ein hadnoddau naturiol i sicrhau lles amgylcheddol Cymru yn y tymor hir. Bydd pwyslais clir ar gyflawni drwy ddarparu gwasanaethau pwysig i fusnesau, ynghyd â ffocws ar gefnogi ecosystemau amrywiol a chadarn sy'n arwain at fanteision economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol i ni heddiw ac i genedlaethau'r dyfodol.

**Elin Jones:** Gwnaethoch ddweud yn eich ateb i Llyr Huws Gruffydd ynghynt y byddech yn enwi ac yn penodi aelodau'r corff newydd hwn yr wythnos nesaf. A wnewch chi roi cyfrifoldeb penodol i rai aelodau'r bwrdd i fod yn bencampwyr dros feysydd penodol, fel pysgota, er enghraifft? Mae rhai pysgotwyr wedi mynegi consŷrn i mi y byddai eu maes diddordeb hwy o bosibl yn mynd ar goll o fewn corff mawr newydd fel y corff adnoddau naturiol. Felly, byddai rhoi cyfrifoldeb penodol i aelodau bwrdd unigol yn fodd o sicrhau llais clir dros rai o'r materion pwysig hyn.

**John Griffiths:** There is much to commend that approach. In the initial discussions that I have with Peter Matthews, as chair of the single body, we discussed the possibility of allocating particular responsibilities to board members, and he was supportive of that approach. However, in these initial stages, without the board in place, it would be a little premature to make any definitive statements on that because, obviously, the new board, the newly appointed chief executive and the chair will want to discuss these matters before we make any final decisions.

rydym yn disgwyl cael canlyniadau gwaith a gomisiynwyd gennym ar rôl y parciau cenedlaethol o ran cynllunio yng Nghymru, ac edrychaf ymlaen at hysbysu'r Aelodau o ganlyniadau'r gwaith hwnnw.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni ofynnir cwestiwn 5, OAQ(4)0171(ADC).

### The New Natural Resources Body

**6. Elin Jones:** *What will be the priorities of the new Natural Resources Body for Wales. OAQ(4)0163(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** The body will manage our natural resources to ensure Wales's long-term environmental wellbeing. It will have a clear emphasis on delivery by providing business-critical services coupled with a focus on supporting diverse and resilient ecosystems that deliver economic, environmental and social benefits now and for future generations.

**Elin Jones:** You said in response to Llyr Huws Gruffydd earlier that you would name and appoint the members of this new body next week. Will you give some board members the specific responsibility of being champions for particular areas, such as fishing, for example? Some anglers have expressed their concerns to me that their area of interest could get lost within a large new body such as the natural resources body. Therefore, giving individual board members specific responsibilities would be a way of ensuring a strong voice for some of these important issues.

**John Griffiths:** Gellir canmol y dull hwnnw am sawl rheswm. Yn y trafodaethau cychwynnol a gefais gyda Peter Matthews, fel cadeirydd y corff sengl, gwnaethom drafod y posibilrwydd o ddyrannu cyfrifoldebau penodol i aelodau'r bwrdd, ac roedd o blaid y dull hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfnodau cychwynnol hyn, heb fod y bwrdd wedi'i sefydlu, byddai braidd yn gynnar gwneud unrhyw ddatganiadau pendant ynglŷn â hynny oherwydd, yn amlwg, bydd y bwrdd newydd, y prif weithredwr newydd a gaiff ei benodi a'r cadeirydd am drafod y materion hyn cyn inni wneud unrhyw benderfyniadau terfynol.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Minister, your Government has set aside £74 million for the new computer system for the currently named 'natural resources body', which is £4 million more than the upper estimate that the consultants, Gartner UK Ltd, recommended. Given the Government's track record with large IT projects, there are concerns that, even at this early stage, spending is already running over budget. Can you confirm whether the IT costs are running over budget and whether the pilot scheme recommended by Gartner, given the levels of unknowns present with the IT contract, has been put in place?

**John Griffiths:** I can assure Antoinette Sandbach and Members in general that the costs of the IT systems and IT transition are within the contingencies that we have set for the creation of the single body and that transitional process.

#### Ansawdd Aer

**7. David Melding:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ansawdd aer yng Nghanol De Cymru. OAQ(4)0172(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Controlling air pollution in Wales is a key objective for the Welsh Government. We are committed to tackling the sources of pollution and ensuring people's right to clean air. Our air is cleaner than it has been at any time since the industrial revolution, but we continue to work towards further improvements.

**David Melding:** Thank you for that, Minister. You will know that transport causes most exposure to harmful air pollutants, and local authorities are key players in developing processes that can help to lower or prevent that. If we move to city regions, do you believe, as I do, that that should enable us to have a good look at transport, particularly in congested areas, and allow a joint approach between local authorities to provide more public transport but also more urbanisation, or more pedestrianisation in urban areas, so that we can enjoy our cities to the full?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Weinidog, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi neilltuo £74 miliwn ar gyfer system gyfrifiadurol newydd y 'corff adnoddau naturiol', fel y'i gelwir ar hyn o bryd, sydd £4 miliwn yn fwy na'r amcangyfrif uchaf a argymhellwyd gan yr ymgynghorwyr, Gartner UK Ltd. O ystyried record y Llywodraeth o ran prosiectau TG mawr, mae pryderon, hyd yn oed yn ystod y cyfnod cynnar hwn, fod gwariant eisoes yn fwy na'r gyllideb. A allwch gadarnhau pa un a yw'r costau TG yn fwy na'r gyllideb ac a yw'r cynllun peilot a argymhellwyd gan Gartner, o ystyried lefelau'r ffactorau anhysbys sy'n gysylltiedig â'r contract TG, wedi cael ei roi ar waith?

**John Griffiths:** Gallaf sicrhau Antoinette Sandbach a'r Aelodau yn gyffredinol bod costau'r systemau TG a'r broses o bontio TG o fewn y symiau wrth gefn a bennwyd gennym ar gyfer creu'r corff sengl a'r broses drosiannol honno.

#### Air Quality

**7. David Melding:** *Will the Minister make a statement on air quality in South Wales Central. OAQ(4)0172(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Mae rheoli llygredd aer yng Nghymru yn un o amcanion allweddol Llywodraeth Cymru. Rydym yn ymrwymedig i fynd i'r afael â ffynonellau llygredd a sicrhau hawl pobl i aer glân. Mae ein haer yn lanach nag y bu ar unrhyw adeg ers y chwyldro diwydiannol, ond rydym yn parhau i weithio tuag at welliannau pellach.

**David Melding:** Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. Byddwch yn gwybod mai trafndiaeth sy'n achosi'r lefel uchaf o amlygiad i lygryddion aer niweidiol, ac mae awdurdodau lleol yn chwarae rhan allweddol wrth ddatblygu prosesau a all helpu i leihau neu atal hynny. Os byddwn yn symud i ddinas-ranbarthau, a gredwch chithau, fel y credaf innau, y dylai hynny ein galluogi i roi ystyriaeth ofalus i drafndiaeth, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd prysur, a hwyluso cydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu mwy o drafndiaeth gyhoeddus, ond hefyd mwy o gynlluniau trefoli, neu fwy o ardaloedd i gerddwyr mewn ardaloedd trefol,

fel y gallwn fwynhau ein dinasoedd i'r eithaf?

**John Griffiths:** I thank David Melding for his question and supplementary question, and I agree that it is very important that we have a good-quality environment in urban areas, towns and city centres, and that includes the air in those areas. I am interested in working with my colleagues, the Minister for business and the Minister for transport, on these matters, particularly in looking at the environmental issues that might be taken forward as part of the city region approach. Having heard the Member's question, I will address the air-quality issues and the issues that he mentioned in general as part of those discussions.

**The Leader of Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood):** The latest figures from the Department of Energy and Climate Change show that carbon emissions per person rose in the Vale of Glamorgan and in Rhondda Cynon Taf between 2009 and 2010. In the Vale of Glamorgan, it was a rise of 0.6 tonnes per person and in Rhondda Cynon Taf, it was 0.3 tonnes. The main source of Wales's greenhouse gas emissions in 2010 was the energy sector, accounting for 36%. A Plaid Cymru Government would call for the devolution of all energy consenting powers to Wales, and we would ensure that the people of Wales would have a say and benefit from large-scale energy projects. What steps is the Welsh Government taking to ensure that it meets its target of reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 3% a year, please?

**John Griffiths:** We report regularly on our progress against the 3% target and, broadly speaking, at the moment, that progress is encouraging. Where there are difficulties in particular areas of Wales, we work with those local areas, including the local authorities, and the local authorities are addressing sustainable development through their local plans and policies. The First Minister has set out in 'Energy Wales' our ambitions for renewable energy and clean energy, which include community benefit and greater control in Wales of our energy destiny.

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i David Melding am ei gwestiwn a'i gwestiwn atodol, a chytunaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn sicrhau amgylchedd o ansawdd da mewn ardaloedd trefol, trefi a chanol dinasoedd, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys yr aer yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Hoffwn weithio gyda'm cyd-Aelodau, y Trefnydd a'r Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth, ar y materion hyn, yn enwedig er mwyn ystyried y materion amgylcheddol y gellid eu rhoi ar waith fel rhan o'r dull gweithredu ar sail dinas-ranbarthau. Ar ôl clywed cwestiwn yr Aelod, ymdriniaf â'r materion o ran ansawdd aer a'r materion y soniodd amdanynt yn gyffredinol fel rhan o'r trafodaethau hynny.

**Arweinydd Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood):** Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf gan yr Adran Ynni a Newid yn yr Hinsawdd yn dangos bod allyriadau carbon y person ym Mro Morgannwg ac yn Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi cynyddu rhwng 2009 a 2010. Ym Mro Morgannwg, cafwyd cynnydd o 0.6 tonnell y person ac yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, roedd yn gynydd o 0.3 tonnell. Y sector ynni oedd y brif ffynhonnell allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru yn 2010, yn cyfrif am 36%. Byddai Llywodraeth Plaid Cymru yn galw am i'r holl bwerau cydsynio mewn perthynas ag ynni gael eu datganoli i Gymru, a byddem yn sicrhau y byddai pobl Cymru yn cael dweud eu dweud ac y byddai prosiectau ynni mawr o fudd iddynt. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i sicrhau ei bod yn cyrraedd ei tharged o leihau allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr 3% y flwyddyn?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym yn cyflwyno adroddiadau rheolaidd ar ein cynnydd yn erbyn y targed o 3%, ac, yn fras, ar hyn o bryd, mae'r cynnydd hwnnw yn galonogol. Lle ceir anawsterau mewn ardaloedd penodol o Gymru, rydym yn gweithio gyda'r ardaloedd lleol hynny, gan gynnwys yr awdurdodau lleol, ac mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn ymdrin â datblygu cynaliadwy drwy eu cynlluniau a'u polisiau lleol. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi nodi ein huchelgeisiau ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy ac ynni glân yn 'Ynni Cymru', gan gynnwys buddiannau cymunedol a mwy o reolaeth yng Nghymru dros ein tynged o ran ynni.

**Eluned Parrott:** The delicate issue of incineration and its impact on air quality concerns many people in South Wales Central. Proposals for an incinerator in Splott are contentious and have become, as I understand it, a cause of dispute in Cardiff Council's ruling group. At what point can local residents expect to know whether this incinerator will be built?

**Eluned Parrott:** Mae llosgi, a'i effaith ar ansawdd aer yn fater sensitif ac yn peri pryder i lawer o bobl yng Nghanol De Cymru. Mae'r cynigion ar gyfer llosgydd yn Sblot yn ddadleuol ac, fel y deallaf, wedi achosi anghydfod o fewn grŵp llywodraethu Cyngor Caerdydd. Pryd y gall trigolion lleol ddisgwyl cael gwybod a gaiff y llosgydd hwn ei adeiladu?

2.00 p.m.

**John Griffiths:** I am not able to comment on any particular proposal, given my responsibility for planning and other responsibilities as Minister. I can say in general, when it comes to air quality issues and energy-from-waste plants, that they do require permits, which are considered and granted, or not, by the Environment Agency in accordance with the applicable European directive.

**John Griffiths:** Ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar unrhyw gynnig penodol, o gofio fy nghyfrifoldeb dros gynllunio a'm cyfrifoldebau eraill fel Gweinidog. Gallaf ddweud yn gyffredinol, o ran materion ansawdd aer a safleoedd ynni-o-wastraff, bod angen caniatadau arnynt, a gaiff eu hystyried a'u rhoi, neu eu gwrthod, gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn unol â'r gyfarwydddeb Ewropeaidd berthnasol.

#### **Blaenoriaethau Iechyd a Lles Anifeiliaid**

#### **Priorities for Animal Health and Welfare**

**8. Antoinette Sandbach:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer iechyd a lles anifeiliaid. OAQ(4)0175(ESD)*

**8. Antoinette Sandbach:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's priorities for animal health and welfare. OAQ(4)0175(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Animal health and welfare priorities include the eradication of bovine TB, ensuring that contingency measures are in place to prevent and manage the incursion of disease outbreaks, and taking forward a range of measures on the welfare of dogs.

**John Griffiths:** Mae blaenoriaethau iechyd a lles anifeiliaid yn cynnwys dileu TB mewn gwartheg, gan sicrhau bod mesurau wrth gefn ar waith i atal a rheoli achosion o glefydau, a bwrw ati ag ystod o fesurau ar les cŵn.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** The outcome of your Government's consultation on the welfare of animals at the time of killing will be of great interest to those who care about the health and welfare of farm animals. While I appreciate that you may not wish to comment on the specific matters within the consultation before it is closed, would you agree with the position of the British Veterinary Association that if slaughter without stunning is to be permitted after this directive is implemented, any meat produced by this method should be clearly marked as such so that consumers can fully understand the choice that they make when they are purchasing it/ Would you also agree that the number of animals killed in a non-humane

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Bydd canlyniad ymgynghoriad eich Llywodraeth ar les anifeiliaid adeg eu lladd o ddiddordeb mawr i'r rhai sy'n pryderu am iechyd a lles anifeiliaid fferm. Er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi na fyddwch o bosibl yn awyddus i wneud sylwadau ar y materion penodol o fewn yr ymgynghoriad cyn iddo ddod i ben, a fydech yn cytuno â safbwynt y Gymdeithas Filfeddygol Brydeinig, os caniateir i anifeiliaid gael eu lladd heb eu stynio ar ôl i'r gyfarwydddeb hon gael ei rhoi ar waith, y dylid nodi'n glir ar unrhyw gig a gynhyrchir gan ddefnyddio'r dull hwn mai dyma'r dull a ddefnyddiwyd, er mwyn i ddefnyddwyr allu deall yn llawn y dewis y maent yn ei wneud pan fyddant yn ei brynu.



way, without stunning, should be proportionate to actual consumer demand?

**John Griffiths:** I would not want to pre-empt the consultation exercise in any way, as the Member recognises. However, I can say that, in terms of animal welfare, the Welsh Government is concerned about the practice of slaughter without stunning. That is why we have posed a particular question as part of the general exercise in taking forward policy on these matters, and we await the responses with great interest.

**Julie Morgan:** Can the Minister tell us when the proposed consultation on the control of dogs will be published? In the meantime, will the Minister agree that putting victims first in this context requires a coherent and self-contained legal framework that promotes responsible dog ownership along the lines of what has been done in Scotland and Northern Ireland, rather than the piecemeal reforms that are coming from Westminster?

**John Griffiths:** I thank Julie Morgan for that question. I very much agree. We do wish to have a system in place in Wales that deals with these dog control issues from an animal welfare point of view. The Scottish model is interesting and informative for us. I hope to have a Bill out for consultation later this year.

**Vaughan Gething:** The Minister will be aware that there is an exemption in the tail docking regulations for working breed dogs, although that means that whole litters of puppies have their tails docked soon after birth. Is the Minister aware of studies undertaken in other European jurisdictions that suggest that many hundreds, if not thousands, of tails are needlessly docked to save one injury to the tail of a working dog, and will he consider having a veterinary science-led review to consider whether the current exemptions for working dogs in Wales are, in fact, a proportionate means of achieving a real unnecessary objective?

A fyddech hefyd yn cytuno y dylai nifer yr anifeiliaid a gaiff eu lladd mewn ffordd anhrugarog, heb eu stynio, fod yn gymesur â'r galw gwirioneddol gan ddefnyddwyr?

**John Griffiths:** Ni fyddwn am achub y blaen ar yr ymgynghoriad mewn unrhyw ffordd, fel y cydnabu'r Aelod. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud, o ran lles anifeiliaid, bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn pryderu am yr arfer o ladd heb stynio. Dyna pam y gofynnwyd cwestiwn penodol gennym fel rhan o'r ymarfer cyffredinol wrth ddatblygu polisi ar y materion hyn, a bydd yn ddiddorol iawn gweld yr ymatebion.

**Julie Morgan:** A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pryd y bydd yr ymgynghoriad arfaethedig ar reoli cŵn yn cael ei gyhoeddi? Yn y cyfamser, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno, er mwyn rhoi dioddefwyr yn gyntaf yn y cyd-destun hwn, fod angen fframwaith cyfreithiol cydlynol ac hunangynhwysol sy'n annog perchenogion cŵn i fod yn gyfrifol, yn debyg i'r hyn a gyflwynwyd yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, yn hytrach na'r diwygiadau tameidiog sy'n dod o San Steffan?

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Julie Morgan am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Cytunaf yn llwyr. Rydym am roi system ar waith yng Nghymru sy'n ymdrin â'r materion hyn o ran rheoli cŵn o safbwynt lles anifeiliaid. Mae model yr Alban yn ddiddorol ac yn rhoi llawer o wybodaeth inni. Rwy'n gobeithio cyflwyno Bil i ymgynghori arno yn nes ymlaen eleni.

**Vaughan Gething:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod yna eithriad yn y rheoliadau tocio cynffonau ar gyfer cŵn gwaith, er bod hynny'n golygu bod cynffonau torllwythi cyfan o gŵn bach yn cael eu tocio yn fuan ar ôl eu geni. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r astudiaethau a gynhaliwyd mewn awdurdodaethau eraill yn Ewrop sy'n awgrymu bod cannoedd lawer, os nad miloedd, o gynffonau yn cael eu tocio'n ddiangen er mwyn atal un anaf i gynffon ci gwaith, ac a wnaiff ystyried cynnal adolygiad gwyddonol milfeddygol i ystyried a yw'r eithriadau presennol ar gyfer cŵn gwaith yng Nghymru, mewn gwirionedd, yn ddull cymesur o gyflawni amcan sydd mewn gwirionedd yn ddiangen?

**John Griffiths:** I thank Vaughan Gething for that question. We follow studies and research on these matters with great interest, as I am sure the Member would expect. Uppermost in our minds in that regard is work currently being carried out by the Glasgow veterinary school, which we expect to publish next year. That work has been commissioned by the Scottish Government, and we will carefully consider it, when it is available, to decide how we move forward on these matters.

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Vaughan Gething am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rydym yn dilyn astudiaethau ac ymchwil ar y materion hyn gyda diddordeb brwd, fel y byddai'r Aelod yn ei ddisgwyl, rwy'n siŵr. Yn hynny o beth, rydym yn rhoi sylw penodol i waith sy'n mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd gan ysgol filfeddygol Glasgow, y disgwylir iddo gyhoeddi adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf. Comisiynwyd y gwaith hwnnw gan Lywodraeth yr Alban, a byddwn yn ei ystyried yn ofalus, pan fydd ar gael, er mwyn penderfynu sut i weithredu ar y materion hyn.

### Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy

**9. Russell George:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effeithiau polisi ynni adnewyddadwy Llywodraeth Cymru ar bobl canolbarth Cymru. OAQ(4)0173(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank Russell George for that question. Decisions on large schemes are the responsibility of the UK Government. Our low carbon policies support the modern, reliable energy infrastructure needed for the businesses and communities of mid Wales. We are committed to the development of renewable energy in ways that deliver sustainable economic growth, job creation and maximum community benefit.

**Russell George:** People in my constituency who are against the proliferation of windfarms in mid Wales are very concerned about an infrastructure planning conference that is to take place in Cardiff on 29 November. The conference seems heavily focused on one source of renewable energy with the aim of coaching developers in successfully navigating the planning system to force onshore windfarms on Welsh communities. This view is highlighted by a session to be led by the national grid's lead for the mid Wales electricity connection project on 'Dealing with opposition'—the title of that part of the conference. Should my constituents be concerned, and how much in the way of resources is the Welsh Government investing in this conference?

**John Griffiths:** I think that it is quite clear

### Renewable Energy Policy

**9. Russell George:** *Will the Minister make a statement regarding the effects of the Welsh Government's renewable energy policy on the people of mid Wales. OAQ(4)0173(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Russell George am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Llywodraeth y DU sy'n gyfrifol am benderfyniadau ar gynlluniau mawr. Mae ein polisiau carbon isel yn cefnogi'r seilwaith ynni dibynadwy, modern sydd ei angen ar fusnesau a chymunedau canolbarth Cymru. Rydym yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy mewn ffyrdd sy'n sicrhau twf economaidd cynaliadwy, swyddi newydd a'r budd mwyaf i'r gymuned.

**Russell George:** Mae pobl yn fy etholaeth sydd yn erbyn nifer y ffermydd gwynt yn y canolbarth, yn bryderus iawn am y gynhadledd cynllunio seilwaith sy'n cael ei chynnal yng Nghaerdydd ar 29 Tachwedd. Ymddengys fod y gynhadledd yn canolbwyntio i raddau helaeth iawn ar un ffynhonnell o ynni adnewyddadwy gyda'r nod o hyfforddi datblygwyr i lywio eu ffordd drwy'r system gynllunio yn llwyddiannus er mwyn gorfodi ffermydd gwynt ar y tir ar gymunedau yng Nghymru. Amlygir y farn hon gan sesiwn a gaiff ei harwain gan arweinydd y grid cenedlaethol ar gyfer prosiect cysylltiadau trydan y canolbarth ar 'Ymdrin â gwrthwynebiad'—sef teitl y rhan honno o'r gynhadledd. A ddylai fy etholwyr fod yn bryderus, a faint o adnoddau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu buddsoddi yn y gynhadledd hon?

**John Griffiths:** Credaf ei bod yn eithaf

that Welsh Government policy is to take forward a range of renewable energy options for very good reasons: to meet targets that we have set; to meet the challenges of climate change; to ensure that the lights stay on; and to ensure that we have affordable energy for our people and businesses. We know that wind, and onshore wind in particular, is the most ready to go, as it were, as a renewable energy source, so it is absolutely right that we work with a range of partners to take forward those renewable energy policies, including addressing issues around the planning system.

**Simon Thomas:** Tomorrow, Minister, I shall be meeting RES UK to discuss its local electricity discount scheme, which is the first to be offered in Wales that gives local people a discount on their electricity due to a local windfarm development. Do you agree with me, Minister, that this sort of development is to be welcomed, as it would help people in mid Wales to balance demands on the environment and their local landscape with an actual benefit to local communities? Also, would you urge other companies developing wind power in Wales to look at this scheme to see how they can roll it out to all communities?

**John Griffiths:** I thank Simon Thomas very much for that clear example of the important community benefit coming from renewable energy projects. The First Minister has been very clear in 'Energy Wales: A Low Carbon Transition' and elsewhere that we expect a much greater degree of community benefit from renewable energy development, including wind energy, and that, in conjunction with the industry, we expect considerable, quick progress for greater community benefit. Allied to that must be real economic benefit for businesses here in Wales and for the supply chain. So, on various fronts, we need to see improvement in the benefits that renewable energy can bring to communities, and we expect that to take place.

**Datblygu Cynaliadwy**

amlwg mai polisi Llywodraeth Cymru yw bwrw ati ag amrywiaeth o opsiynau ynni adnewyddadwy am resymau da iawn: er mwyn cyrraedd targedau a bennwyd gennym; er mwyn ymateb i heriau newid yn yr hinsawdd; er mwyn sicrhau bod digon o ynni; ac er mwyn sicrhau bod ynni fforddiadwy ar gael i'n pobl a'n busnesau. Gwyddom mai gwynt, a gwynt ar y tir yn benodol, yw'r opsiwn sydd fwyaf parod i'w roi ar waith, fel petai, fel ffynhonnell ynni adnewyddadwy, felly mae'n gwbl briodol ein bod yn gweithio gydag amrywiaeth o bartneriaid i ddatblygu'r polisiau ynni adnewyddadwy hynny, gan gynnwys ymdrin â materion sy'n gysylltiedig â'r system gynllunio.

**Simon Thomas:** Yfory, Weinidog, byddaf yn cwrdd â RES UK i drafod ei gynllun disgownt trydan lleol, sef y cynllun cyntaf o'i fath a gynigiwyd yng Nghymru sy'n rhoi disgownt i bobl leol ar eu trydan o ganlyniad i'r ffaith bod fferm wynt wedi'i datblygu'n lleol. A gytunwch â mi, Weinidog, y dylid croesawu'r math hwn o ddatblygiad, gan y byddai'n helpu pobl yn y canolbarth i gydbwysu gofynion ar yr amgylchedd a'u tirlun lleol â budd gwirioneddol i gymunedau lleol? Hefyd, a fydddech yn annog cwmnïau eraill sy'n datblygu ynni gwynt yng Nghymru i edrych ar y cynllun hwn er mwyn gweld sut y gallant ei gyflwyno i bob cymuned?

**John Griffiths:** Diolch yn fawr iawn i Simon Thomas am yr enghraifft glir honno o'r budd cymunedol pwysig sy'n gysylltiedig â phrosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi bod yn glir iawn yn 'Ynni Cymru: Newid Carbon Isel' ac mewn manau eraill ein bod yn disgwyl llawer mwy o fudd cymunedol yn sgîl datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy, gan gynnwys ynni'r gwynt ac, ar y cyd â'r diwydiant, ein bod yn disgwyl cynnydd cyflym a sylweddol er mwyn sicrhau mwy o fudd i'r gymuned. Yn gysylltiedig â hynny, rhaid sicrhau budd economaidd gwirioneddol i fusnesau yma yng Nghymru ac i'r gadwyn gyflenwi. Felly, o sawl tu, mae angen inni weld gwelliant yn y buddiannau y gall ynni adnewyddadwy eu cyflwyno i gymunedau, ac rydym yn disgwyl i hynny ddigwydd.

**Sustainable Development**

**10. Rebecca Evans:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy dros y 12 mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0179(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank Rebecca Evans for that question. My priorities are to strengthen our commitment to sustainable development by introducing a Bill to make sustainable development the central organising principle of the Welsh Government and the public sector. Within my portfolio, I will continue to promote economic, social and environmental wellbeing through my policies and programmes.

**Rebecca Evans:** Thank you, Minister. With regard to the development of renewable energy, the Welsh Government states in 'Energy Wales' that

'We expect Wales' energy developments to focus strongly on community engagement and ensure that benefits and impacts are clearly and objectively understood.'

The impacts of renewable projects are well understood, but what do you consider to be the main benefits for communities, and how are you communicating them?

**John Griffiths:** 'Energy Wales' is very important in setting out how we will have a greater degree of engagement with our communities to show the clear benefits of renewable energy projects. We very much expect developers to fulfil their critical role in clearly setting out the benefits and in delivering them, as I mentioned previously. To aid that effort, we have some important engagement strategies for our sustainable development scheme, which will also show the benefits of renewable energy.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Minister, are you aware that Chwarae Teg promotes engagement of women in the Welsh economy and has expressed concerns that women's skills are severely underutilised at present, at great cost to our economy? Will the First Minister confirm that the sustainable development Bill will encourage steps such

**10. Rebecca Evans:** *Will the Minister outline his priorities for sustainable development over the next 12 months. OAQ(4)0179(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Rebecca Evans am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Fy mlaenoriaethau yw atgyfnerthu ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy drwy gyflwyno Bil i sicrhau mai datblygu cynaliadwy yw prif egwyddor drefniadol Llywodraeth Cymru a'r sector cyhoeddus. O fewn fy mhortffolio, byddaf yn parhau i hyrwyddo lles economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol drwy fy mholisiau a'm rhaglenni.

**Rebecca Evans:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog. O ran datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy, mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn datgan y canlynol yn 'Ynni Cymru':

'Disgwyliwn i ddatblygiadau ynni yng Nghymru ganolbwyntio'n gryf ar ymgysylltu â'r gymuned a sicrhau bod y manteision a'r effeithiau yn glir ac yn wrthrychol.'

Ceir dealltwriaeth gadarn o effeithiau prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy, ond beth, yn eich barn chi, yw'r prif fuddiannau i gymunedau, a sut rydych yn cyfleu'r buddiannau hynny?

**John Griffiths:** Mae 'Ynni Cymru' yn bwysig iawn wrth nodi sut y byddwn yn ymgysylltu fwy â'n cymunedau i ddangos buddiannau amlwg prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy. Rydym yn gobeithio'n fawr y bydd datblygwyr yn cyflawni eu rôl hollbwysig wrth nodi'r buddiannau yn glir a chyflawni'r buddiannau hynny, fel y soniais o'r blaen. Er mwyn hwyluso'r ymdrech honno, mae gennym rai strategaethau ymgysylltu pwysig ar gyfer ein cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, a fydd hefyd yn dangos buddiannau ynni adnewyddadwy.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Weinidog, a ydych yn ymwybodol bod Chwarae Teg yn hyrwyddo'r rhan y gall merched ei chwarae yn economi Cymru a'i fod wedi mynegi pryderon nad yw sgiliau merched yn cael eu defnyddio ddigon o bell ffordd ar hyn o bryd, ar draul enfawr i'n heconomi? A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gadarnhau y bydd y Bil datblygu cynaliadwy

as flexible working and remote working to allow women to fully utilise their skills and maximise the benefits of a good work/life balance?

**John Griffiths:** We always frame sustainable development in terms of three prongs, which are the economy, society and the environment. We are yet to see how the sustainable development Bill will finally be framed, because obviously we have quite some process to go through. I am sure that many matters will be considered in that process, including those mentioned by the Member.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo egwyddorion a dealltwriaeth o ddatblygu cynaliadwy ymhlith y sector gyhoeddus ehangach yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, fel rhan o'r gwaith o fraenaru'r tir ar gyfer y Bil?

**John Griffiths:** We are working strongly with our key partners, for example in the local authority, so that they have their own schemes and plans in place and so that we are very much joined up in our thinking. We also have priorities within our scheme and our strategy that require us to reach out to the devolved public sector. So, around the process of the Bill, we have had much engagement along the lines that the Member suggests, and that will continue to be the case as we work up to the White Paper and Bill.

### Microgynhyrchu

**11. William Powell:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hybu microgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0164(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank William Powell for that question. Microgeneration is an important component of our transition to a sustainable, low carbon economy in Wales. It is promoted through a number of advice services, targeted at specific customer audiences, and of course the UK Government takes the lead on the incentive schemes that underpin the uptake of microgeneration technologies.

yn annog camau megis gweithio hyblyg a gweithio o bell er mwyn rhoi cyfle i ferched ddefnyddio eu sgiliau yn llawn a manteisio i'r eithaf ar gydbwysedd bywyd/gwaith da?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym bob amser yn ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy gan ddefnyddio tri ffactor, sef yr economi, cymdeithas a'r amgylchedd. Nid yw'n hysbys eto sut y caiff y Bil datblygu cynaliadwy ei gyflwyno ar ei ffurf derfynol, gan fod proses gymharol helaeth gennym i'w chyflawni. Rwy'n siŵr y caiff llawer o faterion eu hystyried fel rhan o'r broses honno, gan gynnwys y rheini a grybwyllwyd gan yr Aelod.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** What is the Welsh Government doing to promote the principles and an understanding of sustainable development among the wider public sector in Wales at present as part of the work of preparing the ground for the Bill?

**John Griffiths:** Rydym yn gweithio'n gadarn â'n partneriaid allweddol, er enghraifft yn yr awdurdod lleol, er mwyn sicrhau bod ganddynt eu cynlluniau eu hunain ar waith ac er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn anelu at yr un nodau. Mae gennym flaenoriaethau hefyd yn ein cynllun a'n strategaeth ni sy'n golygu bod angen inni estyn allan i'r sector cyhoeddus datganoledig. Felly, o ran proses y Bil, rydym wedi ymgysylltu'n helaeth yn y ffordd a awgrymwyd gan yr Aelod, a bydd hynny'n parhau wrth inni weithio tuag at y Papur Gwyn a'r Bil.

### Microgeneration

**11. William Powell:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion of micro generation in Wales. OAQ(4)0164(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i William Powell am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae microgynhyrchu yn elfen bwysig o'n proses o drawsnewid i economi carbon isel, gynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Caiff ei hyrwyddo drwy nifer o wasanaethau cynghori, wedi'u targedu at gwsmeriaid penodol, ac wrth gwrs mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi cymryd yr awenau o ran y cynlluniau cymhelliant sy'n sail i'r broses o annog pobl i ddefnyddio technolegau microgynhyrchu.

**William Powell:** I thank the Minister for that answer. A number of people from across the construction sector have recently raised concerns with me that current regulations regarding the requirement for on-site renewables in new developments can, in certain circumstances, act as a positive disincentive to development in certain locations. To that end, will you please detail what consideration has been given to the possibility of establishing a legally binding mechanism that would enable renewables projects remote from new development to actually go forward, so that there would be a more flexible approach rather than a disincentive?

**John Griffiths:** I can tell William Powell that we value flexibility in our policies and ways of working, and wherever there are ideas from industry, we are willing to consider those, and will do so. The matters that he mentions are certainly in that category. We have some important improvements in terms of microgeneration in the general support and assistance that is available for communities, and indeed through permitted development rights, but if there are further initiatives that could be taken, then we would be very happy to consider them.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Minister, there are many small hydroelectric schemes awaiting the go-ahead from the Environment Agency and the Countryside Council for Wales. I am aware that you have no influence in the planning process, but what steps will you be taking to speed up the process of getting the schemes through the consenting process?

**John Griffiths:** The single body will be very useful inasmuch as it will create a one-stop shop for the necessary consents and will have a streamlined approach that will lead to greater timeliness and efficiency. That will be useful. I know there are particular issues around hydro schemes in Wales that involve the circumstances of our rivers and waters, so it is a case of understanding those circumstances while taking forward necessary development as quickly and

**William Powell:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae nifer o bobl o bob rhan o'r sector adeiladu wedi codi pryderon yn ddiweddar gyda mi y gall y rheoliadau presennol ynghylch y gofyniad am ynni adnewyddadwy ar safleoedd lle ceir datblygiadau newydd, mewn rhai amgylchiadau, weithredu fel anghymhelliad cadarnhaol gan annog pobl i beidio â datblygu mewn lleoliadau penodol. I'r perwyl hwnnw, a nodwch pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd i'r posibilrwydd o roi system gyfreithiol rwymol ar waith a fyddai'n galluogi prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy nad ydynt yn ddatblygiadau newydd i fynd rhagddynt, er mwyn sicrhau dull gweithredu mwy hyblyg yn hytrach nag anghymhelliad?

**John Griffiths:** Gallaf ddweud wrth William Powell ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi hyblygrwydd yn ein polisiau a'n dulliau o weithio, a lle bynnag y caiff syniadau eu cyflwyno gan ddiwydiant, ein bod yn barod i'w hystyried, a byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Mae'r materion a grybwyllwyd ganddo yn sicr yn perthyn i'r categori hwnnw. Mae gennym rai gwelliannau pwysig ym maes microgynhyrchu o ran y gefnogaeth a'r cymorth cyffredinol sydd ar gael i gymunedau, ac yn wir drwy hawliau datblygu a ganiateir, ond os oes mentrau pellach y gellid eu rhoi ar waith, yna byddem yn fwy na pharod i'w hystyried.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Weinidog, mae llawer o gynlluniau hydrodrydan bach yn aros i gael eu cymeradwyo gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Rwy'n ymwybodol nad oes gennych unrhyw ddylanwad ar y broses gynllunio, ond pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i gyflymu'r broses o roi caniatâd i gynlluniau o'r fath?

**John Griffiths:** Bydd y corff sengl yn ddefnyddiol iawn yn yr ystyr y bydd yn creu siop-un-stop ar gyfer y caniatadau angenrheidiol ac yn dilyn dull gweithredu symlach a fydd yn arwain at well amseroldeb ac effeithlonrwydd. Bydd hynny'n ddefnyddiol. Gwn fod materion penodol sy'n ymwneud â chynlluniau hydro yng Nghymru o ran amgylchiadau ein hafonydd a'n dyfroedd, felly mae angen deall yr amgylchiadau hynny tra'n rhoi'r

effectively as possible.

datblygiadau angenrheidiol ar waith mor gyflym ac effeithiol â phosibl.

### Parthau Cadwraeth Morol

### Marine Conservation Zones

**12. Janet Finch-Saunders:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am Barthau Cadwraeth Morol. OAQ(4)0167(ESD)*

**12. Janet Finch-Saunders:** *Will the Minister provide an update on Marine Conservation Zones. OAQ(4)0167(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank Janet Finch-Saunders for that question. I appreciate that people want to know the next steps as soon as possible following the first stage of the consultation process, and, as I mentioned earlier, I intend making an announcement shortly.

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Janet Finch-Saunders am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rwy'n gwerthfawrogi bod pobl am wybod y camau nesaf cyn gynted â phosibl yn dilyn cam cyntaf y broses ymgynghori, ac, fel y soniais yn gynharach, rwy'n bwriadu gwneud cyhoeddiad cyn bo hir.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** The Welsh Fisherman's Association Ltd. advocates the use of adaptive co-management groups made up of the relevant local sea users, including fishermen, recreational anglers and conservation groups, to help with the governance of the new marine conservation zones. What consideration has your Government given to the desirability of such co-management groups?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Mae Cymdeithas Pysgotwyr Cymru Cyf o blaid defnyddio grwpiau cyd-reoli ymaddasol yn cynnwys unigolion perthnasol sy'n defnyddio'r môr lleol, gan gynnwys pysgotwyr, genweirwyr hamdden a grwpiau cadwraeth, er mwyn helpu i lywodraethu'r parthau cadwraeth morol newydd. Pa ystyriaeth y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'i rhoi i ddymunoldeb grwpiau cyd-reoli o'r fath?

2.15 p.m.

**John Griffiths:** I can tell the Member that there was a useful meeting here with the Welsh Fisherman's Association when it presented to Members, and I attended and spoke at that event. It is clear that the Welsh Fisherman's Association has come to the table with some interesting ideas and proposals. We very much value that engagement and any ideas that it has are ones that we will want to fully explore as we move forward.

**John Griffiths:** Gallaf hysbysu'r Aelod fod cyfarfod defnyddiol wedi'i gynnal yma gyda Chymdeithas Pysgotwyr Cymru pan wnaeth gyflwyniad i'r Aelodau, ac roeddwn yn bresennol a llefarais yn y digwyddiad hwnnw. Mae'n amlwg bod gan Gymdeithas Pysgotwyr Cymru syniadau a chynigion diddorol. Rydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r cyswllt hwnnw yn fawr iawn ac yn awyddus i ystyried unrhyw syniadau a gyflwynir ganddi yn llawn wrth inni symud ymlaen.

**Elin Jones:** Yn eich ateb i Paul Davies, rhoesoch argraff go glir y byddech yn gwneud datganiad ar sut y byddwch yn symud ymlaen â chamau 2 a 3 yr ymgynghori ar barthau gwarchod morol. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn awgrymu cyfeiriad arall i chi, sef i beidio â symud ymlaen gyda chamau 2 a 3, ond yn hytrach i weithio gyda Chymdeithas Pysgotwyr Cymru ar ei chynllun a'i chynnig ar reolaeth ecosystem o'n moroedd.

**Elin Jones:** In your response to Paul Davies, you gave a clear impression that you will be making a statement on how you will be moving forward with phases 2 and 3 of the consultation on the marine conservation zones. However, I want to suggest to you another direction, which is not to proceed with phases 2 and 3, but to work with the Wales Fisherman's Association on its scheme and its proposal on the ecosystem management of our seas.

**John Griffiths:** I must say to Elin Jones that I believe that the Welsh Fisherman's Association document will be very much part of moving forward with phases 2 and 3. We have mapped out a three-stage consultation process, which allows for what I think is termed an iterative process of us listening to ideas, responding to them and then having a further response from all interested parties, very much including the Welsh Fisherman's Association.

**John Griffiths:** Rhaid imi ddweud wrth Elin Jones fy mod o'r farn y bydd dogfen Cymdeithas Pysgotwyr Cymru yn rhan bwysig iawn o'r broses o symud ymlaen â chamau 2 a 3. Rydym wedi mapio proses ymgynghori tri cham, sy'n caniatáu ar gyfer yr hyn a elwir, credaf, yn broses iterus lle y byddwn ni'n gwrandao ar syniadau, yn ymateb iddynt ac wedyn yn cael ymateb pellach gan bawb sydd â diddordeb, a bydd gan Gymdeithas Pysgotwyr Cymru ran fawr i'w chwarae yn y broses honno.

### Effeithlonrwydd Ynni

**13. Aled Roberts:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y trafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gydag awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ynghylch effeithlonrwydd ynni a lleihau carbon. OAQ(4)0178(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Yn ddiweddar, trafodwyd nifer o bynciau gydag awdurdodau lleol ynghylch defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon a lleihau carbon. Roedd y trafodaethau diweddaraf yn cynnwys pynciau fel targedau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, datblygu cynaliadwy, y fargen werdd, y rhwymedigaeth cwmnïau ynni newydd, Arbed a pharhau i ddatblygu gwaith cynllunio lleihau carbon.

**Aled Roberts:** I am sure that we are all pleased that discussions are ongoing, but, Minister, the Welsh Local Government Association's evaluation report on 'Changing Climate: Changing Places' in 2011 indicated that there was a need for real action, as did the follow-on report. I am sure that you are aware that the PricewaterhouseCoopers report in January of this year indicated that there was a difference in England, where the localism agenda meant that powers were being transferred, and that there was a real need for action by the Welsh Government. Are you expecting to bring forward any proposals in the short term?

**John Griffiths:** We have a very good record of working with local authorities in Wales on energy efficiency and carbon reduction, and Arbed is a prime example of that. We all await with great interest the detail on the green deal and how that will complement those efforts. We certainly intend to move

### Energy Efficiency

**13. Aled Roberts:** *Will the Minister make a statement on discussions he has had with local authorities in Wales regarding energy efficiency and carbon reduction. OAQ(4)0178(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Recent discussions with local authorities have covered a number of topics relating to energy efficiency and carbon reduction. The most recent discussions have included topics such as the climate change targets, sustainable development, green deal, the new energy company obligation, Arbed and the continuing development of carbon reduction planning.

**Aled Roberts:** Rwy'n siŵr bod pob un ohonom yn falch fod trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt, ond, Weinidog, nododd adroddiad gwerthuso Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar 'Newid Hinsawdd: Newid Lleoedd' yn 2011 bod angen gweithredu gwirioneddol, fel y gwnaeth yr adroddiad dilynol. Rwy'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers ym mis Ionawr eleni wedi nodi bod gwahaniaeth yn Lloegr, lle roedd yr agenda lleoliaeth yn golygu bod pwerau yn cael eu trosglwyddo, a bod gwir angen i Lywodraeth Cymru weithredu. A ydych yn disgwyl cyflwyno unrhyw gynigion yn y byrdymor?

**John Griffiths:** Mae gennym hanes da iawn o weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ar effeithlonrwydd ynni a lleihau carbon, ac mae Arbed yn enghraifft amlwg o hynny. Bydd pob un ohonom yn awyddus i glywed manylion y fargen werdd a sut y bydd yn ategu'r ymdrechion hynny. Yn sicr, rydym



forward together—the Welsh Government and local authorities in Wales, along with a range of other partners—to make further progress, building on what we have already done regarding energy efficiency and carbon reduction.

**The Presiding Officer:** The next question is from Jenny Randerson—sorry, Jenny Rathbone. I beg your pardon, Jenny.

**Jenny Rathbone:** I am going to have to get a little tin so that I can collect money for charity. [*Laughter.*]

### Prisiau Ynni Domestig

**14. Jenny Rathbone:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r cynnydd mewn prisiau ynni domestig. OAQ(4)0168(ESD)

**John Griffiths:** I thank Jenny Rathbone for that question. [*Laughter.*] The matter of energy is reserved, so the Welsh Government is limited in the action that it can take to combat rising prices. However, through our Nest scheme, we are helping householders to reduce their fuel bills by providing advice on saving energy, switching tariffs and improving the energy efficiency of their homes.

**Jenny Rathbone:** That is excellent, Minister. I want to commend to you a project that was launched by Oldham Council called Power to the People, which is a collective energy-switching scheme, which is going to benefit all households with up to £150 and will include people on pay-as-you-go schemes. That scheme will have an effect on the terrible impact of rising energy bills. What can the Welsh Government do to encourage local authorities, or third sector organisations, to develop the Oldham energy co-operative model, which would be so beneficial to our communities?

**John Griffiths:** I thank the Member for her supplementary question, because these matters are uppermost in many minds in households in Wales at the moment, for obvious reasons, and will continue to be so for quite some time, unfortunately. In the

yn bwriadu symud ymlaen gyda'n gilydd—Llywodraeth Cymru a'r awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, ynghyd ag ystod o bartneriaid eraill—i wneud cynnydd pellach, gan adeiladu ar yr hyn rydym wedi'i wneud eisoes o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni a lleihau carbon.

**Y Llywydd:** Daw'r cwestiwn nesaf gan Jenny Randerson—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Jenny Rathbone. Ymddiheuriadau, Jenny.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Bydd yn rhaid imi gael tun bach er mwyn gallu casglu arian i elusen. [*Chwerthin.*]

### Domestic Energy Prices

**14. Jenny Rathbone:** What is the Welsh Government doing to combat rising domestic energy prices. OAQ(4)0168(ESD)

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Jenny Rathbone am y cwestiwn hwnnw. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae ynni yn fater a gadwyd yn ôl, felly mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i chyfyngu o ran y camau y gall eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r cynnydd mewn prisiau. Fodd bynnag, drwy ein cynllun Nyth, rydym yn helpu deiliaid tai i leihau eu biliau tanwydd drwy roi cyngor ar arbed ynni, newid tariffau a gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni eu cartrefi.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Mae hynny'n wych, Weinidog. Rwyf am argymhell prosiect ichi a lanswyd gan Gyngor Oldham o'r enw 'Power to the People', sef cynllun newid ynni ar y cyd, a fydd o fudd i bob cartref gan arbed hyd at £150 iddynt, gan gynnwys pobl ar gynlluniau talu-wrth-ddefnyddio. Bydd y cynllun hwnnw yn cael dylanwad o ran effaith ofnadwy'r cynnydd mewn biliau ynni. Beth all Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud i annog awdurdodau lleol, neu sefydliadau'r trydydd sector, i ddatblygu model ynni cydweithredol Oldham, a fyddai mor fuddiol i'n cymunedau?

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei chwestiwn atodol, gan fod y materion hyn yn flaenllaw ym meddyliau llawer o deuluoedd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, am resymau amlwg, a byddant yn parhau felly am beth amser, yn anffodus. Mae'r Blaid Lafur yn

Labour Party in the Welsh Government, we are very keen on collectivism. We have been discussing with local authorities how there could be a coming together within communities to switch suppliers and get a considerably better deal. Following the Member's question, we will step up those efforts to engage with local authorities, and potentially other organisations in Wales, to see what can be done to progress that thinking and that action at such a difficult time for so many people.

### Ynni Adnewyddadwy

**15. Simon Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynllunio ym maes ynni adnewyddadwy. OAQ(4)0180(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** I thank Simon Thomas for that question.

Rwy'n benderfynol bod rhaid i'r system gynllunio hwyluso datblygiad ynni adnewyddadwy priodol ac rwy'n gwbl ymroddedig o hyd i'n polisiau, fel y gwelir yn 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' a nodyn cyngor technegol 8.

**Simon Thomas:** Weinidog, diolch am yr ateb a'r cyfeiriad at y bytholwyrdd nodyn cyngor technegol 8.

Rydych wedi cadarnhau yn ystod y cwestiynau heddiw mai eich bwriad chi a'r Prif Weinidog yw chwilio am ddatganoli llawn ym maes ynni adnewyddadwy. Pa gamau mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i adeiladu'r achos dros hynny? A fyddwch yn cyflwyno achos busnes i'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, ac a fyddwch yn chwilio am gyfle i newid deddfwriaeth yn San Steffan i hwyluso hynny ac i sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd yng nghyfnod y Cynulliad presennol?

**John Griffiths:** I thank Simon Thomas for his questions. The First Minister has made it crystal clear through 'Energy Wales' and important statements that he has made that the Welsh Government seeks much greater power to shape the energy system in Wales. That is a priority for the entire Welsh Government. We will take whatever steps are necessary to further those ambitions.

Llywodraeth Cymru yn hoff iawn o gyfunoliaeth. Rydym wedi bod yn trafod gyda'r awdurdodau lleol sut y gallai cymunedau ddod at ei gilydd i newid cyflenwyr a chael bargaen gryn dipyn yn well. Yn dilyn cwestiwn yr Aelod, byddwn yn cynyddu'r ymdrechion hynny i ymgysylltu ag awdurdodau lleol, ac o bosibl sefydliadau eraill yng Nghymru, i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i ddatblygu'r ffordd honno o feddwl a gweithredu ar adeg mor anodd i gynifer o bobl.

### Renewable Energy

**15. Simon Thomas:** *Will the Minister make a statement on planning in relation to renewable energy. OAQ(4)0180(ESD)*

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Simon Thomas am y cwestiwn hwnnw.

I am determined that the planning system facilitates the development of appropriate renewable energy and remain fully committed to our policies as set out in 'Planning Policy Wales' and technical advice note 8

**Simon Thomas:** Thank you, Minister, for that reply and for the reference to the ever-green technical advice note 8.

You have confirmed during today's questions that you and the First Minister intend to seek full devolution of renewable energy. What steps is the Government taking to build the case for that? Will you be presenting a business case to the Westminster Government, and will you be seeking the opportunity to change legislation in Westminster in order to facilitate that and to ensure that it happens during the lifetime of the current Assembly?

**John Griffiths:** Diolch i Simon Thomas am ei gwestiynau. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi datgan yn hollol glir drwy 'Ynni Cymru' a datganiadau pwysig a wnaed ganddo fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn awyddus i gael llawer mwy o bŵer i lunio'r system ynni yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru gyfan. Byddwn yn cymryd pa bynnag gamau sydd eu hangen i

hyrwyddo'r dyheadau hynny.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth Questions to the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage

### Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y Sector Tai

*1. Mike Hedges: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y sector tai yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0164(HRH)*

**The Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage (Huw Lewis):** I thank the Member for Swansea East. My priorities are set out in my White Paper. They are increasing housing supply, improving the quality of existing homes and improving housing services. I was very encouraged by the overall support for our proposals thus far. The responses are being considered in detail and will inform our legislative and non-legislative action.

**Mike Hedges:** I thank the Minister for his response. There is a substantial and growing demand for housing in Wales. Can the Minister indicate what action he has taken to increase the number of properties being either renovated or built by housing associations?

**Huw Lewis:** Yes, we are working hard to keep those efforts at a maximum. I continue to support, for instance, the social housing grant programme and have supported an additional £6 million of funding for the Welsh housing partnership, which was obtained from centrally retained capital funding. My officials are working with the housing sector to introduce a new social housing revenue grant that will provide around 1,000 new affordable homes. On renovation, my empty homes strategy, Houses into Homes, is in its very early days, but current figures show a 13% increase on previous figures for the conversion of empty properties into liveable homes. Those figures mean that, for the first two years of this Welsh Government, over 2,000 properties have been brought back into use and we are well on track to beat the 5,000 properties target that I set.

### Priorities for the Housing Sector

*1. Mike Hedges: Will the Minister outline his priorities for the housing sector in Wales. OAQ(4)0164(HRH)*

**Y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth (Huw Lewis):** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ddwyrain Abertawe. Mae fy mlaenoriaethau wedi'u nodi yn fy Mhapur Gwyn. Fy mlaenoriaethau yw cynyddu'r cyflenwad tai, gwella ansawdd cartrefi presennol a gwella gwasanaethau tai. Cefais fy nghalonogi'n fawr gan y gefnogaeth gyffredinol i'n cynigion hyd yn hyn. Mae'r ymatebion yn cael eu hystyried yn fanwl a byddant yn hysbysu ein camau gweithredu deddfwriaethol ac anneddfwriaethol.

**Mike Hedges:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ymateb. Mae galw sylweddol a chynyddol am dai yng Nghymru. A all y Gweinidog nodi pa gamau y mae wedi'u cymryd i gynyddu nifer yr eiddo sy'n cael eu hadnewyddu neu'u hadeiladu gan gymdeithasau tai?

**Huw Lewis:** Gallaf, rydym yn gweithio'n galed i sicrhau bod yr ymdrechion hyn yn parhau i'r eithaf. Rwy'n parhau i gefnogi, er enghraifft, y rhaglen grant tai cymdeithasol ac wedi cefnogi rhoi £6 miliwn o arian ychwanegol i bartneriaeth tai Cymru, a gafwyd o arian cyfalaf a gedwir yn ganolog. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio gyda'r sector tai i gyflwyno grant refeniw tai cymdeithasol newydd a fydd yn darparu tua 1,000 o gartrefi fforddiadwy newydd. O ran adnewyddu, mae fy strategaeth cartrefi gwag, Troi Tai'n Gartrefi, yn ei dyddiau cynnar iawn, ond mae ffigurau cyfredol yn dangos cynnydd o 13% ar ffigurau blaenorol ar gyfer addasu eiddo gwag yn gartrefi y gellir byw ynddynt. Mae'r ffigurau hynny yn golygu, am ddwy flynedd gyntaf y Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru, fod dros 2,000 o eiddo wedi cael eu dwyn yn ôl i ddefnydd, ac rydym yn gyfforddus ar y trywydd iawn i guro'r targed

eiddo o 5,000 a osodais.

**Mark Isherwood:** When the UK Government announced its housing package this summer, it was warmly welcomed by the Chartered Institute of Housing, which noted that it is putting housing 'front and central of its policy to kick-start growth'

and by the National Housing Federation, which said that it is

'a major step forward and has the potential to transform the housing market'.

However, the Welsh Government was reported to have said that it had no plans to follow the UK Government. The one area in which the Welsh Government is replicating the work of the UK Government, to which you referred, is empty homes. Could you provide a progress report on that? A local authority has told me that it has been working with the Welsh Government to make funds available, but there have been some delays to the national scheme that are outside local authority control. The first claims for funding in all of the collaborative regions, including north Wales, were only submitted to you in late September, which was the first month in which any region was able to submit claims. What is the position, assuming that the figures that you have just announced did not relate to the Houses into Homes scheme, if the funding has not yet been released for that?

**Huw Lewis:** In my previous answer, I attempted to give headline figures for the empty properties recyclable loan, which is currently out there doing some good in communities. In terms of the contrast with what is going on over the border in England, there is a copycat scheme being run by the UK Government. On the proportional size of our empty properties scheme, as compared to the UK Government's scheme, ours is many times larger and is much more ambitious, with £10 million out there in communities working toward that 5,000 properties target. Thus far, around 2,000 properties are already being refurbished or have been converted back into use. That puts us well on track at this point to hit the 5,000 properties target by

**Mark Isherwood:** Pan gyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU ei phecyn tai yr haf hwn, fe'i croesawyd yn gynnes gan y Sefydliad Tai Siartredig, a nododd fod tai

yn rhan flaenllaw a chanolog o'i bolisi i ysgogi twf,

a chan y Ffederasiwn Tai Cenedlaethol, a ddywedodd ei fod

yn gam mawr ymlaen a bod ganddo'r potensial i drawsnewid y farchnad dai.

Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dweud nad oedd ganddi unrhyw gynlluniau i ddilyn esiampl Llywodraeth y DU. Un maes lle mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ailadrodd gwaith Llywodraeth y DU, y cyfeiriasoch ato, yw cartrefi gwag. A allech ddarparu adroddiad cynnydd ar hynny? Mae awdurdod lleol wedi dweud wrthyf ei fod wedi bod yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod arian ar gael, ond bu peth oedi i'r cynllun cenedlaethol sydd y tu hwnt i reolaeth yr awdurdod lleol. Dim ond ym mis Medi y cyflwynwyd y ceisiadau cyntaf am arian ym mhob un o'r rhanbarthau cydweithredol, gan gynnwys y gogledd, sef y mis cyntaf y gallai unrhyw ranbarth gyflwyno ceisiadau. Beth yw'r sefyllfa, gan dybio nad oedd y ffigurau yr ydych newydd eu cyhoeddi yn ymwneud â'r cynllun Troi Tai'n Gartrefi, os nad yw'r arian wedi cael ei ryddhau eto am hynny?

**Huw Lewis:** Yn fy ateb blaenorol, rwyf wedi ceisio rhoi ffigurau pennawd ar gyfer y benthyciad ailgylchadwy eiddo gwag, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gwneud rhywfaint o les mewn cymunedau. O ran y cyferbyniad â'r hyn sy'n digwydd dros y ffin yn Lloegr, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn rhedeg yn union yr un cynllun. O ran maint cyfrannol ein cynllun eiddo gwag ni, o gymharu â chynllun Llywodraeth y DU, mae ein cynllun ni sawl gwaith yn fwy ac yn llawer mwy uchelgeisiol, gyda £10 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu i gymunedau er mwyn gweithio tuag at y targed eiddo o 5,000. Hyd yma, mae tua 2,000 o eiddo eisoes yn cael eu hadnewyddu neu wedi eu haddasu yn ôl i ddefnydd. Mae hynny'n golygu ein bod yn

the end of this Assembly term.

gyfforddus ar y trywydd iawn i gyrraedd y targed eiddo o 5,000 erbyn diwedd tymor y Cynulliad hwn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Clearly, that is coming from broader support, if what this local authority has told me is correct. I look forward to finding out when the money has been released. However, one area on which the Welsh Government is making positive progress is the Welsh housing bond. I understand that the Welsh Government will be offering revenue support toward the interest costs of the bond to housing associations, which were asked to submit potential schemes to you, outside of the normal schemes, by 10 September. Could you tell us what the total investment in the bond will be? When do you anticipate that these schemes will go live? How many housing associations have expressed an interest?

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn amlwg, mae hynny'n dod o gymorth ehangach, os yw'r hyn y mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi dweud wrthyf yn gywir. Rwy'n edrych ymlaen at ddarganfod pryd fydd yr arian wedi cael ei ryddhau. Fodd bynnag, un maes y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwneud cynnydd cadarnhaol ynddo yw bond tai Cymru. Rwy'n deall y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynnig cymorth refeniw tuag at gostau llog y bond i gymdeithasau tai, y gofynnwyd iddynt gyflwyno cynlluniau posibl i chi, y tu allan i'r cynlluniau arferol, erbyn 10 Medi. A allech ddweud wrthym beth fydd cyfanswm y buddsoddiad yn y bond? Pryd ydych yn rhagweld y caiff y cynlluniau hyn eu gweithredu? Faint o gymdeithasau tai sydd wedi mynegi diddordeb?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank Mark Isherwood for making that point. The Welsh housing bond is progressing well. Negotiations have been positive all along. I will have to write to him with the specific figures on the support, but that support will be considerable and sustained. This will be one among a number of initiatives that I hope to have up and running during this Assembly term to support the flow of capital toward housebuilding.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i Mark Isherwood am wneud y pwynt hwnnw. Mae bond tai Cymru yn mynd rhagddo'n dda. Mae trafodaethau wedi bod yn gadarnhaol ar bob cam. Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu ato gyda'r ffigurau penodol o ran y cymorth, ond bydd y cymorth hwnnw yn sylweddol a pharhaus. Bydd hon yn un ymhlith nifer o fentrau yr wyf yn gobeithio eu rhoi ar waith yn ystod tymor y Cynulliad hwn i gefnogi llif cyfalaf tuag at adeiladu tai.

**Leanne Wood:** Minister, a couple of weeks ago, you made a statement on the responses to the housing White Paper. In that statement, you mentioned that the majority of people who responded supported the shift toward a more preventative approach to homelessness. Can you tell us whether those who supported a preventative approach included banks and other mortgage lenders?

**Leanne Wood:** Weinidog, ychydig o wythnosau yn ôl, gwnaethoch ddatganiad ar yr ymatebion i'r Papur Gwyn ar dai. Yn y datganiad hwnnw, gwnaethoch sôn fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl a ymatebodd yn cefnogi'r newid tuag at ymagwedd fwy ataliol at ddigartrefedd. A allwch ddweud wrthym a oedd y rhai a oedd yn cefnogi ymagwedd ataliol yn cynnwys banciau a benthycwyr morgais eraill?

**Huw Lewis:** I have to confess to the Member that I cannot recall, specifically, what comments might have been made by banks. I think that substantive comments were made by the Council of Mortgage Lenders, representing lenders as a whole. I will write to the Member if I am wrong on this, but I am not aware of any large representative organisation having contacted me with

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n rhaid imi gyfaddef i'r Aelod na allaf gofio, yn benodol, pa sylwadau a allai fod wedi cael eu gwneud gan fanciau. Credaf fod sylwadau sylweddol wedi cael eu gwneud gan y Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi, yn cynrychioli benthycwyr yn gyffredinol. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod os wyf yn anghywir, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw sefydliad

criticism of a preventative approach as a matter of principle as part of its submission.

**Leanne Wood:** It is pretty obvious that a key part of preventing homelessness involves preventing home repossessions in the first place. That is why we are proud of the mortgage rescue scheme that we were responsible for introducing when Plaid Cymru was in Government. That is why we would work with lenders to produce an even better scheme in the longer term. Can you tell us how many times you have met with lenders to discuss reducing the number of repossessions? What policy responses are you considering on repossessions?

2.30 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** Discussions have been held, and I continue to monitor the situation closely. It seems that, at present—at least in a Welsh context—the number of repossessions, although rising slightly, is not what we might have feared at this point in an economic cycle such as the one that we are currently confronting. Should that change at any point, I would of course consider any and all policy options to assist people to hold onto their homes, and to prevent homelessness.

**Peter Black:** Minister, in July 2011, you said that 78% of registered social landlords' homes would achieve the Welsh housing quality standard by 2012. In the figures published on Monday, you actually achieved 33%. What went wrong?

**Huw Lewis:** Everyone is aware of the Welsh housing quality standard statistics that were issued about 24 hours ago. There is cause for concern in those figures. One thing that is important to realise, when studying those figures, is that, if we look at items of improvement across the housing stock, then the figures start to hit levels like 70%, 65%, and so on. I am talking about basic things, such as a proper watertight and modern roof, a proper central heating system, and so on. When it comes to the entire package being assembled around an individual home, then I

cynrychiadol mawr wedi cysylltu â mi yn beirniadu ymagwedd ataliol fel mater o egwyddor fel rhan o'i gyflwyniad.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae'n eithaf amlwg mai un agwedd allweddol ar atal digartrefedd yw atal achosion o adfeddiannu cartrefi yn y lle cyntaf. Dyna pam ein bod yn falch o'r cynllun achub morgeisi roeddem yn gyfrifol am ei gyflwyno pan oedd Plaid Cymru mewn Llywodraeth. Dyna pam y byddem yn gweithio gyda benthycwyr i gynhyrchu cynllun hyd yn oed yn well yn y tymor hwy. A allwch ddweud wrthym sawl gwaith rydych wedi cwrdd â benthycwyr i drafod lleihau nifer yr achosion o adfeddiannu? Pa ymatebion polisi rydych yn eu hystyried ar gyfer adfeddiannu?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae trafodaethau wedi'u cynnal, ac rwy'n parhau i fonitro'r sefyllfa'n agos. Er eu bod yn codi ychydig, mae'n ymddangos, ar hyn o bryd—o leiaf yng nghyd-destun Cymru—nad yw nifer yr adfeddiannau mor uchel ag y gallem fod wedi'i ofni ar y pwynt hwn mewn cylch economaidd fel yr un rydym yn ei wynebu ar hyn o bryd. Pe bai hynny'n newid ar unrhyw adeg, byddwn wrth gwrs yn ystyried pob opsiwn polisi i gynorthwyo pobl i ddal gafael ar eu cartrefi, ac i atal digartrefedd.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, ym mis Gorffennaf 2011, dywedasoch y byddai 78% o gartrefi landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig yn cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru erbyn 2012. Yn y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd ddydd Llun, 33% yw'r nifer mewn gwirionedd. Beth aeth o'i le?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae pawb yn ymwybodol o ystadegau safon ansawdd tai Cymru a gyhoeddwyd tua 24 awr yn ôl. Mae'r ffigurau hynny yn destun pryder. Un peth sy'n bwysig ei sylweddoli, wrth astudio'r ffigurau hynny, yw, os ydym yn edrych ar eitemau o welliant ar draws y stoc tai, yna mae'r ffigurau yn dechrau taro lefelau fel 70%, 65%, ac ati. Rwy'n sôn am bethau sylfaenol, megis to priodol a modern sy'n dal dŵr, system gwres canolog briodol, ac ati. Pan ddaw at gydosod y pecyn cyfan o gwmpas cartref unigol, yna rwy'n barod i gyfaddef bod gennym rai

freely admit that we have some disappointing statistics, which we must confront. I have asked officials to analyse these figures carefully, and to trawl through them, and I will be taking a close look at what we can do to maintain momentum in terms of our work to hit the Welsh housing quality standard.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. The one thing that I can agree with you on is that it is a matter of great concern. Given that you predicted 14 months ago that you would have achieved the figure of 78% at full compliance, what did you do in that period of 14 months to achieve even some momentum towards meeting that target? What extra resources were deployed, and what extra work did you do to deliver on that?

**Huw Lewis:** Peter Black will be well aware of the figures around this, and the degree of investment that has been put into this sort of work. Of course, it would help considerably if issues such as the housing revenue account subsidy, which we are continuing to try to negotiate our way out of in conjunction with the Treasury, were to bear some fruit. That would free up certain local authorities in particular, in order to make much more rapid progress towards hitting the Welsh housing quality standard. Unfortunately, the UK Government seems reluctant, let us say, to make a definitive decision one way or another, despite its Minister's stated intention that Wales should leave the HRAS. I would encourage Peter Black to get on the phone to his colleagues in Westminster, and ask them to expedite this decision, so that Wales can invest even more in the quality of our housing.

### Graddio Adeiladau

**2. David Melding:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am raddio adeiladau'r ugeinfed ganrif. OAQ(4)0169(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for South Wales Central for that question. The grading of twentieth-century buildings is assessed against planning circulars 61/96, and benchmarks provided by existing listings. Through the vehicle of the forthcoming

ystadegau siomedig, y mae'n rhaid inni eu hwynebu. Rwyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion ddadansoddi'r ffigurau hyn yn ofalus, ac edrych drwyddynt, a byddaf yn edrych yn fanwl ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i gynnal momentwm o ran ein gwaith i gyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru.

**Peter Black:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb, Weinidog. Yr unig beth y gallaf gytuno â chi arno yw ei fod yn fater o bryder mawr. O ystyried eich bod wedi rhagweld 14 mis yn ôl y byddech wedi cyrraedd ffigur o 78% ar gydymffurfiaeth lawn, beth wnaethoch yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw o 14 mis i gynhyrchu hyd yn oed rywfaint o fomentwm tuag at gyrraedd y targed hwnnw? Pa adnoddau ychwanegol a ddefnyddiwyd, a pha waith ychwanegol a wnaethoch i gyflawni hynny?

**Huw Lewis:** Bydd Peter Black yn ymwybodol iawn o'r ffigurau ynghylch hyn, a faint o fuddsoddiad sydd wedi cael ei wneud yn y math hwn o waith. Wrth gwrs, byddai o gymorth sylweddol pe bai materion megis cymhorthdal y cyfrif refeniw tai, yr ydym yn parhau i geisio trafod ffordd o'i adael gyda'r Trysorlys, yn dwyn ffrwyth. Byddai hynny'n rhyddhau rhai awdurdodau lleol yn arbennig, er mwyn gwneud cynnydd llawer cyflymach tuag at gyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Yn anffodus, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn ymddangos yn amharod, gadewch inni ddweud, i wneud penderfyniad pendant y naill ffordd neu'r llall, er i'w Gweinidog ddatgan bwriad y dylai Cymru adael cymhorthdal y cyfrif refeniw tai. Byddwn yn annog Peter Black i ffonio ei gyd-aelodau yn San Steffan, a gofyn iddynt gyflymu'r penderfyniad hwn, fel y gall Cymru fuddsoddi mwy fyth yn ansawdd ein tai.

### Grading Buildings

**2. David Melding:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the grading of 20<sup>th</sup> century buildings. OAQ(4)0169(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganol De Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r gwaith o raddio adeiladau'r ugeinfed ganrif yn cael ei asesu yn erbyn cylchlythyrau cynllunio 61/96, a meincnodau a ddarperir gan restrau presennol. Drwy gyfrwng y Bil treftadaeth

heritage Bill, we will be reviewing current arrangements to ensure that they provide effective protection and accessibility now and in the future.

**David Melding:** Minister, you will be aware that many twentieth-century buildings of note in Wales have remained at risk because the grading system has taken such an inordinate length of time. What progress is now being made, at least on the all-Wales buildings at risk register, or will we have to wait for the Bill until we have that in place as well?

**Huw Lewis:** I would not like to think that we would have to wait for the publication and the passage of the Bill through the Assembly. If the Member has areas of specific concern, particularly as regards specific buildings, and how grading issues are affecting those buildings, or the communities in which they are embedded, I would be happy to look at those specifics with him. If he could write with further details, I would be happy to see how we could push things forward without necessarily having to wait for the passage of legislation.

**David Rees:** The grading and preservation of twentieth-century buildings, which have played a major role in a town's development, is important. In previous answers relating to the preservation of buildings in Port Talbot, namely the Custom House and Royal Buildings, you identified the use of local lists by local authorities as a possible option to secure these buildings. In this case, disappointingly, the two buildings no longer exist as the list was not used. Will you provide an update as to how many local authorities have local lists in place?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank David Rees for that question. We know that the approach by local authorities to local lists is nothing if not inconsistent. That is very clear. I have asked officials in Cadw to review their policy and stance towards local listing, and they will be working with local authorities on that at this moment. At this moment in time, I am not able to give you a number in terms of how many local authorities have created a list; I

sydd i ddod, byddwn yn adolygu'r trefniadau presennol i sicrhau eu bod yn darparu amddiffyniad effeithiol a hygyrchedd nawr ac yn y dyfodol.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod llawer o adeiladau o bwys yr ugeinfed ganrif yng Nghymru wedi parhau i fod mewn perygl oherwydd bod y system raddio wedi cymryd cymaint o amser. Pa gynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud bellach, o leiaf ar yr adeiladau Cymru gyfan sydd ar y gofrestr risg, neu a fydd yn rhaid inni aros am y Bil nes bod hynny ar waith hefyd?

**Huw Lewis:** Ni fyddwn yn hoffi meddwl y byddai'n rhaid inni aros i'r Bil gael ei gyhoeddi na'i hynt drwy'r Cynulliad. Os oes gan yr Aelod feysydd penodol o bryder, yn enwedig o ran adeiladau penodol, a sut mae materion graddio yn effeithio ar yr adeiladau hynny, neu am y cymunedau y maent ynddynt, byddwn yn hapus i edrych ar y manylion gydag ef. Os gallai ysgrifennu gyda manylion pellach, byddwn yn hapus i weld sut y gallem wthio pethau ymlaen heb orfod aros am hynt deddfwriaeth o reidrwydd.

**David Rees:** Mae graddio a chadw adeiladau'r ugeinfed ganrif, sydd wedi chwarae rhan bwysig yn natblygiad tref, yn bwysig. Mewn atebion blaenorol yn ymwneud â chadwraeth adeiladau ym Mhort Talbot, sef Custom House a'r Adeiladau Brenhinol, un opsiwn posibl a nodwyd gennych oedd y gallai awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio rhestrau lleol i ddiogelu'r adeiladau hyn. Yn yr achos hwn, mae'n siomedig nodi nad yw'r ddau adeilad yn bodoli mwyach am na chafodd y rhestr ei defnyddio. A wnewch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynghylch faint o awdurdodau lleol sydd â rhestr lleol ar waith?

**Huw Lewis:** Hoffwn ddiolch i David Rees am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rydym yn gwybod bod ymagwedd awdurdodau lleol at restrau lleol yn anghyson a dweud y lleiaf. Mae hynny'n glir iawn. Rwyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion yn Cadw adolygu eu polisi a'u safiad tuag at restru lleol, a byddant wrthi'n gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol ar hynny. Ar hyn o bryd, ni allaf ddweud faint o awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi creu rhestr;



am afraid that we just do not have that information as yet, but we will have it. As part of the development and implementation of the heritage Bill that I have proposed, the Welsh Government will also produce a clear set of guidance for local planning authorities on the usage and worth of local listing, and we will set out criteria against which buildings can be assessed, and consider any options available for safeguarding buildings that have importance within communities.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae gwerth rhai adeiladau yn dibynnu ar y cyd-destun hanesyddol wrth gwrs, gan gynnwys hanes yr ugeinfed ganrif, ac felly mae hi gydag Yr Ysgwrn yn Nhrawsfynydd, sef cartref y bardd Hedd Wyn, y mae Llywodraeth Cymru a Pharc Cenedlaethol Eryri wedi'i ddiogelu i'r dyfodol. Fe laddwyd Ellis Evans, enw bedydd Hedd Wyn, ym mrwydr Passchendaele. A wnewch chi'n siŵr, Weinidog, bod hanes Hedd Wyn, ac Yr Ysgwrn ei hun, yn rhan o'r cofio, ond nid yn rhan o'r dathlu, gobeithio, am erchyllterau'r rhyfel byd cyntaf?

**Huw Lewis:** The Member is quite right to draw attention to the importance and significance of Yr Ysgwrn in terms of the story of Wales in connection with the first world war and, of course, the very personal connection to Ellis Evans, the poet. Of all the historic monuments that I have visited in my current role—and there have been many—very few have had the atmosphere and impact of that quite small dwelling in the Snowdonia National Park. I think it will be a place of pilgrimage for many people in Wales, and for visitors from outside Wales for many years to come, as soon as we have secured the building and restored it in a way that, I hope, will pay proper tribute to the memory of Ellis Evans.

In terms of the connection with the commemoration of the first world war in 2014—'commemoration' is the word that I prefer to use; I have not heard anyone use the word 'celebration'—I will ensure that the usage, the interpretation of the experience of Ellis Evans and the importance of Yr Ysgwrn

rwyn ofni nad oes gennym y wybodaeth honno eto, ond byddwn yn ei chael. Fel rhan o'r gwaith o ddatblygu a gweithredu'r Bil treftadaeth yr wyf wedi'i gynnig, bydd Llywodraeth Cymru hefyd yn cynhyrchu set glir o ganllawiau i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ar y defnydd o restrau lleol a'u gwerth, a byddwn yn nodi meini prawf y gellir asesu adeiladau yn eu herbyn, ac yn ystyried unrhyw opsiynau sydd ar gael ar gyfer diogelu adeiladau o bwysigrwydd mewn cymunedau.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The value of some buildings is dependent on the historic context, of course, including the history of the twentieth century, and that is true of Yr Ysgwrn in Trawsfynydd, the home of the poet Hedd Wyn, which the Welsh Government and the Snowdonia National Park have safeguarded for the future. Ellis Evans—that was Hedd Wyn's given name—was killed at the battle of Passchendaele. Will you ensure, Minister, that the history of Hedd Wyn, and Yr Ysgwrn itself, will be part of the remembering, but not part of the celebration, I hope, of the horrors of the first world war?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r Aelod yn llygad ei le i dynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd ac arwyddocâd Yr Ysgwrn yn stori Cymru mewn cysylltiad â'r rhyfel byd cyntaf ac, wrth gwrs, y cysylltiad personol iawn ag Ellis Evans, y bardd. O'r holl henebion hanesyddol yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy yn fy rôl gyfredol—sy'n niferus—ychydig iawn sydd â'r un awyrgylch ac effaith â'r annedd eithaf bach honno ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Eryri. Rwy'n credu y bydd yn lle o bererindod i lawer o bobl yng Nghymru, ac i ymwelwyr o'r tu allan i Gymru, am flynyddoedd lawer i ddod, cyn gynted ag y byddwn wedi diogelu'r adeilad a'i adnewyddu mewn modd a fydd, gobeithio, yn talu teyrnged briodol er cof am Ellis Evans.

O ran y cysylltiad â choffâu'r rhyfel byd cyntaf yn 2014—'coffâu' yw'r gair sy'n well gen i ei ddefnyddio; nid wyf wedi clywed unrhyw un yn defnyddio'r gair 'dathlu'—byddaf yn sicrhau y bydd y defnydd a'r dehongliad o brofiad Ellis Evans a phwysigrwydd Yr Ysgwrn yn gyffredinol yn

generally will be an integral part of Wales's marking of that 100-year anniversary.

### Gwaddol y Gemau Olympaidd

**3. Simon Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei gynlluniau ar gyfer gwaddol y Gemau Olympaidd yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0177(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Mid and West Wales for that question. Our plans to inspire a generation are well under way. For example, Sport Wales is piloting a Dragon multi-skills and sport programme in west Wales, which teaches five to 11-year-olds core physical skills, including agility, balance and co-ordination, which is intended to complement their physical education lessons at school. Developing basic skills can make young people more confident whatever specific sports they may wish to play.

**Simon Thomas:** I thank the Minister for that reply, and thank him also for meeting me and Elin Jones before the summer to visit the mid Wales cycle and athletics track partnership. I draw his attention to what the finance director of Ceredigion County Borough Council said in the Finance Committee this morning. He mentioned this capital project for a mid Wales cycle and running track in Aberystwyth and said that it was an example of the kind of capital project that was earmarked as being essential in the development of a sports legacy in mid Wales, but was struggling to get going because of the current austerity measures. What help can the Government give to such projects and generally, in trying to free up some of the capital resources that have been tied up to date in the Olympics and that may now start to become available for projects in Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for those points. I remember very well the meeting alongside you and Elin Jones, where a powerful case was made for cycling and athletics facilities in the Ceredigion area. I was pleased in that meeting to see that there was a consensual partnership emerging at that

rhan annatod o weithgareddau Cymru i nodi'r canmlwyddiant hwnnw.

### Olympic Legacy Plans

**3. Simon Thomas:** *Will the Minister make a statement on his Olympic legacy plans for Mid and West Wales. OAQ(4)0177(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae ein cynlluniau i ysbrydoli cenedlaeth ar y gweill. Er enghraifft, mae Chwaraeon Cymru yn treialu Campau'r Ddraig, sef rhaglen aml-sgiliau a chwaraeon yng ngorllewin Cymru sy'n dysgu sgiliau corfforol craidd i blant rhwng pump ac 11 oed, gan gynnwys ystwythder, cydbwysedd a chydsymud, y bwriedir iddi ategu eu gwersi addysg gorfforol yn yr ysgol. Gall datblygu sgiliau sylfaenol wneud pobl ifanc yn fwy hyderus ni waeth pa chwaraeon penodol y byddant yn dymuno eu chwarae.

**Simon Thomas:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw, ac iddo yntau hefyd am gyfarfod â mi ac Elin Jones cyn yr haf i ymweld â phartneriaeth trac beicio ac athletau canolbarth Cymru. Tynnaf ei sylw at yr hyn a ddywedodd Cyfarwyddwr Cyllid Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Ceredigion yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid y bore yma. Soniodd am y prosiect cyfalaf ar gyfer trac beicio a rhedeg ar gyfer canolbarth Cymru yn Aberystwyth a dywedodd ei fod yn enghraifft o'r math o brosiect cyfalaf sy'n hanfodol wrth ddatblygu gwaddol chwaraeon yng nghanolbarth Cymru, ond a oedd yn cael trafferth cychwyn arni oherwydd y mesurau cynilo presennol. Pa gymorth y gall Llywodraeth ei roi i brosiectau o'r fath ac yn gyffredinol, wrth geisio rhyddhau rhai o'r adnoddau cyfalaf a ddyrannwyd hyd yma i'r Gemau Olympaidd ac a all bellach ddechrau dod ar gael ar gyfer prosiectau yng Nghymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am y pwyntiau hynny. Cofiaf yn dda y cyfarfod ochr yn ochr â chi ac Elin Jones, lle cyflwynwyd achos cryf dros gyfleusterau beicio ac athletau yn ardal Ceredigion. Yn y cyfarfod hwnnw roeddwn yn falch o weld bod partneriaeth gydsyniol yn datblygu ar yr adeg honno

point between the local authority and other partners. As I freely said in that meeting, there is clearly a need for this sort of provision in that part of Wales. However, it is also true to say that in the current atmosphere and economic climate, such capital investments are difficult to construct. I will commit absolutely to working with the mid-Wales cycling and athletics partnership to explore every conceivable avenue for capital investment along these lines. I know that Aberystwyth University is now also on board as a partner, but a powerful case could be made, for example, to funders like the lottery, to stand by us and by this part of Wales in terms of making such proposals real.

**Paul Davies:** It is important to build on the Olympic legacy that has been created this summer and to encourage high-level sporting events to take place in all areas of Wales. You may or may not be aware of the decision not to host matches for the UEFA ladies' under-19 tournament next year at Haverfordwest County's New Bridge Meadow Stadium, despite a commitment by UEFA and the Football Association of Wales to do so. Do you share my disappointment regarding UEFA's and the FAW's decision not to hold matches in Pembrokeshire? As the ground is a focal point for football in west Wales, will you join me in lobbying the FAW to reconsider its u-turn?

**Huw Lewis:** On high-level and elite sports, we have had our post-Olympic strategy in place since way before the Olympics began. The Sport Wales elite sport strategy has had in place a strategy that takes us from the Olympics to the Commonwealth Games in Glasgow in 2014 and beyond. On the FAW, we are dealing with slightly different sets of governance and so on. I was not aware of any kind of change of policy relating to the ladies' under-19 tournament that the Member mentioned. I will undertake to get to the bottom of the issue and ask officials to work alongside the FAW to do all that we can to ensure that all parts of Wales benefit from this kind of sporting tournament.

rhwng yr awdurdod lleol a phartneriaid eraill. Fel y dywedais yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, mae'n amlwg bod angen y math hwn o ddarpariaeth yn y rhan honno o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn wir i ddweud, yn yr awyrgylch presennol a'r hinsawdd economaidd sydd ohoni, fod buddsoddiadau cyfalaf o'r fath yn anodd eu hadeiladu. Byddaf yn ymrwymo'n llwyr i weithio gyda phartneriaeth beicio ac athletau canolbarth Cymru i archwilio pob llwybr posibl ar gyfer buddsoddi cyfalaf i'r perwyl hwn. Rwy'n gwybod bod Prifysgol Aberystwyth bellach yn bartner hefyd, ond gellid cyflwyno achos cryf i gyllidwyr fel y loteri, er enghraifft, i'n cefnogi ni a'r rhan hon o Gymru er mwyn gwireddu cynigion o'r fath.

**Paul Davies:** Mae'n bwysig adeiladu ar y gwaddol a grewyd gan y Gemau Olympaidd yn ystod yr haf ac annog digwyddiadau chwaraeon lefel uchel ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r penderfyniad i beidio â chynnal gemau ar gyfer twrnaint dan-19 i ferched UEFA yn Stadiwm New Bridge Meadow, Hwlfordd y flwyddyn nesaf, er gwaethaf ymrwymiad gan UEFA a Chymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru i wneud hynny. A ydych yn rhannu fy siom ynghylch penderfyniad UEFA a'r Gymdeithas i beidio â chynnal gemau yn Sir Benfro? Gan fod y cae yn ganolbwynt ar gyfer pêl-droed yng ngorllewin Cymru, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i lobïo'r Gymdeithas i ailystyried ei thro pedol?

**Huw Lewis:** O ran chwaraeon lefel uchel ac elît, cafodd ein strategaeth ôl-Olympaidd ei pharatoi ymhell cyn dechrau'r Gemau Olympaidd. Mae strategaeth chwaraeon elît Chwaraeon Cymru wedi sefydlu strategaeth sy'n mynd â ni o'r Gemau Olympaidd i Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn Glasgow yn 2014 a thu hwnt. O ran Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru, rydym yn delio â setiau llywodraethu ychydig yn wahanol ac yn y blaen. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o unrhyw fath o newid yn y polisi mewn perthynas â'r twrnaint dan-19 i ferched a grybwyllwyd gan yr Aelod. Addawaf fynd i wraidd y mater a gofyn i swyddogion weithio ochr yn ochr â'r Gymdeithas i wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau bod pob rhan o Gymru yn elwa ar y math hwn o dwrnaint chwaraeon.

**Rhaglen Strategaeth Môn a Menai**

**4. Ieuan Wyn Jones:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu cynnydd Rhaglen Strategaeth Môn a Menai 2011-2014. OAQ(4)0175(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Anglesey for that question. The Môn a Menai regeneration area has been successfully funding a range of projects in Anglesey and the Arfon area of Gwynedd since 2008. In the last two and a half years alone, Môn a Menai core funding of some £17.5 million has been approved for 71 individual projects. This funding is expected to lever in a further £35 million from other sources.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Rwy'n diolch iddo am yr ateb hwnnw. Rwy'n siŵr ei fod yn cofio i mi awgrymu ym mis Mehefin eleni y byddai'n syniad da pe bai'n gallu siarad â'r Gweinidog busnes a'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau i weld sut y gallwn wneud y defnydd gorau o arian, o gofio fod gennym dri chynllun yn yr ardal hon: cynllun Môn a Menai, parth menter, a sgiliau ar gyfer datblygiadau ynni ar yr ynys. Dywedodd bryd hynny ei fod yn credu y byddai hynny'n syniad da. A all y Gweinidog ein diweddarau gyda chanlyniad y trafodaethau hynny hyd yn hyn?

2.45 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** Those discussions have happened and are happening. The energy island programme to which the Member referred contains within it the seeds of tremendous progressive work that we can do on the island of Anglesey. I have been working alongside my ministerial colleagues to hammer out the shape of what might succeed Môn a Menai. The energy island programme needs to be at the heart of our thinking, in terms of skill and opportunity. You are right to point out that this needs to be knitted together as a coherent whole with whatever successor regeneration work might be happening on the island and whatever initiatives might be happening in terms of jobs and skills. This is a work in progress, and I know that the Member will monitor this activity closely. I am sure, given the consensual working on the island that has

**Môn and Menai Strategy Programme**

**4. Ieuan Wyn Jones:** *Will the Minister outline the progress of the Môn and Menai Strategy Programme 2011-2014. OAQ(4)0175(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ynys Môn am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae ardal adfywio Môn a Menai wedi bod yn ariannu amrywiaeth o brosiectau ar Ynys Môn ac yn ardal Arfon yng Ngwynedd yn llwyddiannus ers 2008. Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd a hanner diwethaf yn unig, cymeradwywyd tua £17.5 miliwn o arian craidd Môn a Menai ar gyfer 71 o brosiectau unigol. Mae disgwyl i'r arian hwn ddenu £35 miliwn arall o ffynonellau eraill.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank him for that reply. I am sure that he will recall that I suggested in June this year that it would be a good idea if he could speak to both the Minister for business and the Deputy Minister for Skills to see how we could make the best use of funding, bearing in mind that we have three schemes in this area: Môn a Menai, the enterprise zone and skills for energy developments on the island. He said then that he believed that that would be a good idea. Could the Minister give us an update on the outcomes of those discussions to date?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r trafodaethau hynny wedi digwydd ac yn parhau i ddigwydd. Mae'r rhaglen ynys ynni y mae'r Aelod yn cyfeirio ati yn cynnwys hadau gwaith hynod o flaengar y gallwn ei wneud ar Ynys Môn. Rwyf wedi bod yn gweithio ochr yn ochr â'm cyd-Weinidogion i bennu ffurf yr hyn a allai olynu Môn a Menai. Mae angen i'r rhaglen ynys ynni fod wrth wraidd ein ffordd o feddwl, o ran sgiliau a chyfleoedd. Rydych yn gywir i nodi bod angen gwau hyn oll ynghyd fel un cyfanwaith cydlynol gyda pha waith adfywio olynol bynnag sy'n digwydd ar yr ynys a pha fentrau bynnag sy'n digwydd o ran swyddi a sgiliau. Mae hwn yn waith sy'n mynd rhagddo, a gwn y bydd yr Aelod yn monitro'r gweithgarwch hwn yn agos. Rwy'n siŵr, o ystyried y gwaith cydsyniol ar yr ynys sydd wedi bod yn amlwg dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, y byddwn yn gallu

been self-evident over the last few years, that we will be able to continue in that spirit.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Minister, in an answer to a written question from me, you have indicated that you consider the Pontio project as one of the key achievements in the Môn a Menai regeneration area. When complete, Pontio will undoubtedly bring many benefits, but, to date, this project has also attracted much controversy. The opening date of spring 2013 has been pushed back to 2014, and an initial budget of £37 million was boosted to £44 million in June. Can you confirm what recent discussions you have had with the project's management and what confidence do you have that this project will be delivered on schedule and without the need for any more of Welsh taxpayers' money?

**Huw Lewis:** The Member is right to keep a close eye on the development of major schemes like Pontio, which brings together our ideals around regeneration with our heritage and arts commitments in one package for the benefit of the people of Bangor and the wider area. You are quite right to say that there were issues surrounding the management of Pontio in particular. There were unresolved questions that, I think, left the project with an unrealistic budget. I think that those issues have now been resolved and we can look forward to getting on with the job according to the revised timetable and budget. One thing that I will be watching closely is how Pontio benefits everyone in Bangor and the surrounding region. Pontio is not just about those who might perhaps be the usual suspects in terms of audiences or performers, or even the university. It is about everyone in Bangor and that region of Wales.

#### Datblygiad Llenyddiaeth

**5. Jenny Rathbone:** *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i hybu datblygiad llenyddiaeth yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0167)*

**Huw Lewis:** Welsh literature, in both English and Welsh, is one of our key priorities. Funding is also provided to literature festivals, such as the Hay festival,

parhau yn yr ysbryd hwnnw.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Weinidog, mewn ateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig oddi wrthyf, rydych wedi nodi eich bod yn ystyried prosiect Pontio fel un o'r cyflawniadau allweddol yn ardal adfywio Môn a Menai. Pan fydd wedi'i gwblhau, bydd Pontio yn sicr yn dod â llawer o fanteision, ond, hyd yma, mae'r prosiect hwn hefyd wedi denu cryn ddadlau. Mae'r dyddiad agor yng ngwanwyn 2013 wedi cael ei wthio yn ôl i 2014, a chafodd cyllideb gychwynnol o £37 miliwn ei chynyddu i £44 miliwn ym mis Mehefin. A allwch gadarnhau pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael gyda rheolwyr y prosiect yn ddiweddar a pha mor ffyddiog rydych chi y bydd y prosiect hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno ar amser, heb yr angen am fwy o arian gan drethdalwyr Cymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r Aelod yn iawn i gadw llygad barcud ar ddatblygiad cynlluniau mawr fel Pontio, sy'n dwyn ynghyd ein delfrydau o ran adfywio gyda'n hymrwymiaadau ar gyfer treftadaeth a'r celfyddydau mewn un pecyn er budd pobl Bangor a'r ardal ehangach. Rydych yn hollol iawn i ddweud y bu problemau yn ymwneud â rheoli Pontio yn arbennig. Roedd cwestiynau heb eu datrys a oedd, yn fy marn i, wedi gadael y prosiect â chyllideb afrealistig. Credaf fod y problemau hyn bellach wedi'u datrys a gallwn edrych ymlaen at fynd â'r gwaith rhagddo yn unol â'r amserlen a'r gyllideb ddiwygiedig. Un peth y byddaf yn cadw golwg agos arno yw sut y bydd Pontio o fudd i bawb ym Mangor a'r ardal gyfagos. Mae Pontio yn ehangach na'r cynulleidfaoedd neu'r perfformwyr arferol, neu hyd yn oed y brifysgol. Mae a wnelo â phawb ym Mangor a'r rhanbarth honno o Gymru.

#### Development of Literature

**5. Jenny Rathbone:** *What is the Welsh Government doing to promote the development of literature in Wales. OAQ(4)0167)*

**Huw Lewis:** Mae llenyddiaeth Cymru, yn Saesneg ac yn Gymraeg, yw un o'n blaenoriaethau allweddol. Darperir cyllid hefyd i wyliau llenyddol, megis Gŵyl y

and to individual authors via the Creative Wales awards.

**Jenny Rathbone:** On the day after Hilary Mantel has won the Man Booker prize for the second time for her second book about Thomas Cromwell, that celebrated Welshman who has had such a major impact on our history, what funding has the Welsh Government provided to Literature Wales? What impact has this had on the aim to promote Welsh and English-medium literature in Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for those points. I am quite sure that Thomas Cromwell would never suffer this sort of questioning in public and, had he ever suffered it on one occasion, would have seen to it that it never happened again. To win the Booker prize twice is a fantastic achievement. The Welsh Books Council and Literature Wales receive funding of just shy of £4.9 million annually to develop and promote literature in Wales. In addition, the Arts Council of Wales provides funding to annual festivals, such as Hay, the Laugharne weekend and the North Wales International Poetry Festival. The Arts Council of Wales, via its Creative Wales awards, offers through periods of research and development, awards such as those that have been awarded to writers such as John Williams, Des Barry and Wiliam Owen Roberts.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am sure that the Minister really enjoys this; he is just pretending that he does not. [*Laughter.*] I call Suzy Davies.

**Suzy Davies:** Diolch, Lywydd. I hope that he enjoys this as well. Minister, would you consider raising the potential of crowd-funded publishing with Literature Wales, please, which, as you have said, is supported by the taxpayer through the Welsh Government and the Arts Council of Wales? Crowd-funded publishing involves members of the public pledging financial support to a particular literary project, creating the preliminary market for the final product in the process. The idea was revived at the Hay

Gelli, ac i awduron unigol drwy ddyfarniadau Cymru Greadigol.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Ddiwrnod ar ôl i Hilary Mantel ennill gwobr Man Booker am yr eildro am ei hail lyfr am Thomas Cromwell, y Cymro enwog hwnnw sydd wedi cael effaith mor fawr ar ein hanes, pa gyllid y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i roi i Lenyddiaeth Cymru? Pa effaith y mae hyn wedi'i chael ar y nod i hyrwyddo llenyddiaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg a Saesneg yng Nghymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod am y pwyntiau hynny. Rwy'n eithaf sicr na fyddai Thomas Cromwell byth yn dioddef y math hwn o holi yn gyhoeddus a, phe bai erioed wedi dioddef hynny unwaith, byddai wedi gwneud yn siŵr na fyddai'r un peth yn digwydd byth eto. Mae ennill gwobr Booker ddwywaith yn gyflawniad gwych. Mae Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru a Llenyddiaeth Cymru yn cael ychydig llai na £4.9 miliwn bob blwyddyn i ddatblygu a hyrwyddo llenyddiaeth yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal, mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn darparu cyllid i wyliau blynyddol, fel y Gelli, penwythnos Talacharn a Gŵyl Farddoniaeth Ryngwladol Gogledd Cymru. Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, drwy ei ddyfarniadau Cymru Greadigol, yn cynnig drwy gyfnodau o ymchwil a datblygu, ddyfarniadau megis y rhai sydd wedi cael eu dyfarnu i awduron fel John Williams, Des Barry a Wiliam Owen Roberts.

**Y Llywydd:** Rwy'n siŵr bod y Gweinidog wir yn mwynhau hyn; mae ond yn esgus nad yw'n mwynhau. [*Chwerthin.*] Galwaf ar Suzy Davies.

**Suzy Davies:** Diolch, Lywydd. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff fwynhau hyn yn ogystal. Weinidog, a fyddech yn ystyried cynyddu potensial cyhoeddi a ariennir yn dorfol gyda Llenyddiaeth Cymru a gefnogir, fel y dywedaso, gan y trethdalwr drwy Lywodraeth Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru? Ystyr cyhoeddi a ariennir yn dorfol yw pan fo aelodau o'r cyhoedd yn addo cymorth ariannol i brosiect llenyddol penodol, gan greu'r farchnad ragarweiniol ar gyfer y cynnyrch terfynol yn y broses.

festival this year and could be a leverage opportunity for Literature Wales and Welsh publishers, making the small public investment in literature go considerably further.

**Huw Lewis:** ‘Leverage’ is the word; as soon as I hear that word, I become interested. I can assure the Member that I will ask officials to look at these points. I will find out exactly what thinking has already been done and I will write to you with the detail of what is going on.

**Julie Morgan:** Will the Minister join me in congratulating Honno, the Welsh women’s press, which celebrates its twenty-fifth anniversary this year? It was started around a kitchen table in Cardiff. It is the only independent women’s press in the whole of the UK and it has played a huge role in increasing opportunities for Welsh women writers. As the writer Sarah Waters has said, ‘Hurrah for Honno’.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for those points. Honno is one of the Welsh Books Council’s revenue publishers, receiving a grant of £45,000, which enables Honno to publish seven volumes annually. The Welsh Books Council has also been able to assist Honno this year with events to celebrate that twenty-fifth anniversary. Of course, I join Julie Morgan in applauding Honno’s achievement of a quarter of a century of good work.

**Christine Chapman:** On the very real achievements of Welsh authors, Minister, will you join me in congratulating the inspirational Elaine Morgan, who has recently published her autobiography, after writing across a range of genres, and who lives in Mountain Ash? Will you also join me in applauding Aberdare-born author, Jo Walton, who has recently won the 2012 British Fantasy Award for best novel for her latest work, beating, among other contenders, Stephen King?

**Huw Lewis:** Thanks, Christine; of course, I will. I am always delighted to recognise Welsh successes in the arts, sports, and in

Cafodd y syniad ei adfywio yng Ngŵyl y Gelli eleni a gallai fod yn gyfle trosoledd i Lenyddiaeth Cymru a chyhoeddwr yng Nghymru, gan wneud i’r buddsoddiad cyhoeddus bach mewn llenyddiaeth fynd gryn dipyn ymhellach.

**Huw Lewis:** ‘Trosoledd’ yw’r gair; mae clywed y gair hwnnw yn ennyn fy niddordeb yn syth. Gallaf sicrhau’r Aelod y byddaf yn gofyn i swyddogion edrych ar y pwyntiau hyn. Byddaf yn darganfod yn union pa syniadau sydd eisoes wedi cael eu cynnig a byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch gyda manylion yr hyn sy’n digwydd.

**Julie Morgan:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch Honno, gwasg menywod Cymru, sy’n dathlu ei phen-blwydd yn 25 oed eleni? Fe’i sefydlwyd o amgylch bwrdd cegin yng Nghaerdydd. Hi yw’r unig wasg annibynnol i fenywod yn y DU gyfan ac mae wedi chwarae rhan enfawr wrth gynyddu cyfleoedd i awduron benywaidd Cymru. Fel y dywedodd yr awdur Sarah Waters, ‘Hurrah for Honno’.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i’r Aelod am y pwyntiau hynny. Mae Honno yn un o gyhoeddwr refeniw Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru ac yn cael grant o £45,000, sy’n galluogi Honno i gyhoeddi saith cyfrol bob blwyddyn. Mae Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru hefyd wedi gallu cynorthwyo Honno eleni gyda digwyddiadau i ddathlu ei phen-blwydd yn 25 oed. Wrth gwrs, ymunaf â Julie Morgan i ganmol Honno am ei chwarter canrif o waith da.

**Christine Chapman:** O ran llwyddiannau gwirioneddol awduron Cymru, Weinidog, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch yr ysbrydoledig Elaine Morgan, sydd wedi cyhoeddi ei hunangofiant yn ddiweddar, ar ôl ysgrifennu mewn ystod o genres, ac sy’n byw yn Aberpennar? A wnewch chi hefyd ymuno â mi i ganmol yr awdur Jo Walton, a anwyd yn Aberdâr, a enillodd Wobr Ffantasi Prydain 2012 am y nofel orau yn ddiweddar am ei gwaith diweddaraf, gan drechu, ymhlith ymgeiswyr eraill, Stephen King?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch, Christine; wrth gwrs, y gwnaf. Rwyf wrth fy modd bob amser o gydnabod llwyddiannau Cymru yn y

other fields. These authors are our own and are to be congratulated on their considerable achievements. It is a reminder to us all that Welsh literature and Welsh writers are alive and kicking and are operating in a world context at the very highest level.

### Tai Fforddiadwy

**6. Aled Roberts:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefelau'r farchnad ar dai rhent canolradd yng Nghymru a gaiff eu diffinio fel tai fforddiadwy. OAQ(4)0179(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Intermediate rents are rent levels that are above social rents and below market rents. Intermediate rents should be below or up to local housing allowance or up to 75%, in the Welsh context, of market rents.

**Aled Roberts:** Minister, you mentioned the Welsh context of 75%, but, in England, the understanding is that figures would be set at 80% to 90% of market rent. What evidence or research led to the figure that has been decided upon in Wales?

**Huw Lewis:** There has been no evidence or research as yet, but the one thing that guided me in setting this figure of 75% at this point in time is that I think that it would be clear to everyone that affordability in a Welsh context is something that needs to be set at a lower level, for sure, than the UK average. As the intermediate rental market is new—it is embryonic, really—we will carefully monitor exactly how people manage in terms of these sort of intermediate rent levels in the context of a Welsh housing market. It was important to set down a marker that the 80% to 90% level for immediate rent being set across the border in England takes the word 'affordability' and stretches its definition too far.

**Mark Isherwood:** I understand that your scheme is being delivered through the Welsh housing partnership, a partnership with Principality Building Society and a number of housing associations—I think that there

celfyddydau, chwaraeon, ac mewn meysydd eraill. Ein hawduron ni yw'r rhain a dylid eu llongyfarch ar eu cyflawniadau sylweddol. Mae hyn yn ein hatgoffa ni i gyd fod llenyddiaeth yng Nghymru ac ysgrifenyddwyr Cymru yn fyw ac yn iach ac yn gweithio mewn cyd-destun byd-eang ar y lefel uchaf.

### Affordable Housing

**6. Aled Roberts:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the market levels on intermediate rental housing in Wales that is defined as affordable housing. OAQ(4)0179(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Rhenti canolradd yw lefelau rhent sy'n uwch na rhenti cymdeithasol ac yn is na rhenti'r farchnad. Dylai rhenti canolradd fod yn is na'r lwfans tai lleol neu gyfateb iddo neu dylent fod hyd at 75% o renti'r farchnad, yng nghyd-destun Cymru.

**Aled Roberts:** Weinidog, gwnaethoch sôn am gyd-destun Cymru o 75%, ond, yn Lloegr, y ddealltwriaeth yw y byddai'r ffigurau yn cael eu gosod ar gyfradd o 80% i 90% o rent y farchnad. Pa dystiolaeth neu ymchwil a arweiniodd at y ffigur y penderfynwyd arno yng Nghymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth nac ymchwil hyd yma, ond yr un peth a wnaeth fy arwain i osod y ffigur hwn o 75% ar hyn o bryd yw y credaf y byddai'n glir i bawb bod fforddiadwyedd yng nghyd-destun Cymru yn rhywbeth y mae angen ei osod ar lefel is, yn sicr, na chyfartaledd y DU. Gan fod y farchnad rhentu canolradd yn newydd—yn embryonig, mewn gwirionedd—byddwn yn monitro'n ofalus yn union sut y mae pobl yn ymdopi â'r mathau hyn o lefelau rhent canolradd yng nghyd-destun marchnad dai Cymru. Roedd yn bwysig i osod marciwr i ddangos bod y lefel o 80% i 90% ar gyfer rhent canolradd sy'n cael ei gosod dros y ffin yn Lloegr yn cymryd y gair 'fforddiadwyedd' ac yn ymestyn ei ddiffiniad yn rhy bell.

**Mark Isherwood:** Deallaf fod eich cynllun yn cael ei gyflwyno drwy bartneriaeth tai Cymru, partneriaeth gyda Chymdeithas Adeiladu'r Principality a nifer o gymdeithasau tai—tair ohonynt rwy'n credu,



are three, including Cymdeithas Tai Clwyd. However, I am advised that this is backed by funding that will be repayable after 10 years, presumably because of the current state of the mortgage market and the associated risks. Therefore, what contingency or budget planning are you putting in place to ensure that, at the end of that 10-year period, succession funding might be in place?

**Huw Lewis:** I am afraid that the Member is asking me to go beyond the use of political judgment to some extent and to enter the realm of crystal-ball gazing. It is absolutely true—and anyone can take a look at the figures—that the overall capital that the Welsh Government has available in order to invest in affordable housing is falling by around 40%. Alternative forms of funding packages have to be constructed in that context if we are to meet the severe need that is out there and face up to the housing shortage that Wales has suffered for decades. I would encourage the Member to exert whatever pressure he can upon his colleagues in the UK Government to ensure that Wales is properly funded when it comes to our ability to supply decent homes that people can afford.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Minister, are you aware that it is predicted that there will be a substantial drop in affordable rents within the private rented sector? A year or so ago, you said that you would consider using your powers to introduce a cap on those rents, but recently a spokesperson for you has confirmed that you now have no plans to introduce rent regulation. As your party is committed to introducing regional housing benefit caps across the UK when it can, can you explain the principles that underpin the approach that housing benefit should be capped, but rents in the private rented sector need no control other than the free market?

**Huw Lewis:** The Member is being slightly disingenuous when she implies that such things are decided and are Welsh Government policy, because they are not. We are in a period in which it is extraordinarily difficult to predict the effect upon rents,

gan gynnwys Cymdeithas Tai Clwyd. Fodd bynnag, rwyf ar ddeall bod hyn yn cael ei gefnogi gan arian a fydd yn ad-daladwy ar ôl 10 mlynedd, a hynny, yn ôl pob tebyg, oherwydd cyflwr presennol y farchnad morgeisi a'r risgiau cysylltiedig. Felly, pa gynlluniau wrth gefn neu gynlluniau cyllideb rydych yn eu rhoi ar waith i sicrhau, ar ddiwedd y cyfnod o 10 mlynedd, y gallai cyllid olyniaeth fod ar gael?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae arnaf ofn bod yr Aelod yn gofyn imi fynd y tu hwnt i ddefnyddio barn wleidyddol i ryw raddau ac i ddechrau edrych i mewn i bêl risial. Mae'n hollol wir—a gall unrhyw un gymryd golwg ar y ffigurau—bod y cyfalaf cyffredinol sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i'w fuddsoddi mewn tai fforddiadwy yn gostwng tua 40%. Mae'n rhaid llunio mathau eraill o becynnau ariannu yn y cydestun hwnnw os ydym am ddiwallu'r angen dybryd sydd yno a wynebu'r broblem yn ymwneud â phrinder tai y mae Cymru wedi ei dioddef ers degawdau. Byddwn yn annog yr Aelod i geisio pwysu mewn unrhyw ffordd bosibl ar ei gyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chyllido'n briodol mewn perthynas â'n gallu i ddarparu cartrefi gweddus y gall pobl eu fforddio.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Weinidog, a ydych yn ymwybodol y rhagwelir y bydd gostyngiad sylweddol mewn rhenti fforddiadwy o fewn y sector rhentu preifat? Tua blwyddyn yn ôl, dywedasoch y byddech yn ystyried defnyddio eich pwerau i gyflwyno cap ar y rhenti hynny, ond yn ddiweddar mae llefarydd ar eich rhan wedi cadarnhau nad oes gennych bellach unrhyw gynlluniau i gyflwyno trefniadau rheoleiddio rhenti. Gan fod eich plaid wedi ymrwymo i gyflwyno capiau budd-dal tai rhanbarthol ledled y DU lle bo'n bosibl, a allwch egluro'r egwyddorion sy'n sail i'r ymagwedd y dylai budd-dal tai gael ei gapio, ond nad oes angen unrhyw reolaeth ar renti yn y sector rhentu preifat ar wahân i'r farchnad rydd?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r Aelod fymryn yn ffuantus wrth awgrymu bod y pethau hyn wedi cael eu penderfynu a'u bod yn bolisi gan Lywodraeth Cymru, oherwydd nid yw hynny'n wir. Rydym mewn cyfnod lle mae'n hynod anodd rhagweld yr effaith a gaiff, er

tenants and landlords of, for instance, the forthcoming housing benefit reforms—so called—that the UK Government is imposing upon us. Could that mean, for instance, that social landlords, in having to accommodate the fact that tenants will be less able to meet rental payments, end up in such arrears that they are not able to continue making decent levels of investment in the quality and supply of social housing as they would like? I have asked a team of experts to examine and predict, as accurately as we possibly can, what these changes will mean in a Welsh context in terms of what kinds of rent levels are sustainable and affordable for people and the effect that this might have on landlords, whether they are in the social housing sector or the private rented sector. The truth of the matter is—any honest observer would tell you this—that at the moment we simply do not know what effect this will have on thousands of households, except that we do know that the effect will be negative.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7, OAQ(4)0171(HRH), will not be asked.

#### **Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer Tai Fforddiadwy**

**8. Simon Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy. OAQ(4)0176(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** My priorities for affordable housing are set out in the housing White Paper. They centre on continuing successful capital delivery programmes and innovating to increase the supply of homes, making certain we provide the right type of quality housing and provide more choice for people in housing need in Wales.

**Simon Thomas:** I believe that we expect a statement from the Government about further borrowing powers for capital investment in Wales shortly. Can the Minister for housing assure the Assembly that he has made a bid for investment in the capital affordable housing programme if such borrowing powers come forward?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Mid and

enghraifft, y diwygiadau—fel y'u gelwir—budd-dal tai sydd ar y gweill y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn eu gorfodi arnom, ar renti, tenantiaid a landlordiaid. A allai hynny olygu, er enghraifft, y bydd landlordiaid cymdeithasol, am fod yn rhaid iddynt wneud darpariaethau ar gyfer y ffaith y bydd tenantiaid yn llai abl i wneud taliadau rhent, yn mynd i gymaint o ôl-ddyled fel na allant barhau i fuddsoddi lefelau da o arian yn ansawdd a chyflenwad tai cymdeithasol fel y byddent yn hoffi? Rwyf wedi gofyn i dîm o arbenigwyr ystyried a rhagfynegi, mor gywir ag y gallwn, beth fydd y newidiadau hyn yn ei olygu yng nghyd-destun Cymru o ran pa fathau o lefelau rhent sy'n gynaliadwy ac yn fforddiadwy i bobl a'r effaith y gallai hyn ei chael ar landlordiaid, p'un a ydynt yn y sector tai cymdeithasol neu'r sector rhentu preifat. Y gwir amdani yw—fel y byddai unrhyw arsylwr onest yn ei ddweud wrthyfych—ar hyn o bryd, nid ydym yn gwybod pa effaith a gaiff hyn ar filoedd o aelwydydd, heblaw ein bod yn gwybod y bydd yr effaith yn negyddol.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni chaiff cwestiwn 7, OAQ(4)0171 (HRH), ei ofyn.

#### **Priorities on Affordable Housing**

**8. Simon Thomas:** *Will the Minister outline his priorities on affordable housing. OAQ(4)0176(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Nodir fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy yn y Papur Gwyn ar dai. Maent yn canolbwyntio ar barhau â rhaglenni cyflawni cyfalaf llwyddiannus ac arloesi i gynyddu'r cyflenwad o gartrefi, gan wneud yn siŵr ein bod yn darparu'r math cywir o dai o ansawdd ac yn rhoi mwy o ddewis i bobl y mae angen tai arnynt yng Nghymru.

**Simon Thomas:** Credaf ein bod yn disgwyl datganiad gan y Llywodraeth am bwerau benthyca pellach ar gyfer buddsoddi cyfalaf yng Nghymru yn fuan. A all y Gweinidog tai sicrhau'r Cynulliad ei fod wedi gwneud cais am fuddsoddiad yn y rhaglen cyfalaf tai fforddiadwy os caiff pwerau benthyca o'r fath eu cyflwyno?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros

West Wales for underlining the importance of housing within the overall context of innovative financial mechanisms. The short answer to your question is: yes, of course.

**Mohammad Asghar:** The Conservative-led Government in Westminster has pledged to provide an additional 15,000 affordable homes in England by using a system of loan guarantees. These state-backed guarantees encourage private investment in affordable housing rather than government grants and form part of a package of measures to boost the housing market, which has been welcomed by the Chartered Institute of Housing and the National Housing Federation. I know the Minister is doing his best for the housing market in Wales. Will he undertake to study what is being done in England to see whether a similar scheme could boost the supply of affordable housing in Wales?

3.00 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** I will undertake to look at any reasonable idea that boosts the supply of affordable housing, but I have to inform the Member that, given the multiplicity of announcements that issue forth from Ministers for housing in England, my experience is that the press release and the reality simply will not match. People in England have had a great deal of huff and puff from successive Ministers for housing in the UK context. The reality in England is that social housing continues to be denuded through the right to buy, and that affordable housing at social market rents is given no priority at all by the UK Government, which puts all its eggs in one basket, and that is the idea of affordable rent at between 80% and 90% of market rent. That is not a social housing policy that I recognise.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, park homes are often regarded as an affordable housing option by older citizens. While the legislation proposed by my colleague, Peter Black, will go a long way towards affording them proper protection, much will depend on the enactment of regulations by the Welsh Government. Will you give a commitment that there will be no delays by the Welsh

Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru am danlinellu pwysigrwydd tai o fewn cyd-destun cyffredinol mecanweithiau ariannol arloesol. Yr ateb byr i'ch cwestiwn yw: gall, wrth gwrs.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae'r Llywodraeth dan arweiniad y Ceidwadwyr yn San Steffan wedi addo darparu 15,000 yn rhagor o dai fforddiadwy yn Lloegr drwy ddefnyddio system o warantau benthyciadau. Mae'r gwarantau hyn a gefnogir gan y wladwriaeth yn annog buddsoddiad preifat mewn tai fforddiadwy yn hytrach na grantiau gan y llywodraeth ac yn ffurfio rhan o becyn o fesurau i roi hwb i'r farchnad dai, sydd wedi'i groesawu gan y Sefydliad Tai Siartredig a'r Ffederasiwn Tai Cenedlaethol. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn gwneud ei orau dros y farchnad dai yng Nghymru. A wnaiff ymgymryd i astudio beth sy'n cael ei wneud yn Lloegr i weld a allai cynllun tebyg gynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru?

**Huw Lewis:** Byddaf yn ymgymryd i edrych ar unrhyw syniad rhesymol sy'n cynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy, ond rhaid imi hysbysu'r Aelod, o ystyried nifer fawr y cyhoeddiadau a wneir gan Weinidogion tai yn Lloegr, fy mhrofiad i yw na fydd y datganiad i'r wasg yn cyfateb i'r realiti. Mae pobl yn Lloegr wedi clywed llawer iawn o siarad gwag gan Weinidogion tai olynol yng nghyd-destun y DU. Y realiti yn Lloegr yw bod tai cymdeithasol yn parhau i gael eu dinoethi drwy'r hawl i brynu, ac nad yw tai fforddiadwy ar renti'r farchnad gymdeithasol yn cael unrhyw flaenoriaeth o gwbl gan Lywodraeth y DU, sy'n rhoi ei hwylau i gyd yn yr un fased, sef y syniad o rent fforddiadwy ar gyfradd o rhwng 80% a 90% o rent y farchnad. Nid yw hwnnw'n bolisi tai cymdeithasol rydw i'n ei adnabod.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, caiff cartrefi mewn parciau eu hystyried yn aml fel opsiwn tai fforddiadwy gan ddinasyddion hŷn. Er y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth a gynigir gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Peter Black, yn gwneud cryn dipyn i'w hamddiffyn yn briodol, bydd llawer yn dibynnu ar gamau gan Lywodraeth Cymru i ddeddfu rheoliadau. A wnewch chi roi ymrwymiad na fydd unrhyw oedi gan

Government in enacting regulations that would give life to Peter Black's private Member's legislation, should it pass successfully through the Chamber?

**Huw Lewis:** I thank you for that question. Your colleague, Peter Black, is more than aware of the open and co-operative way in which I have approached the propositions for park homes that he will put before us as an Assembly. The problem is real and it requires, among other things, a legislative solution. The offer of Government support is open and on the table. It will require two-way co-working to bring together what will be a complex piece of legislation as a piece of good law.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 9, OAQ(4)0170(HRH), is withdrawn, and question 10, OAQ(4)0172(HRH), will not be asked.

#### Tai Fforddiadwy

**II. Aled Roberts:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi manylion am ba ddiffiniadau a gaiiff eu defnyddio wrth asesu targed Llywodraeth Cymru i adeiladu 7,500 o dai fforddiadwy yn nhyrnor y Cynulliad hwn. OAQ(4)0178(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** In assessing our affordable housing target, affordable housing applies to housing where there are secure mechanisms in place to ensure that it is accessible to those who cannot afford market housing, both on first occupation and for subsequent occupiers, as defined and laid out in technical advice note 2 on planning and affordable housing, published in 2006.

**Aled Roberts:** Minister, you have referred today to the target of bringing 5,000 empty homes back into use, and the target that was mentioned in the question was for 7,500 affordable homes. In response to a request from Peter Black about monitoring how the target was being met, you referred to regular data being provided, but then went on to refer to annual data collection. Given the problems that we have with affordable housing, do you think that annual data are sufficient in this regard?

Llywodraeth Cymru wrth ddeddfu rheoliadau a fyddai'n rhoi grym i ddeddfwriaeth Aelod preifat Peter Black, pe caiff ei phasio'n llwyddiannus drwy'r Siambr?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch ichi am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Gwyr eich cyd-Aelod, Peter Black, yn iawn fy mod wedi ymdrin â'r cynigion ar gyfer cartrefi mewn parciau y bydd yn eu gosod ger ein bron fel Cynulliad mewn ffordd agored a chydweithredol. Mae'n broblem wirioneddol sy'n gofyn am, ymysg pethau eraill, ateb deddfwriaethol. Mae'r cynnig o gefnogaeth gan y Llywodraeth yn agored ac ar gael ichi. Bydd angen cydweithio dwyffordd i ddwyn ynghyd yr hyn a fydd yn ddarn cymhleth o ddeddfwriaeth yn ddarn o gyfraith dda.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ(4)0170(HRH), yn ôl, ac ni chaiff cwestiwn 10, OAQ(4)0172(HRH), ei ofyn.

#### Affordable Homes

**II. Aled Roberts:** *Will the Minister provide details on what definitions will be applied in assessing the Welsh Government's target of building 7,500 affordable homes this Assembly. OAQ(4)0178(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Wrth asesu ein targed tai fforddiadwy, mae tai fforddiadwy yn cyfeirio at dai lle mae trefniadau diogel ar waith i sicrhau eu bod ar gael i'r rheiny nad ydynt yn gallu fforddio tai ar y farchnad, ar ddeiliadaeth gyntaf ac ar gyfer meddianwyr wedi hynny, fel y cant eu diffinio a'u nodi yn nodyn cyngor technegol 2 ar gynllunio a thai fforddiadwy, a gyhoeddwyd yn 2006.

**Aled Roberts:** Weinidog, rydych wedi cyfeirio heddiw at y targed o ddod â 5,000 o gartrefi gwag yn ôl i ddefnydd, a'r targed y soniwyd amdano yn y cwestiwn oedd 7,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy. Mewn ymateb i gais gan Peter Black ynghylch monitro sut roedd y targed hwnnw'n cael ei gyflawni, cyfeiriasoch at y ffaith bod data rheolaidd yn cael eu darparu, ond yna dywedasoch fod data'n cael eu casglu'n flynyddol. O ystyried y problemau sydd gennym o ran tai fforddiadwy, a ydych yn meddwl bod data blynyddol yn ddigonol yn hyn o beth?

**Huw Lewis:** You are right. They are not, and I have revised that so that we now have quarterly monitoring of the situation. This target is at the heart of my commitment as a Minister to the affordable housing sector. We are in stormy waters when it comes to changes in UK Government policy, for instance on housing benefit and so on, and we are in very difficult circumstances when it comes to the availability of capital. Therefore, you have a point, I accept it, and the monitoring will now be quarterly.

**William Graham:** Does the Minister not agree that there are a variety of ways in which housing can be helped? These include: section 106 agreements to define the percentage of social housing, which could be looked at once again; support for registered social landlords to develop social housing; and support for the development of brownfield sites. The Minister might also consider selling Assembly land to develop social housing.

**Huw Lewis:** All these things are true and all these things are being acted upon. On the release of Welsh Government-owned land to provide options for housing, work has progressed at a pace, and we already have a scheme in place in north Cardiff to deliver around 700 homes through the use of Assembly land and innovative financial partnerships with the private sector and others. That work continues apace. I have a dedicated team now within my housing department, working on the release of publicly owned land, which may be owned by us or by one of our subsidiary organisations, or indeed, by some other player within the public sector.

### Adfywio Canol Trefi

**12. Elin Jones:** *Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cefnogi adfywio canol trefi. OAQ(4)0163(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Ceredigion for that question. The Welsh Government is committed to safeguarding and regenerating our town centres. I will have a great deal more to say on this matter

**Huw Lewis:** Rydych yn gywir. Nid ydynt yn ddigonol, ac rwyf wedi diwygio pethau fel ein bod bellach yn monitro'r sefyllfa yn chwarterol. Mae'r targed hwn wrth wraidd fy ymrwymiad fel Gweinidog i'r sector tai fforddiadwy. Rydym mewn dyfroedd stormus pan ddaw i newidiadau ym mholisi Llywodraeth y DU, er enghraifft ar fudd-dal tai ac yn y blaen, ac rydym mewn sefyllfa anodd iawn o ran argaeledd cyfalaf. Felly, mae gennych bwynt, rwy'n derbyn hynny, a byddwn nawr yn monitro'r sefyllfa yn chwarterol.

**William Graham:** Onid yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod amrywiaeth o ffyrdd y gellir helpu'r sefyllfa tai? Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys: cytundebau adran 106 i ddiffinio canran y tai cymdeithasol, y gellid eu hystyried unwaith eto; cymorth i landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ddatblygu tai cymdeithasol, a chymorth i ddatblygu safleoedd tir llwyd. Gall y Gweinidog hefyd ystyried gwerthu tir y Cynulliad i ddatblygu tai cymdeithasol.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r holl bethau hyn yn wir ac mae'r holl bethau hyn yn cael eu gweithredu. O ran rhyddhau tir sy'n eiddo i Lywodraeth Cymru i ddarparu opsiynau ar gyfer tai, mae gwaith wedi mynd rhagddo'n gyflym, ac mae gennym eisoes gynllun ar waith yng ngogledd Caerdydd i ddarparu tua 700 o gartrefi drwy ddefnyddio tir y Cynulliad a phartneriaethau ariannol arloesol gyda'r sector preifat ac eraill. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn parhau yn gyflym. Mae gennyf bellach dîm pwrpasol yn fy adran dai, sy'n gweithio ar ryddhau tir sy'n eiddo cyhoeddus, a all fod yn eiddo inni neu un o'n his-sefydliadau, neu yn wir, ryw gorff arall o fewn y sector cyhoeddus.

### Town Centre Regeneration

**12. Elin Jones:** *How is the Welsh Government supporting town centre regeneration. OAQ(4)0163(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Geredigion am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwymo i ddiogelu ac adfywio canol ein trefi. Bydd gennyf lawer mwy i'w ddweud ar y mater

following the launch of the regeneration framework next week.

**Elin Jones:** Mae rhai busnesau a siopau canol tref yn fy etholaeth i yn adrodd bod eu trosiant wedi cwmpo yn sylweddol yn ystod yr argyfwng economaidd hwn. A ydych wedi trafod gyda'r Gweinidog busnes yr angen i leihau'r byrdwn o ardrethi busnes ar siopau canol tref, er mwyn eu cynnal drwy'r argyfwng economaidd a lleihau'r angen, maes o law, am eich cyllideb adfywio chi?

**Huw Lewis:** Inter-ministerial discussions about this and other issues concerning town centres go on regularly, if not constantly. I would be very keen not to regard business rates as some kind of holy grail when it comes to the problems that face our town centres, particularly retailers in town centres. The situation is much more complex than that. The Member will be aware of the good work that is going on in her constituency, in Aberystwyth, where we are attempting to bring several players from housing and retail together to realise what can be done for the needs of a particular town centre when working as a team. It is also important to realise that we should take expert advice on the needs of individual towns, no two of which are exactly alike. There will be much more work to do on this issue, and I will have a great deal more to say on the matter next week, following the launch of the regeneration framework.

**William Powell:** Will the Minister please provide an update on the progress made in implementing recommendation 14 of the recent Enterprise and Business Committee's report on town centre regeneration? That recommendation was about local managers or town centre champions taking forward regeneration initiatives.

**Huw Lewis:** Again, I ask the Member to be patient for just a week longer. Recommendation 14 regarding local town centre management and so on was universally acknowledged as something that had substance and importance. I am sure that you will not be disappointed with the emphasis given to that kind of work when the framework is announced next week, and of

hwn yn dilyn lansiad y fframwaith adfywio yr wythnos nesaf.

**Elin Jones:** Some town-centre shops and businesses in my constituency report that their turnover has fallen sharply during the economic crisis. Have you had discussions with the Minister for business about the need to reduce the burden of business rates on town-centre shops to sustain them through the economic crisis and reduce the need, in due course, for your regeneration budget?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae trafodaethau rhwng gweinidogion ynglŷn â'r mater hwn a materion eraill sy'n ymwneud â chanol trefi yn digwydd yn rheolaidd, os nad yn barhaus. Byddwn yn awyddus iawn i beidio ag ystyried ardrethi busnes fel rhyw fath o real sanctaidd mewn perthynas â'r problemau sy'n wynebu canol ein trefi, yn enwedig manwerthwyr yng nghanol trefi. Mae'r sefyllfa yn llawer mwy cymhleth na hynny. Bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith da sy'n digwydd yn ei hetholaeth, yn Aberystwyth, lle rydym yn ceisio dod â sawl corff o'r maes tai a manwerthu at ei gilydd i sylweddoli beth y gellir ei wneud i ddiwallu anghenion canol tref penodol wrth weithio fel tîm. Mae hefyd yn bwysig sylweddoli y dylem gymryd cyngor arbenigol ar anghenion trefi unigol, sydd i gyd yn wahanol. Bydd llawer mwy o waith i'w wneud ar y mater hwn, a bydd gennyf lawer mwy i'w ddweud ar y mater hwn yr wythnos nesaf, yn dilyn lansiad y fframwaith adfywio.

**William Powell:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd a wnaed wrth weithredu argymhelliad 14 o adroddiad diweddar y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar adfywio canol trefi? Yr argymhelliad hwnnw oedd y dylai rheolwyr lleol neu hyrwyddwyr canol trefi symud mentrau adfywio yn eu blaen.

**Huw Lewis:** Unwaith eto, gofynnaf i'r Aelod fod yn amyneddgar am wythnos arall. Cydnabuwyd yn gyffredinol fod argymhelliad 14 ynghylch rheoli canol trefi lleol yn argymhelliad o sylwedd ac o bwys. Rwy'n siŵr na fyddwch yn siomedig â'r pwyslais a roddir ar y math hwnnw o waith pan gaiff y fframwaith ei gyhoeddi yr wythnos nesaf, ac wrth gwrs croesawaf eich

course I reach out to you for your comments on it, so that we can take everyone's views into account.

sylwadau arno, fel y gallwn gymryd barn pawb i ystyriaeth.

### Safon Ansawdd Tai Cymru

### The Welsh Quality Housing Standards

**13. Eluned Parrott:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd o ran cyflawni Safon Ansawdd Tai Cymru. OAQ(4)0166(HRH)*

**13. Eluned Parrott:** *Will the Minister make a statement on progress in delivering the Welsh Quality Housing Standard. OAQ(4)0166(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Yes. Although the 2012 target will not be met by some landlords, good progress is being made towards achieving the Welsh housing quality standard, as indicated in the statistics on progress that were released this week. The continuing improvement of tenants' homes is providing many wider benefits for our communities.

**Huw Lewis:** Gwnaf. Er na chaiff targed 2012 ei gyflawni gan rai landlordiaid, mae cynnydd da yn cael ei wneud tuag at gyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru, fel y nodir yn yr ystadegau ar gynnydd a ryddhawyd yr wythnos hon. Mae'r gwelliannau parhaus i gartrefi tenantiaid yn arwain at lawer o fanteision ehangach i'n cymunedau.

**Eluned Parrott:** I listened with interest to your earlier responses to my colleague, Peter Black. If the reason you did not reach your target for full compliance on the Welsh housing quality standard was lack of progress in exiting the housing subsidy system, can you explain why only 33% of housing association homes were fully compliant—less than half of your target—when they are not in the housing subsidy system?

**Eluned Parrott:** Gwrandewais gyda diddordeb ar eich atebion cynharach i'm cyd-Aelod, Peter Black. Os mai'r rheswm pam na wnaethoch gyflawni eich targed ar gyfer cydymffurfiaeth lawn â safon ansawdd tai Cymru oedd anhawster i adael y system cymhorthdal tai, a allwch egluro pam mai dim ond 33% o gartrefi cymdeithasau tai oedd yn cydymffurfio'n llawn—llai na hanner eich targed—pan nad ydynt yn rhan o'r system cymhorthdal tai?

**Huw Lewis:** I have expressed my disappointment about how those headline figures are working out. We need to dig deeper to find out exactly what is going on and what the picture is across Wales in respect of registered social landlords and local authorities. We need to get to the bottom of what is happening. What is true is that the £108 million per year that the Welsh Government invests to support the work on the Welsh housing quality standard is a level of spend that has been protected—an extraordinarily difficult thing to do in this economic climate. I have established a ministerial taskforce to consider progress by all social landlords and to explore the barriers to achievement. As I say, we will have robust monitoring so that we can accurately track progress as it unfurls.

**Huw Lewis:** Rwyf wedi mynegi fy siom ynghylch y ffigurau pennawd hynny. Mae angen inni edrych yn ddyfnach i ddarganfod beth yn union sy'n digwydd a beth yw'r darlun ledled Cymru mewn perthynas â landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ac awdurdodau lleol. Mae angen inni fynd at wraidd yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Yr hyn sy'n wir yw bod yr £108 miliwn y flwyddyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei fuddsoddi i gefnogi'r gwaith ar safon ansawdd tai Cymru yn wariant sydd wedi'i ddiogelu—rhywbeth sy'n eithriadol o anodd i'w wneud yn yr hinsawdd economaidd sydd ohoni. Rwyf wedi sefydlu tasglu gweinidogol i ystyried y cynnydd a wneir gan bob landlord cymdeithasol ac i ymchwilio i'r rhwystrau i gyflawni. Fel y dywedais, bydd gennym drefniadau monitro cadarn fel y gallwn olrhain cynnydd yn gywir wrth iddo ddiogwydd.

There are two things that are worth bearing in mind. First, although good progress has been achieved across the board—on heating for instance, as around 70% of social housing now has a decent heating system—that translates into a very disappointing figure in the statistics when you consider the entire package of improvement that might be necessary in a home, with issues with kitchens, bathrooms and so on. Obviously, there is a job of work to be done in making sure that we co-ordinate this work.

**Darren Millar:** Minister, one of the issues that has been raised with the Public Accounts Committee about the Welsh housing quality standard is that it currently relies on self-reported compliance. What work are you doing as a Welsh Government to ensure that, when someone reports that a property is now compliant with the standard, it is actually compliant and has been verified by a third party?

**Huw Lewis:** I have asked officials to construct sampling with mystery shopping exercises, if you like, to ensure that compliance is a reality on the ground. The Welsh Government is not letting go of our commitment to the Welsh housing quality standard. Whether the statistics are disappointing or not, and whether some landlords or others are progressing well or not, we are not letting go of this commitment.

### Adfywio Cymunedol

**14. Mark Drakeford:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr effaith y mae buddsoddi mewn tai yn ei chael ar adfywio cymunedol. OAQ(4)0168(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** I thank the Member for Cardiff West. Housing investment can have a range of regeneration impacts, including enhancing attractiveness and a sense of place in communities, improving services for vulnerable people, increasing footfall and supply chains for local businesses and, of course, providing jobs and training for local people. We work with partners across Wales to capture those benefits as best we can.

Mae'n werth cadw dau beth mewn cof. Yn gyntaf, er bod cynnydd da wedi cael ei wneud yn gyffredinol—ar wres er enghraifft, gan fod gan tua 70% o dai cymdeithasol system wresogi weddus erbyn hyn—mae hynny'n trosi'n ffigur siomedig iawn yn yr ystadegau pan fyddwch yn ystyried y pecyn cyfan o welliant y gallai fod ei angen mewn cartref, gyda phroblemau gyda cheginau, ystafelloedd ymolchi ac yn y blaen. Yn amlwg, mae gwaith i'w wneud i sicrhau ein bod yn cyd-drefnu'r gwaith hwn.

**Darren Millar:** Weinidog, un o'r materion a godwyd gyda'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus ynghylch safon ansawdd tai Cymru yw ei bod ar hyn o bryd yn dibynnu ar gydymffurfiaeth hunan-gofnodedig. Pa waith rydych yn ei wneud fel Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau, pan fydd rhywun yn adrodd bod eiddo bellach yn cydymffurfio â'r safon, ei fod yn cydymffurfio mewn gwirionedd ac wedi cael ei wirio gan drydydd parti?

**Huw Lewis:** Rwyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion wneud gwaith samplu gydag ymarferion cwsmer cudd, os mynnwch, er mwyn sicrhau bod cydymffurfiaeth yn realiti ar lawr gwlad. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn ildio ein hymrwymiad i safon ansawdd tai Cymru. P'un a yw'r ystadegau yn siomedig ai peidio, a ph'un a yw rhai landlordiaid neu eraill yn gwneud cynnydd da ai peidio, nid ydym yn ildio'r ymrwymiad hwn.

### Community Regeneration

**14. Mark Drakeford:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the community regeneration impact of investment in housing. OAQ(4)0168(HRH)*

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Orllewin Caerdydd. Gall buddsoddi mewn tai gael ystod o effeithiau adfywio, gan gynnwys gwneud cymunedau yn fwy deniadol a gwella eu hymdeimlad o le, gwella gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl sy'n agored i niwed, cynyddu nifer y cwsmeriaid a chadwyni cyflenwi ar gyfer busnesau lleol ac, wrth gwrs, ddarparu swyddi a hyfforddiant i bobl lleol. Rydym yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid ledled Cymru i gyflawni'r buddiannau hynny hyd eithaf ein gallu.



**Mark Drakeford:** Thank you for that answer, Minister, with which I much agree. Can you give me an assurance that you are conveying those same messages to your Cabinet colleagues so that, when decisions are made in local development plans about the siting of new housing, they are put in places where the maximum regeneration impact can be obtained in a way that a Labour Government would wish to see, rather than simply being dictated by what the market thinks it requires?

**Huw Lewis:** Yes, of course. That is a key aspect of my commitment—and was, within days of my taking on this portfolio—to align housing policy within Wales as closely as possible to what is happening within our regeneration work, if you like, to break down the silos between the two headings of activity, and regard them as a unified whole in delivering for communities.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Ken Skates to ask question 15.

**Kenneth Skates:** Minister, on Sunday, I joined almost 18,000 runners in the Cardiff half marathon. It was a spectacular event, and the people of Cardiff showed wonderful support.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know that we need to move on, but you need to ask the question on the paper.

**Kenneth Skates:** I am sorry, Presiding Officer. Minister, will you look at the current schedule of road runs in north Wales to see whether there is potential to grow some half marathons in that part of Wales?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Sorry, but I think that we will have to move on.

**Kenneth Skates:** Sorry.

**The Presiding Officer:** Two tries are enough. Thank you very much Minister. We now move to item 3.

*Ni ofynnwyd cwestiwn 15, OAQ(4)0173(HRH).*

**Mark Drakeford:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog, yr wyf cytuno ag ef i'r carn. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi eich bod yn cyfleu'r un negeseuon i'ch cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet er mwyn sicrhau, pan fydd penderfyniadau'n cael eu gwneud mewn cynlluniau datblygu lleol ynglŷn â lleoliad tai newydd, y cânt eu rhoi mewn mannau lle y gallant gael yr effaith adfywio fwyaf bosibl mewn ffordd y byddai Llywodraeth Lafur yn dymuno ei gweld, yn hytrach nag ufuddhau i'r hyn y mae'r farchnad yn meddwl sydd ei angen?

**Huw Lewis:** Gallaf, wrth gwrs. Mae honno'n agwedd allweddol ar fy ymrwymiad—ac roedd felly o fewn dyddiau imi ymgymryd â'r portffolio hwn—i alinio polisi tai yng Nghymru mor agos â phosibl â'r hyn sy'n digwydd o fewn ein gwaith adfywio, os mynnwch, i gael gwared ar y seilos rhwng y ddau bennawd o weithgarwch, a'u hystyried gyda'i gilydd wrth ddarparu ar gyfer cymunedau.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Ken Skates i ofyn cwestiwn 15.

**Kenneth Skates:** Weinidog, ddydd Sul, ymunais â bron 18,000 o redwyr yn hanner marathon Caerdydd. Roedd yn ddigwyddiad anhygoel, a dangosodd pobl Caerdydd gefnogaeth wych.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwn fod angen inni symud ymlaen, ond mae angen ichi ofyn y cwestiwn ar y papur.

**Kenneth Skates:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd. Weinidog, a wnewch chi edrych ar y rhestr bresennol o ddigwyddiadau rhedeg ar y ffyrdd yng ngogledd Cymru i weld a oes potensial i gynnal rhai digwyddiadau hanner marathon yn y rhan honno o Gymru?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond rwy'n meddwl y bydd yn rhaid inni symud ymlaen.

**Kenneth Skates:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae dau ymgais yn ddigon. Diolch yn fawr iawn Weinidog. Symudwn yn awr at eitem 3.

*Question 15, OAQ(4)0173(HRH), was not asked.*

**Dadl gan Aelodau Unigol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.21(iv)  
Debate by Individual Members under Standing Order No. 11.21(iv)**

**Ynni Adnewyddadwy o Aber Afon Hafren  
Renewable Energy from the Severn Estuary**

*Cynnig NDM5020 Simon Thomas, Mick Antoniwi, Russell George, William Powell*

*Motion NDM5020 Simon Thomas, Mick Antoniwi, Russell George, William Powell*

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*The National Assembly:*

*1. Yn cydnabod y potensial i gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy o Aber Afon Hafren a phwysigrwydd prosiect o'r fath i Lywodraeth Cymru o ran cyflawni ei thargedau ynni adnewyddadwy, yn ogystal â'r potensial i greu cyflogaeth a chyfleoedd hyfforddi; a*

*1. Recognises the potential to produce renewable energy from the Severn estuary and the importance of such a project for the Welsh Government in achieving its renewable energy targets as well as the potential for the creation of employment and training opportunities; and*

*2. Yn credu, wrth ddatblygu ynni o'r fath, y dylid dylunio'r dechnoleg i echdynnu'r ynni gan sicrhau ei fod yn cael yr effaith amgylcheddol leiaf bosibl, cyn belled ag sy'n rhesymol ymarferol a chymesur.*

*2. Believes that, in the development of such energy, the technology for extracting such energy should be designed to ensure that as far as is reasonably practical and proportionate, it has the minimum possible environmental impact.*

**Simon Thomas:** Cynigiau y cynnig yn fy enw i ac yn enwau Mick Antoniwi, Russell George a William Powell.

**Simon Thomas:** I move the motion in my name and the names of Mick Antoniwi, Russell George and William Powell.

Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i godi'r pwnc hwn yn y ddadl hon heddiw, ac rwy'n ddiolchgar i Mick Antoniwi, Russell George a William Powell am gymryd rhan a chyflwyno'r cynnig hwn ar y cyd. Mae'r cynnig yn ymwneud â'r potensial i gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy o aber afon Hafren, ac rydym yn credu, wrth ddatblygu hynny, y dylid dylunio'r dechnoleg i echdynnu'r ynni gan sicrhau ei bod yn cael yr effaith amgylcheddol leiaf bosibl.

I am grateful for the opportunity to raise this topic for debate today, and I am also grateful to Mick Antoniwi, Russell George and William Powell for taking part and for tabling this motion for debate jointly. The motion relates to the potential to generate renewable energy from the Severn estuary, and we believe that, in developing that, the technology for extracting such energy should be designed to ensure that it has the minimum possible impact on the environment.

3.15 p.m.

Fy mhwrpas wrth agor y ddadl yw gwyntyllu'r posibiladau o ran cynhyrchu trydan o lif y dŵr ym môr Hafren a thrafod rôl y Cynulliad, fel Senedd Cymru, a rôl Llywodraeth Cymru. Cefndir y ddadl hon yw'r angen dirfawr i sefydlu economi carbon isel yng Nghymru. Dyma'r amcanion yr wyf yn eu cefnogi, ond mae problemau datblygu

My aim in opening the debate is to highlight the possibilities for the generation of electricity from tidal flows in the Severn, and to discuss the role of the Assembly, as the Welsh Parliament, and the role of the Welsh Government. The background to this debate is the dire need to establish a low-carbon economy in Wales. This is an ambition that I

ygni gwynt, anhawsterau a goblygiadau datblygu nwy siâl a chwestiynau ynghylch dyfodol ynni niwclear yn sgîl damwain Fukushima ac amharodrwydd cwmnïau i fuddsoddi arian preifat yn y diwydiant niwclear yn ein gorfodi i ystyried pa adnoddau naturiol sydd gennym yng Nghymru a all ddarparu'r *baseload* dibynadwy y mae unrhyw economi carbon isel ei angen.

Mae'n briodol fod y ddadl yn cyd-daro gyda'r drafodaeth ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ar bolisi ynni a chynllunio, gan y bydd angen gweithredu ar argymhellion y pwyllgor hwnnw i wireddu economi carbon isel. Yma, o fewn taflïad carreg llythrennol i'r Senedd—llythrennol os ydych yn aelod o dîm criced Morgannwg, hynny yw—mae un o'r adnoddau ynni mwyaf pwerus yn y byd. Mae gan Afon Hafren y cerrynt llanw mwyaf ym Mhrydain. Yn ôl y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy byrhoedlog, mae potensial i gynhyrchu 10% o holl drydan y DG pe defnyddir y llanw yn llawn. Mae hynny'n enfawr—digon i fod yn gynsail *baseload* i chwyldro gwyrdd adnewyddadwy go iawn yng Nghymru. O'r herwydd, bu'r afon yn destun ymchwil difrifol i'w hadnoddau ers 1981 o leia. Penderfyniad Llywodraeth y DG yn 2010 oedd peidio â bwrw ymlaen ag arian cyhoeddus i forglawdd, fel y clywsom yn y sesiwn gwestiynau ynghynt, gan y byddai cynlluniau amrywiol eraill carbon isel yn well i'r pwr cyhoeddus. Ers hynny, bu newid yn y lliw gwleidyddol yn San Steffan a bu oedi ac arafu amlwg yn y cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy llai ac amrwyiol hynny yng Nghymru, wrth inni barhau i ddadlau fel Cynulliad ac fel pleidiau gwleidyddol am effaith TAN 8. Ni welaf ychwaith fod y cynllun diweddar i ddatblygu ynni gwynt yn Iwerddon, a'i drosglwyddo drwy Gymru i'r grid cenedlaethol, yn cynrychioli budd sylweddol i economi Cymru.

Ers hynny hefyd, mae cwmni Hafren Power wedi mynegi diddordeb mewn datblygu morglawdd heb geiniog o arian cyhoeddus uniongyrchol, ond yn hytrach ar sail y cynlluniau presennol i gefnogi prisoedd

fully support, but issues related to wind energy developments and the difficulties and implications of developing shale gas as well as questions about the future of nuclear energy in light of the Fukushima accident, along with an unwillingness on the part of companies to invest in nuclear energy, force us to look at what renewable sources we have in Wales that could provide the reliable baseload that any low-carbon economy needs.

It is appropriate that the debate should coincide with the debate on the Environment and Sustainability Committee's report on energy and planning policy, as the committee recommendations will need to be implemented if we are to realise a low-carbon economy. Here, literally within a stone's throw of the Senedd—literally if you are a member of the Glamorgan cricket team, of course—there is one of the most powerful natural resources in the world. The Severn has the strongest tidal current in Britain and, according to the short-lived Sustainable Development Commission, the potential exists to produce 10% of all UK energy needs if the tide were fully exploited. That is huge—enough to create that baseload for a real green renewable revolution in Wales. As a result, the Severn's resources have been of serious interest to researchers since 1981 at least. Back in 2010, the UK Government's decision was not to use public money to develop a barrage, as we heard in the previous question session, because other smaller low-carbon developments were apparently considered to be a better use of the public purse. Since then, there has been a change of Government in Westminster and there has been a noticeable delay in the development of these smaller schemes in Wales, as we continually argue as an Assembly and as political parties about the impact of TAN 8. Furthermore, I cannot see the recent plan to develop wind energy in Ireland and transfer it through Wales to the national grid representing a significant benefit to the Welsh economy.

Also since then, Hafren Power has expressed its interest in developing a barrage without direct public subsidy but based on the current plans to support energy prices from renewables, the contracts for difference as

trydan o ynni adnewyddadwy, sef y *contracts for difference*. Cyn bo hir felly, mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid i ni fel Senedd a'r Llywodraeth ymateb i gynllun o'r fath a dangos ein cefnogaeth ai peidio.

Yesterday, the First Minister expressed very clearly to me that he wished to see his Government gain full planning powers over all renewable energy projects in Wales. I certainly welcome his conversion to our cause. Previously, to me and to Leanne Wood, he has stated that any barrage scheme in the Severn would be a matter for the Westminster Government. Today, I hope to persuade the Minister and to hear from him that this is also a key issue for the Welsh Government and that it is right and proper for the Welsh Government to take an active view in considering Hafren Power's plans and coming to a view on them. Indeed, I think that this should be a joint decision of Westminster and Wales. I also hope to persuade fellow Members that we as a Welsh Parliament should come to a view if possible. I do not expect to do that today, but I hope that this motion will help to take the debate forward.

We need look only briefly at Hafren Power's current proposals to get a sense of the importance of tidal energy from the Severn not only to the Welsh economy, but to these islands as a whole. As proposed, the barrage would produce 6,500 MW of installed capacity with an energy output of 15 to 16.4 TWh a year, which is about 5% of the whole annual electricity demand of the United Kingdom. That would be a reliable source of baseload power for power generation that could last 120 years, while complementing the UK energy mix, including offshore wind, at a cost, it is claimed, that is less than that of offshore wind.

The renewable energy route map for Wales refers to the potential for tidal power in the Severn estuary. It states that

'allocating a notional half the output of any major Severn barrage to Wales and half to the south west of England.'

would equate to electricity generation of

they are known. Therefore, before too long, it is possible that we as a Senedd and the Government will have to respond to such a scheme and show our support or lack of support.

Ddoe, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn glir iawn wrthyf ei fod am weld ei Lywodraeth yn cael pwerau cynllunio llawn dros yr holl brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. Yn sicr, croesawaf ei dröedigaeth at ein hachos. Cyn hyn, mae wedi dweud wrthyf fi ac wrth Leanne Wood, mai mater i Lywodraeth San Steffan fyddai unrhyw gynllun morglawdd ar Afon Hafren. Heddiw, rwy'n gobeithio dwyn perswâd ar y Gweinidog a chlywed ganddo fod hwn hefyd yn fater allweddol i Lywodraeth Cymru a'i bod yn hollol briodol i Lywodraeth Cymru fynd ati i ystyried cynlluniau Hafren Power a llunio barn arnynt. Yn wir, credaf y dylai fod yn benderfyniad ar y cyd gan San Steffan a Chymru. Gobeithiaf hefyd ddarbwylllo fy nghyd-Aelodau y dylem ni fel Senedd i Gymru lunio barn os oes modd. Ni ddisgwyliaf wneud hynny heddiw, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y cynnig hwn yn helpu i symud y ddadl yn ei blaen.

Dim ond cael cipolwg ar gynigion cyfredol Hafren Power sydd ei angen i ddeall pwysigrwydd ynni'r llanw yn Afon Hafren nid yn unig i economi Cymru, ond i'r ynysoedd hyn yn eu cyfanrwydd. Fel y'i cynigir, byddai'r morglawdd yn cynhyrchu 6,500 MW o gapasiti cynhyrchu gydag allbwn ynni o 15-16.4 TWh y flwyddyn, sef tua 5% o'r galw blynyddol cyfan am drydan yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Byddai hynny'n ffynhonnell ddibynadwy o allbwn ynni sylfaenol ar gyfer cynhyrchu pŵer a allai bara 120 mlynedd, tra'n ategu cymysgedd ynni'r DU, gan gynnwys ynni'r gwynt ar y môr, am gost, fe honnir, sy'n llai na chost ynni'r gwynt ar y môr.

Mae trywydd ynni adnewyddadwy Cymru yn cyfeirio at y cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio ynni'r llanw yn aber Hafren. Mae'n datgan y byddai

'dyrannu hanner allbwn tybiannol unrhyw forglawdd Hafren mawr i Gymru a'i hanner i dde-orllewin Lloegr.'

yn cyfateb i gynhyrchu tua 8 TWh o drydan y

around 8 TWh a year to Wales. Such an output would meet, and indeed exceed, the Welsh Government's current target for renewable electricity generation of 7 TWh by 2020. I do not think that the barrage would be built by 2020, but it gives you a sense of the target we have, which we are not on track to meet, and a sense of the potential. The contribution it could make to renewable energy would be immense. Just as importantly from my perspective, by providing a reliable baseload, it could also unlock the further development of more intermittent technologies.

Hafren Power's current estimate of the investment needed is around £25 billion. It says that it can do this on the basis of the current support for renewable electricity prices in the United Kingdom, similar to what is being looked at by proposed nuclear power stations. Therefore, it can do this without any direct public subsidy. Using one estimate that was prepared by the UK Contractors Group, for each £1 invested in construction, we could expect £2.84 to be released in economic activity. Therefore, taking £25 billion as the cost of constructing a barrage, that is a huge investment into the economy of Wales and parts of England. It would create the equivalent of around 28,000 jobs and would enhance manufacturing and developments in Port Talbot and Baglan if a decision was taken to use the ports there to support the construction of the barrage. Supply chain jobs would also be significant, as you can imagine. For Wales, this would be a completely transformational project, but only if we actively engage in any such proposals and do not bury our heads in the Severn mudflats.

I personally believe that we must try to utilise the Severn's immense power. I am not wedded to any particular technology, although there are undoubtedly some significant environmental impacts of any barrage. Tidal lagoons have also been proposed, but this may not be an either/or

flwyddyn i Gymru. Byddai'r fath allbwn yn cyflawni targed presennol Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer cynhyrchu trydan adnewyddadwy o 7 TWh erbyn 2020 ac yn wir yn rhagori arno. Ni chredaf y byddai'r morglawdd yn cael ei adeiladu erbyn 2020, ond mae'n rhoi amcan ichi o'r targed sydd gennym, nad ydym ar y trywydd iawn i'w gyflawni, ac amcan o'r potensial. Byddai'r cyfraniad y gallai ei wneud tuag at ynni adnewyddadwy yn enfawr. Yr un mor bwysig o'm safbwynt i, trwy ddarparu allbwn ynni sylfaenol dibynadwy, gallai hefyd helpu gyda'r gwaith o ddatblygu technolegau mwy ysbeidiol ymhellach.

Yn ôl amcangyfrifon cyfredol Hafren Power bydd angen buddsoddiad o tua £25 biliwn. Mae'n dweud y gall wneud hyn ar sail y cymorth presennol ar gyfer prisiau trydan adnewyddadwy yn y Deyrnas Unedig, yn debyg i'r hyn sy'n cael ei ystyried gan orsafoedd ynni niwclear arfaethedig. Felly, gall wneud hyn heb unrhyw gymhorthdal cyhoeddus uniongyrchol. Gan ddefnyddio un amcangyfrif a baratowyd gan Grŵp Contractwyr y DU, ar gyfer pob £1 a fuddsoddir mewn gwaith adeiladu, gallem ddisgwyl i £2.84 gael ei ryddhau mewn gweithgarwch economaidd. Felly, gan gymryd mai £25 biliwn yw cost adeiladu morglawdd, mae hynny'n fuddsoddiad enfawr i economi Cymru a rhannau o Loegr. Byddai'n creu'r hyn sy'n cyfateb i tua 28,000 o swyddi ac yn ychwanegu at weithgynhyrchu a datblygiadau ym Mhort Talbot a Baglan pe bai penderfyniad i ddefnyddio'r porthladdoedd yno i gefnogi'r gwaith o adeiladu'r morglawdd. Byddai nifer y swyddi cadwyn gyflenwi hefyd yn sylweddol, fel y gallwch ddychmygu. I Gymru, byddai hyn yn brosiect cwbl drawsnewidiol, ond dim ond os ydym yn cymryd rhan weithredol mewn unrhyw gynigion o'r fath ac yn peidio â chladdu ein pennau yng ngwastadeddau llaid Afon Hafren.

Credaf yn bersonol fod yn rhaid inni geisio defnyddio pŵer aruthrol Afon Hafren. Nid wyf yn gaeth i unrhyw dechnoleg benodol, er yn ddi-os y bydd morglawdd yn cael rhai effeithiau amgylcheddol sylweddol. Mae morlynnoedd llanw hefyd wedi cael eu cynnig, ond efallai na fydd yn rhaid dewis

choice. I feel strongly that we, in Wales, should maximise for our benefit the investment that any tidal barrage or any other development would bring. It is too early for details, but I want to put on record that I believe that any such development should have strong community benefits, as we explored earlier with the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development, when he recognised that, at the moment, there were not significant community benefits accruing to Wales from renewable energy developments. Here is a chance to put it right.

A barrage would literally change the face of Wales. It could change our economy. It would attract investment to a particular area. I recognise that there are dangers and risks for Wales as well as huge potential, and it is important that we explore these in our democratic institutions. There is also an immense environmental impact, and the 2010 feasibility study found that even smaller barrage schemes would have an unprecedented impact in an environmentally designated area and that compensation for that impact would be challenging to achieve.

I hope that, in this debate, we can explore with the Minister what role and responsibilities he believes the Welsh Government would have in all this, as I believe it is unclear at the moment. I hope that, although we cannot answer all the questions today, this debate will show that we, as elected representatives, want to discuss these barrage proposals thoroughly and without prejudice.

**Russell George:** I am pleased to be involved in this timely individual Members' debate today. Although some colleagues may not completely agree with everything that the four of us put forward in our contributions, I do not think that many in the Chamber would disagree with the principle behind the debate. Simon Thomas's opening remarks on the real and current untapped energy potential that exists in the Severn estuary are important, and I support them.

With the second highest tidal range in the

rhwng y naill a'r llall. Teimlaf yn gryf y dylem ni, yng Nghymru fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y buddsoddiad a ddaw yn sgîl unrhyw forglawdd llanw neu unrhyw ddatblygiad arall. Mae'n rhy gynnar i fynd i fanylion, ond rwyf am ddweud ar goedd fy mod yn credu y dylai unrhyw ddatblygiad o'r fath esgor ar fudd cymunedol cryf, fel y'i hystyriwyd yn gynharach gennym gyda Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy, pan gydnabu nad oedd yr un fantais gymunedol sylweddol, ar hyn o bryd, yn dod i ran Cymru o ganlyniad i ddatblygiadau ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae hwn yn gyfle i unioni'r sefyllfa.

Byddai morglawdd yn llythrennol yn newid wyneb Cymru. Gallai newid ein heconomi. Byddai'n denu buddsoddiad i ardal benodol. Cydnabyddaf fod peryglon a risgiau i Gymru yn ogystal â photensial enfawr, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried y rhain yn ein sefydliadau democrataidd. Bydd hefyd effaith amgylcheddol enfawr, a daeth astudiaeth ddichonoldeb 2010 i'r casgliad y byddai hyd yn oed cynlluniau morglawdd llai o faint yn cael effaith na welwyd mo'i thebyg o'r blaen mewn ardal â dynodiad amgylcheddol ac y byddai gwneud iawn am yr effaith honno yn heriol.

Gobeithiaf, yn y ddadl hon, y gallwn ystyried ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog pa rôl a chyfrifoldebau a fyddai gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn hyn i gyd yn ei farn ef, gan fy mod o'r farn ei bod yn aneglur ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithiaf, er na allwn ateb yr holl gwestiynau heddiw, y bydd y ddadl hon yn dangos ein bod ni, fel cynrychiolwyr etholedig, am drafod y cynigion hyn ar gyfer morglawdd yn drylwyr a heb ragfarn.

**Russell George:** Rwy'n falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl amserol hon gan Aelod unigol heddiw. Er na fydd rhai cyd-Aelodau yn llwyr gytuno o bosibl â phopeth a gyflwynir gan y pedwar ohonom yn ein cyfraniadau, ni chredaf y byddai llawer yn y Siambr yn anghytuno â'r egwyddor sy'n sail i'r ddadl. Mae sylwadau agoriadol Simon Thomas ar wir botensial, heb ei wireddu, sy'n bodoli i gynhyrchu ynni yn aber Afon Hafren yn bwysig, ac rwy'n eu cefnogi.

Gyda'r amrediad llanw uchaf ond un yn y

world, a marine project or projects in the Severn estuary could not only provide the UK with an abundant level of clean and reliable renewable energy for decades to come, but make a significant contribution to the UK's commitment to meeting renewable energy and greenhouse gas targets. Any scheme proposed in this extremely important environment will inevitably have an impact on habitats and wildlife, and some of the proposals could also influence shipping to the ports of Cardiff, Bristol, Gloucester and Newport. It is vital, therefore, that we get the right balance between the environmental conservation, energy generation and economic development.

For someone like me, who would will governments to invest in the research and development of the broadest range of renewable energy technologies, a marine project—probably a tidal project—in the Severn is a no-brainer and long overdue. Purely in engineering terms, there is no doubt that the sea is a far more reliable and constant source of potential energy than wind and other forms of renewable energy. The result of the gravitational pull of the moon and the sun on the earth, tidal power is reliable and inexhaustible. Water is a lot denser than air and packs a bigger punch as well. The energy generated by a current of water travelling at 5 mph would be 822 times greater than that generated by wind of the same speed, given turbines of equal size.

A recent report by the Carbon Trust suggested that marine energy could contribute about 20% of Britain's green energy capacity—that is 27 GW—which is more than is supplied at present by nuclear reactors and far more than by onshore or offshore wind. The arguments for marine energy are so persuasive that it seems extraordinary that Governments of all persuasions since the 1980s have failed to invest properly in its development. However, with the enhancement of climate science and the global urgency of combating climate change, marine technology has to be viewed as the medium and long-term future of energy generation for the UK. Unless the

byd, gallai prosiect neu brosiectau morol yn aber Afon Hafren nid yn unig gynhyrchu digonedd o ynni adnewyddadwy glân a dibynadwy i'r DU am ddegawdau i ddod, ond hefyd wneud cyfraniad sylweddol i ymrwymiad y DU i gyflawni targedau ynni adnewyddadwy a thargedau nwyon tŷ gwydr. Bydd unrhyw gynllun a gynigir yn yr amgylchedd hynod bwysig hwn yn anochel yn cael effaith ar gynefinoedd a bywyd gwyllt, a gallai rhai o'r cynigion hefyd effeithio ar longau sy'n defnyddio porthladdoedd yng Nghaerdydd, Bryste, Caerloyw a Chasnewydd. Mae'n hanfodol, felly, ein bod yn cael y cydbwysedd cywir rhwng cadwraeth amgylcheddol, cynhyrchu ynni a datblygu economaidd.

I rywun fel minnau, a fyddai'n erfyn ar lywodraethau i fuddsoddi mewn gwaith ymchwil a datblygu ar yr ystod ehangaf o dechnolegau ynni adnewyddadwy, byddai prosiect morol—prosiect ynni'r llanw fwy na thebyg—yn Afon Hafren yn rhywbeth amlwg i'w wneud ac y dylid bod wedi'i wneud ers amser. Yn nhermau perianyddol yn unig, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r môr yn ffynhonnell lawer mwy dibynadwy a chyson o ynni posibl na'r gwynt a mathau eraill o ynni adnewyddadwy. Oherwydd tynfa disgrychiant y lleuad a'r haul ar y ddaear, mae ynni'r llanw yn ddibynadwy ac yn ddihysbydd. Mae dŵr yn llawer dwysach nag aer ac yn cael mwy o effaith hefyd. Byddai'r ynni a gynhyrchir gan gerrynt o ddŵr yn teithio 5 milltir yr awr 822 gwaith yn fwy na'r hyn a gynhyrchir gan y gwynt ar yr un cyflymder, a bwrw bod tyrbinau o'r un faint.

Awgrymodd adroddiad diweddar gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon y gallai ynni morol gyfrannu tua 20% o gapasiti ynni gwyrdd Prydain—sef 27 GW—sy'n fwy na'r hyn a gyflenwir ar hyn o bryd gan adweithyddion niwclear a llawer mwy na chan ynni'r gwynt ar y tir neu ar y môr. Mae'r dadleuon o blaid ynni morol mor argyhoeddiadol nes ei bod yn rhyfeddol bod Llywodraethau o bob lliw ers y 1980au wedi methu â buddsoddi'n iawn i'w ddatblygu. Fodd bynnag, gyda'r datblygiadau ym maes gwyddor yr hinsawdd a'r angen brys yn fyd-eang i fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd, rhaid i dechnoleg y môr gael ei hystyried yn ddyfodol cynrychu ynni'r DU yn y tymor canolig a'r hirdymor. Oni bai bod

Welsh and the UK Governments work together to organise strategically our resources and political wills, it is a technology that will always be decades away.

I am pleased that the UK Government has taken steps to encourage the move towards the commercialisation of the sector next year by providing five renewables obligation certificates for wave and tidal stream projects with a capacity of up to 30 MW that are installed and become operational prior to 1 April 2017. That is an important boost for the sector and shows—if you will excuse the pun—that the tide is turning for marine power in Wales and it will put us on an equal footing with other devolved administrations. I am also pleased that the Minister has agreed to the key marine focused recommendations made by the Environment and Sustainability Committee in its report on energy policy.

Therefore, what can the Welsh Government do to help feasibly deliver a marine project in the Severn estuary? It is too soon to choose and champion one particular marine project or technology, and I am yet to be convinced by a barrage project spanning the width of the estuary. I believe that, due to concerns on both sides of the border, the wider public is yet to be convinced also of such a project. I may be wrong, but, from what I have read and from the discussions that I have had with people on this subject, I believe that the feeling, in many respects, is that the direction of technology and innovation is towards smaller, more dispersed solutions to this energy challenge. It is important that the project is backed up by credible scientific and engineering evidence. These data are why the Government's energy and environment private sector panel has an important role to play and will have an even greater role to play when the Government establishes its renewable energy delivery board.

We also need to consider seriously the future of technical advice note 8 as the Government's central underpinning policy on renewable energy. There are serious question

Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i gyd-drefnu ein hadnoddau a'n hewyllys wleidyddol yn strategol, bydd yn aros yn dechnoleg sydd ddegawdau i ffwrdd.

Rwy'n falch bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi cymryd camau i annog y newid tuag at fasnacheiddio'r sector y flwyddyn nesaf drwy ddarparu pum tystysgrif rhwymedigaeth ynni adnewyddadwy ar gyfer prosiectau ynni'r tonnau a ffrydiau llanw gyda'r capasiti i gynhyrchu hyd at 30 MW a fydd yn cael eu gosod ac yn dod yn weithredol cyn 1 Ebrill, 2017. Mae hynny'n hwb pwysig i'r sector ac yn dangos—os maddeuwch y gair mwys—bod y llanw'n troi i gyfeiriad ynni'r môr yng Nghymru a bydd yn ein rhoi ar sail gyfartal â'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Rwyf hefyd yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno i'r argymhellion allweddol ynglŷn â'r môr a wnaed gan y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd yn ei adroddiad ar bolisi ynni.

Felly, beth all Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud i helpu'n ymarferol i gyflwyno prosiect morol yn aber Afon Hafren? Mae'n rhy fuan i ddewis a hyrwyddo un prosiect neu dechnoleg forol arbennig, ac nid wyf eto yn argyhoeddedig ynghylch prosiect morglawdd sy'n ymestyn dros led yr aber. Credaf, oherwydd pryderon ar y ddwy ochr i'r ffin, nad yw'r cyhoedd yn fwy cyffredinol wedi'u hargyhoeddi eto ynghylch prosiect o'r fath. Efallai fy mod wedi camsynied, ond, o'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddarllen ac o'r trafodaethau yr wyf wedi'u cael gyda phobl ar y pwnc hwn, credaf mai'r teimlad, mewn sawl ystyr, yw bod technoleg ac arloesi yn symud i gyfeiriad prosiectau llai, mwy gwasgaredig i ateb yr her hon o ran ynni. Mae'n bwysig bod y prosiect yn cael ei ategu gan dystiolaeth wyddonol a pheirianyddol gredadwy. Y data hyn yw'r rheswm pam mae gan banel ynni ac amgylchedd sector preifat y Llywodraeth rôl bwysig i'w chwarae a bydd ganddynt rôl hyd yn oed yn fwy i'w chwarae pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn sefydlu ei bwrdd cyflawni ynni adnewyddadwy.

Mae angen inni hefyd ystyried o ddifrifol ddyfodol nodyn cyngor technegol 8 fel sail polisi canolog y Llywodraeth ar ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae amheuan difrifol



marks about whether it is fit for purpose and whether the Government has confidence in its long-term future. Moreover, is its focus on marine energy so insignificant that it cannot possibly be a working strategy to guide Government decision making in this area?

**William Powell:** I thank my colleagues Simon Thomas, Russell George and Mick Antonia for joining me in proposing this cross-party debate this afternoon. The fact that Members of all four parties can be on the same page when it comes to renewable energy is a source of real encouragement in itself. It also highlights the commitment that we all share to developing Wales's renewable energy sector for the benefit of the environment and our economy.

For many decades, politicians, civil servants and developers have argued over the various benefits and pitfalls that are associated with energy generation from the Severn estuary. Sadly, despite that ongoing debate, there remains no generation project in place and, if we are honest, little progress has been made towards one. However, despite this climate of relative inaction, my party chose to establish the Severn tidal forum in order to investigate the areas for potential generation using existing designs and also to highlight the potential damage to the environment that might result from their application. As a result, the forum produced a report in 2009 that now sets out our party's position on Severn energy generation and our preferred course of development given the options available at that time. In short, that report supported the construction of a Shoots barrage close to the line of the second Severn crossing, which would also carry a much needed high-speed rail link to supplement the ageing Severn tunnel and additional slimline wind turbines to boost capacity for energy generation. It also called for the development of a pilot lagoon on the seaward side of the barrage for additional power.

3.30 p.m.

Finally, it stated that a further fund should be

ynghylch a yw'n addas at y diben ac a oes gan y Llywodraeth hyder yn ei ddyfodol yn yr hirdymor. At hynny, a yw ei ffocws ar ynni morol mor ddibwys nes ei bod yn amhosibl iddo fod yn strategaeth weithredol i lywio penderfyniadau'r Llywodraeth yn y maes hwn?

**William Powell:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'm cyd-Aelodau Simon Thomas, Russell George a Mick Antoniw am ymuno â mi i gynnig y ddatl drawsbleidiol hon y prynhawn yma. Mae'r ffaith y gall aelodau o'r pedair plaid gyd-weld o ran ynni adnewyddadwy ynddi'i hun yn galonogol iawn. Mae hefyd yn amlygu'r ymrwymiad sydd gan bob un ohonom i ddatblygu sector ynni adnewyddadwy Cymru er lles yr amgylchedd a'n heconomi.

Ers degawdau lawer, mae gwleidyddion, gweision sifil a datblygwyr wedi dadlau dros y gwahanol fanteision a phroblemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chynhyrchu ynni yn aber Afon Hafren. Yn anffodus, er gwaethaf y ddatl barhaus honno, nid oes yr un prosiect cynhyrchu ar waith ac, a dweud y gwir, ychydig iawn o gynnydd sydd wedi cael ei wneud tuag at roi prosiect ar waith. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf y diffyg gweithredu hwn i ryw raddau, mae fy mhlaid wedi dewis sefydlu fforwm llanw Afon Hafren er mwyn ymchwilio i'r meysydd cynhyrchu posibl gan ddefnyddio dyluniadau sy'n bodoli eisoes a hefyd i dynnu sylw at y niwed posibl i'r amgylchedd a allai ddeillio o'u defnyddio. O ganlyniad i hynny, paratôdd y fforwm adroddiad yn 2009 sydd bellach yn amlinellu safbwynt ein plaid ar gynhyrchu ynni yn Afon Hafren a'r ffordd yr ydym am i hynny ddatblygu o ystyried y dewisiadau sydd ar gael ar y pryd. I grynhoi, cefnogodd yr adroddiad hwnnw adeiladu morglawdd Shoots yn agos at linell ail groesfan Hafren, a fyddai hefyd yn dwyn cyswllt rheilffordd cyflym, mawr ei angen, i ategu twnnel Hafren sy'n heneiddio a thyrbinau gwynt main ychwanegol i ychwanegu at yr ynni y gellid ei gynhyrchu. Galwodd hefyd am ddatblygu morlyn peilot ar ochr y môr i'r morglawdd i gynhyrchu pŵer ychwanegol.

Yn olaf, datganodd y dylai cronfa

put aside to research new and innovative options for further power generation. However, since that report was published, we know that Hafren Power has developed its own scheme, with significantly improved generation capacity, reduced environmental impact, which could be built without the need for public sector investment. Such a scheme is obviously much more attractive in terms of its ecological footprint, and in the current economic climate. Given this, my party colleagues and I are in the process of reassembling the group that produced our earlier study, to see whether our standing policy needs to be updated or changed for these developments to take place.

When considering any generation project, in or near the Severn estuary, we first need to appreciate the sheer scale of its potential, and its cost. To construct any meaningful tidal generation project, we have to appreciate the fact that it would be on a scale hitherto unseen in Wales, and indeed the UK, and would have a price tag that dwarfs almost any other energy scheme that has so far been considered. We must also consider the fact that such a scheme has the potential to produce more energy than Wales currently consumes, it could remain in use for well over a century, and, as we have heard, it could provide thousands of much-needed Welsh jobs to stimulate our economy in these difficult times, and in other difficult times to come.

Taken together, such considerations become a balance of risk. On the one hand, we have the potential environmental impacts through the construction and operation of such a scheme. However, on the other hand, we have the potential ecosystem destruction, which is expected to occur over the coming century as a result of global warming, if we are slow to act. In other words, while we know that an estimated 14,400 ha of intertidal habitat could be lost were the largest of the proposed barrages to be constructed, how can we evaluate that loss against the potential if the feared changes to habitat over the life of the barrage, should our global warming and sea-level rise predictions come to pass, should occur? Such a balance is difficult to strike. That is why today's debate is so

ychwanegol gael ei neilltuo i ymchwilio i ddewisiadau newydd ac arloesol ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni pellach. Fodd bynnag, ers i'r adroddiad hwnnw gael ei gyhoeddi, gwyddom fod Hafren Power wedi datblygu ei gynllun ei hun, gyda thipyn mwy o gapasiti cynhyrchu, llai o effaith ar yr amgylchedd, a allai gael ei adeiladu heb yr angen am fuddsoddiad gan y sector cyhoeddus. Mae cynllun o'r fath yn amlwg yn llawer mwy deniadol o ran ei ôl-troed ecolegol, ac yn yr hinsawdd economaidd sydd ohoni. O gofio hyn, mae fy nghyd-Geidwadwyr a minnau wrthi'n ailgynnull y grŵp a baratôdd ein hastudiaeth gynharach, i weld a oes angen diweddarau neu newid ein polisi cyfredol er mwyn i'r datblygiadau hyn fynd rhagddynt.

Wrth ystyried unrhyw brosiect cynhyrchu, yn aber Hafren neu ger yr aber, yn gyntaf mae angen inni sylweddoli pa mor fawr fydd ei botensial, a'i gost. Er mwyn adeiladu unrhyw brosiect cynhyrchu ynni'r llanw o werth, rhaid inni sylweddoli y byddai ar raddfa nas gwelwyd o'r blaen hyd yma yng Nghymru, ac yn wir y DU, ac y byddai'r costau dipyn yn fwy na bron bob cynllun ynni arall a ystyriwyd hyd yn hyn. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried y ffaith y gallai cynllun o'r fath gynhyrchu mwy o ynni na'r hyn a ddefnyddir yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, y gallai fod yn weithredol am ymhell dros ganrif, ac, fel y clywsom, y gallai ddarparu miloedd o swyddi mawr eu hangen yng Nghymru i ysgogi ein heconomi yn y cyfnod anodd hwn, ac mewn cyfnodau anodd eraill i ddod.

Gyda'i gilydd, mae ystyriaethau o'r fath yn mynd yn risg y mae'n rhaid ei chydbwysu. Ar y naill law, mae'r effeithiau amgylcheddol posibl drwy adeiladu a gweithredu cynllun o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, ar y llaw arall, mae'r dinistr posibl i'r ecosystem, y disgwylir ei weld yn ystod y ganrif nesaf o ganlyniad i gynhesu byd-eang, os ydym yn araf yn gweithredu. Mewn geiriau eraill, er ein bod yn gwybod y gallai tua 14,400 hectar o gynefin rhynglanw gael ei golli pe câi'r morglawdd mwyaf o blith y morgloddiau a awgrymir ei adeiladu, sut y gallwn werthuso'r golled honno yn erbyn y potensial os digwydd y newidiadau i'r cynefin a ofnir dros oes y morglawdd, pe câi'r rhagfynegiadau o ran cynhesu byd-eang a chodiad lefel y môr eu gwireddu? Mae'n

important. It is also why we need to have a sensible and rational debate on potential energy projects, which take account of the compensatory habitat creation that would be essential under the European Commission habitats directive.

I trust that this debate will be at least a kick-start to taking these issues forward, and I am very glad to have had the opportunity to take part.

**Vaughan Gething:** I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate, especially as the most commonly talked about barrage option is the Lavernock to Weston option—Lavernock being in my constituency. I have been engaged in debate around this issue since before the Assembly elections, as well as on several occasions since then, with many people with wildly differing views and opinions. I have been clear to everyone that I have spoken to that doing nothing is not an option, and that, equally, any scheme for Severn tidal power would involve some environmental impact, as well as some economic impact. It is a balance between those two factors, and the potential to generate sources of energy, that should guide us in any decision that we make about what we should or should not support.

On the environmental impact, I welcome some of the comments that were made earlier. This is not simply a case of considering what would happen to the Severn estuary. That is a hugely important factor, but it is also important to look at the potential impact of doing nothing. We will continue to use power in significant quantities in the future, and we must think about the potential consequence of not trying to maximise the energy-generating potential of the Severn in any scheme that goes forward. Several people have raised questions and concerns with me about a damaging environmental impact. The Severn estuary is almost always mentioned, because of its protective habitats—not only the bird environment and the mud flats, but in how fish use the estuary as a path in and out of coastal and estuary waters. There are a number of different types of fish that we

anodd taro cydbwysedd o'r fath. Dyna pam mae dadl heddiw mor bwysig. Dyma pam hefyd mae angen inni gael dadl synhwyrol a rhesymegol ar brosiectau ynni posibl, sy'n ystyried creu cynefinoedd cydadferol a fyddai'n hanfodol o dan gyfarwyddeb cynefinoedd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

Hyderaf y bydd y ddadl hon o leiaf yn hwb i ystyried y materion hyn ymhellach, ac rwy'n falch iawn fy mod wedi cael cyfle i gymryd rhan.

**Vaughan Gething:** Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon, yn enwedig gan mai'r opsiwn y sonnir amdano fwyaf o ran morglawdd yw'r opsiwn rhwng Larnog a Weston—ac mae Larnog yn fy etholaeth. Rwyf wedi bod yn cymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau ynghylch y mater hwn ers cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad, ac ar sawl achlysur ers hynny yn ogystal, gyda llawer o bobl sy'n arddel safbwyntiau tra gwahanol. Rwyf wedi dweud yn glir wrth bawb yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy nad oes modd inni wneud dim, ac, yn yr un modd, y byddai unrhyw gynllun ar gyfer ynni'r llanw ar Afon Hafren yn golygu rhywfaint o effaith amgylcheddol, yn ogystal â rhywfaint o effaith economaidd. Y cydbwysedd rhwng y ddau ffactor hynny, a'r potensial i gynhyrchu ffynonellau o ynni yw'r hyn a ddylai ein tywys wrth wneud unrhyw benderfyniad ar yr hyn y dylem neu na ddylem ei gefnogi.

O ran yr effaith amgylcheddol, croesawaf rai o'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd yn gynharach. Nid achos syml o ystyried beth fyddai'n digwydd i aber Afon Hafren yw hwn. Mae hwnnw'n ffactor hynod bwysig, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig edrych ar yr effaith bosibl o wneud dim byd. Byddwn yn parhau i ddefnyddio ynni ar raddfa sylweddol yn y dyfodol, a rhaid inni feddwl am yr hyn a all ddigwydd os na wnawn fanteisio i'r eithaf ar botensial cynhyrchu ynni Afon Hafren mewn unrhyw gynllun sy'n mynd rhagddo. Mae sawl un wedi codi cwestiynau a phryderon gyda mi am effaith amgylcheddol niweidiol. Crybwyllir aber Afon Hafren bron bob tro, oherwydd ei gynefinoedd gwarchoddedig—nid yn unig amgylchedd yr adar a'r gwastadeddau llaid, ond yn y ffordd y mae pysgod yn defnyddio'r aber fel llwybr i mewn ac allan o ddyfroedd arfordirol ac

should think about seriously, because building the wrong barrage, with the wrong turbines, could potentially exterminate those species, if we get it wrong. Therefore, the stakes are high, but that does not mean that it is impossible to do something that could work. I know that there are energy-forming constructions in other European jurisdictions, where they have found a successful way to allow more fish to go forward. I hope, therefore, that in bringing forward any scheme they look at the evidence that already exists in other parts of the world.

I have also been interested in the debate around flooding. Opponents of the barrage talk about it as if it would generate a greater flooding risk, both behind and in front of any barrage, whereas proponents often talk about it safeguarding communities in the Severn estuary. This is part of the difficulty that we face, in that the science is not clear. The scientific study that was stopped shortly after the general election reached a conclusion that many other people are now challenging, about whether there would be significant adverse flooding impacts along the coast of south Wales and Ireland. So, I hope that this is only part of a process in which we reach a more settled point of view.

The economic impact is something that I have been especially interested in. I note what Simon Thomas said about the construction impact, bringing up points that were raised by Joyce Watson in a question earlier this week about spending money on construction having a multiplier impact in terms of its economic benefit. Of course, the economic impact will be much more than just a construction project. Any form of Severn tidal power will have an economic impact after it is built. The point about a barrage, of course, is that it provides alternative options. If you create a huge inland body of water, it is about what you might do with it. Equally, there is the potential for forms of transport between south Wales and the west of England, although there are some people who say that Weston is far too close as it is, but

aberol. Mae nifer o wahanol fathau o bysgod y dylem feddwl amdanynt o ddifrif, oherwydd gallai adeiladu'r morglawdd anghywir, gyda'r tyrbinau anghywir, ddifa'r rhywogaethau hynny o bosibl, os nad ydym yn gwneud y penderfyniadau cywir. Felly, mae cryn dipyn yn y fantol, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu ei bod yn amhosibl gwneud rhywbeth a allai lwyddo. Rwy'n ymwybodol o adeileddau sy'n creu ynni mewn awdurdodaethau eraill yn Ewrop, lle maent wedi dod o hyd i ffordd o alluogi mwy o bysgod i symud yn ddirwysr. Gobeithiaf, felly, wrth gyflwyno unrhyw gynllun y byddant yn ystyried y dystiolaeth sydd eisoes yn bodoli mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd.

Bu gennyf ddiddordeb hefyd yn y ddadl sy'n ymwneud â llifogydd. Mae'r rhai sy'n gwrthwynebu'r morglawdd yn sôn amdano fel petai'n mynd i greu mwy o berygl llifogydd, y tu ôl i unrhyw forglawdd ac o'i flaen, tra bod y rhai sy'n ei gefnogi yn aml yn sôn amdano'n diogelu cymunedau yn aber Afon Hafren. Mae hyn yn rhan o'r anhawster sy'n ein hwynebu, gan nad yw'r wyddoniaeth yn glir. Daeth yr astudiaeth wyddonol y rhoddwyd y gorau iddi yn fuan ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol i gasgliad, y mae llawer o bobl eraill yn ei herio erbyn hyn, ynghylch a fyddai effeithiau andwyol oherwydd llifogydd mawr ar hyd arfordir de Cymru ac Iwerddon. Felly, gobeithiaf mai dim ond rhan o broses lle y byddwn yn dod i gasgliad mwy eglur yw'r ddadl hon.

Mae'r effaith economaidd yn rhywbeth sydd wedi bod o ddiddordeb arbennig imi. Nodaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Simon Thomas am effaith y gwaith adeiladu, gan godi pwyntiau a godwyd gan Joyce Watson mewn cwestiwn yn gynharach yr wythnos hon bod gwario arian ar waith adeiladu yn cael effaith lluosydd o ran budd economaidd. Wrth gwrs, bydd yr effaith economaidd dipyn yn fwy na'r prosiect adeiladu yn unig. Bydd unrhyw fath o ynni'r llanw yn Afon Hafren yn cael effaith economaidd ar ôl ei adeiladu. Y pwynt ynglŷn â morglawdd, wrth gwrs, yw ei fod yn cynnig opsiynau amgen. Os ydych yn creu corff mewndirol enfawr o ddŵr, mae'n ymwneud â'r hyn y gallech ei wneud ag ef. Yn yr un modd, mae potensial ar gyfer mathau o drafnidiaeth rhwng de Cymru a gorllewin Lloegr, er bod rhai pobl yn dweud

that is a matter for them. *[Interruption.]* I will not name names, but I know who he is.

The other part about the economic impact is that we have to think about the port of Bristol in all of this as well. The port of Bristol is unlikely to be a huge supporter of a barrage given what it could do to Bristol as a deep sea port. I imagine that David Rees and the people of Aberavon would be rather delighted at Port Talbot being the nearest deep sea port if a large barrage were built.

Moving on to energy generation potential, many people talk about reefs and lagoons. In fact, lagoons—it is pretty clear, I think—do not have the same energy generation potential as barrage schemes. Those are alternative facts to be taken into account. You also have to think about whether or not the silt in the Severn will prevent lagoons from working effectively over a longer period of time. I am still not wedded to any particular form of Severn tidal power, but I look forward to having a rational debate about what each potential scheme could and would provide, and the only way to do that is to examine a real scheme, with real impact, and look at the technology that people are proposing.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r pwyntiau y byddai rhywun yn dymuno eu gwneud wedi cael eu gwneud, wrth gwrs. Mae gennyf feddwl agored ar gynllun Corlan Hafren. Yn sicr, byddai cynllun o'r fath yn gyfraniad pwysig iawn i harneisio grym naturiol y llanw i greu trydan a gwano'n dibyniaeth ar danwydd ffosil. Rhaid inni gymryd y ddadl honno o ddifrif. Mae tystiolaeth gynyddol bod newid yn yr hinsawdd yn digwydd, a'i fod yn cael effaith wirioneddol ar ein byd. Os yw pethau'n cario ymlaen fel ag y maent, a'n bod yn dal i losgi tanwydd ffosil fel y gwnaethom yn y gorffennol, mae potensial y bydd y canlyniadau'n drychinebus i gannoedd o filiynau o bobl ledled y byd ac y bydd yn newid ein ffordd ni o fyw—waeth beth yw'r cyfarwyddebau o Ewrop—ac yn newid ein

bod Weston yn llawer rhy agos fel y mae, ond mater iddynt hwy yw hynny. *[Torri ar draws.]* Nid wyf am enwi enwau, ond gwn pwy ydyw.

Y rhan arall am yr effaith economaidd yw bod yn rhaid inni feddwl am borthladd Bryste yn hyn i gyd hefyd. Mae porthladd Bryste yn annhebygol o fod yn gefnogwr brwd dros forglawdd o ystyried yr hyn y gallai ei wneud i Fryste fel porthladd môr dwfn. Tybiaf y byddai David Rees a phobl Aberafan wrth eu bodd o feddwl mai Port Talbot fyddai'r porthladd môr dwfn agosaf pe câi morglawdd mawr ei adeiladu.

Gan symud ymlaen at y potensial i gynhyrchu ynni, mae llawer o bobl yn sôn am greigresi a morlynnoedd. Mewn gwirionedd, nid yw morlynnoedd—mae'n eithaf clir, fe gredaf—yn meddu ar yr un potensial i gynhyrchu ynni â chynlluniau morglawdd. Mae'r rhain yn ffeithiau eraill i'w hystyried. Rhaid meddwl hefyd a fydd y silt yn Afon Hafren yn atal morlynnoedd rhag gweithio'n effeithiol dros gyfnod hwy o amser. Nid wyf eto yn ffafrio unrhyw fath penodol o ynni llanw yn Afon Hafren, ond edrychaf ymlaen at gael dadl resymol ynghylch yr hyn y gallai pob cynllun posibl ei gynnig a'r hyn y byddai'n ei gynnig, a'r unig ffordd o wneud hynny yw edrych ar gynllun go iawn, gydag effaith go iawn, ac ystyried y dechnoleg y mae pobl yn ei chynnig.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. Most of the points that one would wish to make have already been made, of course. I have an open mind on the Corlan Hafren scheme. Certainly, such a scheme would be a very important contribution in harnessing the natural power of the tide to generate electricity and reduce our dependence on fossil fuels. We must take that argument seriously. There is increasing evidence that climate change is happening and that it is having a real impact on our world. If things continue as they are, and we continue to burn fossil fuels as we have done in the past, the outcomes will be disastrous for hundreds of millions of people across the globe, and will significantly change our way of life—whatever the directives from Europe—and our environment. Therefore, we have to move

hamgylchedd ni yn sylweddol. Felly, rhaid inni symud o'r ddibyniaeth honno ar danwydd ffosil, a chwilio am ynni adnewyddadwy o wahanol fathau.

Mae'r cynnig hwn ynglŷn â morglawdd Hafren yn un mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried o ddiffrif. Mae'r pwyntiau wedi cael eu gwneud ynglŷn ag effeithiau tebygol morglawdd anferth fel hyn ar ein hamgylchedd, y tu fewn a'r tu allan i'r morglawdd ei hun, nid yn unig ar y tiroedd hynny sy'n ymylu ar y dŵr, ond hefyd ar ar wely'r môr ac ar bysgod, fel y dywedodd Vaughan Gething. Mae'n amlwg y byddai'n rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth eithriadol o fanwl i'r effeithiau posibl hynny. Wrth gwrs, mae'r cyfarwydddebau Ewropeaidd yn rhai real iawn, ac efallai y byddent, yn y pen draw, yn profi'n gryfach. Rhaid cydbwysu'r elfennau hyn wrth ddod i benderfyniad.

Ar bwynt Simon Thomas, y peth pwysig yw bod y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru a ni yn y Cynulliad yn rhan o'r drafodaeth honno. Ni allwn ddweud mai cyfrifoldeb San Steffan yw hyn—mai problem San Steffan ydyw. Credaf fod angen i'r Llywodraeth fod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth honno. Gwn na fydd yn rhan o'r penderfyniad, ond mae'n rhaid i ni yng Nghymru fod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth. Bydd yr effeithiau i'w gweld nid yn unig ar yr amgylchedd, ond hefyd ar ein buddiannau economaidd.

Yn ddiweddar, cefais air gyda rhai o'r cwmni sy'n datblygu'r syniad o lagŵn ym mae Abertawe, a'r hyn sy'n ddiddorol am eu syniadau yw eu bod wedi edrych yn fanwl ar y buddiannau cymunedol a chymdeithasol. Maent yn sôn am y potensial i ddatblygu chwaraeon dŵr o fewn a thu allan i lagŵn o'r fath. Maent hefyd yn sôn hefyd am y potensial i ddatblygu diwydiant pysgod cregyn ac i ddod â buddiannau ariannol uniongyrchol i'r cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt. Felly, mae'r cwmni hwnnw eisoes yn gweld hynny fel rhan o unrhyw gais cynllunio a fydd yn dod yn y dyfodol. Mae'n rhaid i ni weld, felly, potensial y buddiannau hynny mewn cynllun enfawr fel hwn.

Bydd effaith ar borthladdoedd hefyd. Pe bai datblygiad o'r fath yn digwydd, mae'r potensial i ddatblygu porthladdoedd Abertawe a Phort Talbot yn anferth. Mae'n

away from that dependence on fossil fuels, and look for different kinds of renewable energy.

This proposal on a Severn barrage is one that we have to consider seriously. The points have been made on the likely impact of such a huge barrage on our environment, in front of and behind the barrage itself, not only on the coastline but also on the sea bed and on fish, as mentioned by Vaughan Gething. It is clear that we would need to give extremely detailed consideration to the possible impacts involved here. Of course, the European directives are very real, and they could, ultimately, prove to be insurmountable. These various elements need to be balanced in coming to a decision.

On a point made by Simon Thomas, the important thing is that the Welsh Government and we in the Assembly are part of that debate. We cannot say that this is Westminster's responsibility—that it is Westminster's problem. I believe that the Government must be part of that discussion. I know that it will not be part of the decision, but we must be part of the debate. The impacts are not only going to be seen on the environment, but also on our economic interests.

Recently, I spoke to representatives of the company developing the idea of a lagoon in Swansea bay, and what was interesting about their ideas was that they had looked in detail at the community and social benefits. They mentioned the potential to develop water sports within and outside such a lagoon. They also mentioned the potential for developing a shellfish industry and the potential to bring direct financial benefits to the communities impacted. So, that company already saw that as part of any planning application that would be made in the future. We must, therefore, see those benefits as part of any huge scheme like this.

There will also be an effect on ports. If such a development was to go ahead, the potential to develop Swansea and Port Talbot ports would be huge. Vaughan Gething might be right,

bosibl bod Vaughan Gething yn iawn, na fyddai porthladd Bryste yn debygol o gefnogi cynllun o'r fath. Gallai Port Talbot ddatblygu yn sgîl datblygiad o'r fath. Felly, mae potensial mawr i fuddiannau ddod o gynllun o'r fath, ond mae'n rhaid inni gydbwysu hynny â'r niwed bosibl i'r amgylchedd a niweidiau posibl eraill.

Felly, wrth edrych yn fanwl ar y cynllun hwn a gweld y manteision a'r anfanteision, byddwn yn dweud ei fod yn hollbwysig ein bod ni yn y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cymru yn benodol yn rhan integrol o'r trafodaethau hynny oherwydd bydd yr effeithiau'n bellgyrhaeddol a gyda ni am genedlaethau i ddod.

**William Graham:** I am grateful to the Member for bringing forward this motion today. We look forward with great interest to the response of the Assembly Government. I first became interested in the barrage with the development of the Newport barrage around 16 years ago and I still remain convinced of the merits of that.

For this particular barrage, much proper evaluation must take place. However, I commend the motion in terms of its economic development possibilities. Clearly, with road and rail for transport—although fairly obvious in its own way—it will take a lot of existing traffic between Wales and the south-west of England from the ageing Severn tunnel, as has already been said, and from the Severn bridges.

It also links up with our discussion yesterday on the city regions. It would give an enormous boost to economic activity in south Wales generally. As well as road and rail, there are also maritime considerations. The ports that have been referred to as being within the barrage area would all need seagoing locks; in Newport, it is 1,000 ft long and 100 ft wide and well over 60 ft deep with a 50 ft rise of tide. Vessels will be able to come in more or less when the operator of the barrage agrees and they will not have to wait for a lunar tide. Therefore, there are advantages to planning in that way.

that the port of Bristol is not likely to be a great supporter of such a scheme. Port Talbot could be developed as part of such a scheme. Therefore, there is huge potential for us to benefit from such a scheme, but we must balance that with the possibility of environmental damage and other possible damaging impacts.

So, in looking in detail at this scheme and seeing the pros and cons, I would say that it is vital that we in the Assembly, and the Welsh Government specifically, are an integral part of those discussions, because the impacts will be far-reaching and will be with us for generations to come.

**William Graham:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn heddiw. Edrychwn ymlaen yn eiddgar at gael ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fe ddechreuais ymddiddori yn y morglawdd ar ôl i'r morglawdd yng Nghasnewydd gael ei ddatblygu tua 16 mlynedd yn ôl ac rwy'n dal yn argyhoeddedig o fanteision hynny.

O ran y morglawdd penodol hwn, rhaid wrth gryn dipyn o werthuso priodol. Fodd bynnag, cymeradwyaf y cynnig am ei bosibiliadau o ran datblygu economaidd. Yn amlwg, gyda ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd ar gyfer trafndiaeth—er yn eithaf amlwg ynddo'i hun—bydd yn dargyfeirio llawer o'r traffig presennol rhwng Cymru a de-orllewin Lloegr o dwannel Hafren sy'n heneiddio, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, ac oddi ar bontydd Afon Hafren.

Mae hefyd yn gysylltiedig â'n trafodaeth ddod ar y dinas-ranbarthau. Byddai'n rhoi hwb enfawr i weithgarwch economaidd yn y de yn gyffredinol. Yn ogystal â ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd, ceir ystyriaethau morwrol hefyd. Byddai angen llifddorau i'r môr ym mhob o'r porthladdoedd y soniwyd y byddent o fewn ardal y morglawdd; yng Nghasnewydd, ceir llifddor 1,000 troedfedd o hyd a 100 troedfedd o led ac ymhell dros 60 troedfedd o ddyfnder gyda gwahanaieth o 50 troedfedd rhwng lanw a thrai. Bydd cychod yn gallu dod i mewn fwy neu lai pan fydd gweithredwr y morglawdd yn cytuno ac ni fydd yn rhaid iddynt aros am lanw lleuad. Felly, mae manteision i gynllunio yn y modd hwnnw.

The environmental issues are perhaps some of the overwhelming factors that must be addressed adequately. However, I also commend to you that, with a regulated rise and fall of a small amount of tide, the areas that are currently below sea level, both in John Griffiths's constituency and in the Somerset levels, would no longer be at a risk of substantial inundation at times of very high tide.

Fish are vitally important, both salmon and shad. We have seen some of the illustrations—I pay tribute to Mick Bates, who led debates on this in the previous Assembly—that there are turbines well capable of allowing the passage of fish. We all know that there are many fish passes on schemes of a similar nature right across the world.

3.45 p.m.

One point that I will mention is that if this is to be an exclusion barrage, the water retained behind it will completely alter the ecosystem. The mud will no longer be there; the water will be penetrable by light, and the entire ecosystem will change dramatically. There will be new life in the area retained. On a slightly tenuous biblical link, when the patriarch Moses was asked by the children of Israel for his advice, he always advised, 'Choose life'. If there is to be new life from the barrage, I commend this motion to the Assembly.

**Nick Ramsay:** Follow that. I always appreciate it when William Graham starts quoting Moses.

We often use the word 'massive' to describe projects, but in the case of the Severn barrage, I think that the word is used correctly, and we have had an interesting debate today on the consequences that such a massive project would have—and I am concentrating on the barrage proposal, rather than the other possibilities. It is a massive project that would have massive potential and also massive consequences. It is not surprising that making progress with the project has been so tricky over many decades, as no Government should go into such a

Y materion amgylcheddol o bosibl yw'r ffactorau pwysicaf y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy yn ddigonol. Fodd bynnag, tynnaf eich sylw hefyd at y ffaith na fyddai'r ardaloedd sydd o dan lefel y môr ar hyn o bryd yn etholaeth John Griffiths a gwastadeddau Gwlad yr Haf, o reoleiddio llanw a thrai ryw ychydig, mewn perygl o lifogydd mawr mwyach pan fo penllanw mawr.

Mae pysgod yn hanfodol bwysig, eog a gwangod fel ei gilydd. Rydym wedi gweld rhai o'r darluniau—talaf deyrnged i Mick Bates, a arweiniodd ddadleuon ar hyn yn y Cynulliad diwethaf—bod tyrbinau ar gael sy'n caniatáu hynt pysgod. Gwyddom i gyd bod llawer o ysgolion pysgod ar gynlluniau cyffelyb ar draws y byd.

Un pwynt y cyfeiriai ato yw'r ffaith, os mai morglawdd allgau a gaiff ei godi, y bydd y dŵr a ddelir y tu ôl iddo yn newid yr ecosystem yn llwyr. Ni fydd y llaid yno mwyach; bydd modd i olau dreiddio'r dŵr, a bydd yr ecosystem gyfan yn newid yn ddramatig. Bydd bywyd newydd yn yr ardal a gedwir. I godi cyswllt Beiblaidd ychydig yn denau, pan ofynnodd plant Israel am gyngor gan y patriarch Moses, dywedai bob amser, 'Dewiswch fywyd'. Os bydd y morglawdd yn esgor ar fywyd newydd, cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn i'r Cynulliad.

**Nick Ramsay:** Sut mae dilyn hynny. Rwyf bob amser wedi fy mhlesio pan fydd William Graham yn dechrau dyfynnu Moses.

Rydym yn aml yn defnyddio'r gair 'enfawr' i ddisgrifio prosiectau, ond yn achos morglawdd Hafren, credaf fod y gair yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n gywir, ac rydym wedi cael dadl ddiddorol heddiw ar oblygiadau prosiect mor enfawr—a bwriadaf ganolbwyntio ar gynnig y morglawdd, yn hytrach na'r posibilïadau eraill. Mae'n brosiect enfawr a fyddai'n esgor ar botensial enfawr a goblygiadau enfawr hefyd. Nid yw'n syndod iddi fod yn dasg mor anodd datbygu'r prosiect dros ddegawdau lawer, gan na ddylai unrhyw Lywodraeth ymgymryd â chynllun



scheme without a full understanding of exactly what those consequences might be.

The idea of a barrage in the Severn is not new. Simon Thomas mentioned that it was considerably older than 1981; I think that it was in Victorian times that the first proposal for a barrage was made, where the Severn bridge is. However, that was before national electricity production; it was proposed at the time to provide a deep-water harbour for the large fleet of ships that they wanted to keep in that area.

Those proposals were modest, but the scheme that is currently on the table, from Brean Down to Lavernock Point, would produce a considerable amount of power, although less than the outer barrage proposal that would have gone from Ilfracombe, I think I am right in saying, over to west Wales, which would clearly have had massive environmental consequences and is not on the table. However, the Lavernock Point to Brean Down proposal is worthy of very deep consideration. The fact that it would replace three nuclear power stations and prevent concerns about the lights going out—which we have all heard on the news recently, given that our spare capacity electricity production is now down to around 4%—means that a barrage proposal has to feature heavily in Government’s considerations.

What really amazes me is that I was at a coffee morning in Chepstow on the weekend, and I asked people what their views were—it is not amazing that I was at a coffee morning in Chepstow; I frequently go to coffee mornings there. [*Laughter.*] However, the issue of the barrage came up, and a straw poll of the people there showed that, actually, the public are way ahead of us on this, as there was very little opposition to some form of energy generation in the Severn. Okay, there was an awareness of—

**David Melding:** Come to Penarth.

**Nick Ramsay:** Are you heckling? There was an awareness of the issues about a barrage, but there was recognition that something has

o’r fath heb ddeall yn llawn beth yn union fyddai’r goblygiadau hynny o bosibl.

Nid yw’r syniad o gael morglawdd ar Afon Hafren yn un newydd. Crybwyllodd Simon Thomas iddo fynd yn ôl ymhell cyn 1981; credaf mai yn oes Fictoria y cynigiwyd morglawdd gyntaf, lle mae pont Hafren heddiw. Fodd bynnag, roedd hynny cyn dyddiau cynhyrchu trydan ar raddfa genedlaethol; fe’i cynigiwyd ar y pryd i ddarparu harbwr dŵr dwfn ar gyfer y llynges fawr o longau yr oeddent am ei chadw yn yr ardal honno.

Roedd y cynigion hynny yn rhai cymharol fach, ond byddai’r cynllun a gynigir ar hyn o bryd, o Brean Down i Drwyn Larnog, yn cynhyrchu cryn dipyn o ynni, ond llai na chynnig y morglawdd allanol a fyddai wedi mynd o Ilfracombe, credaf fy mod yn iawn o ran hynny, draw i orllewin Cymru, a fyddai’n amlwg wedi esgor ar oblygiadau amgylcheddol enfawr ac nad yw’n cael ei ystyried. Fodd bynnag, mae’r cynnig i godi morglawdd o Drwyn Larnog i Brean Down yn werth ei ystyried yn fanwl iawn. Mae’r ffaith y byddai’n disodli tair gorsaf ynni niwclear a lleddfu pryderon am y goleuadau yn cael eu diffodd—yr ydym ni i gyd wedi clywed sôn amdanynt ar y newyddion yn ddiweddar, o gofio bod ein gallu i gynhyrchu trydan dros ben bellach wedi gostwng i tua 4%—yn golygu bod yn rhaid i forglawdd fod yn rhan amlwg iawn o ystyriaethau’r Llywodraeth.

Yr hyn sy’n wir yn fy rhyfeddu yw fy mod mewn bore coffi yng Nghas-gwent dros y penwythnos, a holais bobl am eu barn—nid yw’n rhyfeddol fy mod mewn bore coffi yng Nghas-gwent; af i foreau coffi yno’n fynych. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, cododd mater y morglawdd, a dangosodd arolwg barn o’r bobl yno fod y cyhoedd ymhell ar y blaen inni mewn gwirionedd, gan nad oedd fawr ddim gwrthwynebiad i ryw fath o gyfleuster cynhyrchu ynni yn Afon Hafren. Iawn, roedd ymwybyddiaeth o—

**David Melding:** Dewch i Benarth.

**Nick Ramsay:** A ydych yn heclo? Roedd ymwybyddiaeth o’r problemau sy’n gysylltiedig â morglawdd, ond roedd

to be done, and when, in 10, 15 or 20 years' time, there is not enough power and the lights are dimming, people will look back and blame us, asking why politicians did not take the lead and do something about it. I am pleased that we are debating this matter today, and while I appreciate that it is not a devolved matter, it does help that the National Assembly and the Welsh Government will have an input into it.

My colleague William Graham mentioned the flood situation. I was looking at some of the statistics in this document and, potentially, the barrage would defend 90,000 properties and protect 500 sq km of floodplain against flooding. We have had surges along the river Severn historically that have caused massive damage and loss of life. Potentially, this technology could guard against them in future. Having said that, as Vaughan Gething eloquently said, this is a project that no-one can enter into lightly, because the environmental consequences could be severe.

I am pleased that the Severn barrage consultation project overview document contains potential solutions for fish stocks, such as the slow-turning turbines that would allow fish to pass and modern fish passes. Also, you would not have to store the water in a lake, as you could have a much less intrusive barrage that would generate energy from water flowing in either direction.

There is the issue of the times at which electricity would be generated, however, and we are still not in the position where we have the technology to adequately store energy for any length of time. Even then, the massive potential of tidal energy, compared to wind energy, is that you know exactly when the moon and the sun will exert their pull, which Russ George so eloquently talked about, on the tides. So, it is at least a predictable form of energy generation. I do not think that we are anywhere near saying that this is going to happen, but if this project was taken off the table, we would all be a lot poorer for it.

cydnabyddiaeth bod yn rhaid i rywbeth gael ei wneud, a phan na fydd digon o bŵer a phan fo'r goleuadau yn pylu, ymhen 10, 15 neu 20 mlynedd, bydd pobl yn edrych yn ôl ac yn rhoi'r bai arnom ni, gan ofyn pam na chymerodd gwleidyddion yr awenau a gwneud rhywbeth am y peth. Rwy'n falch ein bod yn trafod y mater hwn heddiw, ac er fy mod yn sylweddoli nad yw'n fater datganoledig, mae'n fuddiol y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Llywodraeth Cymru yn cyfrannu at y drafodaeth.

Cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelod William Graham at lifogydd. Roeddwn yn edrych ar rai o'r ystadegau yn y ddogfen hon ac, o bosibl, byddai'r morglawdd yn amddiffyn 90,000 eiddo ac yn diogelu 500 km sgwâr o orlffdir rhag llifogydd. Bu ymchwyddiadau ar hyd Afon Hafren yn hanesyddol sydd wedi achosi difrod enfawr a cholli bywyd. O bosibl, gallai'r dechnoleg hon warchod rhag hynny yn y dyfodol. Wedi dweud hynny, fel y dywedodd Vaughan Gething yn huawdl, nid ar chwarae bach y byddai rhywun yn ymgymryd â phrosiect o'r fath, gan y gallai esgor ar oblygiadau amgylcheddol difrifol.

Rwy'n falch bod dogfen trosolwg prosiect ymgynghori ar forglawdd Hafren yn cynnwys atebion posibl i stociau pysgod, fel y tyrbinau sy'n troi'n araf a fyddai'n caniatáu hynt pysgod ac ysgolion pysgod modern. Hefyd, ni fyddai'n rhaid ichi storio dŵr mewn llyn, oherwydd gallai fod gennych forglawdd llawer llai ymwithiol a fyddai'n cynhyrchu ynni o ddŵr yn llifo yn y naill gyfeiriad a'r llall.

Cyfyd mater o ran pryd y câi trydan ei gynhyrchu, fodd bynnag, ac rydym yn dal mewn sefyllfa lle nad oes gennym y dechnoleg i storio ynni'n ddigonol am unrhyw gyfnod o amser. Hyd yn oed wedyn, potensial enfawr ynni'r llanw, o'i gymharu ag ynni'r gwynt, yw eich bod yn gwybod yn union pryd y bydd y lleud a'r haul yn tynnu ar y llanw, fel y disgrifiodd Russ George mor huawdl. Felly, o leiaf mae'n fath rhagweladwy o gynhyrchu ynni. Ni chredaf ein bod yn agos at ddweud bod hyn yn mynd i ddigwydd, ond pe bai'r prosiect hwn yn cael ei ddiystyru, byddai pob un ohonom dipyn ar ein colled.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Andrew R.T. Davies):** I had not indicated prior to the debate that I was going to speak, but looking at the people who have contributed today, they have really put some thoughts forward that are worthy of greater consideration.

The point that I would like to make is that, while we have a source of energy on our doorstep, speaking as an elected Member for South Wales Central, I think that greater consideration needs to be given—and I know that the Member for Cardiff South and Penarth spoke as well—to the views of the people in that immediate area. Time and again proposals have come forward to unlock the potential of the Severn estuary, and each time residents and organisations have wondered, ‘Is this the one that is actually going to do that, or is this just another two or three-year consultation, and it will fall by the wayside?’. I hope that, when the First Minister responds to this debate today, he will give an indication as to whether the Welsh Government will initiate a greater consultation with residents in the immediate area to look at what the Severn estuary can do for South Wales as a whole. Indeed, is it viable with private money or with public money for one of these schemes to become a reality? For a succession of schemes, residents have been led up the hill and marched back down again.

None of us can underestimate the potential. We have heard one figure from Simon Thomas, talking about 10% of UK energy needs, and I believe that various other organisations have talked about 5%. Whichever number you wish to take, it is a significant contributor to the energy needs of this country. Also, are we just talking about a barrage here? Various proposals have talked about a significant economic footprint in the wider economy, and that is worthy of wider debate and wider discussion.

Equally, on the other comments that have come across about planning, it is important that we understand the roles that the Welsh Government and this institution would play in the planning process. This would be a major infrastructure project permitted, I presume, under reserved powers at Westminster, but other parts of it would fall

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Andrew R.T. Davies):** Ni ddywedais cyn y ddadl fy mod yn bwriadu siarad, ond o edrych ar y bobl sydd wedi cyfrannu heddiw, maent yn wir wedi cynnig rhai syniadau sy'n werth eu hystyried ymhellach.

Y pwynt yr hoffwn ei wneud yw, er bod gennym ffynhonnell o ynni ar garreg ein drws, gan siarad fel Aelod etholedig dros Ganol De Cymru, y credaf fod angen ystyried ymhellach—a gwn i'r Aelod dros Dde Caerdydd a Phenarth siarad hefyd—farn y bobl yn yr ardal gyfagos. Dro ar ôl tro mae cynigion wedi cael eu cyflwyno i fanteisio ar botensial aber Afon Hafren, a phob tro mae trigolion a sefydliadau wedi meddwl tybed, ‘Ai dyna'r un a fydd yn wir yn gwneud hynny, neu ai ymgynghoriad dwy neu dair blynedd arall yw hwn, na fydd byth yn cael ei wireddu?’ Gobeithiaf, pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymateb i'r ddadl hon heddiw, y bydd yn rhoi amcan ynghylch a fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn dechrau ar fwy o ymgynghori â thrigolion yn yr ardal gyfagos i edrych ar yr hyn y gall aber Afon Hafren ei wneud dros Dde Cymru yn ei gyfanrwydd. Yn wir, a yw'n hyfyw gwirieddu un o'r cynlluniau hyn gydag arian preifat neu gydag arian cyhoeddus? Un cynllun ar ôl y llall, mae trigolion wedi gorfod ystyried y posibilïadau ond yn ofer yn y diwedd.

Ni all yr un ohonom danbrisió'r potensial. Rydym wedi clywed un ffigur gan Simon Thomas, pan soniodd am 10% o anghenion ynni'r DU, a chredaf fod amrywiol sefydliadau eraill wedi sôn am 5%. Pa ganran bynnag a dderbyniwch, mae'n cyfrannu'n sylweddol at anghenion ynni'r wlad hon. Hefyd, ai morglawdd yn unig sydd dan sylw yma? Mae amrywiol gynigion wedi cyfeirio at ôl troed economaidd sylweddol yn yr economi ehangach, ac mae hynny'n werth ei drafod ymhellach.

Yn yr un modd, o ran y sylwadau eraill ynglŷn â chynllunio, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn deall y rolau y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru a'r sefydliad hwn yn eu chwarae yn y broses gynllunio. Byddai hyn yn brosiect seilwaith mawr a ganiateir, tybiwn i, o dan bwerau a gadwyd yn ôl yn San Steffan, ond byddai rhannau eraill ohono yn dod o fewn

within the competence of this institution, and indeed the Government, in terms of planning. These are the issues that residents are raising with me as a regional Member in South Wales Central.

I hope that the First Minister will use the time that he has to respond to some of the points that I have made. I commend the motion, and I hope that greater discussion can flow from this debate.

**David Melding:** I had not intended to speak either, but I just wanted to put on record a couple of further reservations, and perhaps echo the remarks of Andrew R.T. Davies. My mind is not closed, but there are a number of barriers—if that is not a pun—that have to be overcome. First of all, the embedded cost of the concrete: I am told that this project would use something like a quarter of the available concrete in Europe during its period of construction. That puts it in some perspective as to its size. How would the barrage ever be decommissioned? As far as I understand, its projection for electricity generation is for between 100 and 150 years. I may be wrong, and there may be ways of extending that, but would the barrage ever be decommissioned, other than by mother nature over millennia? Is that what we ought to be about? Finally, are we confident that there will not be future technologies that are less intrusive, like robust turbines to put on the sea floor? It is only if we can answer those sorts of questions that we could ever really embark on such a mega project, in my view.

**The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** It is not often that a motion is tabled for discussion on the floor of the Chamber with which I can wholeheartedly agree, and most Members, I suspect, will take the same view. It is not often that we get a contribution from a Member that suggests that a project could be a latter-day Genesis—'Let there be light', said William Graham. What I cannot promise, however, is that the barrage will be built in six days, and the associated ecosystem put in place within that time.

As a Government, as I mentioned yesterday, we take a strong view that the people of

cymhwysedd y sefydliad hwn, ac yn wir y Llywodraeth, o ran cynllunio. Dyma'r materion y mae trigolion yn eu codi gyda mi fel Aelod rhanbarthol yng Nghanol De Cymru.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn defnyddio'r amser sydd ganddo i ymateb i rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gennyf. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig, a gobeithiaf y gall y ddadl hon esgor ar fwy o drafodaeth.

**David Melding:** Nid oeddwn innau wedi bwriadu siarad ychwaith, ond roeddwn am sôn ar goedd am ychydig o amheuan eraill, ac efallai adleisio sylwadau Andrew R.T. Davies. Mae gennyf feddwl agored o hyd, ond mae nifer o rwystrau—os nad yw hynny'n air mwys—y mae'n rhaid eu goresgyn. Yn gyntaf oll, cost sylfaenol y concridd: dywedir wrthyf y byddai'r prosiect hwn yn defnyddio tua chwarter y concridd sydd ar gael yn Ewrop yn ystod y cyfnod adeiladu. Mae hynny'n rhoi maint y prosiect yn ei gyd-destun. Sut y byddai'r morglawdd byth yn cael ei ddadgomisiynu? Rwyf ar ddeall y rhagamcenir y bydd yn cynhyrchu trydan am rhwng 100 a 150 o flynyddoedd. Efallai fy mod wedi camsynied, ac efallai fod ffyrdd o ymestyn hynny, ond sut y câi'r morglawdd byth ei ddadgomisiynu, ac eithrio drwy natur dros filoedd o flynyddoedd? Ai dyna beth y dylem ei wneud? Yn olaf, a ydym yn hyderus na fydd technolegau yn y dyfodol sy'n llai ymwithiol, fel tyrbinau cadarn i'w rhoi ar wely'r môr? Dim ond os gallwn ateb y math hwn o gwestiynau y gallem fyth ddechrau ar brosiect mor enfawr, yn fy marn i.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones):** Nid yn aml y caiff cynnig ei gyflwyno i'w drafod ar lawr y Siambr y gallaf gytuno'n llwyr ag ef, a bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau yn cyd-fynd, tybiwn i. Nid yn aml y cawn gyfraniad gan Aelod sy'n awgrymu y gallai prosiect fod megis Genesis newydd—'Bydded goleuni', meddai William Graham. Yr hyn na allaf addo, fodd bynnag, yw y bydd y morglawdd yn cael ei adeiladu mewn chwe diwrnod, ac y bydd yr ecosystem gysylltiedig ar waith o fewn y cyfnod hwnnw.

Fel Llywodraeth, fel y soniais ddoe, rydym yn gadarn o'r farn y dylai fod gan bobl

Wales should have sufficient control over their own resources. This control rests with the people of England, Scotland and Northern Ireland in their respective nations; it is not true of Wales. It is important that, as we see natural resources developed, the people of Wales see a benefit. We know from our history that that benefit has not always been there. It is important, as we look to the future, that there is proper benefit for the people of Wales. We must not allow such a situation to happen again, when natural resources are moved, but the compensating benefits are not put in place. In case anyone thinks that this is a call for independence, I would settle for what devolved Scotland has in terms of control over energy. Scotland, as we know, is currently, and I hope in the future, very much part of the UK.

Wales is rich in energy resources and the Severn estuary is a resource that provides a tremendous opportunity to fuel our drive—if I could put it that way—for a fairer and more prosperous Wales. I take a personal lead on energy, because I am determined that we will work effectively across the Welsh Government and utilise all our abilities to make sure that we see a positive transition to a wealthy, low-carbon future. Our overarching aim must be to enhance the economic, social and environmental wellbeing of the people and communities that we represent in Wales and to achieve a better quality of life for our own and future generations.

The Severn estuary is famous for having the second-highest tidal range in the world. When I was much younger, my father had a six-foot inflatable Avon boat—which was made in Llanelli and was therefore a contribution to the Welsh economy—with a 2 horsepower engine. It was made clear that if you tried to go out on the south Wales coast and tried to return against the tide, you would remain out there for 12 hours, because the engine was not powerful enough to fight the tide as it left the shore. Therefore, we know that the tide is powerful and that this huge tidal range could be a source of carbon-free electricity over a very long term, potentially providing up to 5% of the UK's electricity

Cymru reolaeth ddigonol dros eu hadnoddau eu hunain. Mae gan bobl Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon y rheolaeth hon yn eu gwledydd eu hunain; nid yw'n wir am Gymru. Mae'n bwysig, wrth inni weld adnoddau naturiol yn cael eu ddatblygu, bod pobl Cymru yn cael budd. Gwyddom o'n hanes nad yw'r budd hwnnw bob amser wedi dod i ran pobl Cymru. Mae'n bwysig, wrth inni edrych i'r dyfodol, fod pobl Cymru yn cael y budd priodol. Rhaid inni beidio â chaniatáu i'r fath sefyllfa ddigwydd eto, pan fydd adnoddau naturiol yn cael eu symud, ond nad yw'r buddiannau sy'n gwneud iawn am hynny yn cael eu rhoi yn eu lle. Rhag ofn bod unrhyw un yn meddwl fy mod yn galw am annibyniaeth, byddwn yn fodlon ar yr hyn sydd wedi'i ddatganoli i'r Alban o ran rheolaeth dros ynni. Mae'r Alban, fel y gwyddom, ar hyn o bryd, ac yn y dyfodol gobeithio, yn sicr yn rhan o'r DU.

Mae gan Gymru gyfoeth o adnoddau ynni ac mae aber Afon Hafren yn adnodd sy'n cynnig cyfle gwych i danio ein hymdrech—os caf ei roi felly—i sicrhau Cymru decach a mwy ffyniannus. Rwy'n arwain ym maes ynni fy hun, am fy mod yn benderfynol y byddwn yn gweithio'n effeithiol ym mhob rhan o Lywodraeth Cymru ac yn defnyddio ein holl allu i sicrhau ein bod yn gweld newid cadarnhaol i ddyfodol carbon isel cyfoethog. Rhaid mai ein nod cyffredinol fydd gwella lles economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol y bobl a'r cymunedau rydym yn eu cynrychioli yng Nghymru ac i gyflawni gwell ansawdd bywyd i'n cenhedlaeth ni a chenedlaethau'r dyfodol.

Mae aber Afon Hafren yn enwog am fod â'r amrediad llanw mwyaf ond un yn y byd. Pan oeddwn yn iau o lawer, roedd gan fy nhad gwch Avon gwynt chwe throedfedd—a wnaed yn Llanelli, ac a oedd felly yn gyfraniad i economi Cymru—gydag injan dau farchnerth. Fe'i gwnaed yn glir pe baech yn ceisio mynd allan ar arfordir de Cymru a cheisio dychwelyd yn erbyn y llanw, y byddech yn aros yno am 12 awr, am nad oedd yr injan yn ddigon pwerus i frwydro yn erbyn y llanw wrth iddo adael y lan. Felly, gwyddom fod y llanw yn bwerus ac y gallai'r amrediad llanw enfawr hwn fod yn ffynhonnell o drydan di-garbon dros dymor hir iawn, gan ddarparu hyd at 5% o

needs.

I now turn to the points made by Russell George in relation to TAN 8. There is a reason why TAN 8 does not specifically mention the sea: it is because it is a land-based planning document. Therefore, given that the barrage would be in the sea, it would not be caught by TAN 8. I must again remind him that the aim of TAN 8 is to restrict wind generation to certain areas within his constituency and to further limit the number of turbines that can be placed within those areas. I must also remind him that, under the current planning system, under which the people of Wales do not have control over large planning applications, the UK Government has indicated that it will follow guidance that will allow any number of turbines to be built anywhere in his constituency. That is something that he needs to bear in mind, I would suggest.

We recognise the significant challenges associated with the harnessing of this energy—environmental and financial. If these issues—and it is a big ‘if’—can be satisfactorily resolved, then the harnessing of the energy will have stronger support, because we know how important it will be to develop low-carbon energy sources in the future. Indeed, we led the way in funding studies on innovative technologies as part of the UK study of the Severn, and these open up the prospect of utilising this major energy resource sustainably. In parallel with that work, work was also undertaken on the development and assessment of alternative technology options, which could provide a cheaper and less invasive alternative. As a Government, we contributed to the funding that was made available to research this under the Severn tidal power embryonic technologies scheme.

We know that the economic benefits of a barrage crossing on the Severn are likely to be substantial. The investment will result in significant job creation during the construction and operation phases. We know full well that ports such as Port Talbot, and possibly Milford Haven, are in a strong position to attract turbine manufacturing, if the barrage goes ahead, and to service the

anghenion trydan y DU o bosibl.

Trof yn awr at y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Russell George mewn perthynas â TAN 8. Mae rheswm pam nad yw TAN 8 yn cyfeirio'n benodol at y môr: y rheswm yw ei bod yn ddogfen gynllunio sy'n ymwneud â'r tir. Felly, o gofio y byddai'r morglawdd yn y môr, ni fyddai TAN 8 yn berthnasol iddo. Rhaid imi unwaith eto ei atgoffa mai nod TAN 8 yw cyfyngu cynhyrchu ynni'r gwynt i ardaloedd penodol o fewn ei etholaeth a chyfyngu ymhellach ar nifer y tyrbinau y gellir eu lleoli o fewn yr ardaloedd hynny. Rhaid imi hefyd ei atgoffa, o dan y system gynllunio bresennol, lle nad yw pobl Cymru yn cael rheolaeth dros geisiadau cynllunio mawr, fod Llywodraeth y DU wedi nodi y bydd yn dilyn arweiniad a fydd yn caniatáu i unrhyw nifer o dyrbinau gael eu hadeiladu yn unrhyw le yn ei etholaeth. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen iddo gadw mewn cof, hoffwn awgrymu.

Rydym yn cydnabod yr heriau sylweddol sy'n gysylltiedig â harneisio'r ynni hwn—amgylcheddol ac ariannol. Os gall y materion hyn—ac mae'n 'os' mawr—gael eu datrys yn foddhaol, yna bydd unrhyw ymgais i harneisio'r ynni yn cael mwy o gefnogaeth, oherwydd gwyddom pa mor bwysig fydd hi inni ddatblygu ffynonellau o ynni carbon isel yn y dyfodol. Yn wir, ni a arweiniodd o ran ariannu astudiaethau o dechnolegau arloesol fel rhan o astudiaeth y DU o Afon Hafren, ac mae'r rhain yn esgor ar y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio'r adnodd ynni mawr hwn yn gynaliadwy. Ochr yn ochr â'r gwaith hwnnw, gwnaed gwaith hefyd ar ddatblygu ac asesu opsiynau technoleg amgen, a allai gynnig dewis amgen rhatach a llai ymwithiol. Fel Llywodraeth, cyfrannwyd at y cyllid a oedd ar gael i ymchwilio i hyn o dan gynllun egin dechnolegau ynni llanw aber Afon Hafren

Gwyddom y bydd buddiannau economaidd morglawdd sy'n croesi Afon Hafren yn debygol o fod yn sylweddol. Bydd y buddsoddiad yn arwain at greu nifer sylweddol o swyddi yn ystod y cyfnodau adeiladu a gweithredu. Gwyddom yn iawn fod porthladdoedd megis Port Talbot, ac o bosibl Aberdaugleddau, mewn sefyllfa gref i ddenu gwaith cynhyrchu tyrbinau, os bydd y

barrage as it commences its operations. Indeed, we have been in discussions with a number of organisations with regard to that. We know that the scale of the development will offer Wales the potential to benefit from manufacturing and innovation opportunities. We are determined to do all we can to ensure that Wales receives maximum benefit from such a development, should it proceed, to support our ambition to be a world leader in the energy market.

The leader of the opposition asked about the planning role of the Welsh Government. Sadly, there is no planning role for the Welsh Government. Offshore, we only have responsibilities for up to 1 MW, which is a very small amount of energy generation on the part of one single power source. That said, it is important that we have a role—

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I take the point on energy generation, but, from various schemes and plans that I have seen, ancillary developments are also proposed. Does the Welsh Government have a role to play in the planning determination on those ancillary developments, such as roadways, rail and other infrastructure related to the barrage?

4.00 p.m.

**The First Minister:** If there is anything on land, particularly with regard to highways, then there will, inevitably, be a role for the Welsh Government under the present arrangements. We would prefer the role to be wider—a joint role, as suggested by Simon Thomas—so that we can maximise opportunities on both sides of the border. I am fully aware that the Severn estuary is important for its special environmental features, particularly as a conservation site for a variety of species, including migratory fish—salmon and sewin; I still cannot use the words sea trout—and over-wintering birds. The potential impact on those must be considered in the assessment of different technologies for harnessing the energy of the tidal range. What has changed is that previous schemes focused heavily on the engineering aspects of the barrage—perhaps

morglawdd yn mynd yn ei flaen, ac i wasanaethu'r morglawdd wrth iddo ddechrau bod yn weithredol. Yn wir, rydym wedi bod mewn trafodaethau gyda nifer o sefydliadau am hynny. Gwyddom y bydd maint y datblygiad yn cynnig potensial i Gymru fanteisio ar gyfleoedd gweithgynhyrchu ac arloesi. Rydym yn benderfynol o wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau bod Cymru yn cael y budd mwyaf posibl o ddatblygiad o'r fath, pe bai'n mynd rhagddo, er mwyn cefnogi ein huchelgais i arwain yn fyd-eang yn y farchnad ynni.

Holodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid am rôl cynllunio Llywodraeth Cymru. Yn anffodus, nid oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru rôl cynllunio. Ar y môr, dim ond am hyd at 1 MW yr ydym yn gyfrifol, sy'n swm bach iawn o ynni ar ran un ffynhonnell ynni. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'n bwysig bod gennym rôl—

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Derbyniaf y pwynt ynglŷn â chynhyrchu ynni, ond, o gynlluniau amrywiol a chynlluniau yr wyf wedi'u gweld, mae datblygiadau atodol hefyd yn cael eu cynnig. A oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru rôl i'w chwarae yn y penderfyniad cynllunio ar y datblygiadau atodol, megis ffyrdd, rheilffyrdd a seilwaith arall sy'n gysylltiedig â'r morglawdd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os oes unrhyw beth ar y tir, yn enwedig o ran priffyrdd, yna, yn anochel, bydd rôl i Lywodraeth Cymru o dan y trefniadau presennol. Byddai'n well gennym pe bai'r rôl yn ehangach—rôl ar y cyd, fel y'i hawgrymwyd gan Simon Thomas—fel y gallwn fanteisio i'r eithaf ar gyfleoedd ar y ddwy ochr i'r ffin. Rwy'n gwbl ymwybodol bod aber Afon Hafren yn bwysig am ei nodweddion amgylcheddol arbennig, yn enwedig fel safle cadwraeth i amrywiaeth o rywogaethau, gan gynnwys pysgod mudol—eog a sewin; mae'n gas gennyf ddefnyddio'r geiriau *sea trout*—ac adar sy'n gaeafu yma. Rhaid i'r effaith bosibl ar y rheini gael ei hystyried yn yr asesiad o dechnolegau gwahanol ar gyfer harneisio ynni o'r amrediad llanw. Yr hyn sydd wedi newid yw bod cynlluniau blaenorol wedi canolbwyntio'n drwm ar yr agweddau

rightly so, given where the proponents of previous schemes were coming from—with less of an emphasis on the environment. Now, I believe that the proper emphasis is being placed on the environmental impact of a barrage and on what would need to be done to meet the environmental concerns that such a barrage would create.

A balance has to be struck. There is no question that the Severn contains enough power to generate a substantial amount of electricity. It is also the case that there needs to be a mixture of power generation within the UK—within Great Britain to be more precise. Such is the nature of energy demand that we know there will still be a need for wind power and smaller sources of power generation. It does not mean that everything can be large, like the Severn barrage, nor does it mean that all power can be generated through microgeneration. There has to be a mix. Notwithstanding that, the environmental concerns have to be addressed effectively. As a Government, we would support any scheme that generated power from the Severn that met our objectives of economic, social and environmental sustainability. At present, the plans submitted to the UK Government are Corlan Hafren's plans.

O ran yr hyn ddywedodd yr Aelod dros Arfon, rydym wedi bod yn siarad â Corlan Hafren. Rwyf wedi cwrdd â'r cwmni unwaith ac wedi siarad ag ef ar y ffôn sawl gwaith. Rydym am sicrhau ein bod yn gwybod yn union beth yw ei gynlluniau ac yn gallu cefnogi rhywbeth a fyddai'n addas i Gymru.

We are awaiting the outcome of those discussions to ensure that we understand what kind of scheme we can support in the future. Ultimately, this is a matter for the UK authorities.

I am aware of the time, Llywydd, so I will simply conclude by saying that we know that there is tremendous potential in the Severn and that we have renewable energy targets to meet. We know that there are opportunities for the creation of employment and training opportunities and we know that there are challenges with regard to the environment.

peirianyddol ar y morglawdd—a hynny'n gwbl gyfiawn o bosibl, o ystyried safbwynt cefnogwyr y cynlluniau blaenorol—gyda llai o bwyslais ar yr amgylchedd. Erbyn hyn, credaf fod y pwyslais priodol yn cael ei roi ar effaith amgylcheddol morglawdd ac ar yr hyn y byddai angen ei wneud i leddfu'r pryderon amgylcheddol y byddai morglawdd o'r fath yn eu codi.

Rhaid cael cydbwysedd. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw Afon Hafren yn cynnwys digon o bŵer i gynhyrchu swm sylweddol o drydan. Mae hefyd yn wir nod angen cymysgedd o ran cynhyrchu ynni yn y DU—ym Mhrydain Fawr a bod yn fwy manwl gywir. Oherwydd natur y galw am ynni gwyddom y bydd angen ynni'r gwynt a ffynonellau llai o gynhyrchu pŵer o hyd. Nid yw'n golygu y gall popeth fod yn fawr, fel morglawdd Hafren, ac nid yw'n golygu ychwaith y gellir cynhyrchu'r holl ynni drwy ficrogynhyrchu. Rhaid cael cymysgedd. Er gwaethaf hynny, rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon amgylcheddol yn effeithiol. Fel Llywodraeth, byddem yn cefnogi unrhyw gynllun a oedd yn cynhyrchu ynni o Afon Hafren a oedd yn bodloni ein hamcanion cynaliadwyedd economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol. Ar hyn o bryd, y cynlluniau a gyflwynwyd i Lywodraeth y DU yw cynlluniau Corlan Hafren.

As for what the Member for Arfon said, we have been speaking to Corlan Hafren. I have met it once and have spoken to it on the phone on a number of occasions. We want to ensure that we know exactly what its plans are and can support something that would be appropriate for Wales.

Rydym yn aros am ganlyniad y trafodaethau hynny er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn deall pa fath o gynllun y gallwn ei gefnogi yn y dyfodol. Yn y pen draw, mater i awdurdodau'r DU yw hwn.

Rwy'n ymwybodol o'r amser, Lywydd, felly, gorffennaf drwy ddweud ein bod yn gwybod bod potensial aruthrol yn Afon Hafren a bod gennym dargedau ynni adnewyddadwy i'w cyflawni. Gwyddom fod cyfleoedd i greu cyflogaeth a chyfleoedd hyfforddi a gwyddom fod heriau o ran yr amgylchedd. Fodd bynnag, os gellir ymdrin â'r materion



However, if these matters can be dealt with, and those challenges can be met, then the barrage represents a very significant and exciting prospect for the people of Wales.

**Mick Antoniw:** I am grateful for the opportunity to participate and sum up in this debate, detecting as I do a wave of optimism in the proposals—sorry, it is water under the bridge. I will reflect on some of the principles and the points raised and philosophise a little on some of the issues that have been raised.

We live on a planet that is at an environmental precipice. Our endeavours to reverse the impact of a century and a half of fossil and chemical pollution and environmental damage often become trapped in a swathe of political and social contradictions. As industrially developed and wealthy countries in the west, we tell emerging and developing economies not to develop because of the environmental impact. Having destroyed much of our own natural environment, we tell others not to chop down their rainforests because of their important contribution to the oxygenation of the planet. Despite all these contradictions, and the feeling sometimes that we are very small players in the global battle for sustainable economic and energy policies, we nevertheless have an obligation to focus our attention on the necessary and practical steps that we can take to put our own house in order.

Therefore, it is no surprise that renewable energy from the Severn barrage, using our natural tidal resources, features heavily in the Welsh Government's own renewable energy targets and as a part of our international obligations for reducing carbon emissions and combating climate change. Alongside those arguments runs the issue of energy supply and security. The early decision by the coalition Government, when it came to power, to abandon the considerable amount of work that had been done and invested in bringing a Severn barrage to fruition was not only short-sighted but a failure that contributed to pushing the UK economy into recession. The effect of the loss of such macro-economic projects is now being

hyn, ac os gellir ateb yr heriau hynny, yna bydd y morglawdd yn gyfle sylweddol a chyffrous iawn i bobl Cymru.

**Mick Antoniw:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gymryd rhan a chrynhoi yn y ddadl hon, a minnau'n synhwyro rhyw don o obaith yn y cynigion—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, dŵr o dan y bont ydyw. Byddaf yn ystyried rhai o'r egwyddorion a'r pwyntiau a godwyd ac yn athronyddu ychydig ynghylch rhai o'r materion a godwyd.

Rydym yn byw ar blaned sydd ar ddibyn amgylcheddol. Mae ein hymdrechion i wrthdroi canrif a hanner o lygredd ffosil a chemegol a niwed amgylcheddol yn aml yn cael eu dal mewn llwyth o wrthddywediadau gwleidyddol a chymdeithasol. Fel gwledydd diwydiannol-ddatbygedig a chyfoethog yn y gorllewin, rydym yn dweud wrth economïau newydd a datblygol am beidio â datblygu oherwydd yr effaith ar yr amgylchedd. Ar ôl dinistrio llawer o'n hamgylchedd naturiol ein hunain, rydym yn dweud wrth eraill am beidio â thorri eu coedwigoedd glaw oherwydd eu cyfraniad pwysig i ocsigeneiddio'r blaned. Er gwaethaf yr holl wrthddywediadau hyn, a'r teimlad weithiau mai rhan fach iawn sydd gennym ni i'w chwarae yn y frwydr fyd-eang dros bolisiau economaidd ac ynni cynaliadwy, serch hynny mae dyletswydd arnom i ganolbwyntio ar y camau angenrheidiol ac ymarferol y gallwn eu cymryd i roi trefn ar ein materion eu hunain.

Felly, nid yw'n syndod bod ynni adnewyddadwy o forglawdd Hafren, gan ddefnyddio ein hadnoddau llanw naturiol, yn rhan bwysig o dargedau ynni adnewyddadwy Llywodraeth Cymru ei hun ac yn rhan o'n rhwymedigaethau rhyngwladol i leihau allyriadau carbon a mynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd. Ochr yn ochr â'r dadleuon hynny mae mater cyflenwad a sicrwydd ynni. Roedd y penderfyniad cynnar gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid, pan ddaeth i rym, i roi'r gorau i'r gwaith sylweddol a'r buddsoddiad a oedd wedi cael eu gwneud i wireddu morglawdd dros Afon Hafren nid yn unig yn gibddall ond yn fethiant a gyfrannodd at achosi dirwasgiad yn economi'r DU. Mae effaith colli prosiectau

recognised. I am, therefore, encouraged by the renewed and serious interest in a Welsh private investment project, led by Hafren Power, for a £25 billion barrage producing around 5% of the energy required by the UK. It would make an enormous contribution to turning the corner on the challenge of large-scale renewable energy production.

Every project of this type poses as many challenges as it offers benefits. The challenge of harnessing tidal energy is counterpoised by the challenge of its own environmental impact. It is for this reason that the cornerstone of this motion and debate is the need to set an environmental impact framework for any barrage development. The motion recognises that there will be an environmental impact, but accepts that our response to this must be reasonable and proportionate to the immense benefits. In summary, those benefits are a massive increase in the production of clean, renewable and sustainable energy, the creation of tens of thousands of jobs throughout Wales, the establishment of Wales as an economic centre for renewable energy, increased energy security, a massive catalyst for economic growth, an opportunity to forge economic links with the south-west economy, and an economic catalyst for the development of a south Wales metro and of Cardiff Airport.

We are at an early stage, but opportunities like this do not come along often, and we have had many false dawns. There are many challenges ahead—Vaughan Gething, Alun Ffred, and most of the speakers today, have identified a number of those concerns that have existed in the past and will, no doubt, exist in future. However, it is clear that there are emerging serious, groundbreaking and transformational economic opportunities that we cannot afford to ignore. I think that all of the speakers today are of the view that it is essential that the Welsh Government plays a leading role in developing and acquiring the real Welsh benefits of such a project.

**The Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to

macro-economaidd o'r fath bellach yn cael ei chydabod. Felly fe'm calonogir gan y diddordeb newydd a difrifol mewn prosiect buddsoddiad preifat yng Nghymru, o dan arweiniad Hafren Power, i godi morglawdd gwerth £25 biliwn yn cynhyrchu tua 5% o'r ynni sydd ei angen yn y DU. Byddai'n gwneud cyfraniad enfawr i droi'r gornel o ran yr her o gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fawr.

Mae pob prosiect o'r fath yn cynnig cynifer o heriau â buddiannau. Mae'r her o harneisio ynni'r llanw yn cael ei gwrthbwyso gan her ei effaith amgylcheddol ei hun. Am y rheswm hwn conglfaen y cynnig hwn a'r ddadl hon yw'r angen am osod fframwaith effaith amgylcheddol ar gyfer unrhyw forglawdd a ddatblygir. Mae'r cynnig yn cydnabod y bydd effaith ar yr amgylchedd, ond mae'n derbyn bod yn rhaid i'n hymateb i hyn fod yn rhesymol ac yn gymesur â'r buddiannau enfawr. I grynhoi, y buddiannau hynny yw cynnydd enfawr yn yr ynni glân, adnewyddadwy a chynaliadwy a gynhyrchir, creu degau ar filoedd o swyddi ledled Cymru, sefydlu Cymru fel canolfan economaidd ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, mwy o sicrwydd o ran ynni, sbardun enfawr i dwf economaidd, cyfle i feithrin cysylltiadau economaidd ag economi'r de-orllewin, a sbardun economaidd i ddatblygu metro yn y de a Maes Awyr Caerdydd.

Rydym ar gam cynnar, ond nid yw cyfleoedd fel hyn yn codi'n aml, ac rydym wedi gweld breuddwydion yn cael eu chwalu droeon. Mae llawer o heriau o'n blaenau—mae Vaughan Gething, Alun Ffred, a'r rhan fwyaf o'r siaradwyr heddiw, wedi nodi nifer o'r pryderon hynny sydd wedi bodoli yn y gorffennol ac a fydd, yn ddiau, yn bodoli yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg bod cyfleoedd economaidd trawsnewidiol ac arloesol difrifol yn dod i'r amlwg na allwn fforddio eu hanwybyddu. Credaf fod pob un o'r siaradwyr heddiw o'r farn ei bod yn hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn chwarae rôl flaenllaw yn y gwaith o ddatblygu a sicrhau manteision gwirioneddol prosiect o'r fath i Gymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cynnig yw y dylid derbyn y

agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. Mae'r cynnig, felly, wedi'i dderbyn, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 4.08 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 4.08 p.m.*

## **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ar Bolisi Ynni a Chynllunio yng Nghymru**

### **The Environment and Sustainability Committee's Report on Energy Policy and Planning Wales**

*Cynnig NDM5066 Dafydd Elis-Thomas*

*Motion NDM5066 Dafydd Elis-Thomas*

*Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*The National Assembly for Wales:*

*Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ar ei ymchwiliad i bolisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2012.*

*Notes the report of the Environment and Sustainability Committee on its inquiry into energy policy and planning in Wales which was laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2012.*

**Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas:** Cynigaf y cynnig.

**Lord Elis-Thomas:** I move the motion.

Mae'n sicr yn addas bod cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn yn digwydd ar ôl y cyntaf mewn cyfres hir, mae'n sicr, o drafodaethau y bydd yn digwydd yma ynglŷn â sut i harneisio ynni'r Hafren, a'r holl gwestiynau amgylcheddol a chynaliadwyedd difrifol a diddorol, sy'n codi yn sgil hynny. Rwy'n bod yn ofalus iawn i beidio â mynegi barn ar beth ddigwyddodd yn y ddadl flaenorol wrth sefyll fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn, ond, yn sicr, byddwn yn dod at y cwestiwn hwnnw wrth drafod ynni morol yng nghyd-destun penderfyniadau o'r fath. Byddaf yn dweud gair yn y funud am y modd yr wyf yn croesawu'n fawr ymrwymiad y Prif Weinidog a phawb sydd wedi siarad heddiw fod rhaid i unrhyw gynllun ynni o'r natur hon fod yn bartneriaeth rhwng Cymru a Lloegr.

It is certainly appropriate that the presentation of this report should occur after the first in a long series of discussions, I am sure, that will take place here about how to harness the energy of the Severn, and all of the serious and interesting environmental and sustainability questions that are that arise in the wake of that. I am being very careful not to express an opinion on what happened in the previous debate standing here as Chair of the committee presenting this report, but, certainly, we will come to that question in discussing marine energy in the context of such decisions. I will say a word in a minute about how I welcome the commitment of the First Minister and everyone who has spoken today that any such scheme must be a partnership between Wales and England.

Mae'r heriau amgylcheddol sy'n wynebu Cymru yn sylweddol, ac maent yn effeithio ar bob un ohonom fel dinasyddion, ble bynnag

The environmental challenges facing Wales are significant and they affect all of us as citizens, wherever we live. Rising energy

rydym yn byw. Mae costau ynni cynyddol yn fater sy'n cael ei drafod heddiw gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig; mae hynny'n cael effaith ar deuluoedd ac ar dlodi tanwydd. Mae'r digwyddiadau tywydd eithafol sydd wedi effeithio ar gymaint o gymunedau yn ystod yr wythnosau a'r misoedd diwethaf yn dod â'r heriau hyn i garreg y drws yn llythrennol. Mae'r posibilrwydd hollbresennol o newid trychinebus yn yr hinsawdd fyd-eang yn gofyn inni ymateb ar frys i'r heriau hyn; fel arall, mae'r heriau'n gwaethygu yn ddramatig. Byddwn yn mynd mor bell â dweud y bydd y penderfyniadau a wnawn heddiw yn diffinio'r rhagolygon ar gyfer cenedlaethau i ddod. Mae'n bwysig ein bod, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn gwbl ymwybodol o'n dyletswyddau.

Dyna pam wnaethom, fel Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd, neilltuo'r rhan fwyaf o flwyddyn gyntaf ein gwaith i ystyried polisi ynni a chynllunio yng Nghymru. Yn ystod ein gwaith, pwysleisiwyd pwysigrwydd hanfodol y sector ynni i Gymru, o ran cyfrannu at dargedau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy, lleihau allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr ac fel sbardun economaidd. Mae'r potensial enfawr ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, fel rydym newydd glywed yn y ddadl flaenorol, ar y tir ac ar y môr, hefyd wedi dod i'r amlwg. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl Cymru yn elwa, a bod angen rheoli'r effaith ar gymunedau a'r amgylchedd naturiol yn ofalus. Afraid dweud bod amgylchedd naturiol Cymru yn llawer mwy nag adnodd ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni yn unig. Mae'n bwysig bod y dull a gymerir yn cydnabod y berthynas rhwng ynni, cymunedau a'r amgylchedd naturiol. Dyna pam, fel pwyllgor, rydym yn llwyr gefnogi mabwysiadu'r dull ecosystemau gan Lywodraeth Cymru ac yn edrych ymlaen at weld y fframwaith polisi hwn yn datblygu.

Clywodd y pwyllgor sylwadau cryf gan gymunedau a phobl leol—cawsom adlais o hynny eto heddiw—a chonsŷrn am sut y mae polisiau ynni a datblygiadau penodol sydd wedi cael eu cynllunio yn effeithio ar unigolion a chymunedau, ac am sut yr ymdrinnir ag ymgynghoriadau a chyflwyno polisiau newydd. Rhaid dysgu gwersi o hyn. Mae ymgysylltu â'r gymuned a chefnogaeth

costs are an issue that is being discussed today by the UK Government; that impacts on families and on fuel poverty. The extreme weather events that have affected so many communities over the past few weeks and months bring these challenges literally to our doorstep. The omnipresent prospect of catastrophic global climate change requires us to respond urgently to these challenges, otherwise these challenges will become dramatically exacerbated. I would go so far as to say that the decisions that we take today will define the prospects for generations to come. It is important that we, as a National Assembly, are fully aware of our duties.

That is why we, as the Environment and Sustainability Committee, devoted most of our first year's work to the consideration of energy policy and planning in Wales. During the course of our work, the vital importance of the energy sector to Wales was emphasised, in terms of contributing to European Union targets for renewable energy generation, reducing greenhouse gas emissions and as an economic driver. The huge potential for renewable energy, as we have heard in the previous debate, both onshore and offshore, has also emerged. It is important that the people of Wales benefit, and that the impact on communities and the natural environment should be carefully managed. It goes without saying that Wales's natural environment is much more than just a resource for energy generation. It is important that the approach taken recognises the relationship between energy, communities and the natural environment. That is why we, as a committee, fully endorse the ecosystems approach being adopted by the Welsh Government and look forward to seeing this policy framework develop.

The committee heard strong representations from communities and local people—that was echoed here today—and concern about how energy policies and specific developments that have been planned impact upon individuals and communities, and about how consultation and the introduction of new policies have been handled. Lessons must be learned from this. Community engagement

cymuned yn hanfodol os ydym am ymateb o ddifrif i'r heriau a wynebwn.

Mae defnyddio ei hadnoddau ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni yn rhan annatod o hanes Cymru yn y cyfnod modern, pan oedd y byd yn cael ei bweru gan lo, fel y mae'r adeilad brics coch drws nesaf, y Pierhead, yn ein hatgoffa o hyd. Bryd hynny, Cymru oedd yn arwain drwy ddŵr a than. Drwy ein gwaith diweddar, rydym wedi gweld bod gan Gymru gyfle i arwain unwaith eto gan fod ei daearyddiaeth a'i hadnoddau naturiol yn berffaith addas ar gyfer cynhyrchu sawl math o ynni carbon isel. Mae diddordeb mawr gan ddatblygwyr posibl, er bod y cyfnod ar gyfer manteisio ar y diddordeb hwn yn dechrau dod i ben. Mae datblygwyr posibl, a'u buddsoddwyr, yn gweithredu ar raddfa fyd-eang ac ni fyddant yn aros am gyfnod amhenodol i fuddsoddi yn ein gwlad. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn glir o ran ein bwriadau pan ddywedwn fod Cymru'n agored i fusnesau. Pan ddaeth oes y glo i ben, daeth yn boenus o amlwg mai ychydig iawn o'r cyfoeth a gynhyrchwyd o adnoddau naturiol Cymru oedd wedi cael ei fuddsoddi yn ein cymunedau. Mae cyfle yn awr, ar ddechrau cyfnod newydd yn hanes diwydiannol Cymru, i sicrhau bod cyfran briodol o'r budd economaidd sy'n deillio o adnoddau naturiol Cymru yn cael ei fuddsoddi mewn modd cynaliadwy yn ein cymunedau. Mae hwn yn gyfle na all Cymru fforddio i'w golli.

Rwy'n falch bod gwaith y pwyllgor eisoes wedi cael effaith ar y ddadl gyhoeddus ac, o bosibl, y ddadl o fewn y Llywodraeth, ynglŷn â pholisi ynni. Rydym wedi gweld datblygiadau sylweddol ym mhollisiâu Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU yn ystod ein trafodaethau. Mae'r adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gennym yn nodi ein barn a'n hargymhellion ac rwy'n hyderus y bydd yn profi i fod yn garreg filltir bwysig yn y drafodaeth barhaus hon. Er bod yr adroddiad yn bwysig, rwy'n credu bod y daith, drwy ddadl a thrafodaeth, a arweiniodd at y pwynt hwn wedi bod cyn bwysiced yn ei gyfraniad â'n hymyrraeth ysgrifenedig drwy ein hadroddiad.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Llywodraeth am ei chyfraniad at ein gwaith yn ystod yr

and community support are essential if we are to respond seriously to the challenges that we face.

Using its resources for the production of energy is an integral part of Welsh history in modern times, when the world was powered by coal, as the red brick building next door, the Pierhead, reminds us. At that time, Wales was in the vanguard, through fire and water. Through our recent work, we have seen that Wales has an opportunity to lead once again as its geography and natural resources lend themselves perfectly to the generation of many kinds of low carbon energy. There is considerable interest from potential developers, although the window for taking advantage of this interest is beginning to close. Potential developers, and their investors, operate on a global scale and will not wait indefinitely to invest in our country. It is important that we are clear of purpose when we say that Wales is open for business. When the age of coal came to an end, it became painfully apparent that very little of the wealth generated from Welsh natural resources had been invested in our communities. There is an opportunity now, at the dawning of a new epoch in Wales's industrial history, to ensure that an appropriate share of the economic benefit derived from Welsh natural resources is sustainably invested in our communities. This is an opportunity that Wales cannot afford to miss.

I am pleased that the work of the committee has already had an impact on the public debate and, perhaps, on the debate within Government, on energy policy. We have seen significant developments in both Welsh Government and UK Government policy during the course of our work. The report that we have published sets out our views and recommendations and I am confident that it will prove to be an important milestone in this ongoing discussion. Although the report is important, I believe that the journey through debate and discussion that led us to this point has been as important in its contribution as our written intervention in reporting has been.

I thank the Government for its contribution to our work during the course of the inquiry. At

ymchwiliad. Mewn un cyfarfod, clywsom gan bedwar Gweinidog mewn un diwrnod. Mae hynny'n dangos bod Gweinidogion Cymru yn teimlo bod rhaid iddynt ymateb i bwyllgorau mawr newydd y Cynulliad. Rwyf hefyd yn diolch i'r Llywodraeth am ei hymateb i'n hadroddiad, ac rwy'n ei groesawu. Wedi'r cyfan, o blith ein 77 o argymhellion, cafodd 64 eu derbyn yn gyfan gwbl neu mewn egwyddor, cafodd saith eu derbyn yn rhannol, a dim ond chwech a wrthodwyd. Wrth gwrs, nid yw hwn yn ddigon da, a deuaif yn ôl at un neu ddau bwynt cyn y diwedd ynglŷn â hynny.

4.15 p.m.

Rwy'n falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn yr argymhellion hyn: i sefydlu bwrdd cyflawni ynni adnewyddadwy i gydlynu datblygiadau; i sicrhau nodi'n glir ei hachos dros ddatganoli pellach—ac rwy'n croesawu'n fawr bwyslais y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach heddiw a ddoe i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw; i sicrhau bod y gyfundrefn cymhellion ar gyfer prosiectau ynni tonnau a llanw ar y môr yng Nghymru yn gyfartal â chyfundrefn yr Alban; ac i ryddhau'r ôl-groniad o geisiadau am ffermydd gwynt ar dir. Derbyniwyd yr argymelliadau hyn hefyd: i ystyried a oes angen diwygio polisiâu cynllunio ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy unwaith y bydd yr ôl-groniad hwnnw wedi cael ei glirio; i sefydlu protocol gyda datblygwyr ar gyfer buddion cymunedol; ac i lunio cynllun gweithredu manwl i gyrraedd targedau ynni adnewyddadwy ac adroddiad monitro blynyddol i ddangos cynnydd. Rydym yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y rheini wedi eu derbyn. Rwy'n sicrhau'r Llywodraeth y byddwn ni fel pwyllgor yn parhau i edrych yn ofalus ar y cynnydd a wneir yn erbyn argymhellion yr adroddiad yn rheolaidd yn y blynyddoedd i ddod.

O blith y chwe argymhelliad a wrthodwyd, mae dau faes yr hoffwn pe bai'r Gweinidog yn barod eu trafod ymhellach â ni, sef ei benderfyniad i beidio â chomisiynu asesiad effaith economaidd o symudiadau trafnidiaeth sy'n gysylltiedig â datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt, a chomisiynu astudiaeth i edrych ar y posibilrwydd o gynnwys ystyriaeth o fuddion cymunedol yn y broses gynllunio. Deallaf y dadleuon ond, yn

one meeting we heard from four Ministers in one day. That demonstrates that Welsh Ministers feel that they must respond to the new super committees of the Assembly. I also thank the Government for its response to our report, which I welcome. After all, of our 77 recommendations, 64 have been accepted either fully or in principle, seven have been accepted in part, and only six have been rejected. Of course, that is not good enough, and I will return to one or two points before the end in relation to that.

I am pleased that the Government has accepted the following recommendations: to establish a renewable energy delivery board to co-ordinate developments; to clearly set out its case for further devolution—and I warmly welcome the First Minister's emphasis in that regard earlier today and yesterday; to ensure that the incentives regime for marine wave and tidal projects in Wales is on a par with that in Scotland; and to free up the backlog of onshore windfarm applications. The following recommendations were also accepted: to consider whether planning policies for renewable energy need to be amended once that backlog has been cleared; to establish a protocol with developers for community benefits; and to produce a detailed action plan for meeting renewable energy targets and an annual monitoring report to demonstrate progress. We welcome the fact that those recommendations have been accepted. I can assure the Government that we as a committee will be looking closely at the progress being made against the report's recommendations at regular intervals in the years to come.

Of the six recommendations that were rejected, there are two areas that I would like it if the Minister were prepared to discuss with us further, namely his decision not to commission an economic impact assessment of transport movements associated with windfarm developments, and the commissioning of a study to look at the feasibility of incorporating the consideration of community benefits into the planning

enwedig o ran yr ail bwynt, nid ni yw'r unig rai sydd wedi gweld potensial mewn o leiaf edrych ar y cysyniad hwn o gysylltiad rhwng buddion a'r broses gynllunio. Rydym wedi dilyn y farn academiaidd yn y maes a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Rydym yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog gadw meddwl agored ynglŷn â gwrthod yr alwad hon am astudiaeth. Nid ydym yn argymhell bod angen newid y system gynllunio, ond rydym yn gofyn iddo ystyried hynny.

Cyn clywed gan y Gweinidog, mae'n bwysig imi gofnodi fy niolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r ymchwiliad hwn. Cawsom lefel anferthol o ymateb, gyda dros 300 o gyflwyniadau ysgrifenedig ac 20 sesiwn dystiolaeth, yn rhychwantu hyd a lled y gymdeithas yng Nghymru a thu hwnt. Rydym yn wirioneddol ddiolchgar ichi i gyd am eich cyfraniadau. Ni all pwyllgor wneud ei waith heb bobl sy'n fodlon tystiolaethu iddo. Rydym yn bwriadu parhau i fod mewn cysylltiad â'n tystion at y dyfodol. Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch i'm cydweithwyr o bob plaid ar y pwyllgor am y modd trylwyr a diduedd y maent wedi gweithio wrth gymryd tystiolaeth. Derbyniaf nad yw hynny'n hawdd, yn enwedig i rai ohonynt, oherwydd yr ardaloedd y maent yn eu cynrychioli. Rwy'n siŵr y byddai aelodau'r pwyllgor am imi ddiolch yn bersonol i'n pennaeth ymchwil, Graham Winter, am ei fewnbnw arbenigol drwy'r holl broses ymchwilio.

Rwy'n credu mai rôl pwyllgor fel ein un ni yw bod yn gyfaill beirniadol i'r Llywodraeth, ac rwy'n gobeithio bod ein gwaith wedi bod yn gatalydd ac yn gefnogaeth i wella polisi cyhoeddus yn y maes hwn. Bydd y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd yn parhau i fod yn wyliadwrus ac yn drylwyr wrth ddwyn y Llywodraeth i gyfrif am ei pherfformiad o ran bodloni'r argymhellion y mae wedi'u derbyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ymchwiliad hwn wedi'i gwneud yn amlwg i mi fod gan bob un ohonom ddyletswydd i rannu'r cyfrifoldeb i sicrhau dyfodol cynaliadwy. Rhaid inni i gyd chwarae ein rhan os ydym i ymateb i'r heriau yr ydym yn eu hwynebu a chymryd y cyfleoedd a gyflwynir inni ar gyfer ein cymunedau heddiw ac ar gyfer dyfodol y greadigaeth.

process. I understand the arguments but, particularly on the second point, we are not alone in seeing the potential for at least exploring this concept of a link between benefits and community benefit. We have followed academic opinion in this area, and we will continue to do so. We ask the Minister to keep an open mind about his rejection of the call for a study. We are not recommending that the planning system be changed, just asking him to consider that.

Before hearing from the Minister, it is important that I place on record my thanks to all those who provided evidence to this inquiry. We had an unprecedented level of response, with more than 300 written submissions and 20 evidence sessions, spanning the breadth of Welsh society and beyond. We are genuinely grateful to you all for your contributions. A committee cannot do its work without people being willing to give testimony, and we hope to continue to engage with our witnesses in the future. I would also like to thank my committee colleagues from all parties for the rigorous and impartial manner in which they worked through the evidence that we have taken. I accept that that is not easy, particularly for some of them, given the areas that they represent. I am sure that all committee members would join me in thanking our head of research, Graham Winter, for his expert input to our work throughout the inquiry process.

I am of the belief that a committee such as ours must act as a critical friend to Government, and I hope that our work has acted both as a catalyst and as support for improving public policy in this area. The Environment and Sustainability Committee will continue to be vigilant and rigorous in holding the Welsh Government to account for its performance in fulfilling the recommendations that it has accepted. However, this inquiry has made it clear to me that the responsibility to ensure a sustainable future is shared by every one of us. We must each play our part if we are to respond to the challenges that we face and take the opportunities that are presented to us for our communities today and for the future of creation.

**Russell George:** I am very pleased to contribute to this debate this afternoon, following the debate on marine projects on the Severn estuary. In addition to the meeting taking place in London today, it is extremely positive that Governments and institutions on both sides of the M4 are examining how the UK as a whole will strategically move forward with its long-term energy plans. I have no doubt that, within the deliberations of the senior Cabinet members, Wales will play an important part in helping to secure our future energy needs while ensuring that we continue to meet our renewable energy obligations and mitigate the effects of global climate change.

I would, of course, echo the words of our Chair, Lord Elis-Thomas, in thanking the committee team and members of the research service for all their assistance in bringing the report together, as well as those who ably advised us to make the 77 recommendations that are set out in the report. I would particularly like to thank all the witnesses who gave of their time to submit written and oral evidence to our inquiry. This resulted in our having a vast amount of experience at our disposal during this inquiry, which was immensely helpful in allowing us to get to grips with the challenge that the Government and the country face. The evidence also highlighted what some of the potential solutions might be, moving forward.

I would like to spend my time looking at the recommendations that particularly affect mid Wales. Members will be aware of the mid Wales connection project in my constituency. I will have to remind the First Minister that this project is progressing only because of TAN 8 and the Welsh Government's encouragement for having large-scale windfarm developments in the three search areas across mid Wales. For me, TAN 8 is still the most significant barrier to Wales developing an effective and progressive renewable energy agenda.

**David Rees:** I would like to clarify that TAN 8 does not just cover the three search areas in mid Wales. It covers seven areas, including three in mid Wales and three in south Wales, including one in my constituency.

**Russell George:** Rwy'n falch iawn o gyfrannu at y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma, yn dilyn y ddadl ar brosiectau morol ar aber afon Hafren. Yn ychwanegol at y cyfarfod a gynhelir yn Llundain heddiw, mae'n hynod gadarnhaol bod Llywodraethau a sefydliadau ar y naill ochr a'r llall i'r M4 yn ystyried sut y bydd y DU gyfan yn symud ymlaen yn strategol gyda'i chynlluniau ynni tymor hir. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth y bydd Cymru, yn nhrefodaethau uwch aelodau'r Cabinet, yn chwarae rhan bwysig wrth helpu i ddiwallu ein hanghenion ynni yn y dyfodol tra'n sicrhau ein bod yn parhau i gyflawni ein rhwymedigaethau o ran ynni adnewyddadwy ac yn lliniaru effeithiau newid yn yr hinsawdd byd-eang.

Byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn ategu geiriau ein Cadeirydd, yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas, wrth ddiolch i dîm y pwyllgor ac aelodau'r gwasanaeth ymchwil am eu holl gymorth wrth lunio'r adroddiad, yn ogystal â'r rheini a wnaeth ein cynghori'n fedrus i wneud y 77 o argymhellion a nodir yn yr adroddiad. Hoffwn ddiolch yn benodol i'r holl dystion a roddodd o'u hamser i gyflwyno tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a llafar i'n hymchwiliad. Roedd hyn yn golygu bod llawer iawn o brofiad ar gael inni yn ystod yr ymchwiliad hwn, a oedd yn hynod ddefnyddiol i'n galluogi i fynd i'r afael â'r her y mae'r Llywodraeth a'r wlad yn ei hwynebu. Amlygodd y dystiolaeth hefyd rai o'r atebion posibl, wrth symud ymlaen.

Hoffwn dreulio fy amser yn ystyried yr argymhellion sy'n effeithio'n benodol ar ganolbarth Cymru. Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol o brosiect cyswllt canolbarth Cymru yn fy etholaeth. Rhaid imi atgoffa'r Prif Weinidog mai dim ond oherwydd TAN 8 ac anogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru i ddatblygu ffermydd gwynt mawr yn y tair ardal chwilio ledled canolbarth Cymru y mae'r prosiect hwn yn gwneud cynnydd. Yn fy marn i, TAN 8 yw'r rhwystr mwyaf sylweddol o hyd i ddatblygu agenda ynni adnewyddadwy effeithiol a chynyddol yng Nghymru.

**David Rees:** Hoffwn egluro nad yw TAN 8 ond yn cwmpasu'r tair ardal chwilio yng nghanolbarth Cymru. Mae'n cynnwys saith ardal, gan gynnwys tair yng nghanolbarth Cymru a thair yn ne Cymru, gan gynnwys un



yn fy etholaeth i.

**Russell George:** That is true, I acknowledge. It may also be worth pointing out that TAN 8 does not relate only to land-based developments. As the First Minister said in the previous debate, on page 51, it specifically looks at tidal and wave technology and makes reference to the Severn barrage. We need to consider seriously the future purpose of TAN 8, as there are questions about whether it is fit for purpose and in the best interests of the people of Wales. The First Minister has continually said, including in answer to an oral question only yesterday, that it is a redundant document. Therefore, why does the Government and particularly the Minister for environment cling on to the document as being so relevant? I quote from the Government response to recommendation 12: 'TAN 8 provides appropriate framework for the strategic planning of all forms of renewable energy in Wales.'

It simply does not. That was also reflected in the Minister's backtracking letter to the chief planning officer last year. I make no apologies for saying that when the committee discussed its recommendations on TAN 8, I would have preferred to go a lot further by advocating the need to independently test and validate the spatial approach being promoted by TAN 8 to ensure that it not only reflects current circumstances, but demonstrates that it is truly environmentally and socially fit for purpose.

Of course, concessions have to be made, but those concessions, for me, as reflected in recommendation 42, were very much based on a planning Bill coming forward sooner rather than later. The current timetable for that legislation will mean that the recommendation is not fully realised until the fifth Assembly.

Recommendation 18 is an important aspect for the wider mid Wales economy, given that tourism and agriculture are two of the largest wealth creators in the region. What I am unsure of in the Government's response is

**Russell George:** Ydy, mae hynny'n wir. Gall hefyd fod yn werth nodi bod TAN 8 yn ymwneud â mwy na dim ond datblygiadau sy'n seiliedig ar y tir. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn y ddadl flaenorol, ar dudalen 51, mae'n edrych yn benodol ar dechnoleg llanw a thonau ac yn cyfeirio at forglawdd Hafren. Mae angen inni ystyried o ddifrif ddiben TAN 8 yn y dyfodol, gan fod cwestiynau ynghylch a yw'n addas at y diben ac er budd pobl Cymru. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud yn barhaus, gan gynnwys mewn ymateb i gwestiwn llafar dim ond ddoe, ei bod yn ddogfen ddiangen. Felly, pam mae'r Llywodraeth ac yn benodol y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn mynnu bod y ddogfen mor berthnasol? Yn ei hymateb i argymhelliad 12, nododd y Llywodraeth fod: TAN 8 yn darparu fframwaith priodol ar gyfer cynllunio'n strategol bob math o ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru.

Nid yw hynny'n wir. Cafodd hynny ei adlewyrchu hefyd yn llythyr gwrthgilio'r Gweinidog at y prif swyddog cynllunio y llynedd. Nid wyf yn ymddiheuro am ddweud, pan fu'r pwyllgor yn trafod ei argymhellion ar TAN 8, y byddwn wedi hoffi mynd gryn dipyn ymhellach drwy hyrwyddo'r angen i brofi a dilysu'r dull gweithredu gofodol sy'n cael ei hyrwyddo gan TAN 8 yn annibynnol er mwyn sicrhau ei fod nid yn unig yn adlewyrchu amgylchiadau presennol, ond yn dangos ei fod yn wirioneddol addas at y diben yn amgylcheddol ac yn gymdeithasol.

Wrth gwrs, mae'n rhaid gwneud consesiynau, ond roedd y consesiynau hynny, yn fy marn i, fel yr adlewyrchir yn argymhelliad 42, yn seiliedig i raddau helaeth iawn ar gyflwyno Bil cynllunio yn gynt yn hytrach nag yn hwyrach. Bydd yr amserlen bresennol ar gyfer y ddeddfwriaeth honno'n golygu na chaiff yr argymhelliad ei gyflawni'n llawn nes y pumed Cynulliad.

Mae argymhelliad 18 yn agwedd bwysig ar gyfer economi ehangach canolbarth Cymru, o gofio bod twristiaeth ac amaethyddiaeth yn ddau o'r prif bethau sy'n creu cyfoeth yn y rhanbarth. Yr hyn rwy'n ansicr yn ei gylch yn

why does it only accept this is principle, particularly given that it says in the explanation of the response that it will commission research? It is a recommendation request that you either accept or reject. It seems to me that the Government is accepting it, which is welcome, if that is the case.

Looking at the key transport-based recommendations for mid Wales, I am pleased that the Government has accepted recommendation 45, but I am, of course, disappointed that the Government has rejected recommendation 46, which was for a very short and focused economic impact study of the transport movements associated with windfarm developments in mid Wales. I am not comforted by the explanation for rejecting that recommendation, given that, only in May this year, the Welsh Government did not inform Traffic Wales of the movements of abnormal loads carrying infrastructure from Oswestry into Powys.

Recommendation 50 is important, not only because of the policy wobbles that we have witnessed over the past 18 months, but also with the announcement yesterday that the UK Government is considering importing electricity generated by Irish windfarms into the national grid. That will obviously flow into the two spurs in north and south Wales. As Simon Thomas pointed out only yesterday, it raises questions about the potential viability or need for the mid Wales connection project. I would be interested to hear what discussions the Minister has had with colleagues in the Department of Energy and Climate Change about that proposal, and what effects it may have on the connection project.

**David Rees:** Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer, for the opportunity to speak on such an important issue, which is wider than the previous debate, because it covers energy policy on a wider basis. First, I support the comments of Dafydd Elis-Thomas and Russell George in thanking both clerks, their staff, the advisers and researchers for their work during the inquiry, and to the excellent witnesses for providing us with such important information during that time.

ymateb y Llywodraeth yw pam mai dim ond mewn egwyddor y mae'n derbyn hyn, yn enwedig o gofio bod esboniad yr ymateb yn nodi y bydd yn comisiynu ymchwil? Gofynnir yn yr argymhelliad ichi naill ai ei dderbyn neu ei wrthod. Mae'n ymddangos imi fod y Llywodraeth yn ei dderbyn, a chrosawn hynny, os yw hynny'n wir.

Wrth ystyried yr argymhellion allweddol sy'n seiliedig ar drafnidiaeth ar gyfer canolbarth Cymru, rwy'n falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn argymhelliad 45, ond rwy'n siomedig, wrth gwrs, fod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod argymhelliad 46, a oedd yn galw am astudiaeth fer a phenodol o effaith economaidd y symudiadau cludo sy'n gysylltiedig â datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt yng nghanolbarth Cymru. Nid wyf yn fodlon ar yr esboniad dros wrthod yr argymhelliad hwnnw, o gofio na wnaeth Llywodraeth Cymru, ym mis Mai Eleni, hysbysu Traffig Cymru am y symudiadau cludo llwythi anarferol o seilwaith o Groesoswallt i mewn i Bowys.

Mae argymhelliad 50 yn bwysig, nid yn unig oherwydd y polisiau anwadal a welwyd dros y 18 mis diwethaf, ond hefyd yn sgîl y cyhoeddiad ddoe fod Llywodraeth y DU yn ystyried mewnfario trydan a gynhyrchir gan ffermydd gwynt yn Iwerddon i mewn i'r grid cenedlaethol. Yn amlwg, bydd hynny'n llifo i mewn i'r ddwy gainc yng ngogledd a de Cymru. Fel y dywedodd Simon Thomas ddoe, mae'n codi cwestiynau am hyfywedd posibl prosiect cyswllt canolbarth Cymru neu'r angen amdano. Byddai gennyf ddi-ddordeb i glywed pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda chyd-aelodau yn yr Adran Ynni a Newid yn yr Hinsawdd ynghylch y cynnig hwnnw, a pha effeithiau y gall eu cael ar y prosiect cyswllt.

**David Rees:** Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, am y cyfle i siarad am fater mor bwysig, sy'n ehangach na'r ddadl flaenorol, am ei fod yn cwmpasu polisi ynni yn ehangach. Yn gyntaf, rwy'n cefnogi sylwadau Dafydd Elis-Thomas a Russell George wrth ddiolch i'w clerod, staff, cynghorwyr ac ymchwilwyr am eu gwaith yn ystod yr ymchwiliad, ac i'r tystion rhagorol am roi gwybodaeth mor bwysig inni yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

The report is timely as we have recently heard concerns being raised about the future of energy generation within the UK in the coming years. As Nick Ramsay pointed out, Ofgem's first annual electricity capacity assessment highlights the UK's spare capacity as falling from 14% to 4% for the winter of 2015-16, raising fears of energy shortages and blaming the possible shortages on the decommissioning of coal-fired power stations faster than first thought, and the unprecedented challenge of attracting investment to replace generating capacity with other modes.

The report's 77 recommendations clearly indicate the depth and scope of the inquiry, which reflects the complexity of the energy make-up found in Wales, from renewables to nuclear power, and from onshore to offshore, including the Severn tidal barrage possibilities. Much of the report is focused on planning issues, on which we have already heard some views. I look forward to the introduction of the planning Bill where these can be considered in detail, so I will focus on a couple of points that may otherwise be overlooked in the debate.

The Government's response to the report indicated that the way in which we use and view energy is undergoing profound changes as a result of changing environmental and social factors. Keeping people warm and keeping the lights on while meeting our carbon emissions targets means looking to use all the lower-carbon electricity technologies available: gas, wind, solar, marine and tidal, nuclear and geothermal. We must recognise that renewable energy options offer us an opportunity to support our economy and to reduce pollution in our towns and cities, and the target that one day we will rid ourselves of energy insecurity. Naturally, this is leading to a change in our way of life, and how we adapt to that change may be one of the defining legacies of our generation.

The committee's report identified the need to consider the whole mix of energy generation, and the roles that each can play in the policy

Mae'r adroddiad yn amserol gan ein bod wedi clywed pryderon yn cael eu codi'n ddiweddar am ddyfodol cynhyrchu ynni yn y DU dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Fel y dywedodd Nick Ramsay, mae asesiad blynyddol cyntaf Ofgem o gapasiti trydan yn nodi y gallai capasiti dros ben y DU ostwng o 14% i 4% erbyn gaeaf 2015-16, gan arwain at bryderon ynghylch prinder ynni a thaflu'r bai am y prinder posibl ar ddatgomisiynu gorsafoedd ynni glo yn gynt na'r disgwyl, a'r her ddigynsail o ddenu buddsoddiad i gyflwyno dulliau eraill yn lle'r capasiti cynhyrchu.

Mae 77 o argymhellion yr adroddiad yn dangos yn glir ddyfnder a chwmpas yr ymchwiliad, sy'n adlewyrchu cymhlethdod y cyfansoddiad ynni yng Nghymru, o ynni adnewyddadwy i ynni niwclear, ac o gynhyrchu ynni ar y tir i gynhyrchu ynni ar y môr, gan gynnwys y posibiladau o ran morglawdd llanw Afon Hafren. Mae llawer o'r adroddiad yn canolbwyntio ar faterion cynllunio, yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed rhywfaint o farn yn eu cylch. Rwy'n edrych ymlaen at gyflwyno'r Bil cynllunio er mwyn ystyried y rhain yn fanylach, felly byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar un neu ddau bwynt y gellir eu hanwybyddu fel arall yn y ddadl.

Dangosodd ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad fod y ffordd rydym yn defnyddio ac yn ystyried ynni yn newid yn sylweddol o ganlyniad i ffactorau amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol sy'n newid. Mae cadw pobl yn gynnes a chadw'r goleuadau wedi'u cynnau tra'n cyrraedd ein targedau allyriadau carbon yn golygu ceisio defnyddio'r holl dechnolegau trydan carbon is sydd ar gael: nwy, gwynt, solar, morol a llanw, niwclear a geothermol. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod opsiynau ynni adnewyddadwy yn cynnig cyfle inni gefnogi ein heconomi a lleihau llygredd yn ein trefi a'n dinasoedd, a'r targed y cawn wared ar ansicrwydd ynni un dydd. Yn naturiol, mae hyn yn arwain at newid yn ein ffordd o fyw, a gall y ffordd rydym yn ymateb i'r newid hwnnw fod yn un o brif etifeddiaethau ein cenedlaeth.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn nodi'r angen i ystyried y cymysgedd cyfan o ddulliau cynhyrchu ynni, a'r rolau y gall pob un

development that will deliver for a strong and secure energy future. I was pleased to hear the First Minister highlight that point in his comments in the previous debate. It was also noted that there is a need to move forward with the development of new generating sites to avoid such situations arising as have been identified by Ofgem.

Renewable energy is becoming the key to preventing more and more countries from falling into the trap of dependency on increasingly sparse and expensive fossil fuels. The latest figures show a jump in capacity of 42% to 40.2 GW within the UK for the year ending the second quarter just gone. Unfortunately, too much of the recent dialogue on renewable energy has been tainted by conflict. It has been seen in my constituency, where the UK Government has decided to approve the largest onshore windfarm in the UK, at Pen y Cymoedd in the upper Afan Valley. It remains a travesty that decisions on such important issues are not taken in Wales and are taken so far removed from the communities on which they will impact. As such, I welcome recommendation 8 to clarify the case for devolving these powers.

The report also places an emphasis on community empowerment and smaller community-led projects, as in recommendation 60, such as local anaerobic digestion plants or small micro hydroelectric plants that will harness energy in a way that is sympathetic to the local community and the environment. That is to be applauded, but not confused with community benefits from larger projects. That may be a drop in the ocean of our current energy needs, but the picture emerging is one of inspiring local communities to come together to start generating their own energy.

I also wish to praise the report's emphasis on prioritising support for innovation, research and development, namely recommendations 15 and 75, not just within Wales but also for supporting collaboration on a global scale—and the Severn barrage is a perfect example of that possibility. Twenty years ago, across the globe, there were virtually no energy

ohonynt eu chwarae o ran datblygu polisi a fydd yn darparu ar gyfer dyfodol ynni cryf a diogel. Roeddwn yn falch o glywed y Prif Weinidog yn amlygu'r pwynt hwnnw yn ei sylwadau yn y ddafl flaenorol. Nodwyd hefyd fod angen symud ymlaen i ddatblygu safleoedd cynhyrchu newydd er mwyn osgoi'r fath sefyllfaoedd rhag codi ag a nodwyd gan Ofgem.

Mae ynni adnewyddadwy yn dod yn allweddol i atal mwy a mwy o wledydd rhag disgyn i'r fagl o ddibynnu ar danwydd ffosil sy'n mynd yn fwyfwy prin a chostus. Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf yn dangos naid mewn capasiti o 42% i 40.2 GW o fewn y DU ar gyfer y flwyddyn a ddaeth i ben yr ail chwarter diwethaf. Yn anffodus, mae gormod o'r deialog diweddar ar ynni adnewyddadwy wedi cael ei lygru gan wrthdaro. Fe'i gwelwyd yn fy etholaeth i, lle mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi penderfynu cymeradwyo'r fferm wynt ar y tir fwyaf yn y DU, ym Mhen y Cymoedd yng Nghwm Afan Uchaf. Mae'n parhau i fod yn warth nad yw penderfyniadau ar faterion pwysig o'r fath yn cael eu gwneud Nghymru a'u bod yn cael eu gwneud mor bell i ffwrdd oddi wrth y cymunedau y byddant yn effeithio arnynt. Fel y cyfryw, croesawaf argymhelliad 8 i egluro'r achos dros ddatganoli'r pwerau hyn.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn rhoi pwyslais ar rymuso cymunedau a phrosiectau a arweinir gan y gymuned llai o faint, fel yn argymhelliad 60, megis canolfannau treulio anaerobig lleol neu safleoedd trydan dŵr bach a fydd yn harneisio ynni mewn ffordd sy'n ystyried y gymuned leol a'r amgylchedd. Rhaid canmol hynny, ond nid ei ddrysau â buddiannau cymunedol prosiectau mwy o faint. Efallai nad yw hynny ond yn diwallu cyfran fach o'n hanghenion ynni presennol, ond mae'n fodd i ysbrydoli cymunedau lleol i ddod ynghyd i ddechrau cynhyrchu eu hynni eu hunain.

Hoffwn hefyd ganmol y pwyslais a roddir yn yr adroddiad ar flaenoriaethu cymorth ar gyfer arloesedd, ymchwil a datblygu, sef argymhellion 15 a 75, nid yn unig yng Nghymru ond hefyd o ran cefnogi cydweithredu'n fyd-eang—ac mae morglawdd Hafren yn enghraifft berffaith o'r posibilrwydd hwnnw. Ugain mlynedd yn ôl,

policy strategies or energy studies featuring renewables. Renewables were totally underestimated. Indeed, in some cases, they were completely dismissed. By now, the green economy sector contributes 7% to the UK's gross domestic product and employs 900,000 people. We can only imagine the new technologies that are waiting to be found, perhaps as part of the Sêr Cymru scheme or even the new Swansea innovation campus over the next 20 years.

I also welcome the report's emphasis on community empowerment, and enabling local people to develop their own renewable energy. I applaud the Welsh Government's focus on research potential. However, the strongest view that we received as a committee was that of a need for strong action to deliver our renewables targets and to create a balanced mix of electricity-generating capacity in Wales.

I hope that this report acts as a catalyst to drive through our commitment to providing that mix of renewable, nuclear and carbon-based generating sites. It is time to activate the natural, the technical, the economic, and, above all, the human potential needed to tackle one of the greatest challenges facing our generation.

4.30 p.m.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Rwyf innau'n ategu fy niolch i bawb a gyfrannodd at greu yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'r adroddiad yn gyfraniad cyhyrog ac arwyddocaol i drafodaeth amserol a byw iawn. Mae'n drafodaeth sy'n esblygu ac yn datblygu o wythnos i wythnos, fel y gwelwn yn yr adran sy'n rhestru'r datblygiadau pwysig a ddigwyddodd yn ystod yr ymchwiliad: dileu'r Comisiwn Cynllunio Seilwaith; sefydlu comisiwn Silk; cyhoeddi'r ddogfen 'Ynni Cymru: Newid Carbon Isel' gan Lywodraeth Cymru; ffars y *feed-in tariffs*; a'r trafodaethau ar y Bil cynllunio ac yn y blaen. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu hinsawdd gyfnewidiol y maes hwn, felly mae'n

ledled y byd, nid oedd unrhyw strategaethau polisi ynni nac astudiaethau ynni i bob diben yn cynnwys ynni adnewyddadwy. Roedd deunyddiau adnewyddadwy yn cael eu tanbrizio yn gyfan gwbl. Yn wir, mewn rhai achosion, roeddent yn cael eu disytyru'n llwyr. Erbyn hyn, mae'r sector economi werdd yn cyfrannu 7% at gynnyrch crynswth mewnwladol y DU ac yn cyflogi 900,000 o bobl. Ni allwn ond dychmygu'r technolegau newydd sy'n aros i gael eu canfod, efallai fel rhan o gynllun Sêr Cymru neu hyd yn oed y campws arloesi newydd yn Abertawe dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf.

Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu'r pwyslais yn yr adroddiad ar rymuso cymunedau, a galluogi pobl leol i ddatblygu eu hynni adnewyddadwy eu hunain. Rwy'n canmol Llywodraeth Cymru am ganolbwyntio ar botensial ymchwil. Fodd bynnag, y farn gryfaf a gawsom fel pwyllgor oedd bod angen cymryd camau pendant i gyrraedd ein targedau ynni adnewyddadwy a chreu cymysgedd cytbwys o gapasiti cynhyrchu trydan yng Nghymru.

Gobeithio y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn sbardun i lywio ein hymrwymiad i ddarparu'r cymysgedd hwnnw o safleoedd cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy, niwclear a seiliedig ar garbon. Mae'n bryd manteisio ar y potensial naturiol, technegol, economaidd, ac, yn anad dim, y potensial dynol sydd eu hangen i fynd i'r afael ag un o'r heriau mwyaf sy'n wynebu ein cenedlaeth.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** I also add my thanks to everyone who contributed to the forming of this report. The report is a robust and significant contribution to a very timely and live debate. It is a debate that is evolving and developing from week to week, as we see in the section listing the important developments that took place during the inquiry: the abolition of the Infrastructure Planning Commission; the establishment of the Silk commission; the publication of 'Energy Wales: A Low Carbon Transition' by the Welsh Government; the farce of the feed-in tariffs; and the discussions on the planning Bill and so on. These all reflect the changeable nature of this issue, therefore it is

gyfraniad amserol iawn i'r drafodaeth.

O'r 77 argymhelliad, rwy'n mynd i ganolbwyntio ar lond dwrn bychan. Yng nghwrs yr ymchwiliad hwn, roeddem yn dod yn ôl o hyd at y cwestiwn creiddiol o sut y gallwn greu system gynllunio hwylus yng Nghymru sy'n ymateb yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon i geisiadau datblygu, gyda phenderfyniadau cyflymach, a'r penderfyniadau hynny wedi eu cydlynu'n well ac yn fwy cyson. Sut allwn ni wneud hynny wrth hefyd sicrhau ymwneud y cymunedau hynny sy'n cael eu heffeithio gan y datblygiadau arfaethedig mewn modd ystyrlon, cyhyrog a grymus ac mewn modd lle mae trafodaeth wybodus yn digwydd o gwmpas yr holl faes?

Nid oes un ateb i'r cwestiwn creiddiol hwnnw, ond rwy'n hyderus bod yr argymhellion hyn yn gam mawr ymlaen i gael y maen hwnnw i'r wal. Rwy'n falch iawn fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn derbyn rhan helaethaf yr argymhellion. Wrth gwrs, un o'r rhai mwyaf arwyddocaol, yn fy marn i, yw'r argymhelliad sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gyhoeddi ei hachos dros ddatganoli ymhellach bwerau i gydsynio prosiectau ynni a rhoi cymhellion ariannol. Rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn derbyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw, gan fod safbwynt y Llywodraeth wedi newid dros y 18 mis diwethaf o fod o blaid gael pwerau hyd at 50 MW i fod o blaid cael pwerau hyd at 100 MW, ac i'r hyn a glywsom ddoe gan y Prif Weinidog, sef nad oes rheswm mewn egwyddor pam y dylai fod terfyn o gwbl. Wrth gwrs, mae Plaid Cymru am weld y pwerau i gyd yn cael eu datganoli.

Ta waeth, wrth edrych ar y saith prif faes achos y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei hymateb wedi'u rhoi dros gael pwerau pellach, rwy'n cytuno â nhw i gyd. Mae pryderon am gyflawni targedau ynni adnewyddadwy yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a'r Deyrnas Unedig yn un o'r meysydd hynny. Rwy'n gweld yr argymhelliad am gynllun gweithredu manwl i ategu nodau'r Llywodraeth, fel yr amlinellir yn 'Ynni Cymru: Newid Carbon Isel', fel modd i fynd i'r afael â hynny ac o adolygu targedau fel

a very timely contribution to the debate.

Of the 77 recommendations, I want to concentrate on a small handful. During the course of the inquiry, we returned time and again to the core question of how we can create a convenient planning system in Wales that can respond efficiently and effectively to planning applications, with decisions being taken more swiftly and those decisions being better co-ordinated and more consistent. Furthermore, how can we do that while ensuring community engagement where proposed developments would have an impact on communities, and how can we ensure that that engagement happens in a considered, robust manner and with informed debate on the whole area?

There is not a silver bullet in answering those core questions, but I am confident that, taken together, these recommendations are a huge step forward in achieving those goals. I am very pleased that the Welsh Government has accepted the vast majority of the recommendations. Of course, in my opinion, one of the most significant is the recommendation calling on the Welsh Government to publish its case for further devolution of powers of consent over energy projects and powers to give financial incentives. I welcome the fact that the Government accepts that recommendation because the Government's view has changed over the past 18 months from being in favour of powers up to 50 MW to being in favour of powers up to 100 MW, and to what we heard yesterday from the First Minister, which is that there is no reason in principle why there should be any limit at all. Of course, Plaid Cymru wants to see the devolution of all powers.

However, looking at the cases for the seven main areas on which the Government is in favour of seeking further powers, I agree with each and every one. Concern about achieving renewable energy targets imposed by the European Union and the United Kingdom is one of those areas. I see the recommendation on creating a detailed action plan to support the Government's plans, as outlined in the 'Energy Wales: A Low Carbon Transition' document, as a means of getting to grips with that and of reviewing targets as part of that,

rhan o hynny, gan gynnwys yn enwedig gwynt o'r môr a thargedau y tu hwnt i 2015-16.

Achos arall y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i roi yn ei hymateb dros bwerau pellach yw cysondeb a gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Mae'r gymhariaeth â'r Alban wedi codi ei phen yn gyson yng nghwrs yr ymchwiliad o ran yr angen i sicrhau tegwch o safbwynt yr hyn y gallwn ei ddatblygu a'i gynnig yng Nghymru. Ar yr un pryd, mae'r Llywodraeth yn sôn am ymateb i bryderon a gwrthwynebiad y cyhoedd, sicrhau buddion i'r gymuned ac amddiffyn rhag ecsbloetio wrth sicrhau atebolrwydd a lleoliaeth. Yn sydyn iawn, yn yr achos dros ddatganoli, down yn ôl at yr union elfennau yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio atynt ynghynt yng nghyd-destun y cwestiwn creiddiol, sef sicrhau cysondeb a hygrededd ar gyfer buddsoddwyr—un arall o'r saith prif faes achos—tra'n amddiffyn rhag ecsbloetio trigolion ac yn sicrhau ymwneud ystyrlon y gymuned â'r broses gynllunio. Felly, yn fy marn i, mae datganoli pwerau pellach yn sicr yn rhan o'r ateb hwnnw.

Wrth inni aros am y pwerau hynny, mae'n rhaid inni wneud y gorau o'r hyn sydd gennym. Er enghraifft, buaswn i am newid y polisi cynllunio i fod o blaid cynlluniau microgynhyrchu adnewyddadwy bychan ym mherchnogaeth cymunedau. Rwy'n meddwl bod hynny'n rhywbeth y dylid ei ystyried, yn ogystal â diwygiadau yn ymwneud â phrosiectau ar raddfa dipyn yn fwy. Fel plaid, rydym wedi sôn am sefydlu Gwyrdd Cymru, sef sefydliad nad yw'n dosbarthu elw ar gyfer y sector ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae llawer iawn yn yr adroddiad nad yw'n gorffen gyda chyhoeddi'r ddogfen, ond cyfraniad ydyw at drafodaeth fyw, barhaus, a chyfraniad yr wyf i, fel aelod o'r pwyllgor, yn falch iawn ohono.

**Vaughan Gething:** I welcome many of the comments made by previous speakers in this debate, and I suppose that will be a bit of a theme as we move through the rest of this debate. After all, we took a significant period of time in producing a large report, in which we discussed as we went along in committee to try to reach a real consensus on a path forward on this issue.

giving particular consideration to offshore wind energy and targets beyond 2015-16.

The basis of another case put forward by the Government for further powers is consistency with other devolved administrations. The comparison with Scotland came up regularly during the course of the inquiry, as did the need to ensure parity in terms of what we can develop and what we can offer in Wales. Simultaneously, the Government talks about responding to concerns and public opposition, ensuring community benefits and protecting communities from exploitation while ensuring accountability and localism. All of a sudden, in the case for devolution, we return to the very same elements that I referred to earlier in the context of those core questions of ensuring credibility and consistency for investors—another of the seven areas—while at the same time protecting people from exploitation and ensuring community engagement with the planning process. The devolution of further powers is certainly part of that solution.

While we wait for those powers, we have to make the best of what we have. For example, I would want to change planning policy to have a prejudice in favour of small-scale renewable microgeneration schemes that are community owned. I think that that should be considered, along with changes related to larger scale projects. As a party, we have spoken about creating Gwyrdd Cymru, a not-for-profit institution for the renewable energy sector. There is a great deal in the report that does not conclude with the publication of this document, but it is a contribution to a live, continuing debate and a contribution that I, as a member of the committee, am very proud of.

**Vaughan Gething:** Croesawaf lawer o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan siaradwyr blaenorol yn y ddadl hon, ac mae'n debyg y bydd hynny'n dipyn o thema wrth i'r ddadl hon fynd rhagddi. Wedi'r cyfan, gwnaethom gymryd cryn dipyn o amser i gynhyrchu adroddiad mawr, gan drafod wrth fynd ymlaen fel pwyllgor er mwyn ceisio dod i gonsensws gwirioneddol o ran y ffordd

ymlaen ar y mater hwn.

I have been particularly interested in the policy direction—where we are going in the Assembly and, in particular, where the Welsh Government is going with its aspirations on energy policy—and in how we manage to deliver on those shared aspirations. Looking at that policy direction, there has not really been a huge amount of disagreement. We have had some sharper disagreement on particular areas, but have managed to reach a view. Going back to our previous debate on the Severn, for example, about how we must have baseload energy, we reached a sensible and pragmatic view on nuclear energy in recommendation 11, with support for a new nuclear facility in Anglesey. Some committee members wanted to see that expanded into another part of Wales.

We also managed to reach a fairly pragmatic point of view with regard to wind energy. This was an area where there was honesty and sharper disagreements. I still disagree with those people who urged us to reach a finding that wind energy is somehow uneconomic or should not be part of a future energy mix. In fact, I was absolutely convinced by the evidence that we heard that onshore and offshore wind energy is very much part of the mix going forward. My biggest frustration was—this comes back to the delivery point—that we had not been able to do more to deliver projects not just with regard to the planning aspect, which was a constant problem, but with regard to the engagement of developers with communities.

The point about community benefit has already been made. RenewableUK Cymru does not currently have a protocol on what it can go out and do and how developers go and do it, with elements of consistency, so that they can explain properly to a community what sort of project is being proposed and what that means for that community during construction, operation and decommissioning. That is a real hole in what developers are currently looking to do in Wales, and that has been part of the cause of some of the sound and fury we have heard.

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb arbennig yn y cyfeiriad polisi—beth yw ein nod yn y Cynulliad ac, yn arbennig, beth yw dyheadau Llywodraeth Cymru o ran polisi ynni—ac o ran y ffordd y gallwn gyflawni'r dyheadau hynny a rennir. Wrth ystyried y cyfeiriad polisi hwnnw, ni fu rhyw lawer o anghytundeb mewn gwirionedd. Cafwyd anghytuno mwy ffraeth ar rai meysydd penodol, ond rydym wedi llwyddo i ddod i gytundeb. Gan gyfeirio'n ôl at ein dadl flaenorol ar yr Hafren, er enghraifft, ynghylch sut mae'n rhaid inni gael ynni llwyth sylfaenol, daethom i gytundeb synhwyrol a phragmatig mewn perthynas ag ynni niwclear yn argymhelliad 11, gan gefnogi cyfleuster niwclear newydd ar Ynys Môn. Roedd rhai o aelodau'r pwyllgor am weld hynny'n cael ei ymestyn i ran arall o Gymru.

Llwyddwyd hefyd i ddod i gytundeb eithaf pragmatig mewn perthynas ag ynni gwynt. Roedd hwn yn faes lle gwelwyd gonestrwydd ac anghytuno mwy ffraeth. Rwy'n dal i anghytuno â'r bobl hynny a wnaeth ein hannog i ddod i gasgliad bod ynni gwynt rhyw fordd yn aneconomaidd neu na ddylai fod yn rhan o'r cymysgedd ynni ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yn wir, cefais fy narbwyllo'n llwyr gan y dystiolaeth a glywsom fod ynni gwynt ar y tir ac ar y môr yn rhan fawr o'r cymysgedd sy'n cael ei ddatblygu. Y prif rwystredigaeth yn fy marn i—gan ddod yn ôl at gyflenwi—oedd nad oeddem wedi gallu gwneud mwy i gyflawni prosiectau nid yn unig o ran yr agwedd gynllunio, a oedd yn broblem gyson, ond o ran cynnwys datblygwyr mewn cymunedau.

Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt ynghylch budd i gymunedau eisoes. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gan RenewableUK Cymru brotocol o ran yr hyn y gall ei wneud a sut mae datblygwyr yn mynd ati i'w wneud, gyda rhywfaint o gysondeb, er mwyn iddynt allu egluro'n briodol i gymuned pa fath o brosiect sy'n cael ei gynnig a beth fydd hynny'n ei olygu i'r gymuned honno yn ystod y gwaith adeiladu, gweithredu a datgomisiynu. Mae bwch gwirioneddol o ran yr hyn y mae datblygwyr yn ceisio ei wneud ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny wedi bod yn gyfrifol



Really, they could help themselves by getting on board and having a much clearer position on community benefit.

Equally, if politicians and political leaders are serious about seeing Wales playing its part in having more renewable energy, we have to be clear about the fact that wind energy is part of the solution. That means that we need to have mechanisms in place to ensure that decisions are made. It is no good for developers, who want to invest significant amounts of money in producing renewable power in Wales, just as it is no good for a community to have a potential decision hanging over it for years because we cannot have the planning system right. That was a constant frustration. If Julie James was here, I know that she would have some pretty sharp things to say about the ability of planning to deliver and what we could and should do to ensure that happens.

The final area I want to talk about is marine energy and, in particular, the renewable energy board. With regard to the previous debate about tidal power as a form of marine energy, it is clear that there is huge potential in Wales where we could be at least at the head of the game, if not ahead of the game in what can happen here. Some of it is about having the conditions where we can have research and test beds deployed in Welsh waters to see the potential that really exists, and Ramsey sound is one example of that. However, it is really about how we get there and drive forward the whole process. That is why we made the recommendation on having a renewable energy board. I welcome the in-principle support from the Government. I would like us to move forward rapidly to ensure that all the good intentions that we may have and we could potentially sign up to across this Chamber are transformed into positive outcomes that we can all support and be proud of, having made them a reality.

**William Powell:** It is a great pleasure to participate in this debate this afternoon, particularly since this energy report, as

yn rhannol am rywfaint o'r gweiddi a'r ffyrnigrwydd a glywsom. Mewn gwirionedd, gallant helpu eu hunain drwy gymryd rhan a meithrin dealltwriaeth well o'r budd i gymunedau.

Yn yr un modd, os yw gwleidyddion ac arweinwyr gwleidyddol o ddifrif am weld Cymru'n chwarae ei rhan yn y gwaith o sicrhau mwy o ynni adnewyddadwy, mae'n rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch y ffaith bod ynni gwynt yn rhan o'r ateb. Mae hynny'n golygu bod angen inni gael systemau ar waith i sicrhau bod penderfyniadau'n cael eu gwneud. Nid yw'n dda i ddatblygwyr, sydd am fuddsoddi symiau sylweddol o arian mewn cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru, ac yn yr un modd nid yw'n dda i gymuned orfod aros am benderfyniad posibl am flynyddoedd am na allwn gynllunio'n gywir. Roedd hynny'n rhwystredigaeth gyson. Pe bai Julie James yma, gwn y byddai ganddi rai pethau eithaf ffraeth i'w dweud am allu'r system gynllunio i gyflawni ei nodau ac am yr hyn y gallem ac y dylem i gyd ei wneud i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Y maes olaf yr wyf am siarad amdano yw ynni'r môr ac, yn benodol, y bwrdd ynni adnewyddadwy. O ran y ddadl flaenorol am bŵer llanw fel math o ynni'r môr, mae'n amlwg bod potensial enfawr yng Nghymru lle y gallem fod ar flaen y gad os nad ar y blaen iddi o ran yr hyn a all ddigwydd yma. Mae rhywfaint o hynny'n ymwneud â chael yr amodau lle y gallwn ddefnyddio gwelyau ymchwilio ac arbrofi yn nyfroedd Cymru er mwyn gweld y potensial gwirioneddol sy'n bodoli, ac mae Swnd Dewi yn enghraifft o hynny. Fodd bynnag, mewn gwirionedd, mae'n ymwneud â sut y gallwn gyrraedd y nod a datblygu'r broses gyfan. Dyna pam y gwnaethom argymhell sefydlu bwrdd ynni adnewyddadwy. Croesawaf gefnogaeth mewn egwyddor y Llywodraeth. Hoffwn inni symud ymlaen yn gyflym i sicrhau y caiff yr holl fwriadau da a all fod gennym ac y gallem o bosibl ymrwymo iddynt yn y Siambr hon eu troi'n ganlyniadau cadarnhaol y gall pob un ohonom eu cefnogi ac ymfalchïo ynddynt, o'u gwireddu.

**William Powell:** Mae'n bleser mawr cael bod yn rhan o'r ddadl hon y prynhawn yma, yn enwedig gan fod yr adroddiad ynni hwn,

colleagues have said, stands as a result of many months of hard work by fellow Assembly Members, the clerking staff and our research department. We acknowledge the great submissions that came from across Wales. I pay tribute to the contributions made by Rebecca Evans, who left the committee shortly before the report was produced, and by Julie James, who is not be able to be here today but who took a leading part in our deliberations. Given both the environmental and the economic threats that we currently face, it is no overstatement to suggest that our energy and planning policy is perhaps more important now than at any point since this Assembly was created. As such, I trust that this report will be given the full consideration that it merits.

**David Rees:** Do you agree that during the investigation, there were split views and that, in fact, a lot of the developers did not want any changes to TAN 8 and said that they would be happy to see it remain as it is?

**William Powell:** I acknowledge that that view was expressed by a number of developers. However, I want to reiterate the fact that undertakings were made by the previous Welsh Government with regard to aspects of review that have gone unfulfilled. There is still a case to be made on that. While I appreciate that there currently appear to be some political blocks within the Cabinet over such a review, we must be aware of the disappointment and the difficulty that have arisen in communities around Wales with regard to that aspect.

To turn to recommendation 33, I thank the Welsh Government for its acceptance of that recommendation and ask the Minister if he would please expand on the developments he would like to make in the White Paper to encourage regional working without undermining the role of local communities and their immediate representatives. Related to that, I would like to have further information about the Government's partial acceptance of recommendation 36, which calls for a dedicated energy team in the new natural resources body, the name of which we

fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-aelodau, yn deillio o fisoedd o waith caled gan fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cynulliad, y staff clericio a'n hadran ymchwil. Rydym yn cydnabod y cyflwyniadau mawr a ddaeth o bob cwr o Gymru. Talaf deyrnged i'r cyfraniadau a wnaed gan Rebecca Evans, a adawodd y pwyllgor yn fuan cyn i'r adroddiad gael ei gynhyrchu, a Julie James, nad yw'n gallu bod yma heddiw ond a gymerodd ran flaenllaw yn ein trafodaethau. O ystyried y bygythiadau amgylcheddol ac economaidd sy'n ein hwynebu ar hyn o bryd, nid gor-ddweud yw awgrymu bod ein polisi ynni a chynllunio o bosibl yn bwysicach nawr nag ar unrhyw adeg ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad hwn. Fel y cyfryw, hyderaf y caiff yr adroddiad ei ystyried yn llawn yn ôl ei haeddiant.

**David Rees:** A ydych yn cytuno bod gwahaniaeth barn yn ystod yr ymchwiliad ac, mewn gwirionedd, nad oedd llawer o'r datblygwyr am weld unrhyw newidiadau'n cael eu gwneud i TAN 8 ac y byddent yn hapus i'w weld yn aros fel y mae?

**William Powell:** Rwy'n cydnabod mai hon oedd y farn a fynegwyd gan nifer o ddatblygwyr. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ailadrodd y ffaith bod ymgymeriadau a wnaed gan Lywodraeth flaenorol Cymru mewn perthynas ag agweddau ar yr adolygiad nad ydynt wedi'u cyflawni. Mae achos i'w gyflwyno mewn perthynas â hynny o hyd. Er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi bod rhywfaint o rwystrau gwleidyddol yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd o fewn y Cabinet i adolygiad o'r fath, mae'n rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r siom a'r anhawster sydd wedi codi mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru o ran yr agwedd honno.

Gan droi at argymhelliad 33, hoffwn ddiolch i Lywodraeth Cymru am dderbyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw a gofyn i'r Gweinidog a fyddai'n ymhelaethu ar y datblygiadau yr hoffai eu gwneud yn y Papur Gwyn er mwyn annog gweithio rhanbarthol heb danseilio rôl cymunedau lleol a'u cynrychiolwyr uniongyrchol. I'r perwyl hwnnw, hoffwn gael rhagor o wybodaeth am benderfyniad y Llywodraeth i dderbyn argymhelliad 36 yn rhannol, sy'n galw am dîm ynni penodedig yn y corff adnoddau naturiol newydd, y gobeithiwn y caiff ei enwi yr wythnos nesaf,

hope to hear next week, as the Minister said earlier. As many Members will be aware, one of the most common criticisms of the Welsh Government from the energy sector is that of inconsistent leadership. A dedicated team would go some considerable way to plugging that gap, while providing a coherent and consistent level of decision making across the nation.

Finally, I thank the Government for accepting recommendation 45 regarding the need to take action to ensure that strategic transport plans are speedily published for each SSA in Wales. As a member of Powys County Council and a former member of the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority, I am all too aware of the severe deficiencies that there have been in this particular area around the preparation of windfarm applications and the undermining effect that that can have on trust and support in communities across Wales. It is difficult to overstate the importance of clear and early publication of such transport routes, along with the road improvements that would be necessary for such transportation to go forward. What we have seen in recent years and months has left many residents feeling that their homes and communities are not being respected by potential developers and that their concerns get nothing but lip service from the Government here in the bay. In summary, I trust that the recommendations in this report will be enacted quickly, fairly and faithfully to improve energy and planning policy, which is in all our interests.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** May I start by thanking the committee staff and the many witnesses who came forward to provide evidence to the committee and to highlight their experience of energy policy in Wales? This inquiry generated a huge response from members of the public, and it is my hope that this report and this debate will make a meaningful contribution to improving the Welsh Government's energy policies. This report has highlighted the Welsh Government's poor approach to energy policy. It has shown that it is poor in policy formulation and implementation and on planning policy. Nothing more dramatically

fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gynharach. Fel y gŵyr llawer o'm cyd-Aelodau, un o'r prif bethau y mae'r sector ynni yn beirniadu Llywodraeth Cymru amdano yw arweinyddiaeth anghyson. Byddai tîm penodedig yn gwneud llawer i gau'r bwlch hwnnw, tra'n darparu proses gwneud penderfyniadau gydlynol a chyson ledled y wlad.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Llywodraeth am dderbyn argymhelliad 45 ynghylch yr angen i gymryd camau i sicrhau bod cynlluniau trafndiaeth strategol yn cael eu cyhoeddi yn gyflym ar gyfer pob Ardal Chwilio Strategol yng Nghymru. Fel aelod o Gyngor Sir Powys a chyn aelod o Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog, rwy'n ymwybodol iawn o'r gwendidau difrifol a welwyd yn y maes penodol hwn o ran y gwaith o baratoi ceisiadau am ffermydd gwynt a'r effaith andwyol y gall hynny ei chael ar ymddiriedaeth a chefnogaeth mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru. Mae'n anodd gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd cyhoeddi llwybrau trafndiaeth o'r fath yn glir ac yn gynnar, ynghyd â'r gwelliannau ffordd y byddai eu hangen er mwyn eu datblygu. Mae'r hyn a welwyd dros y blynyddoedd a'r misoedd diwethaf yn golygu nad yw llawer o drigolion yn teimlo bod eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau yn cael eu parchu gan ddarpar ddatblygwyr ac mai dim ond esgus gwranddo ar eu pryderon a wna'r Llywodraeth yma yn y bae. I grynhoi, hyderaf y caiff yr argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn eu cyflawni'n gyflym, yn deg ac yn gywir er mwyn gwella polisi ynni a chynllunio, sydd er budd pob un ohonom.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** A gaf ddechrau drwy ddiolch i staff y pwyllgor a'r amryw dystion a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor a dynnodd sylw at eu profiad o bolisi ynni yng Nghymru? Cafwyd llawer o ymateb i'r ymchwiliad hwn gan aelodau o'r cyhoedd, ac rwy'n gobeithio y bydd yr adroddiad hwn a'r ddadl hon yn gwneud cyfraniad ystyrlon tuag at wella polisiau ynni Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'r adroddiad hwn wedi tynnu sylw at ddull gwael Llywodraeth Cymru o ymdrin â pholisi ynni. Mae wedi dangos gwendidau o ran llunio a gweithredu polisi yn ogystal â pholisi cynllunio. Nid oes dim yn profi'r pwynt hwn yn fwy dramatig na'r ffaith bod

illustrates this point than the fact that 34 recommendations were wholly accepted and 31 accepted in principle. The damning fact of this report is that the committee had to make 77 recommendations, 64 of which the Welsh Government accepted.

4.45 p.m.

I would like to highlight three areas, the first of which is leadership. One of the themes of the evidence that we received was the lack of leadership in the Welsh Government, best summarised by the evidence from Kevin McCullough, head of the business, enterprise, technology and science energy and environment sector panel and chief operating officer of RWE npower, who said,

‘The one ingredient that Wales is lacking overall is real spine and leadership: the ability to face challenges, the ability to be aggressive, assertive and demanding when it is required and to get on and do it.’

Here we are in a debate on energy and the Minister responsible for energy is not sitting here and contributing. Where are you, First Minister? Also, where are you, Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science? Mr McCullough, there are many people in Wales who agree with you, and there are 77 recommendations in this report that show that you are right.

The second area that I would like to highlight is TAN 8. This is a discredited policy hated by rural communities that it affects, because it was dumped on them. This report shows that, far from taking the ecosystems approach to planning that we have heard so much about—

**David Rees:** Will you take an intervention?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** No. You have intervened a number of times. I am sorry. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

Far from taking the ecosystems approach to planning that we have heard so much about from this Government, TAN 8 was devised

34 o argymhellion wedi’u derbyn yn gyfan gwbl a 31 wedi’u derbyn mewn egwyddor. Ffaith ddamniol yr adroddiad hwn yw bod y pwyllgor wedi gorfod gwneud 77 o argymhellion, y cafodd 64 ohonynt eu derbyn gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

Hoffwn dynnu sylw at dri maes, a’r un cyntaf yw arweinyddiaeth. Un o’r themâu a welwyd yn y dystiolaeth a gawsom oedd diffyg arweinyddiaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru, a grynhowyd orau gan y dystiolaeth gan Kevin McCullough, pennaeth y panel sector busnes, menter, technoleg a gwyddoniaeth ynni a’r amgylchedd a phrif swyddog gweithredol RWE npower, a ddywedodd,

Yr hyn sydd ar goll yng Nghymru yw asgwrn cefn ac arweinyddiaeth; y gallu i wynebu heriau, y gallu i fod yn ymosodol, yn bendant ac yn heriol lle y bo angen ac i fwrw ati.

Dyma ni mewn dadl ar ynni ac nid yw’r Gweinidog sy’n gyfrifol am ynni yma’n cyfrannu. Ble ydych chi, Brif Weinidog? Hefyd, ble ydych chi, y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth? Mr McCullough, mae llawer o bobl yng Nghymru yn cytuno â chi, ac mae 77 o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn sy’n dangos eich bod yn gywir.

Yr ail faes yr hoffwn dynnu sylw ato yw TAN 8. Mae amheuaeth ynghylch y polisi hwn ac mae cymunedau gwledig yr effeithir arnynt yn ei gasáu, a hynny am ei fod wedi cael ei orfodi arnynt. Mae’r adroddiad hwn yn dangos, yn hytrach na defnyddio dull cynllunio sy’n seiliedig ar ecosystemau y clywsom gymaint amdano—

**David Rees:** A wnewch chi dderbyn myriad?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Na wna. Rydych wedi ymyrryd sawl gwaith. Mae’n ddrwg gennyf. [AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O’.]

Yn hytrach na defnyddio dull cynllunio sy’n seiliedig ar ecosystemau y clywsom gymaint amdano, dyfeisiwyd TAN 8 am ei fod yn

because it looked at only one thing, namely where wind profits could be maximised by the Welsh Government with as much development on Forestry Commission land as possible. Rather than taking responsibility for Welsh Labour's wind policy, the First Minister seeks to perpetuate an untrue myth that TAN 8 has no relevance to large wind projects in Wales. This is, quite simply, a lazy Labour answer that seeks to blame rather than take responsibility for its TAN 8 policy. The very fact that the Welsh Government has refused, for years—and continues to refuse—to accept recommendation 46 of the report, on an economic impact assessment of the transport of massive windfarm components in mid and north Wales, shows that it does not care about the impact on rural communities. It does not want to know what the economic impact assessment will say, because it does not want to take responsibility for its TAN 8 policy. Instead, its response was 'We have put the onus on the windfarm industry to work collaboratively with all parties to develop plans'.

There is also a recommendation to update the spatial plan for Wales in recommendation 4. This has been accepted in principle. The way in which this is carried out, if at all, will show whether Labour is really interested in ecosystems or whether it is all spin.

The UK Government is looking at siting renewable projects near the communities that will need the energy that is generated—a lesson that this Government would do well to learn if it wants proper and effective spatial planning.

Finally, in terms of community impact, in both north and mid Wales, large swathes of local communities are being affected by windfarms and associated grid infrastructure developments. It should be a source of shame to this Government that, after years of a devolved project, there is no protocol in place for community benefits. This has been in place for a year in England as a result of the action and ambition of the coalition Government for the communities affected by these developments. Recommendations 53

ystyried un peth yn unig, sef lle y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru sicrhau'r elw mwyaf posibl o wynt gyda chymaint o waith datblygu ar dir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth â phosibl. Yn hytrach na chymryd cyfrifoldeb am bolisi gwynt Llafur Cymru, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ceisio cyfleu myth anwir nad yw TAN 8 yn berthnasol mewn unrhyw ffordd i brosiectau gwynt mawr yng Nghymru. Mae hyn, yn syml iawn, yn ateb diog gan y blaid Lafur sy'n ceisio bwrw'r bai yn hytrach na chymryd cymrifoldeb am ei pholisi TAN 8. Mae'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gwrthod, am flynyddoedd—ac yn parhau i wrthod—derbyn argymhelliad 46 yr adroddiad, ar asesiad o effaith economaidd cludo cydrannau fferm wynt enfawr yng nghanolbarth a gogledd Cymru, yn dangos nad yw'n poeni dim am yr effaith ar gymunedau gwledig. Nid yw am wybod beth fydd canfyddiadau'r asesiad o effaith economaidd, am nad yw am gymryd cyfrifoldeb am ei pholisi TAN 8. Yn hytrach, mae wedi rhoi'r baich ar y diwydiant ffermydd gwynt i gydweithio â phawb dan sylw i ddatblygu cynlluniau'.

Ceir hefyd argymhelliad i ddiweddarau'r cynllun gofodol ar gyfer Cymru yn argymhelliad 4. Mae hyn wedi ei dderbyn mewn egwyddor. Bydd y ffordd y caiff hyn ei gyflawni, os o gwbl, yn dangos p'un a oes gan y blaid Lafur ddiddordeb gwirioneddol mewn ecosystemau neu p'un ai mai sbin yw'r cyfan.

Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn ystyried lleoli prosiectau adnewyddadwy gerllaw'r cymunedau y bydd angen yr ynni a grëir arnynt—gwerau y byddai'n beth da i'r Llywodraeth hon ei dysgu os yw am sicrhau cynllunio gofodol cywir ac effeithiol.

Yn olaf, o ran yr effaith ar y gymuned, yng ngogledd a chanolbarth Cymru, mae datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt a datblygiadau seilwaith grid cysylltiedig yn effeithio ar ardaloedd mawr o gymunedau lleol. Dylai'r Llywodraeth hon deimlo cywilydd, ar ôl blynyddoedd o brosiect datganoledig, nad oes unrhyw brotocol ar waith er budd y gymuned. Mae hyn wedi bod ar waith am flwyddyn yn Lloegr o ganlyniad i gamau gweithredu ac uchelgais y Llywodraeth glymblaid ar gyfer y cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt gan y

and 54 raise these issues. As a sign of how poor the Welsh Government's planning and energy policy has been, you only have to look at the meetings of the national grid leading up to its 2009 report, where it highlighted the massive grid infrastructure that would be needed in mid and north Wales. Not only did Welsh Government representatives not mention undergrounding, they failed to secure Welsh land for Welsh electricity distribution, meaning that Scottish windfarms would get their electricity into the grid network through Deeside. Just today we have seen that the countryside in Anglesey will be ruined by a third supergrid line, designed to import—

datblygiadau hyn. Mae argymhellion 53 a 54 yn codi'r materion hyn. Fel arwydd o ba mor wael y bu polisi cynllunio ac ynni Llywodraeth Cymru, nid oes angen gwneud dim ond edrych ar gyfarfodydd y grid cenedlaethol yn ystod y cyfnod yn arwain at ei adroddiad yn 2009, lle ydynwyd sylw at y seilwaith grid anferth y byddai ei angen yng ngogledd a chanolbarth Cymru. Nid yn unig na wnaeth cynrychiolwyr Llywodraeth Cymru grybwyll mynd o dan y ddaear, gwnaethant fethu â sicrhau tir yng Nghymru ar gyfer dosbarthu trydan yng Nghymru, gan olygu y byddai trydan o ffermydd gwynt yn yr Alban yn mynd i mewn i'r rhwydwaith grid drwy Lannau Dyfrdwy. Dim ond heddiw rydym wedi gweld y caiff cefn gwlad Ynys Môn ei ddifetha gan drydedd linell uwchgrid—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I must ask you to conclude, please.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid imi ofyn ichi ddod i gasgliad, os gwelwch yn dda.

**The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths):**

I begin by welcoming the Environment and Sustainability Committee's report, and thanking the Chair, Members and all involved for its production. The Welsh Government firmly believes that, in the transition towards low carbon electricity generation, which we outline in 'Energy Wales: A Low Carbon Transition', we have a clear, streamlined, consistent, transparent and accountable planning and consenting regime as a central part of the delivery of 'Energy Wales' and low carbon electricity generation, which of course includes ancillary consents. So, if we are to achieve our energy ambitions and unlock Wales's energy potential, it is fundamental that we move ahead in the way that the committee recommends and the way that 'Energy Wales' sets out.

**Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths):**

Dechreuaf drwy groesawu adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd, a diolch i'r Cadeirydd, yr Aelodau a phawb a gymerodd ran am ei gynhyrchu. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn credu'n gryf, wrth newid i gynhyrchu trydan carbon isel, a amlinellir gennym yn 'Ynni Cymru: Newid Carbon Isel', fod gennym gyfundrefn cynllunio a chydysnio glir, syml, cyson, tryloyw ac atebol fel rhan ganolog o'r gwaith o gyflawni 'Ynni Cymru' a chynhyrchu trydan carbon isel, sydd wrth gwrs yn cynnwys cydsyniadau atodol. Felly, er mwyn i ni allu cyflawni ein huchelgais o ran ynni a datgloi potensial ynni Cymru, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn symud yn ein Blaenau o ran y ffordd y mae'r pwyllgor yn ei argymhell a'r ffordd a nodir yn 'Ynni Cymru'.

The committee's report covers many areas, and it is a reflection of the broad consensus that exists on these energy issues. I think that that is very much reflected in the fact that 71 of the 77 recommendations have been accepted, at least in part, by Welsh Government. The reasons for rejecting the remaining six recommendations are technical or because they are matters beyond the control of the Welsh Government. Contributions by committee members have

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn cwmpasu sawl maes, ac mae'n adlewyrchu'r consensws cyffredinol sy'n bodoli ar y materion ynni hyn. Credaf fod y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi derbyn, yn rhannol o leiaf, 71 o'r 77 o argymhellion yn adlewyrchu hyn yn glir. Mae'r rhesymau dros wrthod y chwe argymhelliad sy'n weddill yn rhai technegol neu'n ymwneud â'r ffaith eu bod yn faterion sydd y tu hwnt i reolaeth Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae cyfraniadau gan aelodau'r

been along the lines of that broad consensus, which I think is important and valuable for us as we move ahead.

The exception, perhaps, was Antoinette Sandbach's contribution. It is quite unusual to hear a committee member who supports the committee report recommendations complaining that so many of them have been accepted by the Government. That is quite an unusual take on these matters. I must point out that, with regard to the First Minister and his responsibilities, I share responsibility for energy with him, which is why I am here, responding to the committee report. It is a little churlish to make points regarding the absence of Ministers who are not tasked with responding to particular debates.

Staying with Antoinette Sandbach's remarks, to say that TAN 8 is a matter of Welsh Government shirking its responsibilities is completely wrongheaded, because we accepted our responsibility for strategy by setting out a strategic approach to where large-scale wind energy developments should be sited. We were accepting our responsibility and setting the parameters for developments of that kind. So, rather than an abdication of responsibility, it is an example of Welsh Government taking a strategic role, and rightly so. The alternative, of course, is pepper-potting. Russell George talked about the effect of TAN 8 on mid Wales—or any of the strategic search areas, in fact—but TAN 8 is strategic, and it avoids the pepper-potting that might otherwise take place right across those strategic search areas and elsewhere.

As far as tourism is concerned, as we state in our response, studies have not shown a significant adverse impact from windfarms. It is also the case, again set out by us, that with regard to transport movements and a study of economic impacts, a substantial amount of work is under way. We now have strategic transport management plans, of course, to address those issues. I hope that that deals with many of the matters referred to by Members and the report itself.

pwylgor wedi bod yn debyg i'r consensws cyffredinol hwnnw, sy'n bwysig ac yn werthfawr yn fy marn i wrth inni symud ymlaen.

Yr eithriad, efallai, oedd cyfraniad Antoinette Sandbach. Mae'n eithaf anghyffredin i glywed aelod o'r pwylgor sy'n cefnogi argymhellion adroddiad y pwylgor yn cwyno bod cynifer ohonynt wedi cael eu derbyn gan y Llywodraeth. Mae hynny'n safbwynt eithaf anghyffredin ar y materion hyn. Rhaid imi nodi, o ran y Prif Weinidog a'i gyfrifoldebau, fy mod yn rhannu cyfrifoldeb ag ef am ynni, a dyna pam rwyf yma, yn ymateb i adroddiad y pwylgor. Peth anfoesgar yw cyfeirio at ddiffyg presenoldeb Gweinidogion nad ydynt yn gyfrifol am ymateb i ddadleuon penodol.

Gan aros gyda sylwadau Antoinette Sandbach, mae dweud bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn osgoi ei chyfrifoldebau drwy TAN 8 yn gwbl anghywir, oherwydd gwnaethom dderbyn ein cyfrifoldeb am strategaeth drwy nodi dull strategol o benderfynu ble y dylai datblygiadau ynni gwynt ar raddfa fawr gael eu lleoli. Roeddem yn derbyn ein cyfrifoldeb ac yn gosod y paramedrau ar gyfer datblygiadau o'r fath. Felly, yn hytrach nag ymwrthod â chyfrifoldeb, mae'n enghraifft o Lywodraeth Cymru yn cymryd rôl strategol, a hynny'n gywir ddigon. Y dewis arall, wrth gwrs, fyddai eu gwasgaru yma a thraw. Soniodd Russell George am effaith TAN 8 ar y canolbarth—neu unrhyw un o'r ardaloedd chwilio strategol, mewn gwirionedd—ond mae TAN 8 yn strategol, ac mae'n osgoi gwasgaru datblygiadau yma a thraw, a allai fel arall ddigwydd ar draws yr ardaloedd chwilio strategol ac mewn mannau eraill.

O ran twristiaeth, fel y nodwn yn ein hymateb, nid yw astudiaethau wedi dangos effaith andwyol sylweddol ffermydd gwynt. Mae hefyd yn wir, a nodir hyn gennym eto yn ein hymateb, fod cryn dipyn o waith yn mynd rhagddo mewn perthynas â symudiadau cludo ac astudiaeth o effeithiau economaidd. Mae gennym bellach gynlluniau rheoli cludiant strategol, wrth gwrs, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd hynny'n ymdrin â llawer o'r materion y cyfeiriwyd atynt gan Aelodau a'r adroddiad ei hun.

As for community benefits and a study of whether we could have something more in planning policy and guidance, I would reiterate our response to the report that it is a central aspect of planning in Wales that each application is considered on its own merits. That must be the case.

I mentioned 'Energy Wales', which deals, I think, with what are defining issues for our generation. The Welsh Government is determined to lead on those issues. 'Energy Wales' clearly puts Welsh Government at the forefront of accepting that leadership responsibility. We know that we have a chance to harness our natural assets in a way that works with business and industry, creates long-term employment and a skilled workforce, and develops our resources rather than simply extracts them. It is about ensuring the long-term viability of our communities, and, along with developers, we recognise the importance of those economic and community benefits. We are, therefore, currently working constructively—for example, with the onshore wind industry—to understand how we can maximise investment and benefits to communities. It is a matter of partnership with business.

Wales is very much open for business on these matters, and we have made that crystal clear through 'Energy Wales'. Action plans will be published with further detail before the end of this year. In parallel, we are developing a dataset that will describe existing and proposed renewable energy developments in Wales, which I think will be very useful to the industry and to all concerned.

Returning briefly to the planning system, of course it is a high priority for us to take forward necessary improvements, and these will be addressed not only through the legislation, but through the work that can take place before the White Paper and the draft Bill. We do have important systems in place to support microgeneration and community energy, such as Ynni'r Fro, Community Energy Wales and some recent developments

O ran manteision cymunedol ac ystyried p'un a allem gael mwy mewn perthynas â pholisi a chanllawiau cynllunio, byddwn yn ailadrodd ein hymateb i'r adroddiad ei fod yn agwedd ganolog ar gynllunio yng Nghymru fod pob cais yn cael ei ystyried yn ôl ei rinweddau ei hun. Rhaid i hynny fod yn wir.

Soniais am 'Ynni Cymru', sy'n ymdrin, rwy'n credu, â'r hyn y cyfeirir atynt fel materion sy'n diffinio ein cenedlaeth. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn benderfynol o arwain ar y materion hynny. Mae 'Ynni Cymru' yn amlwg yn rhoi Llywodraeth Cymru ar flaen y gad o ran derbyn y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw am arwain. Gwyddom fod gennym gyfle i harneisio ein hasedau naturiol mewn ffordd sy'n gweithio gyda busnes a diwydiant, sy'n creu cyflogaeth hirdymor a gweithlu medrus, ac sy'n datblygu ein hadnoddau yn hytrach na dim ond eu defnyddio. Mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau hyfywedd hirdymor ein cymunedau, ac, ar y cyd â datblygwyr, rydym yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y manteision economaidd a chymunedol hynny. Rydym, felly, wrthi'n gweithio mewn modd adeiladol—er enghraifft, gyda'r diwydiant gwynt ar y tir—i ddeall sut y gallwn sicrhau'r buddsoddiad a'r manteision mwyaf i gymunedau. Mae'n fater o bartneriaeth â busnes.

Mae Cymru yn sicr yn agored iawn i fusnes o ran y materion hyn, ac rydym wedi gwneud hynny'n gwbl glir drwy 'Ynni Cymru'. Caiff cynlluniau gweithredu eu cyhoeddi gyda manylion pellach cyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Ar yr un pryd, rydym yn datblygu set ddata a fydd yn disgrifio datblygiadau ynni adnewyddadwy arfaethedig a rhai sy'n bodoli eisoes yng Nghymru, ac rwy'n credu y bydd hynny'n ddefnyddiol iawn i'r diwydiant ac i bawb dan sylw.

Gan ddychwelyd am ychydig at y system gynllunio, mae cyflawni gwelliannau angenrheidiol yn flaenoriaeth fawr inni wrth gwrs, ac eir i'r afael â'r rhain nid yn unig drwy ddeddfwriaeth, ond drwy'r gwaith y gellir ei wneud cyn y Papur Gwyn a'r Bil drafft. Mae gennym systemau pwysig ar waith i gefnogi microgynhyrchu ac ynni cymunedol, megis Ynni'r Fro, Ynni Cymunedol Cymru a rhai datblygiadau



around permitted development rights. All of that is important in supporting community energy.

Members also rightly mentioned the green economy. We have seen some important recent developments with the Confederation of British Industry report, on a UK basis, showing the green economy as the one area of the general economy that is growing impressively. We also had consideration of these issues, as far as Wales is concerned, at one of the important economic summits. That involves business and the trade unions putting forward a joint view that we need to understand the importance of the green economy and make further progress on it. In that light, it is extremely important that Wales has control over its resources, and the First Minister has made crystal clear our ambitions to have greater consenting powers in Wales and a level playing field when it comes to renewable obligations. We do not currently have that, putting us at a major disadvantage compared with other parts of the UK.

So, there is important further progress that we need to make, but I am confident that, with the strong consensus that this report shows, and the Welsh Government's response to it, we can make that further progress, working together.

**Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas:** Ar ddechrau'r ddadl, disgrifiais y pwyllgor fel cyfaill beirniadol i'r Llywodraeth, ond, wrth gwrs, pan mae gennych gylch o gyfeillion beirniadol, mae ambell un yn fwy beirniadol na'i gilydd. Mae cyfraniadau i'r ddadl wedi adlewyrchu ein trafodion yn y pwyllgor dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Rwy'n ddiolchgar i fy nghyfeillion am eu cyfraniadau heddiw, ac i fy nghydweithwyr ar y pwyllgor am yr ysbryd iachus rydym wedi'i gynnal yn y pwyllgor yn ystod ein dadleuon. Rwy'n gwybod bod y Gweinidog yn gwerthfawrogi hynny ar ei ymweliadau cyson—a fydd yn parhau, yn sicr—ac rydym fel pwyllgor yn ddiolchgar iddo am ei ymateb i'r drafodaeth.

Pwysleisiodd Russell George ar y dechrau mor bwysig yw edrych eto ar ein hymdrechion i gwrdd ag ofnau'r gymuned

diweddar ynghylch hawliau datblygu a ganiateir. Mae hynny i gyd yn bwysig o ran cefnogi ynni cymunedol.

Soniodd Aelodau hefyd am yr economi werdd, a hynny'n gywir ddigon. Rydym wedi gweld rhai datblygiadau pwysig yn ddiweddar gydag adroddiad Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn nodi economi werdd y DU fel yr unig ran o'r economi gyffredinol sy'n tyfu ar raddfa drawiadol. Gwnaethom hefyd ystyried y materion hyn yng nghydestun Cymru yn un o'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd pwysig. Mae hynny'n golygu bod angen i fusnes a'r undebau llafur gytuno bod angen inni ddeall pwysigrwydd yr economi werdd a'i datblygu ymhellach. Yng ngoleuni hynny, mae'n hynod bwysig bod gan Gymru reolaeth dros ei hadnoddau, ac mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi nodi'n glir ein huchelgeisiau i gael mwy o bwerau cydsynio yng Nghymru a maes chwarae gwastad mewn perthynas â rhwymedigaethau adnewyddadwy. Nid oes gennym hynny ar hyn o bryd, sy'n golygu ein bod o dan anfantais fawr o gymharu â rhannau eraill o'r DU.

Felly, mae angen i ni wneud cynnydd pellach pwysig, ond rwy'n hyderus, gyda'r consensws cryf y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ei ddangos, ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru iddo, y gallwn wneud y cynnydd pellach hwnnw, gyda'n gilydd.

**Lord Elis-Thomas:** In opening the debate, I described the committee as a critical friend of Government, but of course, when you have a circle of critical friends, some are more critical than others. Contributions to this debate have reflected our proceedings in committee over the past year. I am grateful to my colleagues for their contributions today, and grateful to my fellow committee members for the healthy spirit that we have maintained in committee during our discussions. I know that the Minister also appreciates that on his regular visits—which I am sure will continue—and I am grateful for his response to today's debate.

Russell George at the outset emphasised the importance of looking once again at our efforts to allay the fears of the community in

ym Maldwyn; roedd William Powell yn cyfeirio at yr un pwynt. Dyna oedd amcan ein hargymhelliad ynglŷn â'r astudiaeth hon ar symudiad trafnidiaeth. Felly, carwn i'r Gweinidog edrych eto ar hyn i sicrhau, pan fyddwn yn darparu cynlluniau mewn ardaloedd, bod y cyfan i gyd mewn llaw. Anghysondeb ein dull o ymgynghori rhwng gwahanol brosiectau yw un o'r pethau sydd wedi dod yn ôl atom.

Rwy'n ddiolchgar i David Rees am ei bwyslais ar gymhlethdod creu ynni a'r mathau o ynni sydd yng Nghymru, a'i bwyslais ar yr angen am ymchwil a datblygiad. Mae'n bwysig bod y targedau hyn rydym yn gorfod eu hwynebu bob amser yn glir. Rwy'n meddwl bod hynny wedi ei gryfhau yn y ffordd mae ein hadroddiad wedi cael ei derbyn.

5.00 p.m.

Diolch i Llyr am ei bwyslais ar systemau cynllunio hwylus ac effeithiol. Mae'r Siambr hon ychydig yn anodd pan mae rhywun yn trio cyfarch ei gyfeillion y tu ôl iddo. Dyna'r unig wendid yn y lle yma.

Mae creu system gynllunio hwylus ac effeithlon yn un o'r pethau y mae'n rhaid inni barhau i gadw llygad arno. Rydym wedi dod at hyn yn y ffordd iawn, drwy wneud astudiaeth fawr o effeithiau datblygu a chynllunio yn nhermau un agwedd o bolisi, cyn inni fynd ati i ddeddfu. Rwy'n gobeithio bydd hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn y modd y byddwn ni'n gallu delio â chynllunio nes ymlaen.

Diolch i Vaughan hefyd am ei bwyslais ar bwysigrwydd delifro a'r modd y mae'n teimlo'n rhwystredig oherwydd nad ydym yn gallu symud yn gliriach ac yn gyflymach yn y meysydd hyn. Byddwn yn sicr yn dychwelyd at ei bwyslais ar ynni morol.

Rwyf wedi cyfeirio at William Powell, ac rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn iddo ef ac i Russell, o ddifrif, oherwydd nid oedd yn hawdd bod yn aelod o'r pwyllgor hwn ac yn gynghorydd sir ym Mhowys—roeddech yn cynrychioli eich etholwyr ar ddwy lefel wrth ddelio â'r materion hyn. Rwy'n meddwl bod y ffordd yr ydych wedi gwneud hynny yn deyrnged i chi

Montgomeryshire; William Powell referred to the same point. That was the aim of our recommendation in terms of transport movements. Therefore, I would ask the Minister to look again at this issue to ensure that, when we do provide schemes in areas, everything is in hand. Inconsistency in our means of consultation from one project to the next is one of the issues that has been aired with us.

I am grateful to David Rees for his emphasis on the complexity of energy generation and the types of energy that we have in Wales, and his emphasis on the need for further research and development. It is important that these targets that we face are clearly set out. I think that that is strengthened in the way in which our report has been received.

I am grateful to Llyr for his emphasis on efficient and effective planning systems. This Chamber is little difficult when one tries to greet colleagues who are sitting behind him. That is the only problem with this Chamber.

Creating an efficient and effective planning system is one of the things that we must continue to keep a close eye on. We have approached this in the right way, by carrying out a major study of the impact of planning and development in one policy area, before legislating. I hope that that will be reflected in the way that we will be able to deal with planning later.

I am also grateful to Vaughan for his emphasis on the importance of delivery and the frustration that he feels because we cannot move more swiftly and with more clarity in these areas. We will certainly return to his emphasis on marine energy.

I have referred to William Powell and I am very grateful to him and to Russell, in all seriousness, because it was not easy to be a member of this committee and a county councillor in Powys—you were representing your constituents on two levels while dealing with these issues. I think that the way that you have done that is a tribute to you as

fel unigolion, a gobeithio na fydd yn gwneud drwg ichi'n wleidyddol, er ni ddylwn ddweud peth felly. [*Chwerthin.*]

Yn olaf, trof at fy nghyfeilles o uchelderau Llangernyw—Antoinette Sandbach, ffrind beirniadol y pwyllgor. Diolch iddi am enwi Kevin McCullough, oherwydd roedd presenoldeb pobl fusnes go iawn, sydd â phrofiad hir o ddiwydiant, yn dod i roi tystiolaeth inni yn bwysig. Rwy'n gobeithio y gallwn weld Kevin McCullough yn parhau i allu cefnogi datblygiad ynni yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn dychwelyd at y Gweinidog eto; diolch yn fawr iddo am ei ymateb. Parhawn â'r drafodaeth hon yn sicr.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to note the Environment and Sustainability Committee's report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

individuals, and I hope that it will not damage you politically in any way, although I should probably not make such a point here. [*Laughter.*]

Finally, I turn to my colleague from the highlands of Llangernyw—Antoinette Sandbach, the critical friend on the committee. I thank her for naming Kevin McCullough, because the attendance of real business people with long-established experience of industry, coming to give us evidence, was important. I hope that Kevin McCullough will continue to support energy development in Wales. We will return to the Minister; I thank him very much for his response. We will continue this discussion; there is no doubt about that.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cynigir y dylid nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. Mae'r cynnig, felly, wedi'i dderbyn, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

## Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

### Gwasnaethau i Blant Children's Services

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt, gwelliannau 2 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Aled Roberts.

*Cynnig NDM5068 William Graham*

*Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *Yn cydnabod cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel yn cael eu darparu i ddiwallu anghenion amrywiol holl blant Cymru.*

2. *Yn nodi:*

a) *bod lefel y tlodi plant yng Nghymru yn*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt, amendments 2 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 3 and 4 in the name of Aled Roberts.

*Motion NDM5068 William Graham*

*The National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *Recognises the responsibility of the Welsh Government in ensuring the provision of high-quality services that meet the diverse needs of all children in Wales.*

2. *Notes that:*

a) *the level of child poverty in Wales is the*

*uwch na holl wledydd eraill y DU;*

*b) bod cyrhaeddiad addysgol yng Nghymru yn is na chyfartaledd y DU, a bod bylchau cyrhaeddiad allweddol wedi tyfu; ac*

*c) bod nifer o anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn bodoli rhwng plant yng Nghymru a gweddill y DU.*

*3. Yn gresynu bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn methu â chyflenwi'r gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel y mae eu hangen i helpu plant i gyflawni eu potensial llawn.*

**Mark Isherwood:** I move the motion.

Since 1999, Labour-led Welsh Governments have been responsible for ensuring the provision of high-quality services that meet the diverse needs of all children in Wales. They have failed to deliver the high-quality services needed to assist children in fulfilling their full potential. The level of child poverty in Wales is the highest of any UK nation. Educational attainment in Wales is lower than the UK average and key attainment gaps have widened. Many inequalities in health exist between children in Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom.

We will not be supporting amendment 1. The Welsh Government is expanding the Flying Start programme, targeting areas that are among the most disadvantaged and families that are some of the hardest to reach. However, earlier evidence from the Joseph Rowntree Foundation found that more than half of children in poverty live outside Flying Start areas, and the National Childminding Association called for a greater role in the roll-out of Flying Start. In its evidence on the Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2010, Children in Wales stated:

'Flying Start and Communities First have been in place for some years. It is time to move on and to be a bit more flexible'.

Regrettably, Labour and Plaid Cymru defeated our amendment to the Measure to

*highest of any UK nation;*

*b) educational attainment in Wales is lower than the UK average, and key attainment gaps have widened; and*

*c) many inequalities in health exist between children in Wales and the rest of the UK.*

*3. Regrets that the Welsh Government is failing to deliver the high-quality services needed to assist children in fulfilling their full potential.*

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigaf y cynnig.

Ers 1999, mae Llywodraethau Llafur yng Nghymru wedi bod yn gyfrifol am sicrhau y darperir gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel sy'n diwallu anghenion amrywiol holl blant Cymru. Maent wedi methu â chyflwyno'r gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel sydd eu hangen i helpu plant i gyflawni eu potensial llawn. Mae lefel tlodi plant yng Nghymru yn uwch na holl wledydd eraill y DU. Mae cyrhaeddiad addysgol yng Nghymru yn is na chyfartaledd y DU ac mae bylchau cyrhaeddiad allweddol wedi ymledu. Ceir llawer o anghydraddoldebau mewn iechyd rhwng plant yng Nghymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 1. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ehangu'r rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg, gan dargedu ardaloedd sydd ymhlith y mwyaf difreintiedig a theuluoedd sy'n rhai o'r anhawsaf i'w cyrraedd. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl tystiolaeth gynharach gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree mae mwy na hanner y plant mewn tlodi yn byw y tu allan i ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg, ac mae'r Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Gwarchod Plant wedi galw am fwy o rôl yn y gwaith o gyflwyno Dechrau'n Deg. Yn ei thystiolaeth ar Fesur Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2010, dywedodd Plant yng Nghymru:

Mae Dechrau'n Deg a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi bod ar waith ers rhai blynedd. Mae'n bryd symud ymlaen a bod ychydig yn fwy hyblyg.

Yn anffodus, trechodd Llafur a Phlaid Cymru ein gwelliant i'r Mesur i sicrhau mewnbn

secure the strategic input of the voluntary sector. Save the Children also stated that legislation alone is not enough to end child poverty and that the introduction of duties on local authorities and public bodies would be needed, with targets, milestones and robust monitoring.

The 2011 evaluation of Flying Start found that it is,

'having least success in reaching socio-economically disadvantaged families'.

Speaking in February, our colleague Angela Burns referred to the lack of parental awareness of schemes and problems in the recruitment and retention of health visitors in Flying Start areas. She said that the Welsh Government is moving too quickly in seeking to expand Flying Start without addressing the evaluation's findings.

We will not be supporting amendment 2. The Labour and Plaid Cymru default position is to blame everything on the UK Government and to ignore the poverty and disadvantage that existed in Wales prior to the credit crunch and prior to the change of UK Government. Welfare is a symptom of poverty, but devolved Welsh Governments have failed to tackle its causes, although most lie within areas of devolved responsibility.

Universal credit has moved on from the UK Government's White Paper in 2010. Iain Duncan Smith has said that they remain committed to the targets set out in the Child Poverty Act 2010, but that it is increasingly clear that poverty is not about income alone. Universal credit will ensure that the vast majority of children will be lifted out of poverty if at least one parent works 35 hours a week at the minimum wage, or 24 hours if they are a lone parent. It will provide greater work incentives, as opposed to the current marginal deduction rate of 90% when people go to work. If we want our people to rise out of poverty, we must tackle welfare. More children live in households where nobody works than in almost any other nation in Europe because welfare is not working.

strategol y sector gwirfoddol. Nododd Achub y Plant hefyd nad yw deddfwriaeth ar ei phen ei hun yn ddigon i roi terfyn ar dlodi plant ac y byddai angen cyflwyno dyletswyddau ar awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff cyhoeddus, gyda thargedau, cerrig milltir a monitro cadarn.

Canfu gwerthusiad 2011 o Dechrau'n Deg ei fod yn

cael y trafferth mwyaf i gyrraedd teuluoedd difreintiedig yn economaidd-gymdeithasol.

Wrth siarad ym mis Chwefror, cyfeiriodd ein cyd-Aelod Angela Burns at y diffyg ymwybyddiaeth o gynlluniau ymhlith rhieni a phroblemau recriwtio a chadw ymwelwyr iechyd mewn ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg. Dywedodd fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn symud yn rhy gyflym wrth geisio ehangu Dechrau'n Deg heb fynd i'r afael â chanfyddiadau'r gwerthusiad.

Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2. Safbwynt arferol Llafur a Phlaid Cymru yw beio popeth ar Lywodraeth y DU ac anwybyddu'r tlodi a'r anfantais a oedd yn bodoli yng Nghymru cyn y wasgfa gredyd a chyn y newid yn Llywodraeth y DU. Mae lles yn symptom o dlodi, ond mae Llywodraethau datganoledig Cymru wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â'i achosion, er bod y rhan fwyaf lle mae'r cyfrifoldebau wedi'u datganoli.

Mae credyd cynhwysol wedi datblygu ers Papur Gwyn Llywodraeth y DU yn 2010. Dywedodd Iain Duncan Smith eu bod yn dal i fod yn ymrwymedig i'r targedau a nodir yn Neddf Tlodi Plant 2010, ond ei bod yn fwyfwy amlwg nad yw tlodi'n ymwneud ag incwm yn unig. Bydd credyd cynhwysol yn sicrhau y caiff y mwyafrif llethol o blant eu codi allan o dlodi os oes o leiaf un rhiant yn gweithio 35 awr yr wythnos ar yr isafswm cyflog, neu 24 awr os ydynt yn rhiant unigol. Bydd yn cynnig cymhellion gwell i weithio, yn hytrach na'r gyfradd ddiidynnu ymylol bresennol o 90% pan fydd pobl yn mynd i'r gwaith. Os ydym am i'n pobl godi allan o dlodi, mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â lles. Mae mwy o blant yn byw mewn cartrefi lle nad oes neb yn gweithio nag ym mron unrhyw wlad arall yn Ewrop gan nad yw lles yn gweithio.

**Kenneth Skates:** Thank you for agreeing to take an intervention. Do you not agree with Fiona Weir, chief executive of Gingerbread, who told Channel 4 news last week that the latest round of cuts to the benefits system shows how out of touch the UK Government is, particularly with low-income families?

**Mark Isherwood:** What I would say, as the Department for Work and Pensions' spokesperson said today, is that there will be no cash losers in the roll-out of universal credit. Hundreds of thousands of disabled adults and children will receive more support than they do now. Unfortunately, a lot of information is being based on the White Paper, but the regulations resulting from the consultation have not been published yet, there will be a pilot scheme in the north-east of England next spring and the roll-out is not planned for another 12 months. I am encouraged by the responses that we are receiving from the UK Government that suggest that it has listened and is endeavouring to turn a complex scheme into one that genuinely gives people the hand up that they are looking for.

Some 2.8 million people will be better off under the universal credit in its revised form. It will lift around 900,000 UK children and adults out of poverty. These reforms are not about saving money. The UK Government is spending £2 billion more on universal credit than under the current system and investing an additional £300 million into childcare support on top of the £2 billion already spent under the current system.

Christian Guy, managing director of the Centre for Social Justice, has said that the introduction of universal credit, which was designed by the Centre for Social Justice, to replace the current working-age welfare system will make it easier for people to get into work and keep more of their earnings. He has also said that there is a body of evidence that shows how a bad relationship between parents can mean that a child is more likely to live in poverty, fail at school, end up in prison or be unemployed in later

**Kenneth Skates:** Diolch ichi am gytuno i dderbyn ymyriad. Onid ydych yn cytuno â Fiona Weir, prif weithredwr Gingerbread, a ddywedodd wrth newyddion Channel 4 yr wythnos diwethaf fod y cylch diweddaraf o doriadau yn y system fudd-daliadau yn dangos cymaint y mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi colli gafael ar bethau, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â theuluoedd incwm isel?

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr hyn a ddywedwn, fel y dywedodd y llefarydd ar ran yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau heddiw, yw na fydd neb yn colli arian yn y broses o gyflwyno gredyd cynhwysol. Bydd cannoedd ar filoedd o oedolion a phlant anabl yn cael mwy o gymorth nag y maent yn ei gael ar hyn o bryd. Yn anffodus, mae llawer o wybodaeth yn cael ei seilio ar y Papur Gwyn, ond nid yw'r rheoliadau sy'n deillio o'r ymgynghoriad wedi cael eu cyhoeddi eto, bydd cynllun peilot yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr y gwanwyn nesaf ac nid oes disgwyl iddo gael ei gyflwyno am 12 mis arall. Rwyf wedi fy nghalonogi gan yr ymatebion a gawn gan Lywodraeth y DU sy'n awgrymu ei bod wedi gwrando ac yn ymdrechu i droi cynllun cymhleth yn un sydd o ddifrif yn rhoi'r cymorth i bobl y maent yn chwilio amdano.

Bydd tua 2.8 miliwn o bobl yn well eu byd o dan system y credyd cynhwysol ar ei ffurf ddiwygiedig. Bydd yn codi oddeutu 900,000 o blant y DU ac oedolion allan o dlodi. Nid yw'r diwygiadau hyn yn ymwneud ag arbed arian. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gwario £2 biliwn yn fwy ar gredyd cynhwysol nag o dan y system bresennol ac yn buddsoddi £300 miliwn yn ychwanegol mewn cymorth gofal plant ar ben y £2 biliwn a wariwyd eisoes o dan y system bresennol.

Mae Christian Guy, rheolwr gyfarwyddwr y Ganolfan dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol, wedi dweud y bydd cyflwyno credyd cynhwysol, a gynlluniwyd gan y Ganolfan dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol, i ddisodli'r system lles bresennol o oedran gweithio yn ei gwneud yn haws i bobl gael gwaith a chadw mwy o'u henillion. Mae hefyd wedi dweud bod corff o dystiolaeth sy'n dangos sut y gall perthynas wael rhwng rhieni olygu bod plentyn yn fwy tebygol o fyw mewn tldi, methu yn yr ysgol, mynd i'r carchar yn y pen

life. If you want what is best for children, you have to address, not just children, but, families and relationships too. We need a cohesive family policy that brings all generations in, minimises tensions in the family, protects the vulnerable, and empowers individuals and communities. Such a policy would also address concerns over the Welsh Government's approach to child poverty, which were highlighted today by the Children's Commissioner for Wales. He said that child poverty is the result of family poverty, however, a child-poverty approach to tackling the issue, putting the child at the centre of all policy measures, with rights that extend beyond the family, is essentially different from a family-poverty approach. A child-centred approach should include all generations and tackle tensions in the family while protecting the vulnerable.

**Julie Morgan:** I thank the Member for giving way. Does he agree with the Chancellor who said, at the recent Conservative Party conference, that unemployed families should have their benefits capped if they have more children?

**Mark Isherwood:** You are asking somebody who has six children. [*Laughter.*] I do not personally believe that it should be retrospective. Suffice to say, I was not on benefits when any of them were born. I better move on from that.

In the first five years of devolution, relative child poverty levels in Wales fell, but only to the UK average, and they have been rising again ever since. The Joseph Rowntree Foundation report, 'Monitoring poverty and social exclusion in Wales 2009', stated that, even before the recession, the problem of low income was already rising sharply, to the extent that half of the previous improvement in child poverty had already been lost. Save the Children's 2011 report, 'Children in severe poverty in Wales: an agenda for action', said that Wales has the highest proportion of severe child poverty of the four UK nations. The Joseph Rowntree

draw neu fod yn ddi-waith yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd. Os ydych chi am gael y gorau i blant, mae'n rhaid ichi fynd i'r afael, nid dim ond â phlant, ond â theluoedd a chydberthnasau hefyd. Mae angen polisi teuluol cydlynus arnom sy'n cynnwys pob cenhedlaeth, yn lleihau tensiynau yn y teulu, yn amddiffyn pobl sy'n agored i niwed, ac yn grymuso unigolion a chymunedau. Byddai polisi o'r fath hefyd yn rhoi sylw i bryderon ynghylch agwedd Llywodraeth Cymru at dlodi plant, a amlygwyd heddiw gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru. Dywedodd fod tlodi plant yn deillio o dlodi teuluol, fodd bynnag, mae dull gweithredu yn seiliedig ar dlodi plant o fynd i'r afael â'r broblem, gan sicrhau bod y plentyn yn ganolog i'r holl fesurau polisi, gyda hawliau sy'n ymestyn y tu hwnt i'r teulu, yn ei hanfod yn wahanol i ddull gweithredu yn seiliedig ar dlodi teuluol. Dylai dull sy'n canolbwyntio ar y plentyn gynnwys yr holl genedlaethau a mynd i'r afael â thensiynau yn y teulu tra'n diogelu pobl sy'n agored i niwed.

**Julie Morgan:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ildio. A yw'n cytuno â'r Canghellor a ddywedodd, yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Geidwadol yn ddiweddar, y dylid capio budd-daliadau teuluoedd di-waith os ydynt yn cael mwy o blant?

**Mark Isherwood:** Rydych yn gofyn i rywun sydd â chwech o blant. [*Chwerthin.*] Nid wyf yn bersonol yn credu y dylai fod yn ôl-weithredol. Digon yw dweud nad oeddwn yn cael budd-daliadau pan gafodd unrhyw un ohonynt eu geni. Mae'n well imi symud ymlaen o hynny.

Yn ystod pum mlynedd cyntaf datganoli, gostyngodd lefelau tlodi plant cymharol yng Nghymru, ond dim ond i gyfartaledd y DU, ac maent wedi bod yn codi eto byth ers hynny. Nododd adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, 'Monitro tlodi ac allgáu cymdeithasol yng Nghymru 2009', hyd yn oed cyn y dirwasgiad, fod problem incwm isel eisoes yn gwaethygu'n sydyn, i'r graddau bod hanner y gwelliant blaenorol mewn tlodi plant eisoes wedi'i gollu. Dywedodd adroddiad 2011 Achub y Plant, 'Plant mewn tlodi difrifol yng Nghymru: agenda ar gyfer gweithredu', mai Cymru sydd â'r gyfran uchaf o dlodi plant difrifol o blith y pedair

Foundation report, 'Monitoring poverty and social exclusion in Wales 2011', found that half the improvement in the child poverty rate between the mid-1990s and the mid-2000s had been lost in the last five years.

As I warned in the Chamber during the debate on the Estyn report for 2008-09, the performance of children from relatively poor backgrounds is an important area of concern, because relative poverty affects a large number of pupils in Wales. This has occurred against a backdrop of rising levels of overall child poverty affecting 192,000 children in Wales. Furthermore, Wales suffers the highest rate of children living in severe poverty in the UK, with 96,000 existing without the basic necessities in life, with increased numbers pushed into severe poverty during the four years of economic boom, even before the recession hit in 2008. An estimated 200,000 children now live in poverty in Wales after housing costs, representing 31% of children in Wales.

The End Child Poverty Network Cymru coalition identifies eight priorities for the Welsh Government, which include: addressing the implementation gap between policy and delivery; adequately resourcing, protecting and strengthening national programmes and services that have been effectively evaluated and which deliver positive outcomes for our poorest children; ensuring that existing duties placed on public sector bodies are subject to robust scrutiny procedures to ensure the delivery of child poverty obligations; working with all sectors, including employers, in the national fight against child poverty; and engaging effectively and consistently with the UK Government at all levels around child poverty matters that are non-devolved.

We will be abstaining on amendment 3. The pupil deprivation grant lacks effective outcome measures. The Welsh Government's funding formula for pupils has favoured high-deprivation areas for over a decade. However, this has failed to tackle a growing association between poverty and low levels of educational achievement. We should be

gwlad yn y DU. Yn ôl adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, 'Monitro tlodi ac allgáu cymdeithasol yng Nghymru 2011', mae hanner y gwelliant yn y gyfradd tlodi plant rhwng canol y 1990au a chanol y 2000au wedi'i golli yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

Fel y rhybuddiais yn y Siambr yn ystod y ddadl ar adroddiad Estyn ar gyfer 2008-09, mae perfformiad plant o gefndiroedd cymharol dlawd yn faes pwysig sy'n peri pryder, oherwydd mae tlodi cymharol yn effeithio ar nifer fawr o ddisgyblion yng Nghymru. Mae hyn wedi digwydd yn erbyn cefndir o lefelau cynyddol o dlodi plant cyffredinol sy'n effeithio ar 192,000 o blant yng Nghymru. At hynny, gan Gymru y mae'r gyfradd uchaf o blant sy'n byw mewn tlodi difrifol yn y DU, gyda 96,000 yn byw heb angenrheidiau sylfaenol bywyd, a niferoedd cynyddol yn cael eu gwthio i dlodi difrifol yn ystod y pedair blynedd o ffyniant economaidd, hyd yn oed cyn i'r dirwasgiad daro yn 2008. Mae tua 200,000 o blant bellach yn byw mewn tlodi yng Nghymru ar ôl costau tai, sef 31% o blant yng Nghymru.

Mae cynghrair Rhwydwaith Dileu Tlodi Plant Cymru yn nodi wyth blaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru, sy'n cynnwys: mynd i'r afael â'r bwloch gweithredu rhwng polisi a darpariaeth; sicrhau adnoddau digonol, diogelu a chryfhau rhaglenni a gwasanaethau cenedlaethol sydd wedi cael eu gwerthuso'n effeithiol ac sy'n sicrhau canlyniadau cadarnhaol i'n plant tlotaf; sicrhau bod y dyletswyddau presennol a roddir ar gyrf sector cyhoeddus yn destun gweithdrefnau craffu cadarn er mwyn sicrhau y cyflawnir rhwymedigaethau tlodi plant; gweithio gyda phob sector, gan gynnwys cyflogwyr, yn y frwydr genedlaethol yn erbyn tlodi plant; ac ymgysylltu'n effeithiol ac yn gyson â Llywodraeth y DU ar bob lefel mewn perthynas â materion tlodi plant nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli.

Byddwn yn ymatal ar welliant 3. Mae'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion yn brin o fesurau canlyniadau effeithiol. Mae fformiwla gyllido Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer disgyblion wedi ffafrio ardaloedd difreintiedig iawn ers dros ddegawd. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â chysylltiad cynyddol rhwng tlodi a lefelau isel o gyrhaeddiad



targeting underachievement wherever we find it—having high aspirations for pupils wherever they live and celebrating success, but not tolerating failure, whether schools have high levels of free school meals or not. We therefore support amendment 5.

We also support amendment 4. Although housing is key to health inequalities and other inequalities between children in Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom, the Welsh Government's failure since devolution to tackle the growing housing supply crisis is scandalous. Although well-intentioned, the Welsh Government's flagship policy to tackle deprivation—Communities First—failed to tackle its deep-rooted causes. Before the change in UK Government, the poverty gap between the richest and poorest in Wales had widened and social mobility had stalled. Before the change, Wales had the highest levels of child poverty in the UK, rising for years before the recession. Before the change, Wales had record youth unemployment. Before the recession even began, one in three working-age people in Wales were not in work—double the UK average. However, the Welsh Government rejected the Wales Council for Voluntary Action's call for real community ownership of the future of Communities First.

As the Bevan Foundation stated with regard to the Welsh Government's 'Tackling Poverty Action Plan 2012-2016',

'Some of the actions in the plan are unlikely to have any impact on poverty whatsoever'.

We must combat the root causes of child poverty, including poor education, crime, drug and alcohol dependency, family breakdown, poor access to childcare and transportation, in-work poverty and worklessness. The Welsh Conservatives believe that Wales can and must become an aspiration nation, dumping lazy-Labour policy, planning and performance, and embracing ambition, action and achievement.

addysgol. Dylem fod yn targedu tangyflawni lle bynnag yr ydym yn ei ganfod—cael dyheadau uchel i ddisgyblion ble bynnag maent yn byw a dathlu llwyddiant, ond nid goddef methiant, p'un a oes gan ysgolion lefelau uchel o brydau ysgol am ddim ai peidio. Byddwn felly'n cefnogi gwelliant 5.

Rydym hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 4. Er bod tai yn allweddol i anghydraddoldebau iechyd ac anghydraddoldebau eraill rhwng plant yng Nghymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, mae methiant Llywodraeth Cymru ers datganoli i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng cynyddol o ran cyflenwad tai yn warthus. Er ei fod yn llawn bwriadau da, methodd polisi blaenllaw Llywodraeth Cymru i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd—Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—â mynd i'r afael a'i achosion sylfaenol. Cyn y newid yn Llywodraeth y DU, roedd y bwlch tldi rhwng y cyfoethocaf a'r tlotaf yng Nghymru wedi ymledu ac roedd symudedd cymdeithasol wedi pallu. Cyn y newid, roedd gan Gymru y lefelau uchaf o dlodi plant yn y DU, yn codi am flynyddoedd cyn y dirwasgiad. Cyn y newid, roedd gan Gymru y cyfraddau diweithdra uchaf ymhlith pobl ifanc. Cyn i'r dirwasgiad hyd yn oed ddechrau, nid oedd un o bob tri pherson o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru mewn gwaith—cymaint ddwywaith â chyfartaledd y DU. Fodd bynnag, gwrthododd Llywodraeth Cymru alwad Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru am berchnogaeth gymunedol go iawn o ddyfodol Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Fel y nododd Sefydliad Bevan o ran 'Cynllun Gweithredu ar gyfer Trechu Tlodi 2012-2016' Llywodraeth Cymru,

Mae rhai o'r camau yn y cynllun yn annhebygol o gael unrhyw effaith ar dlodi o gwbl.

Mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag achosion sylfaenol tlodi plant, gan gynnwys addysg wael, troseddu, dibyniaeth ar gyffuriau ac alcohol, teuluoedd yn chwalu, mynediad gwael at ofal plant a chludiant, tlodi mewn gwaith a bod heb waith. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn credu y gall Cymru a bod yn rhaid iddi ddod yn genedl o ddyheadau, sy'n cael gwared ar bolisiau, cynllunio a pherfformiad y blaid Lafur ddiog, ac

*Gwelliant 1—Jane Hutt* ymgorffori uchelgais, gweithredu a chyflawniad.  
*Amendment 1—Jane Hutt*

*Dileu pwyntiau 2 a 3 a rhoi yn eu lle:*

*Yn nodi'r flaenoriaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei rhoi i hawliau plant a phobl ifanc a'r buddsoddiad sylweddol y mae wedi ei wneud er mwyn rhoi'r dechrau gorau posibl i blant, er enghraifft ehangu Dechrau'n Deg, a'i chymorth i helpu plant i gyflawni eu potensial.*

*Delete points 2 and 3 and replace with:*

*Notes the priority given by the Welsh Government to the rights of children and young people and its significant investment to give children the best start in life, such as the expansion of Flying Start, and its support for children to achieve their potential.*

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog Plant a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas):** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt.

**The Deputy Minister for Children and Social Services (Gwenda Thomas):** I move amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt.

*Gwelliant 2—Jocelyn Davies*

*Amendment 2—Jocelyn Davies*

*Ychwanegu pwynt 2 newydd ac ailrifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Add as new point 2 and renumber accordingly:*

*Yn cydnabod yr effaith niweidiol y mae diwygiadau lles Llywodraeth y DU yn ei chael ar blant sydd eisoes yn byw mewn tlodi yng Nghymru.*

*Recognises the adverse impact of the UK Government's welfare reforms on children already living in poverty in Wales.*

*Gwelliant 5—Jocelyn Davies*

*Amendment 5—Jocelyn Davies*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i wneud Estyn yn gyfrifol am fonitro a gwerthuso'r Grant Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion a'r Grant Amddifadedd Disgyblion yn rheolaidd, er mwyn sicrhau bod ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol yn eu defnyddio yn y ffordd orau bosibl i leddfu effeithiau tlodi ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol plant.*

*Calls on the Welsh Government to remit Estyn to monitor and regularly evaluate the School Effectiveness Grant and Pupil Deprivation Grant to ensure that schools and local authorities use them to maximum effect to ameliorate the effects of poverty on children's educational attainment.*

**Leanne Wood:** I move amendments 2 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Leanne Wood:** Cynigiau welliannau 2 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

For much of the past decade, child poverty was at the top—or near the top—of the political agenda. However, since the financial crisis of 2008, it has been quietly dropped as a priority. The Party of Wales would like to see child poverty back near the top of our political agenda.

Am lawer o'r degawd diwethaf, roedd tlodi plant ar frig—neu'n agos at frig—yr agenda wleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, ers argyfwng ariannol 2008, mae wedi cael ei ollwng yn dawel bach fel blaenoriaeth. Byddai Plaid Cymru yn hoffi gweld tlodi plant yn ôl yn agos at frig ein hagenda wleidyddol.

5.15 p.m.

This debate is timely as it coincides with the announcement of the children's commissioner's child poverty strategy and today is also the International Day for the Eradication of Poverty. Almost a third of Welsh children are in poverty, which is defined as living in households whose income is below 60% of the UK median average after housing costs are taken into consideration. One third of Welsh children are in poverty. That is unacceptable. Child poverty, as we know, is linked to lower life expectations, lower educational achievement and poorer health.

Ambitious targets were set for the reduction of child poverty. Do you remember the pledges? It was to be halved by 2010 and eradicated by 2020. Those targets have been agreed by the current UK Government, but, as noted by the children's commissioner, they are unlikely to be met, given the austerity drive. When the child poverty action group looked at the progress made and the lessons learned from the past 15 years, it found that early improvements made in reducing child poverty came about as a mixture of improving work opportunities and above-inflation increases in benefits and tax credits. However, as the Resolution Foundation notes, if the previous Government could not make work-based child poverty strategies successful when the economy was strong, the chances of doing that during a time of double-dip recession, high unemployment, significant under employment, stagnant median wages and heavy household debt burden seem remote indeed.

In Wales, today's unemployment figures remind us of the problems that we face with under employment and the challenge of a low-wage economy. When the supply of our workers far exceeds the demands of the current employment market, is it realistic to expect wage increases, reductions in top-up benefits and an escape from the poverty trap for that third of Welsh children? The Party of Wales has called for an improvement in public procurement strategies so that we can reach the same level as Scotland: 75% of public procurement spending stays within

Mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol gan ei bod yn cyd-daro â chyhoeddiad strategaeth tlodi plant y comisiynydd plant a heddiw hefyd yw'r Diwrnod Rhyngwladol dros Ddileu Tlodi. Mae bron traean o blant Cymru yn byw mewn tlodi, a ddiffinnir fel byw mewn cartrefi sydd ag incwm islaw 60% o gyfartaledd canolrifol y DU ar ôl ystyried costau tai. Mae traean o blant Cymru yn byw mewn tlodi. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Mae tlodi plant, fel y gwyddom, yn gysylltiedig â disgwyliadau bywyd is, cyflawniad addysgol is ac iechyd gwaeth.

Pennwyd targedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer lleihau tlodi plant. A ydych yn cofio'r addewidion? Y bwriad oedd ei haneru erbyn 2010 a'i ddileu erbyn 2020. Mae Llywodraeth bresennol y DU wedi cytuno ar y targedau hynny, ond fel y nododd y comisiynydd plant, maent yn annhebygol o gael eu cyrraedd, o gofio'r cyfnod o galedi. Pan edrychodd y grŵp gweithredu tlodi plant ar y cynnydd a wnaed a'r gwersi a ddysgwyd o'r 15 mlynedd diwethaf, canfu fod gwelliannau cynnar a wnaed o ran lleihau tlodi plant wedi digwydd o ganlyniad i gymysgedd o gyfleoedd gwaith gwell a chynnydd uwch na chwyddiant mewn budd-daliadau a chredydau treth. Fodd bynnag, fel y noda'r Resolution Foundation, os na allai'r Llywodraeth flaenorol sicrhau bod strategaethau tlodi plant seiliedig ar waith yn llwyddo pan oedd yr economi yn gryf, mae'r siawns o wneud hynny yn ystod dirwasgiad dwbl, diweithdra uchel, tangyflogaeth sylweddol, cyflogau canolrifol disymud a baich dyledion trwm ar gartrefi yn ymddangos yn annhebygol iawn.

Yng Nghymru, mae ffigurau diweithdra heddiw yn ein hatgoffa o'r problemau sy'n ein hwynebu o ran tangyflogaeth a her economi cyflog isel. Pan fydd cyflenwad ein gweithwyr yn llawer uwch na gofynion y farchnad gyflogaeth bresennol, a yw'n realistig disgwyl cynnydd mewn cyflogau, gostyngiadau mewn budd-daliadau ychwanegol a dianc rhag tlodi i un rhan o dair o blant Cymru? Mae Plaid Cymru wedi galw am welliant mewn strategaethau caffael cyhoeddus fel y gallwn gyrraedd yr un lefel â'r Alban: mae 75% o wariant caffael

Scotland. If we could achieve that in Wales, we have the potential to create around 50,000 jobs, which would make a substantial impact upon child poverty by increasing the number of people in work.

The reality is that austerity means that all the fine words about wanting to see reductions in child poverty are just fine words. The UK Government is introducing measures that directly undermine that aim. These include the scrapping of the Child Trust Fund and the health in pregnancy grant, which had a further impact in Wales as our top-up Child Trust Fund Cymru has also ended. Child benefits have been frozen for three years and other benefits are being uprated at the lower, consumer price index, rate. There have been housing benefit changes, which mean that housing is restricted to the bottom end of the market, and under-occupation rules are affecting families, with subsequent health impacts. Lone parents are being moved onto jobseeker's allowance when their youngest child reaches the age of five, continuing the previous UK Government's policy.

This morning, we have heard how 100,000 disabled children are to lose £28 a week in direct payments, putting many homes at risk. There is also the cynical 10% cut in council tax benefits, which will hurt thousands of families across Wales, effectively with the Welsh Government's blessing. Despite pushing through cuts in sectors where there has been evidence-based progress in reducing child poverty, the UK Government and the Welsh Government have introduced new proposals for a pupil premium for disadvantaged children. Reports in England, from the Sutton Trust and Ofsted, suggest that this money was not being targeted at those pupils and that is why our amendment 5 calls for a monitoring of the situation in Wales. It seems that the cuts so far are not enough; more are on their way. The Chancellor has announced recently that a further £10 billion is to be cut from the welfare budget. One suggestion has been to slash housing benefit to those under the age of 25, who should, apparently, live with their

cyhoeddus yn aros yn yr Alban. Pe gallem gyflawni hynny yng Nghymru, mae gennym y potensial i greu tua 50,000 o swyddi, a fyddai'n cael effaith sylweddol ar dlodi plant drwy gynyddu nifer y bobl mewn gwaith.

Y gwir yw bod cyfnod o galedi yn golygu bod yr holl eiriau teg am ddymuno gweld gostyngiadau mewn tlodi plant yn ddim mwy na hynny. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn cyflwyno mesurau sy'n tansilio'r nod hwnnw'n uniongyrchol. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys cael gwared ar y Gronfa Ymddiriedolaeth Plant a'r grant iechyd yn ystod beichiogrwydd, a gafodd effaith bellach yng Nghymru gan fod ein Cronfa Ymddiriedolaeth Plant yng Nghymru ychwanegol wedi dod i ben hefyd. Mae budd-daliadau plant wedi cael eu rhewi ers tair blynedd ac mae budd-daliadau eraill yn cael eu huwchraddio ar gyfradd is y mynegai prisiau defnyddwyr. Bu newidiadau i'r budd-dal tai, sy'n golygu bod y tai sydd ar gael yn gyfyngedig i waelod y farchnad, ac mae rheolau tanfeddiannu yn effeithio ar deuluoedd, sydd wedyn yn effeithio ar iechyd. Mae rhieni unigol yn cael eu symud i lwfans ceisio gwaith pan fydd eu plentyn ieuengaf yn cyrraedd pump oed, gan barhau â pholisi Llywodraeth flaenorol y DU.

Y bore yma, rydym wedi clywed y bydd 100,000 o blant anabl yn colli £28 yr wythnos mewn taliadau uniongyrchol, gan roi llawer o gartrefi mewn perygl. Mae toriad sinigaidd o 10% hefyd ym mudd-dal y dreth gyngor, a fydd yn effeithio ar filoedd o deuluoedd ledled Cymru, a hynny yn y bôn gyda sêl bendith Llywodraeth Cymru. Er gwaethaf y toriadau a wnaed mewn sectorau lle bu cynnydd ar sail tystiolaeth mewn lleihau tlodi plant, mae Llywodraeth y DU a Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cyflwyno cynigion newydd ar gyfer premiwm disgybl i blant dan anfantais. Mae adroddiadau yn Lloegr, gan Ymddiriedolaeth Sutton ac Ofsted, yn awgrymu nad oedd yr arian hwn yn cael ei dargedu at y disgyblion hynny a dyna pam mae ein gwelliant 5 yn galw am fonitro'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Ymddengys nad yw'r toriadau hyd yma yn ddigon; mae mwy ar eu ffordd. Mae'r Canghellor wedi cyhoeddi yn ddiweddar y bydd £10 biliwn arall yn cael ei dorri o'r gyllideb les. Un awgrym oedd torri budd-dal tai i'r rhai dan 25 oed gan y dylent,

parents.

mae'n debyg, fyw gyda'u rhieni.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Conclude now, please.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gorffennwch yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Leanne Wood:** The Welsh Government has great intentions and plans for improving outcomes for families, but those plans are no match for a few lines in the UK Government's budget, which condemn Welsh families to poverty. That is the reality of Welsh devolution.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru fwriadau mawr a chynlluniau ar gyfer gwella canlyniadau i deuluoedd, ond nid yw'r cynlluniau hynny yn gallu gwrthsefyll ychydig o linellau yng nghyllideb Llywodraeth y DU, sy'n condemnio teuluoedd Cymru i dlodi. Dyna yw realiti datganoli yng Nghymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must conclude now.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid ichi ddod i ben yn awr.

**Leanne Wood:** On child poverty and welfare—

**Leanne Wood:** O ran tlodi plant a lles—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must conclude now. I have given you two opportunities, in deference to your position as a party leader.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid ichi ddod i ben yn awr. Rwyf wedi rhoi dau gyfle i chi, er parch atoch fel arweinydd plaid.

*Gwelliant 3—Aled Roberts*

*Amendment 3—Aled Roberts*

*Ychwanegu pwynt 3 newydd ac ailrifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Add as new point 3 and re-number accordingly:*

*Yn croesawu cyflwyno'r Grant Amddifadedd Disgyblion yng Nghymru.*

*Welcomes the introduction of the Pupil Deprivation Grant in Wales.*

*Gwelliant 4—Aled Roberts*

*Amendment 4—Aled Roberts*

*Ychwanegu pwynt 3 newydd ac ailrifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Add as new point 3 and re-number accordingly:*

*Yn credu y bydd ffocws newydd ar wella tai ac iechyd y cyhoedd mewn ardaloedd o amddifadedd yn lleihau anghydraddoldebau iechyd rhwng plant yng Nghymru a phlant yng ngweddill y DU.*

*Believes that renewed focus on improving housing and public health in deprived areas will reduce inequalities in health between children in Wales and the rest of the UK.*

**Aled Roberts:** I move amendments 3 and 4 in my name.

**Aled Roberts:** Cynigiau welliannau 3 a 4 yn fy enw i.

Many services in Wales impact on the lives of children, not just those that directly serve children. The quality of the health service, of housing, and of the education system, all have a direct impact. Improving services for all is obviously one way of improving the lives of our children. However, all of us here should strive to give our children the best

Mae llawer o wasanaethau yng Nghymru yn effeithio ar fywydau plant, nid dim ond y rhai sy'n rhoi gwasanaeth uniongyrchol i blant. Mae ansawdd y gwasanaeth iechyd, tai, a'r system addysg, i gyd yn cael effaith uniongyrchol. Mae gwella gwasanaethau i bawb yn amlwg yn un ffordd o wella bywydau ein plant. Fodd bynnag, dylai pob

start in life. It is widely accepted that a bright child living in poverty will be overtaken by his wealthier, if less academically able, counterpart by the age of seven. That is why we backed the pupil premium in last year's budget. Hopefully, it will break the link between a child's background and their future prospects. That is a key priority for us.

The Government's own statistics show that there is a strong link between the level of achievement and entitlement to free school meals. As the level of free school meal entitlement increases, the level of achievement decreases, and that attainment gap increases as a child gets older. Just 21% of our children receiving free school meals achieved five good GCSEs including English or Welsh, mathematics and science. Those are the basic qualifications needed to get entry-level jobs and to access apprenticeships and college courses. Life choices narrow significantly if children do not have access to these qualifications. We also need to face the scandal of children who are in the care of the state. Children leaving care are more likely to end up in prison than they are to go to university. Just one in 10 children leaving care have five A\* to C grades at GCSE. This Government sets a target of just one GCSE for those children in its care. What kind of message does that send?

We hope that the monitoring arrangements of the regional consortia and the Department for Education and Skills in the Government will mean that effective monitoring of the pupil grant is in place. However, we have no problem with supporting Plaid Cymru's amendment 5, if it means that evaluation processes will be more robust. We have seen Welsh children drop behind their European counterparts in recent years, and the Programme for International Student Assessment results last year were a wake-up call to many of us in the Chamber.

un ohonom yma ymdrechu i roi'r dechrau gorau mewn bywyd i'n plant. Derbynnir yn gyffredinol y caiff plentyn disgrair sy'n byw mewn tloedi ei oddiweddyd gan gyfoedyn cyfoethocach, ond llai galluog yn academiaidd, erbyn iddo gyrraedd saith oed. Dyna pam y cefnogwyd y premiwm disgyblion yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Y gobaith yw y bydd yn torri'r cysylltiad rhwng cefndir plentyn a'i ragolygon yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth allweddol i ni.

Mae ystadegau'r Llywodraeth ei hun yn dangos bod cysylltiad cryf rhwng lefel y cyflawniad a hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim. Wrth i lefel yr hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim gynyddu, mae lefel y cyflawniad yn gostwng, ac mae'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad hwnnw yn cynyddu wrth i blentyn fynd yn hŷn. Dim ond 21% o'n plant sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim sy'n ennill pum TGAU da gan gynnwys Saesneg neu Gymraeg, mathemateg a gwyddoniaeth. Dyna'r cymwysterau sylfaenol sydd eu hangen i gael swyddi lefel mynediad ac i fanteisio ar brentisiaethau a chyrsgiau coleg. Mae dewisiadau bywyd yn culhau'n sylweddol os nad yw plant yn gallu manteisio ar y cymwysterau hyn. Mae angen inni hefyd wynebu sgandal y plant sydd yng ngofal y wladwriaeth. Mae plant sy'n gadael gofal yn fwy tebygol o ddiweddu mewn carchar na mynd i'r brifysgol. Dim ond un o bob 10 o blant sy'n gadael gofal sy'n cael pum gradd A\* i C mewn TGAU. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gosod targed o ddim ond un TGAU ar gyfer y plant hynny yn ei gofal. Pa fath o neges y mae hynny'n ei rhoi?

Rydym yn gobeithio y bydd trefniadau monitro'r consortia rhanbarthol a'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn y Llywodraeth yn golygu bod y grant disgyblion yn cael ei fonitro'n effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennym unrhyw broblem o ran cefnogi gwelliant 5 Plaid Cymru, os yw'n golygu y bydd prosesau gwerthuso yn fwy cadarn. Rydym wedi gweld bod plant Cymru ar eu hôl hi o'u cymharu â'u cyfoedion Ewropeaidd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac mae canlyniadau'r Rhaglen ar gyfer Asesu Myfyrwyr Rhyngwladol y llynedd yn rhybudd i lawer ohonom yn y Siambr.

However, it is not only the education of our children that we need to worry about. Earlier this afternoon, many questions were asked regarding the Welsh housing quality standard. Once again, there is an undeniable link between the quality of housing and a person's health. Bad housing can lead to respiratory disease and mental health issues, and has a detrimental impact on other aspects of life, including performance at school. If a child does not have a warm, safe house to go home to, how are they meant to study, do homework and sleep well? Those are all things that affect how they perform in school. Shelter Cymru admits that poor-quality housing can affect the life chances of a child. As we have heard, 23% of Welsh children live below the poverty line and reductions have been all too stubborn in recent years. We should also not underestimate the impact of social exclusion. Being unable to access social events, and being unable to afford to do the simple things that we all take for granted, such as having friends around for tea, going to the cinema and going on school trips, can lead to the exclusion of our children and can have a detrimental effect on their mental health.

There are other factors, such as missing teeth. As we heard in the Children and Young People Committee, by the age of five, poorer children are likely to have twice as many missing, decayed or filled teeth as their wealthier classmates. David Thomas, a consultant in dental public health in the National Public Health Service for Wales, said:

'We have a major problem in Wales and in the most deprived parts of Wales children have the worst teeth.'

Many child and adult health status measures, such as death rates and rates of acute and chronic illness, get steadily worse as you pass from the highest to the lowest socioeconomic status groups.

Children who live in poverty are twice as likely to live in bad housing. Those who live in bad housing are also twice as likely to

Fodd bynnag, nid addysg ein plant yn unig y mae angen inni boeni amdani. Yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, gofynnwyd llawer o gwestiynau am safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Unwaith eto, ceir cyswllt ddiymwad rhwng ansawdd tai ac iechyd person. Gall tai gwael arwain at glefyd anadlol a phroblemau iechyd meddwl, ac mae'n cael effaith niweidiol ar agweddau eraill ar fywyd, gan gynnwys perfformiad yn yr ysgol. Os nad oes gan blentyn gartref cynnes a diogel i fynd adref iddo, sut y gall astudio, gwneud gwaith cartref a chysgu'n dda? Dyna'r holl bethau sy'n effeithio ar y ffordd y maent yn perfformio yn yr ysgol. Mae Shelter Cymru yn cyfaddef y gall ansawdd tai gwael effeithio ar gyfleoedd bywyd plentyn. Fel y clywsom, mae 23% o blant Cymru yn byw o dan y llinell dlodi ac mae'r gostyngiadau dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn rhy debygol o aros yr un o hyd. Ni ddylem ychwaith danamcangyfrif effaith allgáu cymdeithasol. Gall methu â manteisio ar ddigwyddiadau cymdeithasol, a methu â fforddio gwneud y pethau syml yr ydym oll yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol, megis gwahodd ffrindiau i de, mynd i'r sinema a mynd ar dripiâu ysgol, arwain at allgáu ein plant a gall gael effaith niweidiol ar eu hiechyd meddwl.

Mae ffactorau eraill, megis dannedd coll. Fel y clywsom yn y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, erbyn i blant gyrraedd pump oed, mae plant tlotach yn fwy tebygol o gael dwywaith cymaint o ddannedd coll, dannedd wedi pydru neu wedi'u llenwi â'u cyd-ddisgyblion cyfoethocach. Dywedodd David Thomas, meddyg ymgynghorol ym maes iechyd deintyddol cyhoeddus yng Ngwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru:

Mae gennym broblem fawr yng Nghymru ac yn y rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig o Gymru mae gan blant y dannedd gwaethaf.

Mae llawer o fesurau statws iechyd plant ac oedolion, megis cyfraddau marwolaethau a chyfraddau salwch aciwt a chronig, yn graddol waethygu wrth i chi fynd o'r uchaf i'r isaf o'r grwpiau statws economaidd-gymdeithasol.

Mae plant sy'n byw mewn tlodi ddwywaith yn fwy tebygol o fyw mewn tai gwael. Mae'r rhai sy'n byw mewn tai gwael hefyd

suffer from poor health. Poorer families are less likely to have healthy diets. Schemes such as the five-a-day fruit and veg scheme have been successful in championing the need for a healthy diet. I hope that the healthy eating in school regulations that are due within the next year will go some way towards providing a healthy meal for children accessing meals at school. This accumulation of pressures on our poorest children ultimately leads to life chances that are not as good as they could or should be and to a cycle of poverty. We all need to tackle this.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** It is essential, as a devolved Assembly, to be always thinking about a sustainable, long term-future for Wales. I believe it was the late Whitney Houston who sang ‘children are our future’. It is in that spirit that I contribute to this debate. In Wales, 200,000 children live in relative poverty, with 90,000 children living in severe poverty. These are children living in families who may be unable to afford to buy them a warm winter coat or new shoes. These are families in which parents often skip meals just to make ends meet. The Welsh Conservatives want to tackle the root causes of poverty, both at a family level and throughout childhood—[*Interruption.*] Sorry?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Do not respond to sedentary comments.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** I thought that this was actually a serious and important issue. Child poverty is higher in Wales than in any other UK nation. Save the Children has stated that low educational attainment is a major cause of poverty, and poverty is the most important reason for low educational achievement. While we support the principles of the Flying Start and foundation phase initiatives, real progress is desperately needed in those areas. The gap in attainment present from the age of nine months between children living in low-income households and their better-off classmates is 34%. Flying Start has had the least success in reaching

ddwywaith yn fwy tebygol o ddioddef o iechyd gwael. Mae teuluoedd tlotal yn llai tebygol o gael deiet iach. Mae cynlluniau megis y cynllun ffrwythau a llysiau 5 y dydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus o ran hyrwyddo'r angen am ddeiet iach. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd y rheoliadau bwyta'n iach yn yr ysgol sydd i'w disgwyl o fewn y flwyddyn nesaf yn gwneud rhywfaint i ddarparu pryd o fwyd iach i blant sy'n cael prydau bwyd yn yr ysgol. Mae'r cronniad hwn o bwysau ar ein plant tlotal yn y pen draw yn arwain at gyfleoedd mewn bywyd nad ydynt cystal ag y gallent fod neu y dylent fod ac at gylch o dlodi. Mae angen inni gyd fynd i'r afael â hyn.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Fel Cynulliad datganoledig, mae'n hanfodol meddwl bob amser am ddyfodol hirdymor, cynaliadwy i Gymru. Credaf mai'r diweddar Whitney Houston a ganodd ‘children are our future’. Rwy'n cyfrannu at y ddadl hon yn yr ysbryd hwnnw. Yng Nghymru, mae 200,000 o blant yn byw mewn tlodi cymharol, a 90,000 o blant yn byw mewn tlodi difrifol. Plant yw'r rhain sy'n byw mewn teuluoedd na allant o bosibl fforddio prynu côt aeaf gynnes nac esgidiau newydd iddynt. Teuluoedd yw'r rhain lle mae rhieni yn aml yn mynd heb fwyd er mwyn cael dau ben llinyn ynghyd. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig am fynd i'r afael ag achosion sylfaenol tlodi, ar lefel teulu a thrwy gydol plentyndod—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Peidiwch ag ymateb i sylwadau gan rai sydd ar eu heistedd.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Roeddwn i'n meddwl bod hyn wir yn fater difrifol a phwysig. Mae tlodi plant yn uwch yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw wlad arall yn y DU. Mae Achub y Plant wedi datgan bod cyrhaeddiad addysgol isel yn un o brif achosion tlodi, a thlodi yw'r rheswm pwysicaf am gyrhaeddiad addysgol isel. Er ein bod yn cefnogi egwyddorion mentrau Dechrau'n Deg a'r cyfnod sylfaen, mae taer angen cynnydd go iawn yn y meysydd hynny. Mae'r bwloch mewn cyrhaeddiad a welir o naw mis oed rhwng plant sy'n byw mewn cartrefi incwm isel a'u cyd-ddisgyblion cyfoethocach yn 34%. Mae Dechrau'n Deg



socio-economically disadvantaged families, and the visibility of its programme of support is described as being rather poor, with more than half of children in poverty living outside Flying Start areas.

Concerns have been raised around weaknesses in the foundation phase. This apparently affects some 40% of children. Also, 40% of children start secondary school unable to read properly. We, on these benches, call for a review into the effectiveness of the foundation phase programme and for the examination of the possibility of a middle phase to help eight to 13-year-olds with the transition from key stage 2 to key stage 3. That is an issue that has been raised here several times across the party divide. It is something that really needs to be addressed.

It is unfortunately evident that the damaging effects of poverty are not restricted to the classroom, with 35% of Welsh children classed as overweight or obese last year. That is 5% higher than in England. The number of related cases of childhood type 2 diabetes is now increasing. The latest figures show an increase of 5.6% in instances of substance abuse among under 15-year-olds and a 6.6% increase in conception among under 16-year-olds. These figures could, and should, be tackled through prioritising public health. Perhaps there needs to be a deputy Minister for public health in order to focus on this really important area of healthcare.

It is important to acknowledge that poverty premiums exist outside healthcare too. I refer to transport poverty and the lack of broadband provision in rural areas—in Aberconwy, that extends to many areas. These things can all isolate children and restrict their social and educational activities. Is it not a sad state of affairs that 12% of young people in Wales fear that they will end up on benefits at some point in their lives? Save the Children has stressed the importance of work that pays. This is something that the UK Government is really working hard on through raising personal tax allowance and

wedi cael y llwyddiant lleiaf o ran cyrraedd teuluoedd difreintiedig yn economaidd-gymdeithasol, a nodir nad yw ei rhaglen o gefnogaeth yn weladwy iawn, gyda mwy na hanner y plant sy'n byw mewn flodi yn byw y tu allan i ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg.

Codwyd pryderon ynghylch gwendidau yn y cyfnod sylfaen. Mae hyn yn effeithio ar tua 40% o blant i bob golwg. Hefyd, mae 40% o blant yn dechrau'r ysgol uwchradd heb allu darllen yn iawn. Rydym ni, ar y meinciau hyn, yn galw am adolygiad o effeithiolrwydd rhaglen y cyfnod sylfaen ac am archwilio'r posibilrwydd o gyfnod canol i helpu plant wyth i 13 blwydd oed gyda'r pontio o gyfnod allweddol 2 i gyfnod allweddol 3. Mae hwnnw'n fater sydd wedi'i godi yma sawl gwaith ar draws y rhaniad gwleidyddol. Mae'n rhywbeth y mae gwir angen mynd i'r afael ag ef.

Yn anffodus mae'n amlwg nad yw effeithiau niweidiol tlodi yn cael eu cyfyngu i'r ystafell ddosbarth, a nodwyd y llynedd bod 35% o blant Cymru yn rhy drwm neu'n ordew. Mae hynny 5% yn uwch na Lloegr. Mae nifer yr achosion cysylltiedig o ddiabetes math 2 mewn plentynod bellach yn cynyddu. Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf yn dangos cynnydd o 5.6% mewn achosion o gamddefnyddio sylweddau ymysg pobl ifanc dan 16 mlwydd oed a chynnydd o 6.6% ymysg merched ifanc dan 16 mlwydd oed sy'n beichiogi. Gellid mynd i'r afael â'r ffigurau hyn, a dylid gwneud hynny, drwy flaenoriaethu iechyd y cyhoedd. Efallai bod angen dirprwy Weinidog dros iechyd y cyhoedd er mwyn canolbwyntio ar y maes hynod bwysig hwn o ofal iechyd.

Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod premiymau tlodi yn bodoli y tu allan i faes gofal iechyd hefyd. Cyfeiriaf at dlodi trafniadaeth a diffyg darpariaeth band eang mewn ardaloedd gwledig—yn Aberconwy, sy'n ymestyn i nifer o ardaloedd. Gall y pethau hyn i gyd ynysu plant a chyfyngu ar eu gweithgareddau cymdeithasol ac addysgol. Onid yw'n sefyllfa drist bod 12% o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru'n ofni y byddant yn y pen draw ar fuddaliadau ar ryw adeg yn eu bywydau? Mae Achub y Plant wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd gwaith sy'n talu. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gweithio'n galed

welfare reforms. It is essential that the Welsh Government gets on board with these changes and boosts our economy to create more jobs and encourage new business start-ups.

The Welsh Government is not on course to meet its goal of eliminating child poverty by 2020, estimating that, by next year, 6,000 more children will be living in poverty in Wales. The criticisms by the Bevan Foundation that some of the actions in the Welsh Government's 'Tackling Poverty Action Plan 2012-2016' are unlikely to have any impact on poverty whatsoever are most concerning.

5.30 p.m.

The Welsh Government must up its game and focus on tackling the root causes of poverty as a priority—and when I say 'Welsh Government', I include each and every one of us sitting here today. Today, we have outlined where this might be done. I know that we all in the Chamber—well, some of us—have the ambition to see child poverty being eradicated by 2020. Let us now take action to realise this, to show our children that achievement is more than just a buzzword.

**Julie Morgan:** I want to start by saying that it is very surprising that the official opposition is making these claims about the situation of children in Wales, when it is the UK Government led by the Conservatives that is inflicting the most hardship on families and children. Let us not forget—

**Suzy Davies** *rose*—

**Julie Morgan:** Let me say a bit first, then you can come in. Let us not forget that cuts to tax credits and benefits have and will hit children hard. The poorest households with children are estimated to lose the largest proportion of their income as a result of tax and benefit changes. Analysis by the Institute of Fiscal Studies shows that households in

iawn arno drwy godi lwfans treth personol a diwygiadau lles. Mae'n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn cefnogi'r newidiadau hyn ac yn rhoi hwb i'n heconomi i greu mwy o swyddi ac annog busnesau newydd i ddechrau.

Nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni ei nod o ddileu tlodi plant erbyn 2020, ac amcangyfrifir, erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, y bydd 6,000 yn fwy o blant yn byw mewn tlodi yng Nghymru. Mae'r beirniadaethau gan Sefydliad Bevan fod rhai o'r camau gweithredu yng 'Nghynllun Gweithredu ar gyfer Trechu Tlodi 2012-2016' Llywodraeth Cymru yn annhebygol o gael unrhyw effaith ar dlodi o gwbl yn peri pryder mawr.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru wneud mwy o ymdrech a chanolbwyntio ar fynd i'r afael ag achosion sylfaenol tlodi fel blaenoriaeth—a phan ddywedaf 'Llywodraeth Cymru', rwy'n cynnwys pob un ohonom sy'n eistedd yma heddiw. Heddiw, rydym wedi nodi lle y gallai hyn gael ei wneud. Gwn fod gan bob un ohonom yn y Siambr—wel rhai ohonom—yr uchelgais i weld tlodi plant yn cael ei ddileu erbyn 2020. Gadewch inni yn awr gymryd camau i wireddu hyn, i ddangos i'n plant fod cyflawniad yn amgenach na gair ffasiynol yn unig.

**Julie Morgan:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddweud ei bod yn syndod mawr bod yr wrthblaid swyddogol yn gwneud yr honiadau hyn am sefyllfa plant yng Nghymru, o gofio mai Llywodraeth y DU dan arweiniad y Ceidwadwyr sy'n gyfrifol am achosi'r caledi mwyaf i deuluoedd a phlant. Peidied neb ag anghofio—

**Suzy Davies** *a gododd*—

**Julie Morgan:** Gadewch imi ddweud ychydig yn gyntaf, yna gallwch siarad. Peidied neb ag anghofio bod toriadau i gredydau treth a budd-daliadau wedi effeithio'n galed ar blant ac y byddant yn gwneud hynny. Amcangyfrifir mai'r aelwydydd tlotaf â phlant a fydd yn colli'r gyfran fwyaf o'u hincwm o ganlyniad i

Wales can expect to lose on average 4.1% or £1,110 per year off their income as a direct result of the tax and benefit changes, and that the poorest households will lose the most, particularly non-working lone parents and workless couples with children. I give way to Janet Finch-Saunders. [*Laughter.*] Sorry, I mean Suzy Davies.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** I am very grateful—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I think that the Member is giving way to Suzy Davies. I do apologise.

**Suzy Davies:** Thank you for taking the intervention. You quoted the IFS, but what are your views on the words of the Department for Work and Pensions today that hundreds of thousands of people will be more supported under the universal credit, and that no-one will lose any cash as a result of the changes? Who do you believe, the DWP or the IFS?

**Julie Morgan:** I believe the evidence that was brought to me, and I am quoting the IFS here. I give way to Antoinette Sandbach.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** The changes to tax credits are proposed for people who earn over £50,000 a year, which is more than double the average wage in Wales.

**Julie Morgan:** Oh, thank you very much.

We do not know what else is coming. Jocelyn Davies mentioned the £10 billion that the Chancellor mentioned at the Conservative Party conference. Where will that hit people? In my intervention on Mark Isherwood, I mentioned that the Chancellor said that unemployed families should have their benefits capped if they have more children, but the Member did not respond to that. The Child Poverty Action Group's chief

newidiadau treth a budd-daliadau. Dengys dadansoddiad gan y Sefydliad Astudiaethau Cyllid y gall aelwydydd yng Nghymru ddisgwyl colli 4.1% neu £1,110 y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd oddi ar eu hincwm o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r newidiadau treth a budd-daliadau, ac y bydd y cartrefi tlotaf yn colli'r mwyaf, yn enwedig rhieni unigol nad ydynt yn gweithio a pharau heb waith gyda phlant. Ildiaf i Janet Finch-Saunders. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, rwy'n golygu Suzy Davies.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Credaf fod yr Aelod yn ildio i Suzy Davies. Ymddiheuraf.

**Suzy Davies:** Diolch am dderbyn yr ymyriad. Gwnaethoch ddyfynnu'r Sefydliad Astudiaethau Cyllid, ond beth yw eich barn ar eiriau'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau heddiw y bydd cannoedd ar filoedd o bobl yn cael mwy o gefnogaeth o dan y credyd cynhwysol, ac na fydd unrhyw un yn colli unrhyw arian parod o ganlyniad i'r newidiadau? Pwy ydych yn ei gredu, yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau neu'r Sefydliad Astudiaethau Cyllid?

**Julie Morgan:** Rwy'n credu'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i mi, ac rwy'n dyfynnu'r Sefydliad Astudiaethau Cyllid yma. Ildiaf i Antoinette Sandbach.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Cynigir y newidiadau i gredydau treth ar gyfer pobl sy'n ennill dros £50,000 y flwyddyn, sy'n fwy na dwbl y cyflog cyfartalog yng Nghymru.

**Julie Morgan:** O, diolch yn fawr iawn.

Ni wyddom beth arall sy'n dod. Soniodd Jocelyn Davies am y £10 biliwn y soniodd y Canghellor amdano yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Geidwadol. Ble bydd hwnnw'n effeithio ar bobl? Yn fy ymyriad pan oedd Mark Isherwood yn siarad, soniais fod y Canghellor wedi dweud y dylid capio budd-daliadau teuluoedd di-waith os cânt rhagor o blant, ond ni wnaeth yr Aelod ymateb i hynny. Mae prif weithredwr Grŵp

executive, Alison Garnham, has spoken out against this.

‘With this abhorrent proposal, the Chancellor is saying that some children will be marked out from birth as second class citizens with their lives worth less than others.’

I cannot see that that can be defended by the party opposite.

To reiterate, the Tory-led UK Government has cut child benefit, child tax credits and housing benefit. In England, it has cut funding for school breakfast clubs, scrapped child trust funds, scrapped education maintenance allowances, and failed to protect young people from higher tuition fees. The Welsh Government estimates that the UK Government’s reforms could increase the number of cases of relative child poverty in Wales by about 6,000 in 2012-13. In contrast, the Welsh Government is taking a concerted and co-ordinated approach to tackling child poverty, to achieve better outcomes for children. To me, the whole debate really seems a bit of a cheek.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I am very grateful to the Member for being so generous with her time in the debate today. Do you not recognise that, in 2010, when the Labour Party left Government, there were record numbers of children in poverty in Wales? Despite a massive expansion in the welfare state, you killed aspiration and put more children in poverty. You had not enabled anyone.

**Julie Morgan:** I think that you have made it much worse.

I want to go on to make a few more positive comments, because child poverty is a serious issue. Child poverty is not just about money. There are lots of other aspects to it, and there are some things that we can do to include children and to make their general being better that do not necessarily cost a lot of money. One thing that I feel very strongly about is the fact that a lot of progress could be made in the area of design and planning. Would it not be wonderful if, when town

Gweithredu ar Dlodi Plant, Alison Garnham, wedi siarad yn erbyn hyn.

Gyda’r cynnig ffaidd hwn, mae’r Canghellor yn dweud y bydd rhai plant yn cael eu nodi o’u genedigaeth fel dinasyddion ail ddosbarth gyda’u bywydau yn werth llai nag eraill.

Ni allaf weld y gall hynny gael ei amddiffyn gan y blaid gyferbyn.

I ailadrodd, mae Llywodraeth y DU dan arweiniad y Torïaid wedi torri budd-dal plant, credydau treth plant a budd-dal tai. Yn Lloegr, mae wedi torri cyllid ar gyfer clybiau brecwast ysgol, wedi dileu cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant a lwfansau cynhaliath addysg, ac wedi methu â gwarchod pobl ifanc rhag ffioedd dysgu uwch. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn amcangyfrif y gallai diwygiadau Llywodraeth y DU gynyddu nifer yr achosion o dlodi plant cymharol yng Nghymru oddeutu 6,000 yn 2012-13. Mewn cyferbyniad â hyn, mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd ar y cyd a chydgyssylltiedig at fynd i’r afael â thlodi plant, er mwyn cyflawni gwell canlyniadau i blant. I mi, mae’r ddadl gyfan mewn gwirionedd yn ymddangos braidd yn ddigywilydd.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Rwy’n ddiolchgar i’r Aelod am fod mor hael gyda’i amser yn y ddadl heddiw. Onid ydych yn cydnabod, yn 2010, pan gollodd y Blaid Lafur rym, fod y nifer fwyaf erioed o blant mewn tlodi yng Nghymru? Er gwaethaf y cynnydd enfawr yn y wladwriaeth les, gwnaethoch ladd pob dyhead a rhoi mwy o blant mewn tlodi. Nid oeddech wedi galluogi neb.

**Julie Morgan:** Rwy’n meddwl eich bod wedi ei wneud yn llawer gwaeth.

Rwyf am fynd ymlaen i wneud ychydig o sylwadau mwy cadarnhaol, oherwydd mae tlodi plant yn fater difrifol. Nid yw tlodi plant yn ymwneud ag arian yn unig. Mae llawer o agweddau eraill arno, ac mae rhai pethau y gallwn ei wneud i gynnwys plant ac i wneud eu lles yn well yn gyffredinol nad ydynt o reidrwydd yn costio llawer o arian. Un peth rwy’n teimlo’n gryf iawn yn ei gylch yw’r ffaith y gallai llawer o gynnydd gael ei wneud ym maes dylunio a chynllunio. Oni

centres were designed or there was new building happening in a town centre, specific areas were built for children and young people? There should be a playground for little children in the centre of Cardiff so that they feel a part of the city. There should be places for young people to go in the centre of cities, where they are welcomed and where their presence is not seen as a threat. It is very worrying that, as many elderly people in my community do, we often view young people in groups as a threat. I wish that we could get rid of that attitude.

If time permits, I would like to tell a little story, briefly. I was reminded of how we tend to assume the worst of our young people when one of my colleagues said that she was in Cardiff city centre the other day and saw a boy of about 15 putting a traffic cone on top of the Aneurin Bevan statue.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must conclude.

**Julie Morgan:** She approached him and was preparing to give him a lecture on just who Aneurin Bevan was, when he said, 'Well, Aneurin Bevan was a really important person and I want people to notice him, so I thought that the cone might make people look at the statue'. [*Laughter.*]

**Antoinette Sandbach:** This debate is a welcome opportunity to highlight the importance of Welsh children receiving the quality of service that they deserve. This issue is particularly relevant in rural areas, where access to services is particularly poor. Between 2005 and 2012, the number of schools was reduced by 20 in Ceredigion, by 20 in Carmarthenshire, by 10 in Powys and by 13 in Pembrokeshire. These rural school closures damage the foundation of rural communities and leave children in rural areas having to travel further and further to access education. The Minister for Local Government and Communities refuses to create a virtual Communities First to tackle rural deprivation and poverty. Current policies are also letting down the poorest

fyddai'n wych pe bai ardaloedd penodol yn cael eu hadeiladu'n benodol i blant a phobl ifanc pan fyddai canolfannau tref yn cael eu dylunio neu pan fyddai adeilad newydd yn cael ei godi ynghanol tref? Dylid sicrhau bod maes chwarae ar gael i blant bach ynghanol Caerdydd fel eu bod yn teimlo'n rhan o'r ddinas. Dylai fod lleoedd i bobl ifanc fynd iddynt ynghanol dinasoedd, lle y cânt eu croesawu a lle nad yw eu presenoldeb yn cael ei weld fel bygythiad. Mae'n destun cryn bryder, fel llawer o bobl hŷn yn fy nghymuned, ein bod yn aml yn gweld pobl ifanc mewn grwpiau fel bygythiad. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe gallem gael gwared ar y agwedd honno.

Os bydd amser yn caniatáu, hoffwn ddweud stori fach, yn fyr. Cefais fy atgoffa o sut rydym yn tueddu i feddwl y gwaethaf o'n pobl ifanc pan ddywedodd un o'm cyd-Aelodau ei bod yng nghanol dinas Caerdydd y diwrnod o'r blaen a gwelodd fachgen tua 15 oed yn rhoi côn traffig ar ben cerflun Aneurin Bevan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid ichi ddod i ben.

**Julie Morgan:** Aeth ato ac roedd yn paratoi i roi darlith iddo ar Aneurin Bevan, pan ddywedodd, 'Wel, roedd Aneurin Bevan yn berson pwysig iawn ac rwyf am i bobl sylwi arno, felly roeddwn i'n meddwl y byddai'r côn efallai yn gwneud i bobl edrych ar y cerflun'. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Mae'r ddadl hon yn gyfle da i dynnu sylw at ba mor bwysig ydyw i blant Cymru gael y gwasanaeth o ansawdd y maent yn ei haeddu. Mae'r mater hwn yn arbennig o berthnasol mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle mae mynediad at wasanaethau yn arbennig o wael. Rhwng 2005 a 2012, roedd 20 ysgol yn llai yng Ngheredigion, 20 yn llai yng Nghaerfyrddin, 10 yn llai ym Mhowys a 13 yn llai yn Sir Benfro. Mae'r achosion hyn o gau ysgolion gwledig yn niweidio sylfaen cymunedau gwledig ac yn golygu bod plant mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn gorfod teithio ymhellach ac ymhellach i gael addysg. Mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn gwrthod creu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf rhithwir i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd gwledig a thlodi. Mae polisïau

students. I raised this point yesterday in questions to the First Minister.

As Aled Roberts has already said, in core subjects—the most important to students for their job prospects and further education, and therefore for improving the lives of their children and their families—there has been no real progress in closing the gulf between the achievements of the poorest students in receipt of free school meals and their peers at GCSE level. In fact, that gap in attainment has widened over the past five years of this Labour Government in the Assembly. Undoubtedly, this has had a huge impact on these pupils' chances of success in later life. There is also a serious gap between the attainment of pupils in Wales and those in England. A succession of Ministers has failed to drive up standards, and the current Minister has conceded that he is presiding over a 'systemic' failure in education. It is concerning that he does not expect improvements in the next round of results from the Programme for International Student Assessment. Quite frankly, our children deserve better. Those from the lowest socioeconomic backgrounds are the ones who are being let down the most.

There is also a lack of public transport and there is transport poverty in general in rural areas, which is a huge issue. I am aware of one Assembly Member living in a rural area whose child now has to travel more than 50 minutes each way to school and on a road that, in winter, can be inaccessible or closed due to snow. Children in rural areas are at a considerable disadvantage compared with those living in urban areas, not just in accessing education but also in accessing extra-curricular services that might improve their life chances, including youth clubs, sports clubs, drama clubs and so on. There is a real fear that, in rural communities, they will be left even further behind as superfast broadband is rolled out elsewhere in Wales, adding to the exclusion felt by children in rural areas who will be unable to participate in social media. Access to internet services is also so important for learning. It should be a priority to bring a basic broadband service to

cyfredol hefyd yn siomi'r myfyrwyr tlotaf. Codais y pwynt hwn ddoe yn y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog.

Fel y mae Aled Roberts eisoes wedi'i ddweud, yn y pynciau craidd—y rhai pwysicaf i fyfyrwyr o ran eu rhagolygon swyddi a'u haddysg bellach, ac felly o ran gwella bywydau eu plant a'u teuluoedd—ni fu unrhyw gynnydd gwirioneddol o ran cau'r gagendor rhwng cyflawniadau'r myfyrwyr tlotaf sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim a'u cyfoedion ar lefel TGAU. Yn wir, mae'r bwch hwnnw mewn cyrhaeddiad wedi ymledu dros bum mlynedd diwethaf y Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Yn ddi- au, mae hyn wedi cael effaith enfawr ar gyfleoedd y disgyblion hyn o ran llwyddiant yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd. Mae bwch difrifol hefyd rhwng cyrhaeddiad disgyblion yng Nghymru a'r rheini yn Lloegr. Mae cyfres o Weinidogion wedi methu â chodi safonau, ac mae'r Gweinidog presennol wedi cyfaddef ei fod yn llywyddu dros fethiant 'systemig' mewn addysg. Mae'n destun pryder nad yw'n disgwyl gwelliannau yn y cylch nesaf o ganlyniadau o'r Rhaglen ar gyfer Asesu Myfyrwyr Rhyngwladol. A dweud y gwir, mae ein plant yn haeddu gwell. Y rhai o'r cefndiroedd economaidd-gymdeithasol isaf yw'r rhai sy'n cael eu siomi fwyaf.

Mae yna hefyd ddiffyg trafndiaeth gyhoeddus ac mae flodi trafndiaeth yn gyffredinol mewn ardaloedd gwledig, sy'n broblem enfawr. Rwy'n ymwybodol o un Aelod Cynulliad sy'n byw mewn ardal wledig sydd â phlentyn sy'n gorfod teithio bellach mwy na 50 munud bob ffordd i'r ysgol ac ar hyd ffordd a all, yn y gaeaf, fod yn anhygyrch neu ar gau oherwydd eira. Mae plant mewn ardaloedd gwledig dan anfantais sylweddol o'u cymharu â'r rhai sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd trefol, nid yn unig o ran manteisio ar addysg, ond hefyd o ran manteisio ar wasanaethau allgyrsiol a allai wella eu cyfleoedd mewn bywyd, gan gynnwys clybiau ieuenctid, clybiau chwaraeon, clybiau drama ac yn y blaen. Mae yna ofn gwirioneddol, mewn cymunedau gwledig, y cânt eu gadael ar ei hôl hi hyd yn oed yn fwy wrth i fand eang cyflym iawn gael ei gyflwyno mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru, gan ychwanegu at y teimlad o

all existing notspots alongside the superfast service that is being rolled out in urban areas.

allgáu a brofir gan blant mewn ardaloedd gwledig na fyddant yn gallu cymryd rhan yn y cyfryngau cymdeithasol. Mae mynediad at wasanaethau rhynggrwyd hefyd mor bwysig ar gyfer dysgu. Dylai cyflwyno gwasanaeth band eang sylfaenol i bob man gwan presennol ochr yn ochr â'r gwasanaeth cyflym iawn sy'n cael ei gyflwyno mewn ardaloedd trefol fod yn flaenoriaeth.

We need to have greater ambition for our children and better planning to deliver services. Those who are let down are not those who have the most money, because they can afford to travel; they can afford to travel to get those services. The children who are let down the most are the poorest children. Only today in the Assembly, a group of young carers came from Flintshire with their access to action card, which was a simple way of their being able to promote and access services such as health and education services without having to explain constantly what their background is.

Mae angen inni gael mwy o uchelgais dros ein plant a gwell cynllunio i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Nid y rhai sydd â'r mwyaf o arian yw'r rhai sy'n cael eu siomi, oherwydd gallant fforddio teithio; gallant fforddio teithio i gael y gwasanaethau hynny. Y plant sy'n cael eu siomi fwyaf yw'r plant tlotaf. Dim ond heddiw yn y Cynulliad, daeth grŵp o ofalwyr ifanc o Sir y Fflint gyda'u cerdyn mynediad i weithredu, a oedd yn ffordd syml o sicrhau eu bod yn gallu hyrwyddo a chael gafael ar wasanaethau megis gwasanaethau iechyd ac addysg heb orfod egluro'n gyson beth yw eu cefndir .

**Joyce Watson:** When you were speaking to these children from Flintshire, did you ask them what they felt about the possibility, according to the articles that I have read, that their parents may lose their benefits? Did you discuss those things with them? I would be very interested to know.

**Joyce Watson:** Pan oeddech yn siarad â'r plant hynny o Sir y Fflint, a wnaethoch ofyn iddynt beth oedd eu barn hwy am y posibilrwydd, yn ôl yr erthyglau yr wyf wedi eu darllen, y gall eu rhieni golli eu budd-daliadau? A wnaethoch drafod y pethau hynny gyda hwy? Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mawr i wybod hynny.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** They were concerned about accessing services. They were not able to access services. These were the youngest, most vulnerable people who were carers—*[Interruption.]*

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Roeddent yn pryderu ynghylch cael gafael ar wasanaethau. Nid ydynt yn gallu cael gafael ar wasanaethau. Y rhain oedd y bobl ieuengaf, fwyaf agored i niwed a oedd yn ofalwyr—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Kenneth Skates** *rose*—

**Kenneth Skates** *a gododd*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Members has no more time to take further interventions.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes gan yr Aelod fwy o amser i dderbyn ymyriadau pellach.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** These were the youngest and most vulnerable carers who were looking after parents and siblings. They had to come up with a solution that had been recommended to Welsh Government in Keith Towler's report in 2009. Keith Towler, the children commissioner, recommended that an ID card be developed for young carers. That has not being taken up. This was the

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Y rhain oedd y gofalwyr ieuengaf a mwyaf agored i niwed a oedd yn gofalu am rieni a brodyr a chwiorydd. Roedd yn rhaid iddynt ddod o hyd i ateb a oedd wedi ei argymhell i Lywodraeth Cymru yn adroddiad Keith Towler yn 2009. Argymhellodd Keith Towler, y comisiynydd plant, y dylid datblygu cerdyn adnabod i ofalwyr ifanc. Ni

Flintshire children's own initiative. It is quite clear from the UK Government benefit reforms that a marginal tax rate of 95% will lead to those people who would drop off a cliff edge when they move into work with regard to their access to benefits in fact being better off as a result of the changes that we will see.

**Ann Jones:** There seems to be some sort of pattern emerging here. The Tories' Wednesday afternoon debates are an attempt to make it look like they have the answers. Janet Finch-Saunders made a good stab at being 'I'm every woman, it's all in me', but she did not get there. *[Interruption.]* Ask your researcher what that meant. I want to assure the people of Wales that the Tories, whether in Westminster or Cardiff, do not have the answers. More often than not, they are the source of the problems.

Let us look at what the Welsh Tories would like to do if they ever got hold of the reins of power in Wales. We would have a Welsh leader who would slash free prescriptions at the drop of a hat. Is that correct?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** It is important to correct the wrong impression that you are giving. We do not believe that 40%-rate taxpayers should have free prescriptions, but you are quite happy to stand there and deny cancer patients cancer drugs. That is the difference between us. We believe in social justice; you believe in posturing. That is a fact.

**Ann Jones:** I am not able to posture because I do not have two good legs. What I talk about is what I listen to in the Chamber, and sometimes I really want to say, 'Pass me the sick bucket'.

The Tories are committed to slashing 20% from the education budget in Wales. When my children were in school, they had 'Thatcher, the milk snatcher'. Darren, stop reading your e-mails, because we now have my grandchildren going to school, and they

weithredwyd ar hynny. Menter plant Sir y Fflint eu hunain oedd hon. Mae'n eithaf clir o ddiwygiadau Llywodraeth y DU i fudd-daliadau y bydd cyfradd dreth ymylol o 95% yn arwain at sefyllfa lle y byddai'r bobl hynny a fyddai'n sefyll ar ddibyn pan fyddant yn dechrau gweithio o ran eu mynediad at fudd-daliadau yn well eu byd mewn gwirionedd o ganlyniad i'r newidiadau y byddwn yn eu gweld.

**Ann Jones:** Ymddengys bod rhyw fath o batrwm yn dod i'r amlwg yma. Mae dadleuon prynhawn Mercher y Torïaid yn ymgais i geisio rhoi'r argraff bod yr atebion ganddynt. Rhoddodd Janet Finch-Saunders gynnig da ar fod yn 'I'm every woman, it's all in me', ond ni chyrrhaeddodd y nod. *[Torri ar draws.]* Gofynnwch i'ch ymchwilydd beth oedd hynny'n ei olygu. Rwyf am sicrhau pobl Cymru nad oes gan y Torïaid yr atebion, boed yn San Steffan neu Gaerdydd. Yn amlach na pheidio, hwy sy'n achosi'r problemau.

Gadewch inni edrych ar yr hyn y byddai Torïaid Cymru yn hoffi ei wneud pe baent byth yn dod i rym yng Nghymru. Byddai gennym arweinydd Cymreig a fyddai'n cael gwared â phresgripsiynau am ddim ar unwaith. A yw hynny'n gywir?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae'n bwysig cywiro'r argraff anghywir a roddwch. Ni chredwn y dylai trethdalwyr cyfradd 40% gael presgripsiynau am ddim, ond rydych yn eithaf hapus i sefyll yno a gwrthod cyffuriau canser i gleifion canser. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhyngom. Rydym yn credu mewn cyfiawnder cymdeithasol; rydych chi'n credu mewn ymagweddu. Mae hynny'n ffaith.

**Ann Jones:** Nid wyf yn gallu ymagweddu oherwydd nid oes gennyf ddwy goes dda. Yr hyn yr wyf yn siarad amdano yw'r hyn yr wyf yn gwranddo arno yn y Siambr, ac weithiau rwyf wir am ddweud, 'Rwyf am chwydu'.

Mae'r Torïaid wedi ymrwymo i dorri 20% oddi ar y gyllideb addysg yng Nghymru. Pan oedd fy mhlant yn yr ysgol, roedd ganddynt 'Thatcher, y lleidr llaeth'. Darren, rhowch y gorau i ddarllen eich negeseuon e-bost, oherwydd bellach mae fy wyrion yn mynd i'r



have to put up with 'Millar, the cereal killer'.  
[*Laughter.*]

Last year, they attempted to secure some power to abolish Communities First, cutting the lifeline of funding for our most deprived and disadvantaged communities. These actions that I have just reeled off would not address child poverty; they would make it worse. Therefore, while you would cause chaos, the Welsh Labour Government gets on with delivering here in Wales. We deliver in spite of the fact that Wales has had its worse settlement from the Tory-Lib Dem coalition Government since devolution began. [*Interruption.*] Well, you are borrowing more now than when we left, so do not even go down that route. [*Interruption.*] I am beginning to sound like Mark Isherwood shouting over you all. I do apologise. It was responsible for a 42% real-terms cuts in the Welsh Government capital budget over the four years from 2011-12 to 2014-15.

I want to pick up on the Flying Start programme and look at what it means in practice to those families: it means free, quality, part-time childcare for two to three-year-olds; it means an enhanced health visiting service; it means access to parenting programmes and early language development. I believe that our commitment on these benches to doubling the number of children and their families benefiting from Flying Start to 36,000 is to be applauded. To support that, an additional £55 million of funding is being made available over the course of the next three years: £5 million in 2012-13, £20 million in 2013-14 and £30 million in 2014-15. It is an early intervention programme that is available to all eligible children and their families in the areas where it runs, delivering on one of our priorities to protect the most vulnerable.

5.45 p.m.

In addition, there is the foundation phase, now fully rolled out to all three to seven-year-olds, a new reading test starting in the spring and new numeracy tests beginning in May next year. School budgets have been

ysgol, a rhaid iddynt ddiodef 'Millar, y llofrudd grawnfwyd'. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y llynedd, gwnaethant geisio sicrhau rhywfaint o bŵer i ddiddymu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan dorri'r cyllid ar gyfer ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig a'r rhai dan yr anfantais fwyaf. Ni fyddai'r camau hyn yr wyf newydd eu rhaffu yn mynd i'r afael â thlodi plant; byddent yn ei wneud yn waeth. Felly, tra byddech chi'n achosi anhrefn, mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru yn mynd ati i gyflawni yma yng Nghymru. Rydym yn darparu er gwaethaf y ffaith bod Cymru wedi cael ei setliad gwaethaf gan glymblaid y Toriaid-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ers i ddatganoli ddechrau. [*Torri ar draws.*] Wel, rydych yn benthyg mwy nawr na phan wnaethom adael, felly peidiwch hyd yn oed â dechrau sôn am hynny. [*Torri ar draws.*] Rwy'n dechrau swnio fel Mark Isherwood yn gweiddi dros bob un ohonoch. Ymddiheuraf. Bu'n gyfrifol am doriadau o 42% mewn termau real yng nghyllideb cyfalaf Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystod y pedair blynedd o 2011-12 i 2014-15.

Rwyf am gyfeirio at y rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg ac edrych ar beth mae'n ei olygu yn ymarferol i'r teuluoedd hynny: mae'n golygu gofal plant rhan amser, o safon, yn rhad ac am ddim i blant dwy i dair blwydd oed; mae'n golygu gwasanaeth ymwelydd iechyd gwell; mae'n golygu manteisio ar raglenni rhianta a datblygiad iaith cynnar. Credaf fod ein hymrwymiad ar y meinciau hyn i ddyblu nifer y plant a'u teuluoedd sy'n cael budd o'r rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg i 36,000 i'w gymeradwyo. Er mwyn cefnogi hynny, mae swm ychwanegol o £55 miliwn o gyllid yn cael ei ddarparu yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf: £5 miliwn yn 2012-13, £20 miliwn yn 2013-14 a £30 miliwn yn 2014-15. Mae'n rhaglen ymyrraeth gynnar sydd ar gael i bob plentyn cymwys a'u teuluoedd yn yr ardaloedd lle y caiff ei chynnal, gan gyflawni un o'n blaenoriaethau i amddiffyn y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed.

Yn ogystal, mae'r cyfnod sylfaen, sydd erbyn hyn wedi'i gyflwyno'n llawn i bob plentyn rhwng tair a saith mlwydd oed, prawf darllen newydd yn dechrau yn y gwanwyn a phroffion rhifedd newydd yn dechrau mis Mai y

raised by 1% above the amount that Wales receives from the UK Government, and a pupil deprivation grant has been introduced to help address the impact of deprivation on attainment. These are not just words in my speech, but actions, and those actions will help to address child poverty. It is ironic for the Welsh Tories to demand action on addressing the life-expectancy gap between the richest and the poorest in Wales when their cuts to child benefit, child tax credits, working families tax credits, child trust funds and housing benefits, and their current extra £10 billion on top of all that, would do the complete opposite.

**Mohammad Asghar:** The goal of ending child poverty in Britain is one that unites all political parties. This was demonstrated by the cross-party support for the Child Poverty Act 2010. The previous Labour Government at Westminster set itself the target of halving child poverty by 2010 and eradicating it totally by 2020. However, that target to halve child poverty was not met in spite of the vast amount of money that was poured into reducing poverty. The target was missed by 600,000 poorer children. The Labour Government spent £150 billion on tax credits alone between 2004 and 2010, and yet too many of the root causes of poverty have remained unchecked.

The coalition Government at Westminster recognises that income is important. That is why it has lifted 2 million of our lowest paid workers out of income tax altogether by raising personal allowances. Money is not the answer; there are other measures to tackle poverty in childhood rather than pouring money into it. The coalition has also renewed the commitment to end child poverty by 2020 in line with the Child Poverty Act. That aspiration is shared by the Welsh Government, but tackling child poverty is not just about raising family incomes. The best route out of poverty is through achievement in education and work. We must address the barriers to employment to ensure that every child has the opportunity to succeed. Poor physical health, family instability, drug and

flwyddyn nesaf. Mae cyllidebau ysgolion wedi cael eu codi 1% yn uwch na'r swm a gaiff Cymru gan Lywodraeth y DU, ac mae grant amddifadedd disgyblion wedi cael ei gyflwyno i helpu i fynd i'r afael ag effaith amddifadedd ar gyrhaeddiad. Nid geiriau yn fy araith yn unig yw'r rhain, ond camau gweithredu, a bydd y camau gweithredu hynny'n helpu i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Mae'n eironig bod Torïaid Cymru'n galw am weithredu i fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch disgwyliad oes rhwng y cyfoethocaf a'r tlotaf yng Nghymru pan fydd eu toriadau i fudd-dal plant, credydau treth plant, credydau treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio, cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant a budd-daliadau tai, a'u £10 biliwn ychwanegol ar hyn o bryd ar ben hynny oll, yn gwneud y gwrthwyneb yn llwyr.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae'r nod o ddileu tlodi plant ym Mhrydain yn un sy'n uno'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol. Dangoswyd hyn gan y gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i Ddeddf Tlodi Plant 2010. Pennodd y Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol yn San Steffan darged iddi ei hun i haneru tlodi plant erbyn 2010 a'i ddileu'n gyfan gwbl erbyn 2020. Fodd bynnag, ni chyflawnwyd y targed hwnnw i haneru tlodi plant er gwaethaf y swm enfawr o arian a wariwyd ar leihau tlodi. Methwyd y targed o 600,000 o blant tlotach. Gwariodd y Llywodraeth Lafur £150 biliwn ar gredydau treth yn unig rhwng 2004 a 2010, ac eto mae gormod o achosion sylfaenol tlodi yn parhau'n ddiatal.

Mae'r Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan yn cydnabod bod incwm yn bwysig. Dyna pam mae wedi codi 2 filiwn o'n gweithwyr ar y cyflog isaf allan o dreth incwm yn gyfan gwbl drwy godi lwfansau personol. Nid arian yw'r ateb; mae mesurau eraill i fynd i'r afael â thlodi yn ystod plentyndod yn hytrach na gwario arian mawr arno. Mae'r glymblaid wedi adnewyddu hefyd yr ymrwymiad i roi terfyn ar dlodi plant erbyn 2020 yn unol â'r Ddeddf Tlodi Plant. Rhennir y dyhead hwnnw gan Lywodraeth Cymru, ond nid oes a wnelo tlodi plant â chodi incwm teuluoedd yn unig. Y llwybr gorau allan o dlodi yw drwy gyflawniad mewn addysg a gwaith. Mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau i gyflogaeth i sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn cael y cyfle i lwyddo. Mae iechyd corfforol

alcohol abuse and low levels of aspiration serve to continue the cycle of deprivation that causes child poverty.

**Ann Jones:** Will you give way on that point?

**Mohammad Asghar:** I am sorry, Ann, but I will not.

According to Save the Children, 31% of children in Wales—approximately 200,000 children—were living in relative poverty in 2010-11, and 14% lived in severe poverty. This is highest rate of any region in the United Kingdom, to the shame of Labour rulers in this part of the UK. That is the scale of the task that we face, here and in London, and yet our education services are failing to equip our schoolchildren with even basic skill requirements. According to Estyn, 40% of schoolchildren start secondary school unable to read properly and 20% are not functionally literate at that age. The attainment gap between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom is widening. Education services for children with special educational needs are vital to tackle child poverty, but the Assembly's education committee found the current statutory framework on statementing to be insufficient, complex, bureaucratic and costly, as well as not focusing on the need of the child.

Improving the health of our children and young people is vital to breaking the cycle of deprivation. Wales has one of the highest rates of child obesity in the world. Shame on the Labour Government.

**Ann Jones:** Will you take an intervention on that point?

**Mohammad Asghar:** No, Ann.

Last year, 35% of Wales's children were classed as being overweight, with 19% being classed as obese. These figures are shameful and have been more or less static for the past five years—since the Labour Government has been in power. In spite of the Healthy Eating in Schools (Wales) Measure 2009 and

gwael, ansefydlogrwydd teuluol, camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol a lefelau isel o ddyhead yn fodd i barhau â'r cylch amddifadedd sy'n achosi tlodi plant.

**Ann Jones:** A wnewch chi ildio ar y pwynt hwnnw?

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ann, ond ni wnaf.

Yn ôl Achub y Plant, roedd 31% o blant yng Nghymru—tua 200,000 o blant—yn byw mewn tlodi cymharol yn 2010-11, ac roedd 14% yn byw mewn tlodi difrifol. Dyma'r gyfradd uchaf o blith unrhyw ranbarth yn y Deyrnas Unedig, er gwarth i'r llywodraethwyr Llafur yn y rhan hon o'r DU. Dyna faint y dasg sy'n ein hwynebu, yma ac yn Llundain, ac eto mae ein gwasanaethau addysg yn methu â rhoi'r sgiliau sylfaenol hyd yn oed i'n plant ysgol. Yn ôl Estyn, mae 40% o blant ysgol yn dechrau ysgol uwchradd heb allu darllen yn iawn ac nid yw 20% yn llythrennog yn weithredol pan gyrrhaeddant yr oedran hwnnw. Mae'r bwlch cyrrhaeddiad rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig yn mynd yn fwy. Mae gwasanaethau addysg i blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn hanfodol i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, ond canfu pwyllgor addysg y Cynulliad fod y fframwaith statudol cyfredol ar ddatganiadau yn annigonol, yn gymhleth, yn fiwrocraidd ac yn gostus, ac nad oedd ychwaith yn canolbwyntio ar angen y plentyn.

Mae gwella iechyd ein plant a phobl ifanc yn hanfodol i dorri cylch amddifadedd. Mae gan Gymru un o'r cyfraddau uchaf o ordewdra mewn plant yn y byd. Rhag cywilydd i'r Llywodraeth Lafur.

**Ann Jones:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad ar y pwynt hwnnw?

**Mohammad Asghar:** Na wnaf, Ann.

Y llynedd, nodwyd bod 35% o blant Cymru yn rhy drwm, a nodwyd bod 19% yn ordew. Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn gywilyddus ac wedi bod yn sefydlog fwy neu lai am y pum mlynedd diwethaf—ers i'r Llywodraeth Lafur ddod i rym. Er gwaethaf Mesur

the 'Appetite for Life' initiative, the gap in oral health between the most deprived in the least deprived families is widening. Shame on Labour.

The level of teenage smoking and drinking continues to be a cause for concern.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must conclude.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Also, there has been a rise in the number of cases of substance misuse among the under-15s. Shame on Labour.

**The Deputy Minister for Children and Social Services (Gwenda Thomas):** I am always pleased to come to this Chamber to discuss how this Government is prioritising the needs of children and young people. I thank the Member for South Wales East for providing this opportunity for us this afternoon.

Our programme for government makes clear our commitment to children and young people, and to ensuring that they get the best start in life and are supported to reach their potential. In doubling Flying Start, we will reach an additional 18,000 children, as has been said, with this vital early years programme, providing the very best early-years experience for children and their parents. We will be investing an additional £74 million over the next three years alone to deliver on this commitment. Perhaps you do not recollect what I have said previously about introducing an outreach element to the Flying Start budget, which perhaps answers Janet Finch-Saunders's point about reaching out to children outside of Flying Start areas. Of course, we would like to roll it out throughout Wales, but as a devolved Government, we have to work within our resources, and I am determined that we will do our best to ameliorate the effects of child poverty.

In my recent statement on Families First, I reaffirmed our commitment to ensure that services are in place that can respond quickly and appropriately to the needs of children and

Bwyta'n iach mewn Ysgolion (Cymru) 2009 a'r fenter 'Blas am Oes', mae'r bwlch o ran iechyd y geg rhwng y teuluoedd mwyaf difreintiedig a'r teuluoedd lleiaf difreintiedig yn mynd yn fwy. Rhag cywilydd i Lafur.

Mae lefel yr ysmegu ac yfed ymhlith pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau yn parhau i fod yn achos pryder.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid i chi ddod i ben.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Hefyd, bu cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o gamddefnyddio sylweddau ymhlith pobl ifanc dan 15 oed. Rhag cywilydd i Lafur.

**Dirprwy Weinidog Plant a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas):** Rwyf bob amser yn falch o ddod i'r Siambr hon i drafod sut y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn blaenoriaethu anghenion plant a phobl ifanc. Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ddwyrain De Cymru am gynnig y cyfle inni y prynhawn yma.

Mae ein rhaglen llywodraethu yn gwneud yn glir ein hymrwymiad i blant a phobl ifanc, ac i sicrhau eu bod yn cael y cychwyn gorau mewn bywyd ac yn cael cymorth i gyflawni eu potensial. Wrth ddyblu Dechrau'n Deg, byddwn yn cyrraedd 18,000 o blant ychwanegol, fel y dywedwyd, gyda'r rhaglen blynnyddoedd cynnar hanfodol hon, gan ddarparu'r profiad blynnyddoedd gorau posibl i blant a'u rhieni. Byddwn yn buddsoddi swm ychwanegol o £74 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf yn unig i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwn. Efallai nad ydych yn cofio'r hyn a ddywedais o'r blaen am gyflwyno elfen allgymorth yng nghyllideb Dechrau'n Deg, sydd efallai'n ateb y pwynt a wnaeth Janet Finch-Saunders ynghylch cyrraedd plant y tu allan i ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg. Wrth gwrs, hoffem ei chyflwyno ledled Cymru, ond fel Llywodraeth ddatganoledig, mae'n rhaid inni weithio o fewn ein hadnoddau, ac rwy'n benderfynol y gwnawn ein gorau i liniaru effeithiau tlodi plant.

Yn fy natganiad diweddar ar Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf, gwneuthum ailddatgan ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar waith a all ymateb yn gyflym ac yn briodol i

their families. As the Government, we have a clear responsibility in this and have made available significant additional funding, through programmes such as Flying Start, to ensure that this happens. However, funding alone will not deliver. We need all partners to understand the importance of delivering high-quality services that can reach those children and their families that need them most.

It is also about ensuring that support is effective, that it reaches people as early as possible, that it is the most appropriate support and that it is sustained. It is only through effective interventions that we will lift people, and children in particular, out of poverty. These interventions will need to prioritise improving learning, health and employment outcomes, alongside addressing the lived experience of poverty.

Turning to the amendments, we recognise the significant challenge facing children and families that are in poverty. The level of child poverty in Wales is of course higher than we want to see, but there are comparable areas of England where the situation is worse. Based on a three-year average from 2008 to 2011, child poverty levels were found to be higher in five of the former Government office regions in England. However, we would not want to celebrate that in any way, and that is why we are focused on delivering for children in Wales who are in poverty—improving services, increasing investment and ensuring that children and their families get the support they need. It is for these reasons that we have tabled the amendments to points 2 and 3 of the motion.

We will be supporting amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. We fully recognise that Wales will be hit disproportionately compared with the rest of the UK by the welfare reforms proposed and being implemented by the UK Government. I cannot accept the glossing over of the effects of welfare reform. To take one element of that, let us look at the benefit cap, which is to be introduced in April 2013. Four hundred households in Cardiff will be affected, with 100 families losing over £100 a week.

anghenion plant a'u teuluoedd. Fel y Llywodraeth, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb clir yn hyn o beth ac rydym wedi sicrhau bod arian ychwanegol sylweddol ar gael, drwy raglenni megis Dechrau'n Deg, er mwyn sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd cyllid yn unig yn cyflawni hyn. Mae angen i'r holl bartneriaid ddeall pa mor bwysig yw darparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel a all gyrraedd y plant hynny a'u teuluoedd sydd eu hangen fwyaf.

Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod cymorth yn effeithiol, ei fod yn cyrraedd pobl mor gynnar ag y bo modd, mai'r cymorth mwyaf priodol ydyw a'i fod yn cael ei gynnal. Dim ond drwy ymyriadau effeithiol y byddwn yn codi pobl, a phlant yn arbennig, allan o dlodi. Bydd angen i'r ymyriadau hyn flaenoriaethu'r gwaith o wella canlyniadau dysgu, iechyd a chyflogaeth, ochr yn ochr â mynd i'r afael â'r profiad bywyd o dlodi.

Gan droi at y gwelliannau, cydnabyddwn yr her sylweddol sy'n wynebu plant a theuluoedd sydd mewn tldodi. Mae lefel tldodi plant yng Nghymru, wrth gwrs, yn uwch nag yr ydym am ei gweld, ond mae yna ardaloedd cymaradwy yn Lloegr lle mae'r sefyllfa yn waeth. Yn seiliedig ar gyfartaledd tair blynedd o 2008 i 2011, canfuwyd bod lefelau tldodi plant yn uwch mewn pump o hen ranbarthau swyddfeydd y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddem am ddatlu hynny mewn unrhyw ffordd, a dyna pam ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar gyflawni dros blant yng Nghymru sydd mewn tldodi—gwella gwasanaethau, cynyddu buddsoddiad a sicrhau bod plant a'u teuluoedd yn cael y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt. Am y rhesymau hyn rydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliannau i bwyntiau 2 a 3 o'r cynnig.

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Rydym yn cydnabod yn llawn y bydd y diwygiadau lles a gynigir ac a weithredir gan Lywodraeth y DU yn effeithio'n anghymesur ar Gymru o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU. Ni allaf dderbyn y modd y ceisiwyd bychanu effeithiau diwygio lles. I gymryd un elfen o hynny, gadewch inni edrych ar y cap budd-dal sydd i'w gyflwyno ym mis Ebrill 2013. Effeithir ar 400 o gartrefi yng Nghaerdydd a bydd 100 o deuluoedd yn colli dros £100 yr wythnos.

Ninety-five per cent have children, and 41% have five or more. Therefore, 380—that is 95%—of the 400 homes have children, with 155—that is 41% of those—having five or more. That is a minimum of 775 children in Cardiff alone—775 children in just one city in Wales. Indeed, that is a sobering thought. We might think that the figure of 6,000 more children in Wales being pushed into poverty might prove to be a conservative estimate.

I will take your intervention, Antoinette.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Are you suggesting that a family that receives £26,000 a year in benefits will not be able to manage its budget, even if it has five children?

**Gwenda Thomas:** I am concentrating on child poverty this afternoon, and it really does not seem to me that the UK Government is looking adequately at children within the family unit. I am talking about children—750 children in Cardiff.

We will also be supporting amendment 3 in the name of Aled Roberts. Tackling inequality through narrowing the gap between educational attainment and poverty remains a key objective of the Welsh Government. The Minister for Education and Skills has made it clear that this, along with improved literacy and numeracy levels, are his top priorities. The new pupil deprivation grant will provide £32.4 million in support this year, allowing schools, local authorities and education consortia to address the link between deprivation and educational attainment.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I am grateful to the Minister for giving me some of her time. I made the point to the Member for Cardiff North that, when the Labour UK Government left office in 2010, under your own targets we had record numbers of children in poverty. So, your previous actions, with the expansion of the welfare state—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This

Mae gan 95 y cant ohonynt blant, ac mae gan 41% ohonynt bump neu fwy. Felly, mae gan 380—hynny yw 95%—o'r 400 o gartrefi blant, ac mae gan 155—hynny yw 41% o'r rheini—bump neu fwy. Mae hynny'n cyfrif am 775 o blant yng Nghaerdydd yn unig—775 o blant mewn un ddinas yng Nghymru yn unig. Yn wir, mae hynny'n ddigon i'ch sobri. Efallai y byddwn yn meddwl bod y ffigur o 6,000 yn fwy o blant yng Nghymru sy'n cael eu gwthio i dlodi yn profi i fod yn amcangyfrif ceidwadol.

Derbyniaf eich ymyriad, Antoinette.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** A ydych yn awgrymu na fydd teulu sy'n derbyn £26,000 y flwyddyn mewn budd-daliadau yn gallu rheoli ei gyllideb, hyd yn oed os oes ganddo bump o blant?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Rwy'n canolbwyntio ar dlodi plant y prynhawn yma, ac nid yw'n ymddangos i mi mewn gwirionedd fod Llywodraeth y DU yn rhoi digon o sylw i blant o fewn yr uned deuluol. Rwy'n sôn am blant—750 o blant yng Nghaerdydd.

Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 yn enw Aled Roberts. Mae mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb drwy leihau'r bwlc rhwng cyrhaeddiad addysgol a thlodi yn parhau i fod yn un o amcanion allweddol Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau wedi ei gwneud yn glir mai hyn, ynghyd â lefelau llythrennedd a rhifedd gwell, yw ei brif flaenoriaethau. Bydd y grant amddifadedd disgyblion newydd yn darparu £32.4 miliwn mewn cymorth eleni, gan alluogi ysgolion, awdurdodau lleol a chonsortia addysg i fynd i'r afael â'r cysylltiad rhwng amddifadedd a chyrrhaeddiad addysgol.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am roi peth o'i hamser imi. Gwneuthum y pwynt i'r Aelod dros Ogledd Caerdydd, pan gollodd Llywodraeth Lafur y DU rym yn 2010, o dan eich targedau eich hunan fod gennym y nifer fwyaf erioed o blant mewn tlodi. Felly, mae eich camau gweithredu blaenorol, gydag ehangiad y wladwriaeth les—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae hon yn

is another speech. Quickly, please.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Your actions have failed, and you have not used any of your time to give us confidence that the new measures will address the issue.

**Gwenda Thomas:** That is no reason for your Government to make things worse.

It is particularly important that 100% of the deprivation grant will be delegated to schools, allowing for local and responsive approaches. We will also be supporting amendment 4 in the name of Aled Roberts. The housing White Paper, issued by the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage, clearly recognised the need to join up the agenda on housing, health and, in particular, homelessness—including the need for joint plans between local health boards and local authorities.

Finally, we will also be supporting amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. It is essential that funding through the pupil deprivation grant and the school effectiveness grant has the maximum impact on poverty, and that we have an effective monitoring system to measure impact. Officials from the Minister for Education and Skills' department will work with Estyn to consider how they can best support us in meeting that objective.

6.00 p.m.

I have heard mention of the publication of the children's commissioner's child poverty strategy. I have not had time to completely assimilate that report, but I will respond fully to it in due course.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. A final sentence, please, Deputy Minister.

**Gwenda Thomas:** The tabling of this motion has given us the opportunity to debate important cross-Government issues, and it is important that we do that regularly. Eradicating and ameliorating the effects of child poverty is, and will remain, a top priority for this Government.

**Suzy Davies:** I thank everyone for taking

araith arall. Yn gyflym, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae eich camau gweithredu wedi methu, ac nid ydych wedi defnyddio eich amser i'n darbwyllo y bydd y mesurau newydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Nid yw hynny'n rheswm i'ch Llywodraeth wneud pethau'n waeth.

Mae'n arbennig o bwysig bod 100% o'r grant amddifadedd yn cael ei ddirprwyo i ysgolion, gan ganiatáu ar gyfer dulliau lleol ac ymatebol. Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 4 yn enw Aled Roberts. Gwnaeth y Papur Gwyn ar dai, a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth, gydnabod yn amlwg yr angen i gydgyssylltu'r agenda ar dai, iechyd ac, yn benodol, ddigartrefedd— gan gynnwys yr angen am gynlluniau ar y cyd rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol.

Yn olaf, byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Mae'n hanfodol bod cyllid drwy'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion a'r grant effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn cael yr effaith fwyaf bosibl ar dlodi, a bod gennym system fonitro effeithiol i fesur effaith. Bydd swyddogion adran y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau yn gweithio gydag Estyn i ystyried sut y gallant ein cefnogi orau i gyrraedd y nod hwnnw.

Rwyf wedi clywed sôn am gyhoeddi strategaeth tlodi plant y comisiynydd plant. Nid wyf wedi cael amser i ystyried yr adroddiad hwnnw'n fanwl, ond byddaf yn ymateb yn llawn iddo maes o law.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Brawddeg olaf, os gwelwch yn dda, Ddirprwy Weinidog.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn wedi rhoi cyfle inni drafod materion trawslywodraethol pwysig, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwneud hynny yn rheolaidd. Mae dileu a lleddfu effeithiau tlodi plant yn parhau i fod yn flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth hon a bydd yn parhau felly.

**Suzy Davies:** Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb am

part in the debate today and the Deputy Minister for her response. Given that I only have a few minutes, I apologise in advance for not responding to you all. I will not be able to accommodate any interventions either, I am afraid.

The Welsh Conservatives tabled this wide-ranging debate topic to allow Members to comment on the many ways that Government activity or inactivity affects children. I am, therefore, pleased that the children's commissioner's comments have been raised in this debate, given that one of his roles is to put his boot behind our collective bottoms from time to time and to remind us that it is effective action that children need, not endless talking about it. Let us accept that child poverty is a complex and multi-layered problem, but just because it is difficult does not mean that it cannot be conquered.

While I accept that the Government, in its amendment, talks about significant investment—and the Government's warm commitment has also been mentioned here today—there is a question about whether significant investment is the same as effective investment. Regardless of your plans, Deputy Minister, it is true that Flying Start has missed half the children in poverty in Wales, so it has not been a wholly effective plan to date, even though I suspect that we all approve of the principle behind it. As both you and Julie Morgan mentioned, child poverty is about more than money. While it is not that I did not hear what Leanne Wood and Julie Morgan said about the UK Government policy and its consequences—

**Lynne Neagle** *rose*—

**Suzy Davies:** I am sorry, but I do not have the time to give way.

I am asking Leanne Wood and Julie Morgan to hear too, because no-one who has followed the work of Iain Duncan Smith over the last 10 years or so can seriously accuse him of wanting to keep people in poverty, especially children. What they will recognise is a Secretary of State for Work and Pensions

gymryd rhan yn y ddadl heddiw ac i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am ei hymateb. Gan nad oes gennyf ond ychydig funudau, ymddiheuraf ymlaen llaw am beidio ag ymateb i chi i gyd. Ni fyddaf yn gallu derbyn unrhyw ymyriadau ychwaith, mae arnaf ofn.

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi cyflwyno'r pwnc eang ei gwmpas hwn fel y gall Aelodau roi sylwadau ar y ffyrdd niferus y mae gweithgarwch y Llywodraeth neu ei hanweithgarwch yn effeithio ar blant. Felly rwy'n falch bod sylwadau'r comisiynydd plant wedi cael eu codi yn y ddadl hon, o gofio mai un o'i swyddogaethau yw dweud y drefn wrthym o bryd i'w gilydd a'n hatgoffa mai gweithredu effeithiol yw'r hyn sydd ei angen ar blant, nid siarad di-baid amdano. Gadewch inni dderbyn bod tlodi plant yn broblem gymhleth ac amlhaenog, ond nid yw'n golygu na ellir ei gorchfygu yn syml am ei bod yn anodd.

Er fy mod yn derbyn bod y Llywodraeth, yn ei gwelliant, yn sôn am fuddsoddiad sylweddol—a soniwyd am ymrwymiad gwresog y Llywodraeth yma heddiw—mae cwestiwn yn codi ynghylch a yw buddsoddiad sylweddol yr un fath â buddsoddiad effeithiol. Waeth beth yw eich cynlluniau, Ddirprwy Weinidog, mae'n wir bod Dechrau'n Deg wedi colli hanner y plant mewn tlodi yng Nghymru, felly nid yw wedi bod yn gynllun hollol effeithiol hyd yma, er fy mod yn amau bod pob un ohonom yn cymeradwyo'r egwyddor y tu ôl iddo. Fel y gwnaethoch chi a Julie Morgan ei grybwyll, mae a wnelo tlodi plant â mwy nag arian. Er nad wyf yn diystyru'r hyn a ddywedodd Leanne Wood a Julie Morgan am bolisi Llywodraeth y DU a'i ganlyniadau—

**Lynne Neagle** *a gododd*—

**Suzy Davies:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond nid oes gennyf yr amser i ildio.

Rwy'n gofyn i Leanne Wood a Julie Morgan glywed hefyd, oherwydd ni all neb sydd wedi dilyn gwaith Iain Duncan Smith dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf neu fwy ei gyhuddo o ddifrif o ddymuno cadw pobl mewn tlodi, yn enwedig plant. Yr hyn y byddant yn ei gydnabod yw Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros



who is facing up to something that we already know: a huge sea change is needed, particularly here in Wales. There is a need for a move away from the culture of unquestioned entitlement to a culture of personal enablement, where welfare properly supports and cares for those who need it in the long and short term, but is not undermined by those who see it as the means to opt out of personal responsibility for their families. Otherwise, some children will continue to see benefit-funded poverty as their lot in life, and I am unhappy with that. They will see aspiration as no more than a fancy word and the whole idea of an ability to determine their own future as something just for other people.

Yes, it will be more difficult for some to genuinely burst through difficult personal circumstances, but anyone who met the carers here this morning will know that it can be done. We, as politicians, should not countenance any way forward that encourages people to think that they have one predetermined future. I would rather take inspiration from the 50% of people who came off the work experience programme and jobseeker's allowance recently and went back into work.

One step in the right direction on child poverty would be to ditch the low bar of expectation that only a few are asked to jump. We need to face up immediately to the fact that, according to Estyn, very few secondary schools support more able and talented people from disadvantaged areas to overcome barriers to learning, which is a failure. Of course, where children can succeed, they should not be afraid to succeed and they should certainly not be discouraged from succeeding.

This debate calls on the Welsh Government to meet the needs of children and that is because Wales needs its children. Wales needs its children to aspire to a world of hard work and not hard luck.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly

Waith a Phensiynau sy'n wynebu rhywbeth rydym eisoes yn ei wybod: mae angen newid mawr pendant, yn enwedig yma yng Nghymru. Mae angen symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth y diwylliant o hawl ddi-gwestiwn at ddiwylliant o alluogi personol, lle mae lles yn cefnogi ac yn gofalu'n briodol am y rhai sydd ei angen yn yr hirdymor a'r byrdymor, ond nad yw'n cael ei danseilio gan y rhai sy'n ei ystyried yn ffordd o beidio â derbyn cyfrifoldeb personol am eu teuluoedd. Fel arall, bydd rhai plant yn parhau i weld tlodi a ariennir gan fudd-daliadau fel eu tynged hwy mewn bywyd, ac rwy'n anfodlon ar hynny. Byddant yn gweld dyhead fel dim byd amgenach na gair ffansi a'r holl syniad o allu penderfynu ar eu dyfodol eu hunain fel rhywbeth ar gyfer pobl eraill yn unig.

Bydd, bydd yn fwy anodd i rai ohonynt dorri'n wirioneddol drwy amgylchiadau personol anodd, ond bydd unrhyw un a wnaeth gyfarfod â'r gofaluwr yma y bore yma yn gwybod y gellir ei wneud. Ni ddylem ni, fel gwleidyddion, oddef unrhyw ffordd ymlaen sy'n annog pobl i feddwl bod ganddynt un dyfodol a bennwyd ymlaen llaw. Byddai'n well gennyf gymryd ysbrydoliaeth oddi wrth y 50% o bobl a oedd wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r rhaglen profiad gwaith a lwfans ceisio gwaith yn ddiweddar ac a aeth yn ôl i weithio.

Un cam i'r cyfeiriad cywir mewn perthynas â thlodi plant fyddai cael gwared ar y bar isel o ddisgwyliadau y gofynnir i ychydig o blant yn unig neidio drosto. Mae angen inni wynebu'r ffaith, yn ôl Estyn, mai ychydig iawn o ysgolion uwchradd sy'n cefnogi disgyblion mwy galluog a thalentog o ardaloedd difreintiedig i oresgyn rhwystrau i ddysgu, sydd yn fethiant. Wrth gwrs, lle y gall plant llwyddo, ni ddylent fod ag ofn llwyddo ac yn sicr ni ddylent gael eu hatal rhag llwyddo.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ddiwallu anghenion plant a hynny am fod angen ei phlant ar Gymru. Mae ar Gymru angen i'w phlant ddyheu am fyd o waith caled ac nid caledi.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is that the motion be agreed without amendment. Are there any objections? I see

gohiriaf bob pleidlais ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio. that there are, so I postpone all voting on this item until voting time.

Voting time now follows. We will proceed unless there are three Members who wish for the bell to be rung. I see that there are not. Bydd y cyfnod pleidleisio yn dilyn yn awr. Byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen oni bai bod tri Aelod yn dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu. Gwelaf nad oes.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

### **Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time**

*Cynnig NDM5068: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.  
Motion NDM5068: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren  
Ramsay, Nick  
Sandbach, Antoinette

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Simon  
Watson, Joyce  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM5068: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
Amendment 1 to NDM5068: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Millar, Darren  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Ramsay, Nick  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM5068: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.  
Amendment 2 to NDM5068: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Simon  
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Ramsay, Nick  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette

Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM5068: O blaid 28, Ymatal 17, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amendment 3 to NDM5068: For 28, Abstain 17, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:

The following Members abstained:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Millar, Darren  
Ramsay, Nick  
Sandbach, Antoinette  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM5068: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4 to NDM5068: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Ramsay, Nick  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Simon  
Watson, Joyce  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM5068: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5 to NDM5068: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Rees, David  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sandbach, Antoinette  
 Skates, Kenneth  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM5068 fel y'i diwygiwyd:*

*Motion NDM5068 as amended:*

*Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*The National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn cydnabod cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel yn cael eu darparu i ddiwallu anghenion amrywiol holl blant Cymru.*

*1. Recognises the responsibility of the Welsh Government in ensuring the provision of high-quality services that meet the diverse needs of all children in Wales.*

*2. Yn nodi'r flaenoriaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei rhoi i hawliau plant a phobl ifanc a'r buddsoddiad sylweddol y mae wedi ei wneud er mwyn rhoi'r dechrau gorau posibl i blant, er enghraifft ehangu Dechrau'n Deg, a'i chymorth i helpu plant i gyflawni eu potensial.*

*2. Notes the priority given by the Welsh Government to the rights of children and young people and its significant investment to give children the best start in life, such as the expansion of Flying Start, and its support for children to achieve their potential.*

- |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>3. <i>Yn cydnabod yr effaith niweidiol y mae diwygiadau lles Llywodraeth y DU yn ei chael ar blant sydd eisoes yn byw mewn tlodi yng Nghymru.</i></p> <p>4. <i>Yn croesawu cyflwyno'r Grant Amddifadedd Disgyblion yng Nghymru.</i></p> <p>5. <i>Yn credu y bydd ffocws newydd ar wella tai ac iechyd y cyhoedd mewn ardaloedd o amddifadedd yn lleihau anghydraddoldebau iechyd rhwng plant yng Nghymru a phlant yng ngweddill y DU.</i></p> <p>6. <i>Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i wneud Estyn yn gyfrifol am fonitro a gwerthuso'r Grant Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion a'r Grant Amddifadedd Disgyblion yn rheolaidd, er mwyn sicrhau bod ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol yn eu defnyddio yn y ffordd orau bosibl i leddfu effeithiau tlodi ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol plant.</i></p> | <p>3. <i>Recognises the adverse impact of the UK Government's welfare reforms on children already living in poverty in Wales.</i></p> <p>4. <i>Welcomes the introduction of the Pupil Deprivation Grant in Wales.</i></p> <p>5. <i>Believes that renewed focus on improving housing and public health in deprived areas will reduce inequalities in health between children in Wales and the rest of the UK.</i></p> <p>6. <i>Calls on the Welsh Government to remit Estyn to monitor and regularly evaluate the School Effectiveness Grant and Pupil Deprivation Grant to ensure that schools and local authorities use them to maximum effect to ameliorate the effects of poverty on children's educational attainment.</i></p> |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

*Cynnig NDM5068 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.*

*Motion NDM5068 as amended: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Simon  
Watson, Joyce  
Whittle, Lindsay

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Ramsay, Nick  
Roberts, Aled  
Sandbach, Antoinette

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM5068 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM5068 as amended agreed.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Gwella Gofal Dementia—Datblygu Gwasanaethau Di-dor Improving Dementia Care—Developing Seamless Services**

**Jenny Rathbone:** The increasing incidence of dementia throughout our communities requires a critical rethink of services as well as attitudes. I am pleased to allow one-minute contributions by Rebecca Evans, Darren Millar and Lindsay Whittle and a two-minute contribution by Eluned Parrott, as chair of the cross-party group on dementia. I am grateful to Professor Bayer, head of the memory team for Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board, the multi-disciplinary medical rehabilitation unit at Cardiff Royal Infirmary, the Alzheimer's Society, Age Cymru and the Older People's Commissioner for Wales for sharing their work on this subject.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Mae'r cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o ddementia ar hyd a lled ein cymunedau yn golygu bod angen mynd ati o ddifrif i ailystyried gwasanaethau yn ogystal ag agweddau. Mae'n bleser gennyf ganiatáu cyfraniadau munud o hyd gan Rebecca Evans, Darren Millar a Lindsay Whittle a chyfraniad dwy funud gan Eluned Parrott, fel cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar ddementia. Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Athro Bayer, pennaeth tîm y cof ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro, yr uned adsefydlu meddygol aml-ddisgyblaethol yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd, Cymdeithas Clefyd Alzheimer, Age Cymru a Chomisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru am rannu eu gwaith ar y pwnc hwn.

I start with Mrs Jones—not her real name. She has moved from one care home to an acute hospital, then to another care home, and then swiftly back to another hospital, all in the space of four months. That is four moves in four months. This lady's main problem is dementia. Possible explanations for all these disruptive moves include, first, that the residential homes where she lived wanted to use some minor medical matter to get rid of her—I am not saying that it is a common problem, but with people running care homes for a profit it is bound to happen occasionally. Secondly, there are not enough nursing homes with the skills to care for people with dementia, so the minute a bed is released, it is occupied by somebody else. Thirdly, there are not enough services in the community tailored to support the increasing number of people with dementia and their families—the subject of this debate. In Mrs Jones's case, it is probably a combination of all three problems. At any one time, a quarter of NHS hospital beds are occupied by people over 65 with dementia. Are you surprised?

Dechreuaf gyda Mrs Jones—nid ei henw go iawn. Mae hi wedi symud o un cartref gofal i ysbyty aciwt, yna i gartref gofal arall, ac yna yn gyflym yn ôl i ysbyty arall, a hynny o fewn cyfnod o bedwar mis. Mae wedi symud bedair gwaith mewn pedwar mis. Prif broblem y wraig hon yw dementia. Ymhlith yr esboniadau posibl dros yr achosion aflonyddgar hyn o symud, yn gyntaf, roedd y ffaith bod y cartrefi preswyl lle trigai am ddefnyddio rhyw fân fater meddygol i gael gwared arni—nid wyf yn honni bod y broblem hon yn gyffredin, ond gyda phobl yn rhedeg cartrefi gofal er mwyn gwneud elw, mae'n siŵr o ddigwydd o bryd i'w gilydd. Yn ail, nid oes digon o gartrefi nyrsio â'r sgiliau i ofalu am bobl â dementia, felly cyn gynted ag y daw gwely yn rhydd, daw rhywun i'w lenwi. Yn drydydd, nid oes digon o wasanaethau yn y gymuned wedi'u teilwra i roi cymorth i'r nifer gynyddol o bobl â dementia a'u teuluoedd—sef testun y ddadl hon. Yn achos Mrs Jones, fwy na thebyg mai cyfuniad o'r tair problem a gafwyd. Ar unrhyw un adeg, mae chwarter gwelyau



You should not be; one third of us will die with dementia.

What is dementia? It is a brain disease. It starts with forgetfulness and memory problems, and later spreads to affect most parts of the brain. It can start as early as at 40 years of age; Rebecca is going to talk about early onset dementia. However, it is much more common in older people. In people over 65, at least one in 15 will have dementia, and by the age of 80, it is one in five. We all know at least one of the 40,000 people in Wales with dementia. The most common cause is Alzheimer's disease. Publicity campaigns and celebrity endorsements have raised awareness of Alzheimer's, so that most people have now heard of it; in fact, among the over-55s, it is the most feared disease, over and above cancer.

Diagnosis of dementia has stigma attached to it. A well-known former British Prime Minister has not done what Ronnie Reagan did, which was to tell everybody. When he wrote an open letter to the people of the United States in 1994, he instantly made dementia respectable there. That is why dementia is now the fourth most common cause of death in the US. However, in the UK, dementia is almost never stated as the cause of death.

The UK Department of Health is currently running a £3.5 million television campaign to raise the profile of dementia. It is hard-hitting and thought-provoking. Even if you do not see it, news travels, and it will undoubtedly drive up awareness and demand for services in Wales and England. That is good, because neither England nor Wales is good enough at diagnosis at the moment.

The Alzheimer's Society's work on mapping the dementia gap tells us that, in 2011, 37% of people with dementia in Wales and 41% of

ysbytai'r GIG yn cael eu defnyddio gan bobl dros 65 oed â dementia. A yw hynny'n eich synnu? Ni ddylai wneud; bydd traean ohonom yn marw â dementia.

Beth yw dementia? Clefyd sy'n effeithio ar yr ymennydd ydyw. I ddechrau daw'r claf yn anghofus a chaiff broblemau â'i gof, bydd yn lledaenu i effeithio ar y rhan fwyaf o'r ymennydd. Gall ddechrau mor gynnar â 40 mlwydd oed; mae Rebecca yn mynd i sôn am ddementia cynnar. Fodd bynnag, mae'n llawer mwy cyffredin ymhlith pobl hŷn. Mewn pobl dros 65 oed, bydd o leiaf un o bob 15 yn cael dementia, ac erbyn 80 oed, bydd yn un o bob pump. Gŵyr pob un ohonom am o leiaf un o'r 40,000 o bobl yng Nghymru sydd â dementia. Yr achos mwyaf cyffredin yw clefyd Alzheimer. Mae ymgyrchoedd cyhoeddusrwydd a'r defnydd o bobl enwog i dynnu sylw at y mater wedi codi ymwybyddiaeth o Alzheimer's, fel bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl wedi clywed amdano erbyn hyn; yn wir, ymhlith pobl dros 55 oed, hwn yw'r clefyd a gaiff ei ofni fwyaf, yn fwy na chanser hyd yn oed.

Mae stigma ynghlwm wrth ddiagnosis o ddementia. Ni wnaeth un o gyn Brif Weinidogion adnabyddus Prydain wneud yr hyn a wnaeth Ronnie Reagan, sef dweud wrth bawb. Pan ysgrifennodd lythyr agored at bobl yr Unol Daleithiau yn 1994, llwyddodd i ennyn parch ar unwaith at ddementia yno. Dyna pam mai dementia erbyn hyn yw'r pedwerydd achos mwyaf cyffredin o farwolaeth yn yr UD. Fodd bynnag, yn y DU, ni chaiff dementia bron byth ei nodi fel achos marwolaeth.

Mae Adran Iechyd y DU ar hyn o bryd yn cynnal ymgyrch deledu gwerth £3.5 miliwn i godi proffil dementia. Mae'n gignoeth ac yn ysgogi'r meddwl. Hyd yn oed os na welwch yr ymgyrch, bydd sôn amdani, a bydd yn sicr yn gwella ymwybyddiaeth ac yn cynyddu'r galw am wasanaethau yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae hynny'n beth da, am nad yw'r broses o wneud diagnosis o ddementia yn ddigon da yng Nghymru nac yn Lloegr ar hyn o bryd.

Mae gwaith Cymdeithas Clefyd Alzheimer ar fapio'r bwlch dementia yn dangos, yn 2011, bod 37% o'r bobl â dementia yng Nghymru a

those with dementia in England had been diagnosed. However, that compares with 62% in Northern Ireland and 65% in Scotland. All but two health boards in Wales have improved their rates since 2010, but there is considerable variation between them—from 32% in Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board to 43% in Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board and Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board.

Driving up rates of identification and assessment is important, because the earlier that assessment happens, the earlier that treatment and advice can be given. It also allows people to plan ahead, perhaps moving house to be near their families or appointing someone that they trust with power of attorney. Crucially, it allows patients to be involved in decisions about their future care when they are still able to understand what is going on. Over and above that, there is some evidence that people diagnosed earlier with mild forms of dementia can be kept stable for longer and, perhaps, the rate of deterioration can be slowed down. This makes sense financially, as an early diagnosis, followed by information and support, reduces long-term care costs by almost 30%.

Some general practitioners used to wonder ‘What is the point of diagnosing dementia—it just worries people, and there is nothing that we can do about it anyway’. However, nearly all GPs have moved on from this thinking. Aided by quality outcomes framework incentives, they all keep dementia registers. If you are worried about your memory, they can perform a memory test, as well as physical tests and blood tests. If there are issues or concerns, you could then be referred to your local memory team.

However, demand is rapidly outstripping supply. Five years ago, the memory clinic at University Hospital Llandough, headed by Professor Antony Bayer, had 500 referrals a year; now, that has tripled to 1,500 referrals a year with fewer staff. With only 2,200 clinic slots, there is little room for follow-up appointments. The waiting list is already 16

41% o’r rheini â dementia yn Lloegr wedi cael diagnosis. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny’n cymharu â 62% yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a 65% yn yr Alban. Mae pob un ond dau o’r byrddau iechyd yng Nghymru wedi gwella eu cyfraddau ers 2010, ond mae amrywiaeth sylweddol rhyngddynt—o 32% ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr i 43% ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a’r Fro.

Mae gwella cyfraddau adnabod ac asesu yn bwysig, oherwydd po gynharaf y cynhelir yr asesiad hwnnw, y cynharaf y gellir rhoi triniaeth a chyngor. Mae hefyd yn galluogi pobl i gynllunio ymlaen llaw, gan efallai symud tŷ i fod yn agos i’w teuluoedd neu roi pŵer atwrnai i rywun y maent yn ymddiried ynddynt. Yn hanfodol, mae’n caniatáu i gleifion gymryd rhan yn y penderfyniadau am eu gofal yn y dyfodol tra byddant yn dal i allu deall beth sy’n digwydd. Yn anad dim, ceir rhywfaint o dystiolaeth y gellir cadw pobl a gaiff ddiagnosis cynharach o ffurfiau ysgafn ar ddementia yn sefydlog am gyfnod hwy ac, o bosibl, y gellir arafu cyfradd y dirywiad. Mae hyn yn gwneud synnwyr yn ariannol, gan fod diagnosis cynnar, wedi’i ddilyn gan wybodaeth a chefnogaeth, yn lleihau costau gofal hirdymor bron i 30%.

Arferai rhai meddygon teulu arddel y farn nad oes pwynt gwneud diagnosis o ddementia—mae’n gwneud i bobl bryderu, ac nid oes unrhyw beth y gallwn ei wneud am y cyflwr beth bynnag. Fodd bynnag, mae bron pob meddyg teulu wedi newid ei ffordd o feddwl. Gyda chymorth cymhellion y fframwaith canlyniadau ansawdd, mae pob un ohonynt yn cadw cofrestrau dementia. Os ydych yn poeni am eich cof, gallant gynnal prawf cof, yn ogystal â phrofion corfforol a phrofion gwaed. Os oes problemau neu bryderon, gellid wedyn eich atgyfeirio at eich tîm cof lleol.

Fodd bynnag, mae’r galw yn prysur fynd yn uwch na’r cyflenwad. Bum mlynedd yn ôl, roedd 500 o gleifion y flwyddyn yn cael eu hatgyfeirio i’r clinig cof yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Llandochau, o dan arweiniad yr Athro Antony Bayer; mae hynny bellach wedi treblu i 1,500 o atgyfeiriadau y flwyddyn gyda llai o staff. Gyda dim ond 2,200 o

weeks, and it is getting worse. However, in England, some waiting lists are as long as 9 months.

In January, 'Growing old my way', a joint review by the Care and Social Services Inspectorate for Wales and Healthcare Inspectorate Wales, found that the variation, size and structure of these memory clinics leads to inequality in services across Wales. It recommended the development of nationwide services for early diagnosis and intervention in dementia. As Professor Bayer points out, many people can live quite happily with their undiagnosed dementia at home, hopefully with some support from family or friends. With the right services to actively help people maintain their skills, capabilities and relationships. That could be extended to most people with dementia.

6.15 p.m.

However, people with dementia often go undiagnosed or without care and support until they hit crisis point and they get admitted to hospital. That means that their care becomes hugely expensive, fragmented and prolonged. The all-party parliamentary group on dementia last year said that the cost of dementia in the UK has reached £20 billion. To free up £1 billion extra for improving community-based services for dementia, we would need to make a 10% cut in the number of NHS beds. This is perfectly possible when we consider that, at any time, up to a quarter of NHS hospital beds are occupied by people over 65 with dementia, yet only one in 20 hospitals have mandatory training in dementia awareness and only one third of NHS staff said they had sufficient knowledge of dementia.

Fortunately, an ex-carer has developed the Butterfly scheme, which is being adopted in many hospitals across England and Wales, including in Cardiff, Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire. It is a low-cost scheme that prompts staff to offer a positive and

slotiau clinig, nid oes fawr dim cyfle i gynnal apwyntiadau dilynol. Mae'r rhestr aros eisoes yn 16 wythnos, ac mae'n gwaethygu. Fodd bynnag, yn Lloegr, mae rhai rhestrau aros gyhyd â 9 mis.

Ym mis Ionawr, canfu 'Heneiddio fel y mynnaf', sef adolygiad ar y cyd gan Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ac Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru, fod amrywiad, maint a strwythur y clinigau cof hyn yn arwain at anghydraddoldeb mewn gwasanaethau ledled Cymru. Argymhellodd y dylid datblygu gwasanaethau cenedlaethol ar gyfer diagnosis ac ymyrraeth gynnar mewn achosion o ddementia. Fel y noda'r Athro Bayer, gall llawer o bobl fyw yn ddigon hapus gartref heb gael diagnosis o'u dementia, gyda rhywfaint o gymorth, gobeithio, gan deulu neu ffrindiau. Gyda'r gwasanaethau cywir i fynd ati i helpu pobl i gynnal eu sgiliau, eu galluoedd a'u cydberthnasau. Gellid ehangu hynny i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl â dementia.

Fodd bynnag, yn aml nid yw pobl â dementia yn cael diagnosis neu nid ydynt yn cael gofal a chymorth hyd nes y bydd wedi dod yn argyfwng a chânt eu derbyn i'r ysbyty. Mae hynny'n golygu bod eu gofal yn dod yn hynod o ddud, yn dameidiog a bod ei angen am gyfnod hir. Dywedodd y grŵp hollbleidiol seneddol ar ddementia y llynedd bod cost dementia yn y DU wedi cyrraedd £20 biliwn. Er mwyn rhyddhau £1 biliwn ychwanegol i wella gwasanaethau dementia yn y gymuned, byddai angen inni gwtogi'r nifer o welyau yn y GIG 10%. Mae hyn yn gwbl bosibl o ystyried, ar unrhyw adeg, bod hyd at chwarter gwelyau ysbytai'r GIG yn cael eu defnyddio gan bobl dros 65 oed â dementia, ac eto dim ond un o bob 20 ysbyty sy'n cynnal hyfforddiant gorfodol mewn ymwybyddiaeth o ddementia a dim ond traean o staff y GIG a ddywedodd eu bod yn meddu ar wybodaeth ddigonol am ddementia.

Yn ffodus, mae cyn ofalwr wedi datblygu cynllun 'Pili-pala', sy'n cael ei fabwysiadu mewn llawer o ysbytai ledled Cymru a Lloegr, gan gynnwys yng Nghaerdydd, Sir Gaerfyrddin a Sir Benfro. Mae'n gynllun cost isel sy'n annog staff i gynnig ymateb

appropriate response to hospitals patients. However, it will not get Mrs Jones out of hospital. People with dementia stay in hospital long after their medical needs have been addressed, and we have all heard about the delayed assessments, discharges and turf wars between health and social services. Hospital social workers are a dying species and often referrals are not made until the patient is medically fit. Also, services do not talk to each other.

Last year, only 6% of hospitals across the UK had a care pathway in place, although 44% are developing one. Cardiff and the Vale University Local Health Board is close to agreeing its dementia pathway, but it has been a long time in the making. If people were supported to leave hospital a week earlier than they currently do, savings of hundreds of millions of pounds could pay for community services to keep them out of hospital in the first place. For example, we now have a multidisciplinary community resource team operating a virtual ward across Cardiff and the Vale, with health, social care and the third sector offering up to six to eight weeks of support to get people out of hospital quicker and to help them get back on their feet. I would like to see that service extended to keep people like Mrs Jones out of hospital and to treat her within familiar surroundings. Ten sessions of occupational therapy over five weeks improves the functioning of people with dementia for at least three months and makes life easier for carers. Postponing people's entry into residential care by just one year through adapting their homes with telecare systems et cetera, to keep them safe, saves £28,000 per person. It is worth investing in early preventative community services.

I acknowledge what the Welsh Government has already achieved with the launch last year of its dementia helpline and website, the inclusion of people with dementia in the book prescription scheme and the dementia information packs available through the Alzheimer's Society. I look forward to hearing from the Minister what improvements we are making to ensure that

cadarnhaol a phriodol i gleifion ysbyty. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yn arwain at ryddhau Mrs Jones o'r ysbyty. Mae pobl â dementia yn aros yn yr ysbyty am gyfnod hir ar ôl delio â'u hanghenion meddygol, ac mae pob un ohonom wedi clywed am yr oedi cyn cynnal asesiadau a rhyddhau cleifion a'r rhyfeloedd tiriogaeth rhwng iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae gweithwyr cymdeithasol mewn ysbytai yn mynd yn fwy prin ac yn aml ni chaiff atgyfeiriadau eu gwneud hyd nes y bydd y claf yn feddygol iach. Hefyd, nid yw gwasanaethau yn siarad â'i gilydd.

Y llynedd, dim ond 6% o ysbytai ledled y DU oedd â llwybr gofal ar waith, er bod 44% wrthi'n datblygu llwybr o'r fath. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro yn agos at gytuno ar ei llwybr dementia, ond bu hir aros amdano. Pe câi pobl gymorth i adael yr ysbyty wythnos yn gynharach na'r adeg y maent yn gadael ar hyn o bryd, gallai'r arbedion o filiynau o bunnoedd dalu am wasanaethau cymunedol i'w cadw allan o'r ysbyty yn y lle cyntaf. Er enghraifft, mae tîm adnoddau cymunedol amlddisgyblaethol bellach yn gweithredu ward rithwir ar draws Caerdydd a'r Fro, gydag iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a'r trydydd sector yn cynnig hyd at chwech i wyth wythnos o gymorth i gael pobl allan o'r ysbyty yn gynt ac i'w helpu i adsefydlu. Hoffwn weld y gwasanaeth hwnnw yn cael ei ymestyn er mwyn cadw pobl fel Mrs Jones allan o'r ysbyty a'i thrin o fewn amgylchedd cyfarwydd. Mae deg sesiwn o therapi galwedigaethol dros bum wythnos yn gwella gweithrediad pobl â dementia am o leiaf dri mis ac yn gwneud bywyd yn haws i ofalwyr. Mae gohirio mynediad pobl i ofal preswyl o ddim ond blwyddyn drwy addasu eu cartrefi â systemau teleofal ac ati, i'w cadw'n ddiogel, yn arbed £28,000 y person. Mae'n werth buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cymunedol ataliol cynnar.

Rwy'n cydnabod yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru eisoes wedi'i gyflawni drwy lansio ei llinell gymorth a'i gwefan dementia y llynedd, drwy gynnwys pobl â dementia yn y cynllun presgripsiwn llyfrau a thrwy'r pecynnau gwybodaeth am ddementia sydd ar gael drwy Gymdeithas Alzheimer. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed gan y Gweinidog pa welliannau rydym yn eu gwneud i sicrhau ein

we are keeping many more people out of hospital.

**Rebecca Evans:** I would like to use this opportunity to highlight early-onset dementia and seek improved diagnosis and more appropriate services and support. We have heard today how the earlier a diagnosis is made, the better the outcome for the individual, but there is a real need for greater awareness of early-onset dementia in primary health care, where the condition is often misdiagnosed as depression or stress, and some people can wait a decade for diagnosis. Younger people with dementia often find that they are lost between services and when services are open to them, they may not always be appropriate to their needs. Younger people with dementia are more likely to be in work at the time of diagnosis, more likely to have dependent children or family, be physically fit and have heavy financial commitments such as a mortgage, and are more likely to have a rare form of dementia. The use of elderly mentally infirm wards is not appropriate, and nursing homes are not necessarily appropriate settings for the provision of care, either. So, I take this opportunity to urge the Minister to ensure that all this is taken into account when a care package for a younger person with dementia is developed.

**Darren Millar:** I want to congratulate Jenny on bringing forward an interesting and important debate that we need to be having at this time. I could not agree more that we need to ensure that there is early diagnosis and that we need to do more to support people to be able to stay in their homes and with their families for as long as possible, given the potential costs of residential and hospital care. However, there is one issue that we need to grapple with, and that is the fact that a care home has to be registered separately for dementia purposes. I think that what we need to do is to mainstream dementia and support for dementia in all of our care homes, given the increasing prevalence of it in our society. Minister, will you give some consideration to that in your response today?

**Lindsay Whittle:** I thank Jenny Rathbone for my minute. I would like to see this debate making it quite clear that the Welsh

bod yn cadw llawer mwy o bobl allan o'r ysbyty.

**Rebecca Evans:** Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at ddementia cynnar a cheisio anelu at well diagnosis a gwasanaethau a chymorth mwy priodol. Rydym wedi clywed heddiw po gynharaf y gwneir diagnosis, y gorau yw'r canlyniad i'r unigolyn, ond mae gwir angen gwell ymwybyddiaeth o ddementia cynnar ym maes gofal iechyd sylfaenol, lle caiff y cyflwr yn aml ei gamddiagnosis fel iselder neu straen, a gall rhai pobl aros degawd i gael diagnosis. Mae pobl iau sydd â dementia yn aml yn canfod eu bod yn cael eu colli rhwng gwasanaethau a phan fydd gwasanaethau ar gael iddynt, efallai na fyddant bob amser yn briodol i'w hanghenion. Mae pobl iau sydd â dementia yn fwy tebygol o fod mewn gwaith adeg y diagnosis, yn fwy tebygol o fod â phlant neu deulu dibynnol, o fod yn gorfforol heini ac o fod ag ymrwymadau ariannol sylweddol fel morgais, ac mae'n fwy tebygol y bydd ganddynt fath prin o ddementia. Nid yw defnyddio wardiau i henoed eiddil eu meddwl yn briodol, ac nid yw cartrefi nyrsio o reidrwydd yn lleoliadau priodol ar gyfer darparu gofal ychwaith. Felly, rwy'n achub ar y cyfle hwn i annog y Gweinidog i sicrhau y caiff hyn oll ei ystyried wrth ddatblygu pecyn gofal i berson iau â dementia.

**Darren Millar:** Hoffwn longyfarch Jenny ar gyflwyno dadl ddiddorol a phwysig y mae angen inni ei chael ar hyn o bryd. Rwy'n cytuno'n llwyr bod angen inni sicrhau diagnosis cynnar a bod angen inni wneud mwy i helpu pobl i allu aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain a chyda'u teuluoedd am gyhyd ag y bo modd, o ystyried costau posibl gofal preswyl a gofal ysbyty. Fodd bynnag, mae un mater y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael ag ef, sef y ffaith bod yn rhaid i gartrefi gofal gael eu cofrestru ar wahân at ddibenion dementia. Credaf fod angen inni brif-ffrydio dementia a chymorth i ddementia ymhob un o'n cartrefi gofal, o gofio'r cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o fewn ein cymdeithas. Weinidog, a wnewch chi roi rhywfaint o ystyriaeth i hynny yn eich ymateb heddiw?

**Lindsay Whittle:** Diolch i Jenny Rathbone am fy munud. Hoffwn weld y ddadl hon yn ei gwneud yn gwbl glir bod Llywodraeth

Government acknowledges and supports the work done by occupational therapists, who provide an essential and, indeed, cost-effective service by delaying the admission into residential care of people suffering from dementia and their often stressed family and carers.

I fully support what Rebecca Evans said: adequate training for workers in residential homes should be given so that they can recognise the onset of dementia earlier among older people. I also fully support the principle of dementia-friendly towns and welcome the planning application for the dementia-orientated development in my region, which is the first of its kind in Wales.

**Eluned Parrott:** I, too, would like to thank Jenny Rathbone for bringing forward this important debate today and thank all of the Members who contributed. I hope that you will join the cross-party group and continue these discussions further.

Dementia is a subject that is very close to my heart. On boxing day last year, I lost my grandmother to dementia and, a few months later, I lost my grandfather as well. Our experience as a family of dealing with the challenges that that presented led me to want to establish the cross-party group and to investigate these things more fully. My grandmother was an incredibly strong, capable and clever woman. She was formidable. I was terrified of her. I cared more for her opinion than anyone else's. However, dementia took that away from us; it stole her personality. The lack of dignity and the lack of compassion that she sometimes faced in the care she received was not something that we should face in a civilised society.

We need to have more understanding in our communities, so I welcome the development that Lindsay mentioned. We need to have more compassion in our care, and we will get that through better training and awareness, as well as a more joined-up approach between different specialists, because, of course, old age does not travel alone and neither does dementia. The interrelationship between

Cymru yn cydnabod ac yn cefnogi'r gwaith a wneir gan therapyddion galwedigaethol, sy'n darparu gwasanaeth hanfodol, ac, yn wir, gost-ffeithiol drwy ohirio'r adeg y caiff pobl sy'n dioddef o ddementia eu hanfon i ofal preswyl a'u teulu a'u gofalwyr sy'n aml o dan straen.

Rwy'n llwyr gefnogi'r hyn a ddywedodd Rebecca Evans: dylid rhoi hyfforddiant digonol i weithwyr mewn cartrefi preswyl er mwyn iddynt allu adnabod arwyddion dementia yn gynharach ymhlith pobl hŷn. Rwyf hefyd yn llwyr gefnogi'r egwyddor o drefi sy'n ystyriol o ddementia ac yn croesawu'r cais cynllunio ar gyfer datblygiad wedi'i anelu at bobl â dementia yn fy rhanbarth i, sef y cyntaf o'i fath yng Nghymru.

**Eluned Parrott:** Hoffwn innau hefyd ddiolch i Jenny Rathbone am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon heddiw a diolch i bob Aelod a gyfrannodd. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ymuno â'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ac yn parhau ymhellach â'r trafodaethau hyn.

Mae dementia yn bwnc sy'n agos iawn at fy nghalon. Ar ddydd Gŵyl San Steffan y llynedd, bu farw fy nain o ddementia ac, ychydig fisoedd yn ddiweddarach, collais fy nhaid hefyd. Ein profiad fel teulu o ymdrin â'r heriau cysylltiedig a sbardunodd fy awydd i sefydlu'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ac i ymchwilio i'r materion hyn yn fanylach. Roedd fy nain yn wraig hynod o gryf, galluog a chlyfar. Roedd yn eithriadol. Roeddwn yn ei hofni. Roedd ei barn hi yn bwysicach na barn unrhyw un arall imi. Fodd bynnag, aeth dementia â hynny oddi wrthym; cipiodd ei phersonoliaeth. Nid oedd y diffyg urddas a'r diffyg tosturi tuag ati weithiau yn y gofal a dderbyniodd yn rhywbeth y dylem ei wynebu mewn cymdeithas wâr.

Mae angen inni gael mwy o ddealltwriaeth yn ein cymunedau, felly croesawaf y datblygiad y soniodd Lindsay amdano. Mae angen inni gael mwy o dosturi yn ein gofal, a daw hynny drwy well hyfforddiant ac ymwybyddiaeth, yn ogystal â dull mwy cydgysylltiedig o weithredu rhwng gwahanol arbenigwyr, oherwydd, wrth gwrs, dim ond un rhan o'r daith yw henaint, felly hefyd ddementia. Gall

different health conditions and the way in which they affect dementia can be very profound, but perhaps even more critically, there need to be better systems for early diagnosis. It is a massive frustration for families. My grandmother hid her condition from us, and my aunt is a mental health nurse who specialises in the care of the elderly. She hid it from us and we could not get the medical professionals to listen to us when we raised issues with them. It was only when she finally decided that she wanted to admit that she had a problem that we were able to get help for her, by which time it was too late for the fantastic drug treatments that are available to be of use to her.

So, those are some issues that I hope the Minister will consider. As our population ages, because of the wonderful work of our medical professionals in keeping us alive for longer, we have to recognise that dementia will present an increasing challenge for society. We need to plan now to ensure that we rise to that challenge.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths):** I, too, would like to thank Jenny Rathbone for bringing forward this topic as the subject of her short debate today, and I thank the four Members who spoke for their comments.

There is no doubt that dementia presents us with a series of challenges. We face not just resource and capacity issues in ensuring that our health and social services are ready and able to respond to the demands that dementia places on them, we also face an emotional challenge, as individuals, communities and wider society, experiencing the pain and distress of watching a loved one cope with this extremely challenging condition—and Eluned shared her very poignant family experience with us this afternoon.

The reality is sobering. One in five people over the age of 80 has dementia and, by 2021, the number of people with dementia across Wales is projected to increase by 31%. It is, therefore, imperative that we continue to tackle this problem and prepare our services

y rhyngberthynas rhwng gwahanol gyflyrau iechyd a'r ffordd y maent yn effeithio ar ddementia fod yn ddwys iawn, ond efallai yn bwysicach fyth, mae angen systemau gwell ar gyfer diagnosis cynnar. Mae'n rhwystredigaeth enfawr i deuluoedd. Celodd fy nain ei chyflwr oddi wrthym, ac mae fy modryb yn nyrs iechyd meddwl sy'n arbenigo mewn gofal yr henoed. Fe'i celodd oddi wrthym ac ni allem gael y gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol i wrando arnom pan wnaethom godi materion gyda hwy. Dim ond pan benderfynodd hi o'r diwedd ei bod am gyfaddef bod ganddi broblem y gwnaethom lwyddo i gael help iddi, ac erbyn hynny roedd yn rhy hwyr i'r triniaethau cyffuriau gwych sydd ar gael fod o fudd iddi.

Felly, dyna rai materion rwy'n gobeithio y gwnaiff y Gweinidog eu hystyried. Wrth i'n poblogaeth heneiddio, diolch i waith gwych ein gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol yn ein cadw'n fyw am gyfnod hwy, mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod y bydd dementia yn her gynyddol i gymdeithas. Mae angen inni gynllunio nawr er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn ymateb i'r her honno.

**Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths):** Hoffwn innau hefyd ddiolch i Jenny Rathbone am gyflwyno'r pwnc hwn fel testun ei dadl fer heddiw, a diolch i'r pedwar Aelod a siaradodd am eu sylwadau.

Nid oes amheuaeth bod dementia yn cyflwyno cyfres o heriau inni. Yn ogystal â materion o ran adnoddau a gallu wrth sicrhau bod ein gwasanaethau iechyd a'n gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn barod ac yn gallu ymateb i ofynion dementia, rydym hefyd yn wynebu her emosiynol, fel unigolion, cymunedau a'r gymdeithas ehangach, wrth brofi'r boen a'r gofid o wyllo rhywun annwyl yn ymdopi â'r cyflwr hynod heriol hwn—a rhannodd Eluned brofiad teimladwy iawn ei theulu gyda ni y prynhawn yma.

Mae'r realiti yn ddifrifol. Mae gan un o bob pump o bobl dros 80 oed ddementia ac, erbyn 2021, rhagwelir y bydd nifer y bobl â dementia ledled Cymru yn cynyddu 31%. Felly, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn parhau i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon ac yn paratoi

for the challenges that the condition presents. It is for this reason that the 'National Dementia Vision for Wales', 'Together for Health', our programme for government and the forthcoming mental health and wellbeing strategy, Together for Mental Health, which I will be launching next week, all confirm the importance of delivering care and support for those with dementia.

We are determined to continuously improve our services—services that ensure that an individual is treated and cared for in a safe and dignified fashion. To achieve this, we have invested heavily in a range of measures designed to raise awareness, improve standards of care and push forward our understanding of the causes and effects of dementia. All these are critical if we are to meet the needs and expectations of patients, carers and health professionals. As a Government, we are committed to ensuring people have prompt and ready access to world-class health and social care services, delivered within or as close to people's homes as possible.

Services should be designed around the needs of individuals. To support this, individual care plans for every person with a long-term health condition provide a basis for the evolving nature of the relationship between health professionals and service users. Care plans will enable individuals to make real choices about their own care and be empowered to take more responsibility for their own health. For those people in specialist mental health services, these care plans are now a statutory requirement. 'This is me' and the Butterfly scheme initiatives ensure that every patient has an individual care plan, tailored to meet the specific needs of a patient with dementia, and is approved by them and their carers. Progress is measured through the individual health boards' dementia action plans as part of the quality and delivery meetings.

Dementia does not discriminate. It does not distinguish between rich and poor, race and

ein gwasanaethau ar gyfer yr heriau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r cyflwr. Dyna pam y mae 'Gweledigaeth Genedlaethol Cymru ar Ddementia', 'Law yn Llaw at Iechyd', ein rhaglen lywodraethu a'r strategaeth iechyd a lles meddyliol arfaethedig, Law yn Llaw at Iechyd Meddwl, y byddaf yn ei lansio yr wythnos nesaf, oll yn cadarnhau pwysigrwydd darparu gofal a chymorth i'r rheini â dementia.

Rydym yn benderfynol o barhau i wella ein gwasanaethau—gwasanaethau sy'n sicrhau y caiff unigolyn driniaeth a gofal mewn modd diogel ac urddasol. Er mwyn cyflawni hyn, rydym wedi buddsoddi'n helaeth mewn ystod o fesurau a gynlluniwyd i godi ymwybyddiaeth, gwella safonau gofal a datblygu ein dealltwriaeth o achosion ac effeithiau dementia. Mae'r rhain oll yn hanfodol er mwyn inni ddiwallu anghenion a bodloni disgwyliadau cleifion, gofalwyr a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol. Fel Llywodraeth, rydym yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau y gall pobl gael gafael ar wasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol o'r radd flaenaf yn brydlon ac yn hawdd, wedi'u darparu yng nghartrefi pobl neu mor agos â phosibl at gartrefi pobl.

Dylid cynllunio gwasanaethau yn seiliedig ar anghenion unigolion. I ategu hyn, mae cynlluniau gofal unigol ar gyfer pob person sydd â chyflwr iechyd hirdymor yn darparu sail ar gyfer natur esblygol y gydberthynas rhwng gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Bydd cynlluniau gofal yn galluogi unigolion i wneud dewisiadau go iawn am eu gofal eu hunain ac yn eu grymuso i gymryd mwy o gyfrifoldeb am eu hiechyd eu hunain. I'r bobl hynny sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl arbenigol, mae'r cynlluniau gofal hyn bellach yn ofyniad statudol. Mae 'Dyma fi' a mentrau'r cynllun 'Pili-pala' yn sicrhau bod gan bob claf gynllun gofal unigol, wedi'i deilwra i ddiwallu anghenion penodol claf â dementia, ac a gaiff ei gymeradwyo ganddynt hwy a'u gofalwyr. Caiff cynnydd ei fesur drwy gynlluniau gweithredu ar ddementia byrddau iechyd unigol fel rhan o'r cyfarfodydd ansawdd a chyflenwi.

Nid yw dementia yn gwahaniaethu. Nid yw'n gwahaniaethu rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd,



gender, and, although rare—as we heard from Rebecca Evans—it can strike in earlier adulthood. With that in mind, we have established, with the help of our local health boards, a young onset dementia service for Wales. This sits alongside expanded services for older people and makes possible care and treatment in the least restrictive fashion possible, in the community.

However, circumstances do, on occasion, demand in-patient care. With that in mind, we recognise the need for world-class in-patient facilities truly fit for the twenty-first century and capable of delivering the best care. The Welsh Government has invested significantly in the provision of new facilities for elderly mental health services across Wales. This includes £25 million and £56 million respectively to establish new units at Wrexham Maelor and Llandough hospitals. I recently visited the Llandough hospital unit. I do not know if anyone else has been there, but it has a fantastic room where you can pretend to be sitting on a beach. It is very good for people with dementia who remember their childhood holidays. You can sit on a reclining chair while wave music is being played with flowers around your neck. There was somebody in there when I went who was completely captivated by this. It was really good to see the pleasure that she was taking from it.

As the number of people with dementia increases, the challenge of meeting the needs arising from co-morbid physical and mental health conditions will also increase. To address this need, a dementia intelligent target has been developed, which looks specifically at the care of people in a general hospital setting. This is being delivered through a 1000 Lives Plus collaborative. Raising awareness is of paramount importance and we are working with our third sector partners to improve understanding. Welsh-Government-funded Alzheimer's Society dementia information liaison officers are continuing to build the necessary links between key agencies. They have worked hard to develop a UK-first information pack for every patient with a diagnosis of dementia. The pack clearly and

hil na rhyw, ac, er yn brin—fel y clywsom gan Rebecca Evans—gall daro oedolion ifancach. O ystyried hynny, rydym wedi sefydlu, gyda chymorth ein byrddau iechyd lleol, wasanaeth dementia cynnar i'r ifanc i Gymru. Caiff ei gynnig ochr yn ochr â gwasanaethau estynedig i bobl hŷn gan olygu y gellir cynnig gofal a thriniaeth yn y ffordd leiaf cyfyngol posibl, yn y gymuned.

Fodd bynnag, mae amgylchiadau, o bryd i'w gilydd, yn golygu bod angen darparu gofal fel claf mewnol. O ystyried hynny, rydym yn cydnabod yr angen am gyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf i gleifion mewnol sy'n wirioneddol addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain ac yn gallu darparu'r gofal gorau. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol i ddarparu cyfleusterau newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yr henoed ledled Cymru. Mae hyn yn cynnwys £25 miliwn a £56 miliwn i sefydlu unedau newydd, y naill i ysbyty Wrecsam Maelor a'r llall i ysbyty Llandochoau. Ymwelais ag uned ysbyty Llandochoau yn ddiweddar. Ni wn a oes unrhyw un arall wedi bod yno, ond mae ganddi ystafell ardderchog lle y gallwch esgus eich bod yn eistedd ar draeth. Mae'n dda iawn i bobl â dementia sy'n cofio eu gwyliau fel plant. Gallwch ledorwedd ar gadair â cherddoriaeth tonnau yn y cefndir a blodau am eich gwddf. Roedd rhywun yno ar y pryd a oedd wedi'i swyno'n llwyr gan hyn. Roedd yn braf gweld y pleser roedd yn ei chael o'r profiad.

Wrth i nifer y bobl â dementia gynyddu, bydd yr her o ddiwallu anghenion sy'n deillio o gyd-gyflyrau iechyd corfforol a meddyliol gwael hefyd yn cynyddu. Er mwyn ymdrin â hyn, datblygwyd targed deallus ar gyfer dementia, sy'n ystyried yn benodol y broses o ofalu am bobl mewn ysbyty cyffredinol. Caiff ei gyflwyno drwy un o brosiectau cydweithredol 1000 o Fywydau a Mwy. Mae codi ymwybyddiaeth yn hollbwysig ac rydym yn gweithio gyda'n partneriaid yn y trydydd sector i wella dealltwriaeth. Mae swyddogion cyswllt gwybodaeth am ddementia Cymdeithas Alzheimer yn parhau i feithrin y cysylltiadau angenrheidiol rhwng asiantaethau allweddol. Maent wedi gweithio'n galed i ddatblygu pecyn gwybodaeth cyntaf y DU i bob claf sydd wedi cael diagnosis o ddementia. Mae'r

simply explains to those with a diagnosis the likely impacts of the condition. Another equally groundbreaking scheme, book prescription Wales, has recently been expanded to include four books that focus specifically on dementia.

The need for improved awareness also informs our support for the Dementia Services Development Centre. The centre's role is to review, develop and deliver training to staff in care homes, those working in hospital, community and mental health settings, and primary care staff, including general practitioners. The invaluable help and sensitive care offered by such individuals is complemented by our bilingual Wales dementia helpline and website, which is available 24 hours a day, 365 days a year, offering practical and emotional support and advice.

Improving standards of care is not enough; we have to do more. We need to better understand the causes of dementia, so we might reduce wherever possible the incidence of dementia. This ambition is reflected in our support for the Wales Dementias and Neurodegenerative Diseases Research Network, and the MRC Centre for Neuropsychiatric Genetics and Genomics. These bodies bring together world-renowned professionals to further our understanding.

6.30 p.m.

While progress is being made, there remains room for improvement. The introduction of memory clinics across Wales and an increase in the numbers attending them demonstrates that we are getting better at diagnosing these conditions earlier. However, we must work harder to further improve rates of diagnosis and support primary care services to do so. Part 1 of the Mental Health (Wales) Measure 2010 serves to expand primary care mental health services, including to those people with a dementia.

In April 2011, as Jenny Rathbone said, a new

pecyn yn esbonio effeithiau tebygol y cyflwr i'r rheini sydd wedi cael diagnosis mewn ffordd glir a syml. Yn ddiweddar, cafodd cynllun arall yr un mor arloesol, sef presgripsiwn llyfrau Cymru, ei ehangu i gynnwys pedwar llyfr sy'n canolbwyntio'n benodol ar ddementia.

Mae'r angen am well ymwybyddiaeth hefyd yn llywio'r cymorth a roddir gennym i'r Ganolfan Datblygu Gwasanaethau Dementia. Rôl y ganolfan yw adolygu, datblygu a darparu hyfforddiant i staff mewn cartrefi gofal, y rheini sy'n gweithio mewn ysbytai, lleoliadau cymunedol a lleoliadau iechyd meddwl, a staff gofal sylfaenol, gan gynnwys meddygon teulu. Caiff y cymorth amhrisiadwy a'r gofal sensitif a gynigir gan unigolion o'r fath eu hategu gan ein llinell gymorth a'n gwefan dementia ddwyieithog i Gymru, sydd ar gael 24 awr y dydd, 365 diwrnod y flwyddyn, gan gynnig cymorth a chynghor ymarferol ac emosiynol.

Nid yw gwella safonau gofal yn ddigon; rhaid inni wneud mwy. Mae angen inni ddeall achosion dementia yn well, er mwyn inni, lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, leihau nifer yr achosion o ddementia. Adlewyrchir yr uchelgais hwn yn y cymorth a roddir gennym i'r Rhwydwaith Ymchwil yng Nghymru ar Ddementiau a Chlefydau Niwro-ddirywiol, a Chanolfan MRC ar gyfer Geneteg a Genomeg Niwroseiciatrig. Mae'r cyrff hyn yn dod â gweithwyr proffesiynol byd-enwog ynghyd er mwyn gwella ein dealltwriaeth.

Er bod cynnydd yn cael ei wneud, mae lle i wella o hyd. Mae'r ffaith bod clinigau cof yn cael eu cyflwyno ledled Cymru a'r cynnydd yn y niferoedd sy'n eu mynychu yn dangos ein bod yn gwella o ran gwneud diagnosis cynharach o'r cyflyrau hyn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni weithio'n galetach er mwyn gwella cyfraddau diagnosis ymhellach a helpu gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol i wneud hynny. Nod Rhan 1 o Fesur Iechyd Meddwl (Cymru) 2010 yw ehangu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl gofal sylfaenol, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau i'r bobl hynny sydd â dementia.

Ym mis Ebrill 2011, fel y dywedodd Jenny

indicator was introduced to the QuOF following a recommendation by NICE. The indicator requires practices to record a range of test results for patients newly diagnosed with dementia. This is in line with the current NICE clinical guidelines on dementia.

Our forthcoming mental health strategy for Wales, 'Together for Mental Health', outlines our approach to dementia over the next few years. Of critical importance is how we further encourage meaningful collaboration between social services, the NHS and the third sector, so that we can maximise the resources at our disposal to the benefit of the people of Wales. As an age-inclusive strategy, 'Together for Mental Health' will help to reduce the complications and transitions that arise as people age. Under the umbrella of the strategy, the continued delivery of the dementia vision will help us to provide those with dementia the best opportunities possible for living meaningful and rewarding lives.

We are also conscious of the need to account for Welsh-speaking communities and acknowledge that many who speak English may only understand or be able to communicate in their first language of Welsh as the illness progresses. Access to health and social services through the medium of Welsh is therefore not just a matter of equality—it can also be crucial to clinical assessment and treatment.

Darren Millar made a point regarding care homes; the Deputy Minister heard your comments, and it is something that we will look at.

I am sure that many of you are aware of the pioneering work that has been started in Wales around integrated family support teams to support children and families in the community. This model has been very successful to date, and I am keen to explore how it could be applied to individuals at an early stage of dementia with their families and within the community.

Rathbone, cyflwynwyd dangosydd newydd i'r Fframwaith Canlyniadau Ansawdd yn dilyn argymhelliad gan NICE. Mae'r dangosydd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bractisau gofnodi canlyniadau amrywiaeth o brofion ar gyfer cleifion sydd newydd gael diagnosis o ddementia. Mae hyn yn unol â chanllawiau clinigol cyfredol NICE ar ddementia.

Mae ein strategaeth iechyd meddwl arfaethedig i Gymru, 'Law yn Llaw at Iechyd Meddwl', yn amlinellu ein dull o ymdrin â dementia dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Mae sut y byddwn yn annog mwy o gydweithredu ystyrion rhwng y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, y GIG a'r trydydd sector, fel y gallwn wneud y gorau o'r adnoddau sydd ar gael inni er budd pobl Cymru yn hollbwysig. Fel strategaeth oed-gynhwysol, mae 'Law yn Llaw at Iechyd Meddwl' yn helpu i leihau'r cymhlethdodau a'r newidiadau sy'n digwydd wrth i bobl heneiddio. O dan fantell y strategaeth, bydd parhau i roi'r weledigaeth am ddementia ar waith yn ein helpu i roi'r cyfleoedd gorau posibl er mwyn i'r rheini â dementia fyw bywydau ystyrion a boddhaus.

Rydym hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r angen i ystyried cymunedau Cymraeg eu hiaith ac yn cydnabod ei bod yn bosibl y bydd llawer o bobl sy'n siarad Saesneg ond yn deall neu'n gallu cyfathrebu yn eu mamiaith, sef y Gymraeg, wrth i'r salwch ddatblygu. Felly nid dim ond mater o gydraddoldeb yw sicrhau y gall pobl gael gwasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg—gall hefyd fod yn hanfodol o ran cynnal asesiadau clinigol a rhoi triniaeth.

Cyfeiriodd Darren Millar at gartrefi gofal; clywodd y Dirprwy Weinidog eich sylwadau, ac mae'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn ei ystyried.

Rwy'n siŵr bod llawer ohonoch yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith arloesol a ddechreuwyd yng Nghymru mewn perthynas â thimau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd i helpu plant a theuluoedd yn y gymuned. Mae'r model hwn wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn hyd yma, ac rwy'n awyddus i ystyried sut y gellid ei gymhwyso i unigolion ar gam cynnar o ddementia gyda'u teuluoedd ac yn y

gymuned.

‘Sustainable Social Services for Wales: A Framework for Action’, published last year, makes a clear commitment to look at dementia services in Wales. IFSTs offer us a real opportunity to build a model that will provide support to help those with dementia to retain their independence and sense of self for as long as possible.

Mae ‘Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cynaliadwy i Gymru: Fframwaith Gweithredu’, a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd, yn gwneud ymrwymiad clir i ystyried gwasanaethau dementia yng Nghymru. Mae timau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd yn rhoi cyfle gwirioneddol inni greu model a fydd yn rhoi cymorth i helpu’r rheini sydd â dementia i gadw eu hannibyniaeth ac ymdeimlad ohonynt hwy eu hunain gyhyd ag y bo modd.

Policies communicate our vision for dementia services. What makes these policies a reality is local health boards and local authorities working with partners to translate them into actions that mean better patient outcomes. Tackling dementia is critical, because the human, societal and financial costs are so great.

Mae polisiau yn cyfleu ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau dementia. Caiff y polisiau hyn eu troi’n realiti wrth i fyrrdau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol weithio gyda phartneriaid i’w trosi’n gamau gweithredu sy’n arwain at well canlyniadau i gleifion. Mae mynd i’r afael â dementia yn hollbwysig, gan fod y costau dynol, y costau cymdeithasol a’r costau ariannol mor uchel.

Services must work together if we are to minimise the impact that dementia has on individuals, their families, health and social care services and, ultimately, the Welsh economy. This will require actions within all sectors and all communities. Tackling dementia truly is everybody’s business. However, I know that we can count on our services in Wales to rise to the challenge and, working in partnership, ensure that people living with the condition can enjoy the best quality of life possible.

Rhaid i wasanaethau gydweithio er mwyn lleihau’r effaith a gaiff dementia ar unigolion, eu teuluoedd, gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ac, yn y pen draw, economi Cymru. Bydd angen i bob sector a phob cymuned weithredu. Mae mynd i’r afael â dementia yn fusnes i bawb. Fodd bynnag, gwn y gallwn ddibyynu ar ein gwasanaethau yng Nghymru i ymateb i’r her a, chan weithio mewn partneriaeth, sicrhau y gall pobl sy’n byw gyda’r cyflwr fwynhau’r ansawdd bywyd gorau posibl.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch yn fawr. Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you. That brings today’s proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.33 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 6.33 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a’u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Antoniwi, Mick (Llafur – Labour)  
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)

Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru Annibynnol – Independent Plaid Cymru)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Parrott, Eluned (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)  
 Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)  
 Roberts, Aled (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)